



University of Tennessee, Knoxville  
**Trace: Tennessee Research and Creative  
Exchange**

---

IACE Hall of Fame Repository

International Adult and Continuing Education Hall  
of Fame Repository

---

1973

# Malcolm S. Knowles: His Contributions to the Theory and Practice of Adult Education

John A. Henschke EdD

*Lindenwood University*, [jHenschke1@lindenwood.edu](mailto:jHenschke1@lindenwood.edu)

Follow this and additional works at: [http://trace.tennessee.edu/utk\\_IACE-browseall](http://trace.tennessee.edu/utk_IACE-browseall)

 Part of the [Community College Leadership Commons](#), [Curriculum and Instruction Commons](#), [Curriculum and Social Inquiry Commons](#), [Disability and Equity in Education Commons](#), [Educational Administration and Supervision Commons](#), [Educational Leadership Commons](#), [Educational Methods Commons](#), [Educational Psychology Commons](#), [Higher Education Commons](#), [Instructional Media Design Commons](#), [International and Comparative Education Commons](#), [Online and Distance Education Commons](#), [Other Education Commons](#), [Social and Philosophical Foundations of Education Commons](#), [Special Education and Teaching Commons](#), [Student Counseling and Personnel Services Commons](#), and the [Teacher Education and Professional Development Commons](#)

---

## Recommended Citation

Henschke, John A. EdD, "Malcolm S. Knowles: His Contributions to the Theory and Practice of Adult Education" (1973). *IACE Hall of Fame Repository*.

This Book is brought to you for free and open access by the International Adult and Continuing Education Hall of Fame Repository at Trace: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange. It has been accepted for inclusion in IACE Hall of Fame Repository by an authorized administrator of Trace: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange. For more information, please contact [trace@utk.edu](mailto:trace@utk.edu).



January 1973

## Malcolm S. Knowles: His Contributions to the Theory and Practice of Adult Education

Contact  
Author

Start Your Own  
SelectedWorks

Notify Me  
of New Work

Approved by

First Reader Eugene E. DuBois  
Eugene E. DuBois, Associate Professor of Education

Second Reader Stuart A. Marshall  
Stuart A. Marshall, Professor of Education

Third Reader Kenneth D. Benne  
Kenneth D. Benne, Professor of Philosophy

Fourth Reader Albert J. Sullivan  
Albert J. Sullivan, Professor of Public Communication

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The encouragement and support of many friends and colleagues have helped in this research.

Thanks go to Dr. Malcolm S. Knowles for initially consenting to my developing this study, and for serving as "prime information resource" throughout various phases of this work.

I am deeply grateful for the academic freedom allowed and support received from Dr. Eugene E. DuBois, Dr. Stuart A. Marshall, Dr. Kenneth D. Benne, and Dr. Albert J. Sullivan who helped guide me in this endeavor. The stimulus of my colleagues in the Spring, 1968, "Change Strategies" graduate seminar at Boston University under the cogent direction of Dr. Robert Chin and Dr. Kenneth D. Benne was invaluable toward shaping the research design.

I also appreciate the understanding support from my present faculty colleagues at the University of Missouri.

Finally, gratitude and love are due my wife, Carol, for her technical skill in typing early drafts and the final form of this research report; her patient encouragement when the task seemed mountainous; and for her, as well as our daughter's—Connie, Deanna, and Wendy—generous sacrifices during this research effort.

© Copyright by

John Arthur Henschke

1973

BOSTON UNIVERSITY  
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

Dissertation

MALCOLM S. KNOWLES:  
HIS CONTRIBUTIONS TO THE  
THEORY AND PRACTICE  
OF ADULT EDUCATION

Submitted by

John Arthur Menschke

B.A., Bob Jones University, 1955

B.D., Northern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1958

Th.M., Northern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1963

M.Div., Northern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1972

(M.Div. awarded in exchange for B.D.)

In Partial Fulfillment of Requirements for  
the Degree of Doctor of Education

1973

MALCOLM S. KNOWLES: HIS CONTRIBUTIONS TO THE  
THEORY AND PRACTICE OF ADULT EDUCATION  
(Order No. )

John Arthur Henschke, Ed.D.  
Boston University School of Education, 1973

Major Professor, Eugene E. DuBois,  
Associate Professor of Education

The central question of this study was: What are the contributions in theory and practice Malcolm S. Knowles has made to the emerging field of adult education? The nature of the study as contemporary history of a living person's educational work, required the findings to be preliminary.

The sources of information used to answer the central question were: Interviews with and questionnaire responses of contemporaries of Knowles and Malcolm S. Knowles who served as "prime information resource;" writings of Knowles and others; and documents and proceedings of a variety of organizations influenced by Knowles.

Sections were included on the influences that shaped him as an adult educator; his administrative role at Chicago Central YMCA and Adult Education Association of the U.S.A.; his being Professor of Education at Boston University; and his spin-off influence on total social systems and individuals, in addition to numerous students and graduates. His influence on more than forty social systems are described and his influence on forty-four individuals is described.

George F. Aker's model of twenty-three essential adult educator behaviors was the tool used to determine areas of strength and weakness

of Knowles as assessed by others.

Three conclusions concerning Knowles seem warranted: (1) Only the activities and vocation which offered him the opportunity to pioneer and do what he perceived as socially useful could ultimately capture his efforts—adult education thus far has met this test; (2) Eduard C. Lindeman's book The Meaning of Adult Education formed the central over-all perspective, inspiration, influence and foundation for Knowles' contribution to the field of adult education; and (3) Knowles' social science research base in his adult education contributions stem from Alvin Johnson and his book The Clock of History.



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Title Page . . . . .	i
Readers Approval Page. . . . .	ii
Acknowledgements . . . . .	iii
Abstract . . . . .	iv
Chapter	
I. INTRODUCTION. . . . .	1
The Purpose of the Study. . . . .	1
Background of the Study . . . . .	2
Adult Education as a discrete field of social practice	
Characteristics of the field	
Genetic Principles	
Historical context of the study	
Theoretically	
Justification for the Study . . . . .	3
Special Terms . . . . .	10
The Research Design . . . . .	11
Sources	
1. Types of sources	
2. Location of sources	
Scope . . . . .	24
Limitations . . . . .	25
II. THE SHAPING OF AN ADULT EDUCATOR. . . . .	26
The Early Years (1911-1937) . . . . .	27
Montana	
Florida	
Harvard University	
Alfred North Whitehead	
Ralph Barton Perry	
The Testing Years (1938-1946) . . . . .	32
Eduard C. Lindeman	
Dorothy Hewitt and Kirtley Mather	
Alvin Johnson	
The Professional Development Years (1946-1960). . . . .	40
Chicago	
Carl Rogers	
Cyril Houle	
Robert Havighurst	
Robert Redfield	
National Training Laboratories and Leland Bradford	
Summary . . . . .	47

III. FIELD BUILDING BY A PIONEER IN ADULT EDUCATION . . . . .	49
Chicago, Central YMCA. . . . .	51
Informal Adult Education - The Book	
Twentieth Anniversary Celebration	
Adult Education Association of the U.S.A.. . . . .	60
Formation of a New Organization	
Staff Relationships	
The Fund for Adult Education's Relationship to the Adult Leadership Project	
Knowles as Administrative Coordinator of AEA in Relation to the Total Field of Adult Education	
Knowles' Goals for the Organization	
The Church	
Various Organizations	
Council of National Organizations	
Theory of Maturation as a Guide to Learning	
An Interim Period	
Knowles' Ph.D. Degree	
The 1960 Handbook of Adult Education	
AEA, Annual Meeting, 1966	
Other Considerations	
Boston University. . . . .	94
Role of General Consultant in Adult Education	
The Teaching Role at Boston University	
Sub-Speciality of Human Relations Trainers	
Evaluation	
The Theory Builder	
Knowles' Theory of Andragogy	
Sequential Research Needs	
Higher Adult Education	
Spin-offs. . . . .	142
Dr. Leonard Nadler	
Dr. Donald Klein	
Dr. Watson Dickerman	
Dr. Theodore A. Austin	
Mr. Clarence H. Thompson	
The YMCA Organization Development Project	
Girl Scouts of U.S.A.	
Dr. Eugene DuBois	
Dr. John Ohliger	
North Carolina State University, Department of Adult and Community College Education	
Career Development Program, General Electric Co.,	
Management Development Institute, Ossining, New York	
Data Education, Inc., Waltham, Massachusetts	
The Trainer's Guide to Andragogy and Social Rehabilitation Service of the Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, Washington, D.C.	

Intensive Coronary Care Multimedia Learning System ROCOM Division of Hoffman-LaRoche, Inc., Nutley, New Jersey	
Adult Education Commission of National Catholic Education Association and Institute for Continuing Education—Archdiocese of Detroit, Michigan	
University of Missouri Extension Association	
Areas in Question	
Doctor of Education Dissertations at Boston University which test or apply concepts of Andragogy	
Summary . . . . .	196
IV. ASSESSMENT OF MALCOLM S. KNOWLES BY CONTEMPORARIES. . . . .	198
Negative and Positive Comments. . . . .	200
Negative Comments	
Refusal to Answer	
(1) Knowles not known well enough by respondent	
(2) Questioning reliability of the project	
Expressed Concerns	
(1) Questioning reliability of the study	
(2) General annoyance with the opinionaire	
Positive Comments	
General Eulogistic Comments	
Enjoyment at taking part in the study	
Those considering knowles as a profound influence on the adult education field	
Knowles' operational effectiveness	
Data Received on Non-Behavioral Aspects of Knowles' Influence . . . . .	207
Respondent's academic and work background	
Likenesses to Knowles in Educational Philosophy and Practice of Respondent's as seen by Respondents	
Specific perceived likenesses of respondents to Knowles	
General perceived likenesses of respondents to Knowles	
Differences from Knowles in Educational Philosophy and Practice of Respondent's as seen by Respondents	
Specific differences of respondent from Knowles as perceived by respondent	
(1) Those expressions by respondents of "Knowles more than I"	
(2) Those expressions by respondents of "Knowles less than I"	
References to perceived changes taking place in the respondent as a result of the difference from Knowles	

Knowles Working as a Change Agent and Changes Resulting in Organizations as Perceived by a Respondent Associated with that Organization	
(1) Adult Education Association of the U.S.A.	
(2) Commission of the Professors of Adult Education	
(3) Leadership Resources, Inc.	
(4) Girl Scouts of America	
(5) Young Men's Christian Association	
(6) Department of Adult Education--North Carolina State University at Raleigh	
(7) Providence, Rhode Island, Public Schools	
(8) Cooperative Extension Service	
(9) Center for the Study of Liberal Education for Adults	
(10) Unitarian-Universalist Women's Leadership Division	
(11) United Church of Christ Stewardship Council	
Data Received on Behavioral Aspects of Knowles Influence . .	220
Aker's Twenty-Three Behaviors as a Tool for Analysis	
General Analysis . . . . .	235
General Comments, Hesitations About, and Hindrances of Knowles' Behavior . . . . .	239
Summary. . . . .	241
V. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS . . . . .	243
Findings	
Conclusions	
Values of This Kind of Research	
Recommendations for Further Research	
APPENDICES. . . . .	262
A. Applied Behavioral Science Interview Schedule	
B. Cover Letter and Adaptation of Applied Behavioral Science Interview Schedule	
BIBLIOGRAPHY. . . . .	272
Books and Pamphlets	
Articles and Periodicals	
Reports and Proceedings	
Unpublished Materials	
Other Sources	
VITA. . . . .	291

## CHAPTER I

### INTRODUCTION

This document is a study of Malcolm S. Knowles' contribution to the theory and practice of adult education. The study is suggested by the fact that he is one of many professors and practitioners who have helped adult education make a contribution to mankind. Adult education is one of the human interests that has persisted since the beginning of history. Adult education activities in the United States had their rootage in the British and Western European scene and their American beginnings in the Colonial period. These activities had a focus of helping the Colonialists realize some of the freedoms and possibilities for participation in democracy denied them in the Old World. The fruits of these adult education efforts have continued into the present. In recent times adult education has been recognized as a new imperative for our times and as an emerging field of professional study.<sup>1</sup> The contributions of many professors and practitioners in this field have been significant in the growth of the field and its contribution to help man from becoming obsolete in the midst of accelerating change.

#### The Purpose of the Study

The object of the study was: to identify the contributions in theory and practice Malcolm S. Knowles has made to the emerging field of

---

<sup>1</sup>Jensen, Gale; and others; Adult Education: A New Imperative For Our Times (Washington. Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1961), p. 3.

adult education; to ascertain what events and influences shaped him as an adult educator; to learn what beliefs he embraced which informed and helped shape his theory and practice as an adult educator; to determine what he thought to be the most pressing needs of adult education and how he considered those needs could best be met; to observe the technologies and strategies of change he has developed; to understand the application of his educational beliefs and strategies within the variety of institutions with which he was affiliated; and to gain an assessment of his contributions to the field of adult education as perceived by current and former colleagues and students.

#### BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

##### Adult education as a discrete field of social practice

Adult education as a discrete field of social practice has had a short history. March 26, 1926 marks the date of the founding of the American Association for Adult Education.<sup>2</sup> This is when adult education became publicly defined as a discrete field of social practice. It is young compared with a library field defined similarly in 1876, a social work field defined in 1873, and a public school field defined in 1857.<sup>3</sup>

Adult education has grown more rapidly in its first forty-seven years than has most other fields. However, adult education cannot be

---

<sup>2</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "What We Know About the Field of Adult Education," Adult Education, XV (Winter, 1964), p. 67.

<sup>3</sup>Ibid., p. 67.

classified as a "profession" but as an "emerging profession."<sup>4</sup> The reasons it falls short of the category of "profession" are that it does not meet the criteria ordinarily applied to a profession, such as retaining its members throughout life and insisting that its members live up to an established and accepted code of ethics.

The first graduate courses in adult education were offered in 1929 at Columbia University. By 1960 Boston University inaugurated the thirteenth such program and by 1971 there were thirty institutions offering programs in professional adult education. The theoretical frameworks undergirding these programs are still varied and developing.<sup>5</sup> That there are no standard criteria for professional adult education, despite its proliferation, is one of adult education's problems.

In an "emerging profession," such as adult education, the importance of basic theoretical constructs to the development of a field or body of knowledge should not be minimized. It is a real question whether adult education will ever become a profession in the strict sense of the term, and it will be very difficult to become one. Coolie Verner suggests, "The more closely a field is related to the everyday behavior of people the more difficult it is to achieve the objective analysis upon which theory can be built. Adult education suffers from this...."<sup>6</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup>A. A. Liveright, A Study of Adult Education in the United States (Brookline, Mass.: Center for the Study of Liberal Education for Adults at Boston University, 1968), p. 38.

<sup>5</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Professional Education for Adult Educators," Journal of Continuing Education and Training, Vol. 1, No. 1 (May, 1971), pp. 5-6.

<sup>6</sup>Coolie Verner, A Conceptual Scheme for the Identification and Classification of Processes (Washington: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1962), p. iii.

In building the theory constructs of the adult education field, it would also appear useful and important that as much history as possible of that movement be known. This is some of the foundation upon which theory is built. A rich resource for understanding adult education history and theory development can be to study characteristics of the field, genetic principles that guide the development of the field, and contributions of individuals in the field. The characteristics and genetic principles presented here in brief form have already been studied<sup>7</sup> elsewhere and one individual's (Malcolm S. Knowles) contribution is the subject of this present research.

#### Characteristics of the field

The adult education field is still in its adolescent stage. Consequently its characteristics are dynamic rather than static, which indicate some of the problems inherent in that type of situation, because: (1) the adult education field is highly expansive and flexible; (2) the adult education field is taking the shape of a multidimensional social system with dimensions being institutional, subject matter, geographical and personnel; (3) the adult education field is a highly interactive social system; (4) the adult education field is in the process of developing a distinctive curriculum and methodology; and (5) adult education is becoming an increasingly clearly delineated field of study and practice.<sup>8</sup>

---

<sup>7</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, The Adult Education Movement in the United States (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc., 1962), p. 172. [For a full account of the emergence of the adult education movement or field see this book.]

<sup>8</sup>Ibid., pp. 247-256.



### Genetic Principles

Certain genetic principles which guide the development of the adult education field further illumine its character as well as further highlight some of the problems it faces as it emerges and grows. The genetic principles are: (1) the institutions of adult education typically emerge in response to specific needs, rather than as part of a general design for the continuing education of adults; (2) the developmental process of adult education tends to be more episodic than consistent; (3) institutional forms for the education of adults tend to survive to the extent that they become attached to agencies established for other purposes; (4) adult educational programs tend to emerge with a secondary status in the institutional hierarchy; (5) adult educational programs tend to gain stability and permanence as they become increasingly differentiated in administration, finance, curriculum and methodology; and (6) the institutional segments of the adult educational field tend to crystallize into organized substructures without reference to any conception of a general adult education movement.<sup>9</sup>

### Historical context of the study

The world to which adult education first carried its message no longer exists. The present world is so complex that no one single interpretation of it can succeed in making all the pertinent problems and issues clear. For the first time in the history of civilization, the time span of drastic cultural change has been telescoped into less than the lifetime of the individual. The current generation of mature adults

---

<sup>9</sup>Ibid., pp. 257-260.

now represents the first generation faced with managing a culture different in kind than the culture originally transmitted to them.

The knowledge of today is out of date tomorrow. The skills and tools of today become the technological junk of tomorrow. The patterns, values, senses of belonging and identity are rapidly changing. Traditional businesses and interpersonal relationships of all kinds are in constant flux. They strive toward compatibility with modern living conditions.

Adult education at one time was a luxury or secondary activity. Now there is a new emphasis on the education of adults in America. Adult education is shifting rapidly from a marginal to a central concern and need of our civilization to help man grow, adapt and learn to live in a new kind of world. "Adults must continue to learn; learning, like breathing, is a requirement of living."<sup>10</sup>

Legislators and educational policy-makers recognize that society now has a great stake in the continued learning of adults. The U.S. Commissioner of Education invited A. A. Liveright to look at adult education programs in American society, set a focus on unmet needs, and recommend appropriate action by the Federal Government. The report was published in 1968.

Professors of adult education are sparing no effort to see the movement go forward.<sup>11</sup> Coolie Verner's concern shows in the statement:

---

<sup>10</sup>Gale Jensen, Chairman; Coolie Verner; A. A. Liveright, Adult Education: A New Imperative For Our Time (Washington: Adult Education Association, 1961), p. 5.

<sup>11</sup>The Commission of the Professors of Adult Education of the Adult Education Association of the U.S.A. published two works: Adult Education: A New Imperative For Our Times, 1961; and Adult Education: Outlines of an Emerging Field of University Study, 1964.

"If we are to fulfill our responsibilities as Professors of Adult Education, we must develop the basic theoretical constructs that distinguish Adult Education."<sup>12</sup>

### Theoretically

Adult education is not achieving full potential because it has been teaching adults by the traditional methods and concepts of the traditional education of children—pedagogy.

Liveright contrasts the status of adult education today:

On the one hand the adolescent state of the field of adult education is responsible for certain doubts, feelings of inferiority, periods of inadequacy and compensatory periods of aggressiveness. On the other, the concomitant fluidity places persons now in the field in an especially fortunate and challenging position. Patterns are still open and not rigid, future directions may still be explored.<sup>13</sup>

Adult education has accumulated a growing body of insights and knowledge about adults from research and experience. It has learned that adults are different from the traditional concept of children as learners. In other words, adults are not grown children, but adults and children are both growing human beings. Each is at a different place on the life continuum.

A new technology and new label, andragogy—the art and science of helping adults to learn is emerging. Malcolm S. Knowles has made a substantial contribution in this area and he continues to do so.

---

<sup>12</sup>Verner, A Conceptual Scheme for the Identification and Classification of Processes, p. iii.

<sup>13</sup>Liveright, A Study of Adult Education in the United States, p. 39.

## JUSTIFICATION FOR THE STUDY

The main object of this research has already given indication that this is historical research but of a unique kind—contemporary, not long past. The reasons to justify it, therefore, are those that would justify the writing of any history. However, in its application to the continued developing of the field of adult education the study of Malcolm S. Knowles has special justification. Here is a man who has occupied a rather singular position in the adult education field; Malcolm S. Knowles received adult education's coveted Delbert Clark Award in 1967, and the citation that accompanied the award read,

A creative and inventive leader, teacher, and administrator, Dr. Knowles is one of the unusual professors whose national and international reputation is based not only upon the importance of his ideas and concepts, but also upon the model of his behavior...;<sup>14</sup>

He built the foundation of the Chicago Central YMCA adult education program which has become a prototype model in the United States; he was the first executive director of the Adult Education Association; he was the first man appointed to the new position, with the title of Associate Professor of Education and General Consultant in Adult Education, created at Boston University; he was the first man to write a history of adult education as a movement in the United States; and he borrowed from European colleagues the term andragogy and introduced its usage into the United States, although the theory and technology he is infusing into

---

<sup>14</sup>Citation, Delbert Clark Award (Carrollton, Georgia: West Georgia College), July, 1967.

the word are largely his own and new.<sup>15</sup>

As such, Malcolm S. Knowles' work in education began some years ago and his influence continues to grow. He is a man whose judgment and consultation is being increasingly sought and respected in and out of this nation. He is a man who is continuing to change, develop and grow with the times.

Malcolm S. Knowles is a man who is alive, and served as an "information resource"\* for this study. The study of his interaction with various educational movements gives further dimension and meaning to this research: the opportunity of experiences in the education of the day as he sees it; increased awareness of the possibilities of education endeavors in observing the work of one who excels in his area; his assistance in more accurately viewing his influence upon the public to whom he looks for support.

There is the additional justification that some believe a case study (this study may also be considered such) has greater potential than has been generally realized for advancing the knowledge and practice of the applied social sciences. Walton suggests six relative advantages offered by the case study: (1) Inductive development of new theory usable

---

<sup>15</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles with Roger Hiemstra, Andragogy: A Discussion About a New Concept in Adult Education, A Supplementary Instruction on Videotape (Lincoln, Nebraska: Nebraska Education Television Council for Higher Education, 1972), Program Announcement, back page.

\* Note: Malcolm S. Knowles is the major professor in adult education at Boston University--the institution where the author is writing this dissertation as partial fulfillment for the Doctor of Education degree. As major professor, Knowles would have been the first reader on the author's dissertation committee. However, when permission was granted to develop this study, Knowles chose to remove himself from the author's dissertation committee and be an "information resource" during the study.

for the affairs of mankind; (2) keeping existing theory and technology open to change or refinement; (3) understanding the processes ("throughput," that middle state between "input" and "output") which mediate interventions and outcomes; (4) semi-experientially based educational strategy, anchoring learning to concrete experiences; (5) avoidance of depersonalization of change science and technology, including sensitive descriptive material about particular human beings who were central to the change process; and (6) a basis for judging applicability of technique.<sup>16</sup>

### SPECIAL TERMS

The following is a list of special terms and their meanings when used in this study.

1. Adult Education: Adult education is a process through which persons no longer attending school on a regular, full-time basis undertake activities with the conscious intention of bringing about changes in information, knowledge, insight, understanding, skills, appreciation, interests, values and attitudes; or to identify and solve personal or community problems.
2. Andragogy: The art and science of helping adults to learn.
3. Pedagogy: The art and science of teaching children.
4. Change Agent: A person or persons professionally qualified or otherwise organized to assist a person or system in the deliberate improvement required for more satisfactory operation or adjustment.
5. Client System: The specific person or group of persons assisted in the process of change by a change agent.
6. Collaboration: The process of mutual planning between the change agent and the client system.

---

<sup>16</sup>Richard E. Walton, "Advantages and Attributes of the Case Study," Journal of Applied Behavioral Science, VIII (January/February, 1972), pp. 73-78.

7. System: An individual, group, organization, or community.
8. Influence Process: A relationship between persons or groups where one or the other party (or both) utilize some form of interpersonal (or intersystem) operation to induce the other to do, or feel, or think that which the influencer believes is desirable.
9. Influence: A persistent, shaping effect upon the thought and behavior of human beings, singly or collectively.
10. Theory: A set of interrelated constructs (concepts), definitions, and propositions that present a systematic view of phenomena by specifying relations among variables, with the purpose of explaining the phenomena.

The use of these terms is justified by their common usage in the disciplines to which they are peculiar. No special or deviant definitions are included.

#### THE RESEARCH DESIGN

The purpose of this study was to write a developmental history of Malcolm S. Knowles' contribution to the field of adult education. However, historical research has many problems of validity. Except for occasional traces, most past events, distant or immediate, have perished or have never become a part of recorded history. A moment's reflection by Gottschalk is sufficient to establish that fact.

How much, for example, of what you do, say, or think is ever observed by anyone (including yourself)? Multiply your unobserved actions, thoughts, words and physiological processes by 2,000,000,000 and you will get a rough estimate of the amount of unobserved happenings that go on in the world all the time. And only part of what was observed in the past was remembered by those who observed it; and only part of what was remembered was recorded; only part of what was recorded has survived; only part of what has survived has come to the historians' attention; only part of what has come to their attention is credible; only part of what is credible has been

grasped; only part of what has been grasped can be expounded or narrated by the historian.<sup>17</sup>

A quick count will reveal eight transition points between the actual event and the historian's narration of that event. At any or all of these transition points the facts of history are subject to human selection, distortion or literally becoming lost. Nevertheless, historical research is undertaken and is valid despite those weaknesses. The alternative is to not do historical research. This would, in fact, accomplish less than scrupulous efforts for historical authenticity.

Beyond the narration of historical events this particular research presents another problem. This research applies the discipline of adult education, (at least in part) as it has emerged to date, to the recording and preliminary analysis of contemporary phenomena. Specifically, the subject of this study is Malcolm S. Knowles' contributions to and influence upon the field of adult education to date. Consequently, regarding the assessment of a contemporary's contributions to a field of study, one of the important criteria for proof of an influence may be missing.

Gottschalk suggests considerations which may convincingly establish that one historical person, thing or event (or groups thereof) had an influence upon another. They are

- (1) If A had an influence upon B, A must have been antecedent to or concurrent with B....
- (2) Similarity to A in thought or behavior on the part of B may also indicate influence, but is not sufficient in itself to do so....
- (3) Acknowledgment by B of A's influence may also be helpful in establishing it, but influences may operate effectively though unsuspected and therefore unacknowledged....
- (4) Since all of these tests except that of time are inconclusive and time is conclusive only where an anachronism in cause-and-effect sequence can be established, the best proof that B was

---

<sup>17</sup>Louis Gottschalk, Understanding History (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1950; 1969), p. 45.



influenced by A, where any evidence to that effect raises the probability, is to try to eliminate the other apparent causes of B's thought or action. Usually it will be found that other factors cannot be eliminated entirely. Hence, influence with rare exceptions is best conceived of as part of a complicated and not easily separable puzzle.<sup>18</sup>

At this point in time the fourth criteria regarding this research is very minimally fulfilled. This is reported in Chapter III. Those areas where all four criteria have been met, could be proven otherwise with the amassing of further evidence, the mere passage of time, or the changing definition of the field of adult education. This study at best, given its contemporaneous nature, must be inconclusive, even though accurate in reporting the data. The first three criteria of Gottschalk are fulfilled and reported in Chapter IV, the assessment of Knowles' influence by others. The fourth criteria has not had the advantage of sufficient time elapsing to be fulfilled.

It is assumed by this researcher that a doctoral dissertation studying a contemporary is highly unusual, even suspect. Arthur Schlesinger, Jr. suggests: "The traditional argument for the inferiority of contemporary history, and especially eyewitness history, thus rests on alleged deficiencies in both the collection and interpretation of historical facts."<sup>19</sup> Schlesinger argues that contemporary or eyewitness history has its distinctive merits and needs to be accepted for what it is. There is room for this kind of history, with its emphasis on preserving the "felt texture of events"<sup>20</sup> while recognizing the role of such elements

---

<sup>18</sup>Ibid., pp. 261-262.

<sup>19</sup>Arthur Schlesinger, Jr., "The Historian as Participant," Daedalus, Vol. 100, No. 2 (Spring, 1971), p. 346.

<sup>20</sup>Ibid., p. 354.

as "confusion, ignorance, chance and sheer stupidity."<sup>21</sup> This is not to suggest that contemporary or eyewitness history replace the kind of history written by the historian who works entirely with documents describing events with which he has not had any prior personal association.<sup>22</sup>

---

<sup>21</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>22</sup>Ibid., p. 349. Note: Arthur Schlesinger, Jr. has given testimony of his personal experience with writing contemporary or eyewitness history. It is included within this note so as not to interrupt the flow of the dissertation.

...the way people think and feel is an organic part of history.

This is something that the technical historian misses, as Professor Butterfield has noted: 'The reader of technical history learns too little from it of the hopes and fears of the majority of men, too little of their joy in nature and art, their falling in love, their family affection, their spiritual questings, and their ultimate vision of things.' Since this is so, Professor Butterfield himself has wondered 'whether technical history can claim to give us the mirror of life any more than modern physics provides us with an actual picture of the universe.'<sup>3</sup> If technical history cannot claim to give us the mirror of life, can one be so certain about the advantages provided by the stages of historiographical growth? If I may cite a personal example, I have no question that, by writing A Thousand Days the year after President Kennedy's death, I was able to suggest something about the mood and relationships of the Kennedy years which no future historian could ever get on the basis of the documents--indeed, which memory, the knowledge of consequences, and the introduction of new preoccupations and perspectives, had I tried to write the book ten or twenty years later. Page Smith (in The Historian and History) argues persuasively that, for historians writing years after the fact, 'the difficulty of recreating faithfully the events and their causes will be greater and demand a more powerful effort of the will and the creative imagination than that demanded of the participant-historian.'<sup>4</sup>

The case against the eyewitness historian in the domain of facts thus seems on examination less compelling than the arguments of the

---

<sup>3</sup>Sir Herbert Butterfield, Man On His Past (Cambridge, Eng.: University Press, 1955), p. 137.

<sup>4</sup>Page Smith, The Historian and History (New York: Knopf, 1964), p. 205.

The variety of history, then, undertaken by this study is more of the contemporary or eyewitness history. Technical history is at a minimum if it could be said to be present at all.

As a basis for Chapter II, The Shaping of An Adult Educator, the beginning step was to interview Knowles, using the schedule located in Appendix A of this work. This proved advantageous in providing information that otherwise would have taken much time to obtain, if it would have been available at all. He indicated what and who had influenced him and his thinking. The sources Knowles suggested were then investigated to find the ideas he said influenced him. It was not the total thinking of any individual but selected ideas of many people that shaped his thinking. Therefore, the choice was based on obvious statements from these influence sources.

Where no documents were available to substantiate Knowles statements of facts as he remembered them, friends, family and professional associates were consulted to check factual accuracy.

Interviews with persons who are acquainted with Knowles personally and/or professionally were conducted. In addition to interviews, the writings listed below were used to gain the data necessary to form Chapter

---

(note continued from previous page)  
 technical historian at first suggestion. Against the doctrine that truth is the daughter of time one may perhaps place Emerson's dictum: "Time dissipates to shining either the solid angularity of facts."<sup>c</sup>

---

<sup>c</sup>R. W. Emerson, Essays, "History."

Arthur Schlesinger, Jr., "The Historian as Participant," Daedalus, Vol. 100, No. 2 (Spring, 1971), p. 349.

III, "Field Building by a Pioneer in Adult Education." The data needed to answer the questions were available to the researcher through the following means:

I. Types of Sources

1. Published writings by Malcolm S. Knowles written by himself and in collaboration with others.
  - a. Books
  - b. Pamphlets
  - c. Articles in Journal of Education
  - d. Articles in books
  - e. Articles and reports in Adult Education Journal
  - f. Book edited
  - g. Articles and reports in Adult Leadership
  - h. Articles for popular magazines
  - i. Articles in religious magazines
  - j. Reports of Adult Education Association activities and progress
2. Published writings about Malcolm S. Knowles
  - a. In magazines
  - b. In newspapers
  - c. In books
3. As many unpublished sources as possible of Malcolm S. Knowles, Adult Education Association, Commission of Professors of Adult Education
  - a. Memos
  - b. Reports
  - c. Letters and correspondence
  - d. Manuscripts
  - e. Notes
  - f. Minutes
  - g. Diaries
  - h. Speeches
  - i. Course outlines and bibliographies
4. Personal interviews (structured and unstructured, taped and otherwise)
  - a. The researcher with Malcolm S. Knowles
  - b. The researcher with persons acquainted or associated with Malcolm S. Knowles personally, professionally or otherwise.
5. Other relevant bibliography

## II. Location of Sources

1. Malcolm S. Knowles' personal library and archives which he has made available to the researcher.
2. Malcolm S. Knowles' knowledge and memory of the past. He has consented to be a prime "information resource" for the study.
3. Suggestions from Malcolm S. Knowles and others as to who the researcher might interview to gain the information desired.
4. Adult Education Association Files.
5. Commission of the Professors of Adult Education Files.
6. Any other places and sources the search indicates.
7. Boston University Library.
8. The researcher's personal library.

The AEA file, and Commission of the Professors of Adult Education file materials were limited to that which was available in Malcolm S. Knowles' personal archives. The AEA and Professors files were, at the time this research was in progress, being moved from AEA office, Washington, D.C. to the Library of Continuing Education at Syracuse University, New York. The material was also not catalogued at the time. The limitation of time and resources and the situation in transition precluded the full use of those AEA and Professors of Adult Education files. However, it is doubtful that this lessened the accuracy of the data since the files available to the writer were quite complete, at least for the years Knowles was Executive Director of AEA.

The sources and means of gathering the data for Chapter IV, "Assessment of Malcolm S. Knowles by Contemporaries" were quite complex. It is recognized that being a contemporary study, the personal and interpersonal factors would weigh heavily in Knowles' influence to date. In fact, it has been suggested that being a ruggedly masculine personality,

Knowles goes a long way in putting across his philosophy and practice which at times almost seems dogmatic even though he may not intend it so. Consequently, it is forwarded that to separate Knowles the theory field builder, from the person, at this point, is impossible.

In addition, it must be remembered that Knowles sees his own field building activities as his "swirling around in the whirlpools with everyone else" as contrasted with "looking down on the field and analyzing what is happening." This contrast sounds much like the contrast Lindeman made years ago between the intelligent and other.

An intelligent person sees facts, not merely in relation to each other but in relation to himself. Indeed, one of the first marks of intelligence is to recognize that 'mental views of the real are aspects of reality.' Intelligence then becomes a way of appropriating facts—a way of integrating facts with the total aspects of personality. Only the educated specialist naively sees facts as discreet, objective and external units of experience. He speaks of the 'laws of nature' as if man's mind were not somehow mixed with the formulation of those laws....briefly, one of the functions of intelligence—its critical mission—is to give full recognition to the personal equation in all fact-finding and fact-using.<sup>23</sup>

It is conceivable that a person might be glorified contemporaneously and yet have been uninfluential. On the other hand, it may also be maintained that the place to be given to a historical figure in a narrative is "proportionate to the relative importance that different kinds of witnesses give him."

In their benchmark study on Personal Influence, Katz and Lazarsfeld discovered that influence on consumer beliefs and preferences does not result from direct exposure of the individual to relevant information and advertising, but rather from exposure to "opinion leaders" in

---

<sup>23</sup>Edward S. Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education (Montreal: Harvest House, 1961), p. 121.

the community. Or in their own words,

Leadership, then, is not simply a matter of being more interested than others; it is a matter of being interested when others are interested, too...it seems reasonable to infer that the flow of influence is not so much directed from highly interested people to people who are not interested at all, but from interested people to people of equal, or perhaps very slightly lower, interest. Shared interest, in short, appears to be a channel through which communications flow.<sup>24</sup>

If these phenomena are indeed general, it argues that an adult education leader may not influence any disinterested or low interested person to go into the field. However, his sphere of influence would be upon those who shared interests, opinions and attitudes in adult education at the same time of those interested in the field of adult education. This influence would mainly take place hand in hand within the interpersonal relationships of the people concerned.

In the initial proposal of this research, it was determined that a part of the data gathering would be accomplished by developing and using an adaptation of the Applied Behavioral Science Interview schedule included in Appendix A.\* Since much of Knowles' influence on the field thus far has been inseparably connected with his personal influence, the schedule adaptation included the bias of personal influence.

It is recognized that the emphasis of assessment by others could have taken the bias purely of change strategy and sought to de-emphasize the personal equation. However, this was rejected because the person

---

<sup>24</sup>Elihu Katz and Paul F. Lazarsfeld, Personal Influence, Free Press Paperback (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1955), p. 327.

\*The adaptation of that schedule is included in Appendix B. It was a loosely constructed opinionaire and no firm categories were made in which to interpret the data. About twenty-three behaviors were among those decided upon to be used. This is discussed later in this work.

figures high in contemporary study as contrasted with a study, conducted a generation after the subject's death, which would seek to inquire as to what remained after the person was gone.

A potential advantage of case study research (this may be considered a variation on the case study) Walton suggests is also:

...that the role of personal styles (preferences, strengths, weaknesses and biases) of the actors in a system of planned change can be appreciated, even if the role of these factors does not appear sufficiently systematic to generalize and incorporate in a theory of intervention.<sup>25</sup>

The personal influence bias was chosen because Knowles sees himself as very much personally involved in the field developmental processes in contrast to having stood off from the field and studying what is happening,<sup>26</sup> much like the Tavistock Institute's change agent as role model.<sup>27</sup> The following description of the Tavistock change agent model is included in note form so as not to interrupt the flow of the study.\*

---

<sup>25</sup>Walton, "Advantages and Attributes of the Case Study," Journal of Applied Behavioral Science, p. 77.

<sup>26</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, private interview held in his home, Newton Highlands, Massachusetts, November 16, 1969.

<sup>27</sup>Warren G. Bennis, "Theory and Method in Applying Behavioral Science to Planned Organizational Change," in The Planning of Change, ed. by Warren G. Bennis, Kenneth D. Benge, Robert Chin (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc., 1969), pp. 70-71. See also behavior number 14, pp. of chapter IV on his congruency.

\*Note: "The change agent qua consultant: perhaps best exemplified in the work of the Tavistock Institute, operates in a manner very like the practicing physician or psychoanalyst: that is, he starts from the chief presenting symptom of the client, articulates it in such a way that causal and underlying mechanisms of the problem are understood, and then takes remedial action. Heavy emphasis is placed on the strategy of role model because the main instrument is the change agent himself.

Certainly if the role of the consultant sounds ambiguous and vague, this probably reflects reality. Certainly in the consultant approach the processes of change and the change agent's interventions are



It appears from the full description, not included in the main body of the paper, that Knowles fits the Tavistock role model change agent description, and maintains his experimentalism throughout.

Further, the adapted "opinionaire" schedule that was developed used a somewhat retrospective approach. It was still felt to be worthy, assuming the problems of factual and events recall. It was determined that as many adult educators as possible would be contacted and interviewed.

Since this research was not considered to be statistical in nature there were not the usual problems present that are connected with random selection of respondents. An August, 1969 membership name and address list of the Adult Education Association's Commission of the Professors of Adult Education was obtained. In addition to the Commission of the Professors membership, the writer's committee suggested names of people associated with Knowles in AEA when he was administrator, who never were or are no longer in the adult education field. A list of former and current students was also obtained. This list included some who had and some who

---

(note continued from previous page)  
less systematic and less programmed than in training or applied research programs."<sup>a</sup>

The experimental method is much like the "pilot run" proposed by the Tavistock group, but it differs in that it is seen as a more extensive period of experimentation. It runs through a series of phases but never really ceases to maintain its experimental orientation, particularly where the consultant-trainer role is required.<sup>b</sup>

---

<sup>a</sup>Bennis, "Theory and Method in Applying Behavioral Science to Planned Organizational Change," pp. 70-71.

<sup>b</sup>John C. Clidewell, "The Entry Problem in Consultation," in The Planning of Change, ed. by Warren G. Bennis, Kenneth D. Deane, Robert Chin (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1961), p. 658.

had not finished degree programs with Knowles at Boston University. Finally, some of Knowles current colleagues at Boston University were listed.

The compiled list of possible people to be contacted ranged near 150. From the total, a number were chosen for personal taped interviews who had worked closely\* with Knowles and were considered the most likely to be able to give a candid assessment of Knowles based on their close professional contact with him.

As contacts were initiated problems began to arise. The issue of current addresses eliminated some names. Old addresses were known but for some no forwarding address was available to the writer. Numerous telephone calls were made to establish possible times of appointment for an interview. Some few appointments were made this way. However, many persons were not in their office at the time of the initial call. A message was given to each respective secretary requesting a return telephone call. None of the persons who were requested, returned a telephone call. The reason could have been that the writer was not known to the parties being called, or for some other unexplained reason. Second, third and fourth telephone calls were made but with the same response. It became obvious that the time consumed, even if increased, could be fruitless.

Another possible approach to be made could have been to make a personal journey to the office of those with whom an interview was desired and request the interview in person. This idea was abandoned because of

---

\*Note: There were those who were unfavorable as well as favorable to his views of adult education.

the risk of the person not being there on that day or the possibility of audience not being granted. The expense and time involved in this approach would have been prohibitive, considering the resources available to the writer.

The decision was then made to interview personally the few persons who had been contacted and responded. Then, the loosely constructed, openended "opinionnaire"\* was developed which was an adaptation of the interview schedule in Appendix A. It was decided to send the "opinionnaire" to all those on the above mentioned name and address lists, except those with whom interviews were obtained. A cover letter was written\*\* and sent with the "opinionnaire" to 150 people. The first three pages were sent to everyone. The fourth page was alternately included in the letters as follows:

- (1) Page 4a of the "opinionnaire" was included and sent to professional colleagues of Knowles. (Appendix B, p. 270.)
- (2) Page 4b of the "opinionnaire" was included and sent to former and current students of Knowles. (Appendix B, p. 271.)

Problems of negative response and questioning the validity of the study arose when the "opinionnaires" were sent through the mail. It was the intention of the writer, as stated in the initial proposal and first chapter of this research, that the major portion of the dissertation would be based on data available in documents, published and unpublished, by, about and concerning activities in which Knowles was involved. Conversely, it was intended that the data gained through personal interview and "opinionnaire" or "questionnaire" from Knowles or others about Knowles

---

\*Note: A copy of this is located in Appendix B, pp. 267-271.

\*\*Note: A copy of the cover letter is located on p. 266.

would be secondary and not the only data upon which the research was based. However, it is recognized that the cover letter sent to the 150 people could have conveyed that the "opinionnaire" data was the only data upon which the research was to be based. This could account for some of the problems incurred. The "opinionnaire" with page 4a on organizations was sent to ninety people and with page 4b on students was sent to sixty people.

The data received can be placed in three categories: (1) Negative and positive comments received regarding the study itself and the writer's procedure; (2) Non-behavioral, factual data--responses relative to individual professional background of the respondents, their perceived differences and likeness between Malcolm S. Knowles and themselves regarding educational philosophy and practice, and their perception of organizational changes occurring as a result of Knowles' intervention as a change agent; and (3) Behavioral data--the respondents perception of influence processes Knowles used with individuals and organizations, facilitating and hindering behaviors Knowles used during their degree process with him, and the most significant contribution Knowles has made to the field of adult education.

#### SCOPE

The focus of the study was not upon a detailed history of the life of Malcolm S. Knowles. The focus was upon selected contributions of Malcolm S. Knowles to the field of adult education. In other words, this study was a way of viewing the history of Malcolm S. Knowles, namely through the medium of his contributions to date to adult education. The

study was not meant to be exhaustive. An historical study, per se would include all of the events of his life which could be judged in any way significant. In the present study only those elements were included which bore directly upon the development of his theories and contributions to the field of adult education.

### LIMITATIONS

To this study of Malcolm S. Knowles the writer was keenly conscious of bringing certain givens, which may be considered as constituting the limitations of the attempt:

1. The writer was pursuing study of adult education at Boston University and Malcolm S. Knowles is the major professor in the field at this school.
2. The writer was approaching the work with an awareness of the admiration he has for Malcolm S. Knowles. The admiration has developed from the time of the writer's first personal contact with Knowles on the telephone. The admiration has continued to grow as he is influenced by Knowles' teaching.
3. The writer faced the possibility that even though there were sufficient resources available, certain valuable points were perhaps left undeveloped, or even untouched due to human intellectual imperfection.
4. There may be other limitations of which the writer was possibly not aware.

The following chapters are a report of the writer's research into Malcolm S. Knowles' contribution to the theory and practice of adult education.

## CHAPTER II

### THE SHAPING OF AN ADULT EDUCATOR

In the latter half of the 1930's, there was nothing exceptional about a young man named Malcolm S. Knowles receiving a copy of an out-of-print book The Meaning of Adult Education. The book is the American classic social philosophical statement of Adult Education by Eduard C. Lindeman. Knowles' thought became captured with the theme from this book which can be summarized this way: Intelligence being the price man is obliged to pay for continuous growth, the goal of life; meaning in life emerges and is discovered in process with struggle for growth, education serves as revealer as it becomes coterminous with life, not just preparation for life; and that no effort directed toward the increase of these would be wasted effort.<sup>1</sup>

At the time Knowles received this book, he was working with the National Youth Administration in the youth education program. Later he would become an Adult Educator. Moreover, the book and its central themes would figure highly, not only in shaping the perspective of the many influences on his beliefs, but also toward inspiring his efforts and contributions to the theory and practice of Adult Education.

In this chapter the purpose is to present the historical events shaping Knowles as an Adult Educator and the educational beliefs that

---

<sup>1</sup>Eduard C. Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, (Montreal: Harvest House, 1961), pp. 128-129. [First Printed in 1926, by New Republic, Inc., New York.]

emerged from those events. These may be divided into three eras:

(1) The Early Years, prior to receiving the book; (2) The Testing Years, from receiving the book to his decision of becoming a professional Adult Educator; and (3) The Professional Development Years, schooling and other activities.

#### THE EARLY YEARS 1911-1937

By the time Malcolm S. Knowles was given a copy of the book, The Meaning of Adult Education, he had many influences that had already become construction materials in the building of his experience. On August 24, 1913, Malcolm S. Knowles was born in Livingston, Montana. He was the fourth of five children born to Dr. and Mrs. Albert Dixon Knowles.

#### Montana

Some grade school years were spent in Missoula, Montana. The Montana geographical terrain helped to develop not only Knowles' penchant for trout fishing, but more important, his "pioneering outlook on life in a frontier society."<sup>2</sup> He savored and was convinced pioneering was where the real living, for him, would be done.

One of the terms used in the research into what innovators are like is "pioneer."<sup>3</sup> The research also indicates that innovators are venturesome individuals, having the ability to understand and use complex information in the new models they build for doing things in new ways.

---

<sup>2</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, private interview at his office, School of Education, Boston University, Boston, Massachusetts, May, 1968.

<sup>3</sup>Everett M. Rogers, Diffusion of Innovations (New York: The Free Press of Glencoe, 1962), pp. 150-151.

Knowles' need for probing with others the meaning of life began to be satisfied early. He and his veterinarian father talked about those meanings as they rode into the countryside to treat animals. In addition, he remembers long conversations with the Knowles' family lawyer, his early role model, that focused on "the meaning of life, the world, and what was important."

### Florida

As a result of Dr. Albert Dixon Knowles' health condition of arthritis, the Knowles family moved to West Palm Beach, Florida in 1924. Although some suggest there was little play time for Florida residents in the 1920's, Knowles later indicated that Florida's hedonistic play values of leisure, pleasure and enjoyment had little impact on him.<sup>4</sup> It appeared that most of his pleasure was being derived from his work at satisfying, what Lindeman calls, his "need to learn." Knowles remembers that he aimed much of his effort in elementary and secondary school to get into Harvard, a commitment he had made within himself at an early age.<sup>5</sup> He started the concept of his being the serious student in his family. The family reinforced that concept.

### Harvard University

Knowles enrolled in the course at Harvard that would prepare him for law: History, Government and Economics. His enrollment in Harvard offered no clue to his becoming an adult educator. However, during the Harvard years a number of crucial elements appear to be mixed into the

---

<sup>4</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, private interview at his office, May, 1968.

<sup>5</sup>Ibid. cit.



cement of his education foundations.

He was president of the Harvard Liberal Club—an organization of the 1930's which he characterized as equivilant to the Weathermen of the 1970's. He was president of the youth section of the Ford Hall Forum known as the free speech institution in Boston since the early twentieth century.<sup>6</sup>

The student volunteer organization at Harvard was one of the first indications of his interest toward involvement in work with a people orientation, the social and behavioral sciences. Knowles was in charge of placing student volunteers in the work of settlement houses. He did much volunteer work himself.

Knowles spent the summer prior to his senior year in Europe on a traveling fellowship from Harvard. The purpose was to get to know Europe better so he could more effectively interpret American life to the foreign students as they came off the boats and trains to Harvard.

In the formal classroom at Harvard, two teachers stand at the top of the list regarding their impact on Knowles: Alfred North Whitehead and Ralph Barton Perry.

#### Alfred North Whitehead

Alfred North Whitehead with his construct regarding the purpose of education, heralded a new force in 1931. According to Whitehead the new force introduced into the dynamics of civilization requires an entirely new set of assumptions about the purpose and nature of education. The new force is simply this: The fact that the time span of cultural

---

<sup>6</sup>Loc. cit.

revolution has for the first time in history become compressed into less than the lifetime of an individual. As long as this was not true, what a person learned in his youth would carry him through his lifetime. With the new fact of compressed cultural revolution the new set of assumptions were required: The purpose of education should be along the concept of lifelong learning.

This fact further prepared Knowles as fertile ground for the inroads of adult education at the appropriate time.

#### Ralph Barton Perry

Ralph Barton Perry, was the other teacher at Harvard who greatly influenced Knowles. Perry taught a course on Jeremy Bentham, John Stuart Mill, and the Utilitarian philosophy of "the greatest good to the greatest number," which became the central philosophical orientation of Knowles' life. A full account of Bentham and the Utilitarian philosophy is elsewhere available. However, it would appear useful to present here a minimum sketch of that philosophy and its accompanying beliefs.

The Utilitarians felt that human society, like every other institution and belief, could afford to rest squarely upon a rational and socially useful basis, without bringing in either nature or God to give it a more firm support. They claimed that human reason was itself sufficiently cogent to criticize time-honored and ridiculous traditions in politics as in religion, and that outside help was worse than useless. Hoary antiquity should claim no special respect. What cannot pass the test of its service of the needs of today, should be summarily discarded, no matter how time-honored, or how great the reputations of its apologists.

Benthamism rested on a basis of psychological hedonism, the theory

that every human being seeks by nature to attain pleasure and avoid pain. It is not necessary to consult Plato, nor Aristotle.

For the purpose of determining the "greatest good for the greatest number" Bentham provides a hedonistic or felicific (great Happiness) calculus. The seven factors are: Intensity, duration, certainty or uncertainty, propinquity\* or remoteness, fecundity, purity, extent--the number of persons affected.<sup>7</sup>

The function of government and legislation was to guarantee harmonizing of individual interests for obtaining the common good. This could only be done by placing government, so far as this is practicable, in the hands of all.

To avoid misunderstanding, it must be added that the harmonization of interests by law which Bentham demanded was primarily a removal of hindrances to the increase of the happiness of the greatest possible number of citizens rather than what would generally be thought of as positive interference with the freedom of the individual.

It is interesting to note that while the Florida hedonistic play culture did not entice Knowles, this philosophy of "the greatest happiness for the greatest number" made, and still makes sense to him, a hedonism of a psychological variety. It presented to him a sensible orientation and possible answer to his further probe into the meaning of life. The idea of removing blocks to increase that good to the greatest

---

<sup>7</sup>Frederick Copleston, S. J., A History of Philosophy, Vol. 8: Modern Philosophy: Bentham to Russell, Part 1: British Empiricism and the Idealist Movement in Great Britain, Image Books (Garden City, New York: Doubleday and Co., Inc., 1966), pp. 27-28.

\*Note: Propinquity means nearness in place and time, proximity.

number, found its way into Knowles' educational philosophy.

Upon graduation from Harvard in 1934, Knowles began preparing for diplomatic service and international law. He received a fellowship into the Fletcher School of Diplomacy jointly operated by two universities, Harvard and Tufts. By the end of one semester, however, lack of sufficient funds to support his school efforts, waning interest in and increasing boredom with the subject at hand took its toll. He left school and sold silk hose door to door for six months.

Knowles met and married Hulda Fornell a year after he was graduated from Harvard. She had attended another school and was from a Swedish immigrant family. Her father was a leader in the Swedish labor movement. According to Knowles, she managed to educate him in liberal politics.

#### THE TESTING YEARS 1938-1946

Parallel in time to the above events the United States government was launching the National Youth Administration Poverty Program (NYA). The NYA was the youth division of the Works Progress Administration. For the period from 1935-1940, Knowles was Director of the Massachusetts NYA Recreational Leadership Institute. As such he was in charge of managing and innovating the training and work programs of these Massachusetts youth. The climate of the NYA, under the direction of compassionate Eddy Casey, was congenial toward anything that would help youth. Consequently, Knowles was able to build a model of an innovative program that was

followed by other states in the NYA.<sup>8</sup>

Eduard C. Lindeman

Eduard C. Lindeman, educational director of the WPA, held workshops and conferences for all of those working in poverty programs. At one of these events Lindeman had one of his former students give a copy of his book, The Meaning of Adult Education to Knowles. The theme of this book has been cited earlier. There is no evidence of what immediate effects this book had on Knowles. However, a statement by him over thirty years later: "I still go back to that book as many people go to the Bible for inspiration,"<sup>9</sup> offers a clue to the long range effects.

A careful reading of Lindeman's book drives one to the conclusion that it expresses the utilitarian philosophy in the specific area of adult education. If, as has been stated earlier, Knowles had already become utilitarian in his philosophy, then it seems safe to assume this is one reason he found Lindeman's ideas on adult education quite compatible. This also could have set the stage for later emerging developments in Knowles' philosophy and practice of adult education.

Time and events do not stand still. Eddy Casey was at some earlier time the head football coach of Harvard. The Washington Redskins football coaching offer now lured Casey away from NYA. A man named Donovan was appointed to take Casey's post in NYA. The question of the purpose of

---

<sup>8</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, private interview held in his home, Newton Highlands, Massachusetts, November, 1969. (The development of the model was influenced by John Dewey's idea of education as self-directed inquiry. The model: The work projects of twenty hours a week became the content and focus of discussion in the related training programs of twenty hours a week.)

<sup>9</sup>Loc. cit.

the NYA began to be raised by Donovan. Subsequent events and developments in the NYA new management policies were completely incongruent and intolerable to one (Knowles) who had a "social usefulness" philosophy.

The Boston YMCA was primarily a youth education organization. They had, however, started an adult education program they called "Association School." They were in need of someone to direct this new program.

Until this time, Knowles' educational and service work had been primarily involved with youth. However, given the facts that he had become a Utilitarian in philosophy, had contact with Lindeman, read the book on adult education, had experience in educational work, and what he felt were deteriorating conditions in NYA, Knowles found it natural and easy to take the position in adult education offered to him in 1940 by a traditionally youth institution, the YMCA.

#### Dorothy Hewitt and Kirtley Mather

To get prepared for the new work Knowles read Dorothy Hewitt and Kirtley Mather's book, Adult Education: A Dynamic for Democracy. They emphasized "participative learning," and were discoverers of discussion as an educational technique. The book presented a strong rationale for adult education in its most complete sense as a continuing means for personal development lasting throughout life. Knowles adopted many of Hewitt and Mather's ideas for his initial adult education practice. Some of their more salient points follow.<sup>10</sup>

---

<sup>10</sup> Dorothy Hewitt and Kirtley F. Mather, Adult Education: A Dynamic for Democracy, (New York: D. Appleton-Century Co., Inc., 1937), p. 14.

First, human beings possess physical, intellectual and aesthetic potentialities which must have a chance to mature if persons are to live to the full rather than merely exist.<sup>11</sup> Second, the prime aim of adult education is to help develop the kind of social arrangement where the genuine powers of people may be realized for themselves and they would in turn not tolerate social situations that prevent their fellow-beings from doing likewise.<sup>12</sup> Third, when people meet together in groups the give and take which comes from mind meeting mind produces a group spirit with dynamic quality and greater results than that attainable in isolation. Each is a resource for the learning of others.<sup>13</sup> Fourth, the informal discussion method then was at the pioneering edge of adult education, the best method for exploiting the resources of the learners.<sup>14</sup>

This work in adult education at Boston YMCA was Knowles' opportunity to test his pioneering innovative spirit initially gained as a boy in Montana. He could work with adults—he had worked with youth before. He could test and see whether the discussion method would do what Hewitt and Mather claimed. It was exciting and he was ready to capitalize on the opportunity. The emphasis on man's untapped potential and adult education as a way of tapping that potential, propelled Knowles into adult education.

Within the span of three years, programming and recreational experience with the YMCA helped Knowles develop concepts and techniques

---

<sup>11</sup>Ibid., p. 12.

<sup>12</sup>Ibid., pp. 12, 19.

<sup>13</sup>Ibid., pp. 107, 108.

<sup>14</sup>Ibid., p. 113.

that would continue to be a part of his practice for many years. One of the earliest and most picturesque experiences of realizing what characteristics made for a good teacher involved a course in astronomy. The first time he engaged, as a teacher, a student from Harvard majoring in astronomy. By dryly reading his lecture notes to the students he managed to kill the course because almost everyone stayed away in disgust. Knowles rescheduled, with success, the astronomy course with another teacher who was excitedly interested in people and their curiosities surrounding astronomy.

By 1943 the crescendo of World War II was obvious. The United States of America was deeply involved. In order to fulfill, in utilitarian terms, his desire to be useful to the war effort Knowles took a job with the U.S.O. in Detroit, Michigan. His work there included recreation and educational programming for service personnel.

During his stay in Detroit he enrolled in some courses at the nearby University of Michigan. Professor Arthur Dunham, pioneer in community organization, helped Knowles to think of the community as an organic entity, a client, a social system capable of being influenced as a unit.

#### Alvin Johnson

In 1945, the pressure of the war became sufficient that Knowles enlisted in the United States Navy as a Communications Officer. He was in service for one and a half years. Several months of his service hitch were spent in an Oceanside, California hospital bed with an ulcer.

Some of that time he occupied by reading. One book, just off the press, that was to be of great significance to him was The Clock of



History by Alvin Johnson. Johnson was the president of the New York School of Social Research and considered by some as a patron saint of adult education. It will be necessary to include more historical setting and some references from Johnson to gain the overview of his influence on Knowles.

The most devastating hot war of human history had just concluded. Yet the world had not been made totally safe for democracy. The cold war was yet to emerge. The recovery from the great economic depression of the 1930's still had some ground to gain. Traditionalism remained strong in American primary, secondary and higher education despite the noble efforts of the progressive-education movement. Even though the United States constitution, the "most magnificent asset in the possession of democratic freedom, was established to secure the blessings of liberty," the freedom and development of all individuals was far from complete.

The Clock of History is a collection of articles. Each article was attached to some current event, looking beyond the event to meanings and values. The articles had appeared over a period of fourteen years in the newsletter of the New School.

The Clock of History was Johnson's rationale for adult education as a life-long process being needed to keep democracy alive, which in turn affords the most favorable seedbed for developing the individual. He contended that adult education could: help the democracy to make better individualists<sup>15</sup> who are the key to human values;<sup>16</sup> improve democracy's

---

<sup>15</sup>Alvin Johnson, The Clock of History (New York: W. W. Norton and Co., Inc., 1946), p. 123.

<sup>16</sup>Ibid., p. 108.

lights for peace;<sup>17</sup> revive fine American courage;<sup>18</sup> forestall depression; and, keep our minds supple through the next unexpected strains.<sup>19</sup>

In addition to these salient points, Knowles was deeply influenced by the fact that adult education needed much energy put into it to help it develop, mature, grow, become organized, differentiated and defined as a field. While much work was being done, Johnson emphasized that adult education needed to be professionalized and developed by scholars who would prepare themselves and expend their energies to these ends.

Johnson suggested a chief function of adult education is breaking down the psychological barriers between the intellectually elite and realistic human who needs to learn.<sup>20</sup> Lindeman contended that the resource of highest value for learning in adult education is the learner's experience,<sup>21</sup> and the adult educator is a non-authoritarian guide who shares with others in the learning experience.<sup>22</sup> There were still strained conditions in the world at the end of the great war. These things converged and Knowles gives this descriptive account of what happened to him:

I saw adult education as being: (1) the most exciting and fermenting of the fields; (2) the field offering the most opportunity for self-expression, innovation and experimentation; (3) the field most in need of development. I got a glimmer of myself as a field builder. Johnson stimulated me to think theoretically about what I had learned in principles for practice: the kinds of people who

---

<sup>17</sup>Ibid., pp. 54-55.

<sup>18</sup>Ibid., p. 48.

<sup>19</sup>Ibid., p. 169.

<sup>20</sup>Ibid., pp. 216-217.

<sup>21</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, pp. 4-7.

<sup>22</sup>Robert Gesaner, ed., The Democratic Man in Selected Writings of Eduard C. Lindeman (Boston: Beacon Press, 1956), p. 33.

made good and bad teachers, and what are the processes by which good programs get developed. I got the flash insight that what I had been doing, but didn't know it, was adult education. It had been exploratory. I had explored law, diplomacy, youth work, adult education and social work. Johnson was the final stimulus that gave me the commitment to make adult education a lifetime vocation. So, by gosh, I decided that I wanted to be a professional adult educator!<sup>23</sup>

Knowles had thought deeply about the meaning of life and his total life experience converged at this time of pause in his life and he was ready to give himself to what he considered vital. With his pioneering spirit and his bias for people-oriented work, it is probable that he could only have become a religious minister or an adult educator. It was as if Lindeman's The Meaning of Adult Education was predictive and would actually come true in his life.

...People...find life's meaning...in the things for which they strive, the goals which they set for themselves, their wants, needs, desires and wishes.<sup>24</sup>

To become a professional in the very young emerging profession of adult education would be an ambition which would require a great deal of effort.

It is not without significance that the two main influences (Lindeman and Johnson) which converged upon Knowles in his decision to become an adult educator are from what Webster Cotton calls two different traditions: (1) Lindeman from the social reformist; and (2) Johnson from the professional.<sup>25</sup> Cotton considered the major task facing American

---

<sup>23</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, private interviews, May, 1968 and November, 1969.

<sup>24</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 8.

<sup>25</sup>Webster E. Cotton, "The Challenge Confronting American Adult Education," Adult Education Journal, Vol. XIV, No. 3 (Winter, 1964), p. 64.

adult education in this most critical phase of development from 1961 onward as being the need to draw upon the positive characteristics of these two traditions in adult education.

While Knowles' actually began his full time adult education teaching career in 1960, he had been getting a good foundation since he made the initial decision for adult education in 1946. This combination of two traditions may offer one clue to his place in the adult education field. After he made the decision to become an adult educator, other influences were to follow.

#### THE PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT YEARS 1946-1960

The time had arrived for Malcolm S. Knowles to be discharged from the U. S. Navy. This would also be a time to see whether or not his commitment to become a professional adult educator would be followed. To become a professional in a young emerging profession meant that there was no cut and dried kind of adult educator to become. There were no precise standards to be met. This meant he could pioneer and set criteria for himself.

It was as if Lindeman was predictive of Knowles' criteria.

...Viewed from the standpoint of adult education, such personalities seem to want among other things, intelligence, power, self-expression, freedom, creativity, appreciation, enjoyment, fellowship. Or stated in terms of the Greek ideal, they are searchers after the good life. They want to count for something; they want their experiences to be vivid and meaningful; they want their talents to be utilized; they want to know beauty and joy; and they want all of these realizations of their total personalities to be shared in communities of fellowship. Briefly they want to improve themselves; this is their realistic and primary aim. But they want also to change the social order so that vital personalities

will be creating a new environment in which their aspirations may be properly expressed.<sup>\*26</sup>

### Chicago

One of Knowles' special emphasis would be for himself to be an adult educator of the social change agent variety--change society from part to wholly educative. Stated another way, he would expend his efforts to remove the barriers that keep society from having a totally educative environment--a Utilitarian concept.

Knowles inquired and learned that, according to his criteria, the best graduate program in adult education at that time was at the University of Chicago. He also needed to work full time to support his wife and child. He wrote to the YMCA in Chicago indicating his availability for employment. He was hired as Director of Adult Education.

Knowles began his work at the Chicago YMCA on Monday, June 10, 1946, and enrolled in a master's degree program in adult education at the University of Chicago on Tuesday, June 11, 1946.

### Carl Rogers

Knowles gained from Rogers the belief in the great potential of man, that man's behavior is exquisitely rational, especially in a person to person relationship.<sup>27</sup>

---

<sup>26</sup> Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 9.

<sup>27</sup> Carl Rogers, "Toward Becoming a Fully Functioning Person," in Behavioral Science and the Manager's Role, ed. by William D. Eddy, et al. (Washington, D. C.: NTL Institute for Applied Behavioral Science, 1969), p. 52.

\*Italics this author's for special emphasis on Knowles' change agent style.

The beliefs of "the constructive forward moving tendency of human beings"<sup>28</sup> and "doing what feels right"<sup>29</sup> which were actually practiced in Roger's classes at the University of Chicago were immensely helpful and the end of a long period of tension in Knowles. He remembers,

In 1936, I felt like being warm and accepting of people. The social system put pressure on me to be judgmental and cold toward people. During the twelve years from 1936 to 1947 I went through great tension between what I wanted to be and what I thought I ought to be. Carl Rogers gave me congruency. I found it was all right to behave like I want to behave.<sup>30</sup>

In that span of time he became aware of the need for counseling in adult education. It was there he acquired his real deep commitment to the notion of self-direction. It was then he realized the deep need every adult has to be self-accepting, self-respecting and therefore accepted and respected by others.

Prior to this exposure and experience he had thought of education operationally in terms of what needs to be done to get a good program built. Now he began to think about the dynamics of the human being; what motivates people to learn; what the dynamics are of transferring these and all learnings from a classroom situation to a life situation.

Knowles received his Master of Arts degree in adult education in the Division of Social Sciences from the University of Chicago in 1949. His social change agent style was being shaped by these events as it was by additional events.

---

<sup>28</sup>Ibid., p. 61.

<sup>29</sup>Ibid., pp. 57, 61.

<sup>30</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, private interview, November 16, 1969.

### Cyril Houle

The research competency he gained in the Chicago years was directly attributable to his major professor, Cyril Houle. From him, Knowles also gained three other things: (1) Insight into the nature of the field of adult education; (2) understanding that adult education was a social field in the process of being shaped; and (3) help in his movement development process.

### Robert Havighurst

Knowles' concept of self-direction in adult learning found expansion with Robert Havighurst's Developmental Tasks and Education. The readiness to learn is dependent upon an individuals' teachable moment, when the body is ripe, society requires and the self is ready.<sup>31</sup> This also convinced him that packaged educational programs are to be suspect and will likely be dysfunctional.

### Robert Redfield

The expansion of Knowles' thinking about community systems and subsystems or what Lindeman referred to as "communities of fellowship" came at the hand of Robert Redfield in anthropology.

Redfield declares:

...the folk society is a little world off by itself, a world in which the recurrent problems of life from birth to death are met by all its members in much the same inter-related way resulting in a coherent and self-consistent system.<sup>32</sup>

---

<sup>31</sup>Robert J. Havighurst, Developmental Tasks and Education (New York: David McKay Company, Inc., 1952), pp. 4-5.

<sup>32</sup>Robert Redfield, "The Folk Society," in Cultural Anthropology, Vol II of Readings in Anthropology, ed. by Morton H. Fried (2 vols.; New York: Thomas H. Crowell Company, 1968), p. 503.

Knowles gained a sense of the integrity and authenticity of subcultures as having character and worth of their own because of their ability to meet the needs of the human beings involved.

Knowles received his Doctor of Philosophy degree in Adult Education in the Department of Education, from the University of Chicago in 1960.

#### National Training Laboratories and Leland Bradford

Another strong influence upon Knowles was the National Training Laboratories Institute for Applied Behavioral Science. His first T-group experience was in 1947 during a group dynamics laboratory as part of his Master's program conducted by Herbert Thelen at the University of Chicago. His next exposure came in a group at the 1949 Purdue meeting of the National Education Association Department of Adult Education. Thomas Van Zant, the program chairman for that year had arranged T-groups to be organized in the midst of the meeting. Despite the fact that in those days there was much threat in T-groups to most adult education people, Kenneth Benne remembers,

Malcolm was quite excited about it. He was ready for it. He found no shock in it. He entered into it with great gusto. He was very enthusiastic. His great feeling was that this direction was all right for adult education.<sup>33</sup>

Knowles became very much identified with the NTL Institute staff. When he became Administrative Coordinator of the new Adult Education Association, he also became Project Director of Adult Leadership.

Adult Leadership was made possible at a low subscription cost by a generous \$188,000 grant for two years from the Fund for Adult Education,

---

<sup>33</sup> Kenneth D. Benne, private interview at the Human Relations Center, Boston University, Boston, Massachusetts, November 18, 1969.



established by Ford Foundation. The development of Adult Leadership reflected some basic group leadership ideas held by the Staff Team and Operations Committee. The basic editorial goals were that the magazine contents be training materials dealing with practical problems of groups and leaders. As such these materials were intended "to be read, yes, but, above all, to be used as instruments of self-training and as resources and tools for better leadership."<sup>34</sup>

These editorial goals were developed in a series of three-day meetings attended by members of the Staff Team and Operations Committee. When the outlines for the first and subsequent issues of the magazine were determined a number of people with broad experience in various fields were asked to meet and collaborate on producing the materials for the contents.<sup>35</sup> These people became known as the issue committees. The membership changed each month depending on the theme for a given month and the needed expertise. Knowles, as Project Director of Adult Leadership, leaned heavily upon NTL for staffing the issue committees of Adult Leadership.

Knowles became involved in the laboratory education activities sponsored by NTL Institute located at Bethel, Maine. National Training Laboratories in general, and Leland Bradford in particular, have helped him to enlarge the Rogers' influence with other things: (1) Conceiving the target of education as being the change of behavior; (2) picturing the transaction of the learning experience as dynamic between teacher,

---

<sup>34</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "What! Another Magazine?," Adult Leadership, Vol. I, May, 1952, p. 1.

<sup>35</sup>Ibid., inside cover.

learner and learning group; and (3) emphasizing the differences between deterrents and facilitators to learning. These also found rootage in many of the ideas Lindeman had expressed and by which Knowles had already been influenced.

Individual growth and change in behavior as the educational target is broader than cognitive learning.<sup>36</sup> Knowles knew this would require a method of self-diagnosis and self-determination as to where changes would be made.<sup>37</sup>

It was in the working relationship with Bradford that Knowles gained the insight into teaching being a human relational activity engaging teachers and learners:

...in a complex process of exploration and diagnosis of needs for and resistances to learning and change; of experimentation and fact finding; of testing and planning for utilization of learning and change in the life of the individual. The relationships among learners and between teacher and learners have a great deal to do with the ultimate learning.<sup>38</sup>

In regard to facilitators and deterrents to learning and change, Knowles saw that the difference comes at the point where the class group does or does not accept the common task of group learning. Learning can come only from social interaction. Where competition is emphasized,

---

<sup>36</sup>Leland P. Bradford, "The Teaching-Learning Transaction," Human Forces in Teaching and Learning, ed. by Leland P. Bradford (Washington, D.C.: National Training Laboratories, 1961), pp. 5-15.

<sup>37</sup>Leland P. Bradford, "Toward a Philosophy of Adult Education," Seeking Common Ground in Adult Education, ed. by Robertsen Sillars (Chicago: Adult Education Association in the U.S.A., 1958), p. 99.

<sup>38</sup>Bradford, "The Teaching-Learning Transaction," op. cit., p. 5.

learning is deterred.<sup>39</sup> Where collaboration is emphasized, learning is enhanced.<sup>40</sup>

Knowles reflected and identified eight main sources of help to him as a teacher of adults. These were: (1) research in psychotherapy, (2) developmental psychology, (3) literature on group dynamics and organizational change, (4) educational philosophy, (5) literature on learning theory, (6) research on program development and evaluation, (7) systems theory, and (8) development of competency models in adult education. However, some of these helps were less prominent than others. Some also came much later in his professional career than others.<sup>41</sup>

#### SUMMARY

The shaping of Knowles as an adult educator, his experiences of receiving personal influence and his emerging beliefs, came about in three stages. First, the early years in Montana, Florida, and Harvard set the stage for his becoming a pioneer in something he considered useful. He tried diplomacy and left it.

Second, he tested social work and adult education. He received a glimpse of what adult education could be and his social philosophy from Eduard C. Lindeman. He gained satisfactions from his own adult

---

<sup>39</sup>Leland P. Bradford, "Developing Potentialities Through Class Groups," Human Forces in Teaching and Learning, ed. by Leland P. Bradford (Washington, D. C.: National Training Laboratories, 1961), p. 34.

<sup>40</sup>Ibid., p. 35.

<sup>41</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Research in Adult Education: New Perspectives and Directions--The Relevance of Research for the Adult Education Teacher/Trainer." Adult Leadership, February, 1972, pp. 270-272, 302.

education work experiments. He perceived adult education's need for professional field development from Alvin Johnson, and committed his life to adult education's development.

Third, he prepared himself professionally to become the best possible adult educator. He took Masters and Doctorate degrees in adult education from the University of Chicago. He also developed himself in laboratory training with the National Training Laboratories Institute for Applied Behavioral Science.

The following chapters are an attempt to search in depth Knowles' contributions to the emerging field of adult education.

### CHAPTER III

#### FIELD BUILDING BY A PIONEER IN ADULT EDUCATION

Malcolm S. Knowles' choice to become a professional adult educator was a free choice. That freedom was not, as many people conceive of freedom, freedom from an obstacle. People exist within a natural environment and all their behavior is a response to, and a function of, the multitudinous stimuli which arise either within or without their bodies and operate according to laws which are dimly understood.

To draw upon Lindeman for perspective:

Freedom is a creative relatedness between personality and the manageable aspects of the universe. Since nothing possesses meaning save in relation to something else, it follows that freedom becomes significant when viewed in relation to its proper references. To be free from bondage is preliminary; dynamic freedom stirs the personality in the direction of the radical, causative, originaive activity. The function of freedom is to create.<sup>1</sup>

With all the forces and events impinging upon Knowles, he became a dynamic free man, free in the sense that he established a creative relationship with manageable aspects of the adult education universe.

The function of his freedom would be to create or build parts of the adult education field that did not already exist. This would not be a creation for but with the field of adult education. His creation would not be one of discarding old patterns of behavior in favor of new: rather he would combine old patterns of behavior with the result that new

---

<sup>1</sup>Eduard C. Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education (Montreal: Harvest House, 1961), pp. 128-129. [First Printed in 1926, by New Republic, Inc., New York.]

patterns would emerge. As Lindeman says, "We live in freedom when we are conscious of a degree of self-direction proportionate to our capacities."<sup>2</sup>

Knowles' work was to be a combination of meeting his own personal needs while he responded to what he perceived as needs of the adult educational field. As has been mentioned previously, he needed to be a pioneer. That became even more obvious to the writer of this study through analysis of Knowles' writing, teaching and conversation. The notion emerged that Knowles' work in adult education could be given a label of "field building." However, there is no formal discipline of field building as there is, for instance, administration.\* The pioneering aspect of Knowles' field building work extended even to its definition.\*\*This is

---

<sup>2</sup>Loc. cit.

\*The excellence of performance of the role of administrator is judged by criteria that have to do with organization health, organization performance, organization productivity, organization growth, size of membership, adequacy of financing.

\*\*To refrain from interrupting the flow of the paper a definition of field building is attempted below. The role of a field builder (which may also be called movement builder, movement developer, movement stimulator, field developer, catalytic agent or field stimulator) has such functions as: (1) presenting visions, of what the field could become, to be tested by elements of the field. These visions would be adopted or rejected; (2) conceptualizing, theorizing about the field, (3) construct generating; that is engaging the field in the process of self-analysis, self-definition, goal or aspiration setting for the field, what direction the field wants to move in; what is the goal of the field as a total system of organization.

The criteria by which one measures the effectiveness of the performance of the role of field builder is evidence over time that the elements of the field: (1) are indeed working toward more common goals; (2) are working more collaboratively with each other; (3) are defining themselves as a part of a unified whole; (4) are working toward some common ends that are outside and above the goals of the particular institution that pays for them. (This conception and tentative definition was formulated by the author in conversation with the subject, Malcolm S. Knowles.)

(Another concept of field building was given to the writer by Dr. Cyril Houle, at the University of Chicago when the writer was interviewing

not to say Knowles' saw himself as the only, or even the first, field builder in adult education. There were, and are, other field builders. Morse Cartwright and Frederick Keppel with the American Association of Adult Education were among the first. Horace Mann was a field builder for the public school system. Jane Addams was builder for the field of Social Work. However, there was no field building formal discipline.

Knowles' adult education field building activities, then, would be developed in the setting of three different institutions: the Chicago YMCA, the Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., and Boston University. The results and spin-offs would reach beyond the boundaries of these three institutions into the field of adult education.

The purpose of this chapter is to analyze Knowles' contributions to the field of adult education as revealed by the data available in his and others' writings.

#### CHICAGO, CENTRAL YMCA

The vision of himself as an adult education field builder led Knowles immediately into a vital relationship with this field. He chose the University of Chicago for formal adult education training because he

---

(note continued from previous page)  
 Houle regarding Knowles). A system builder has to have one of two traits: (1) The capacity to dig in endlessly to the roots of things in order to find out and be aware of all the evidence and then put it together into a systematic idea; (2) to have tied up in one's basic personality such a marvelously selective mechanism that one knows what is right without knowing why it is right. It is a learned, quick, thoughtful grasp of what is, and what is not, important so one has an immediate selectivity. It is like perceiving in flashing insight, and designing the fabric of relationships out of the claps of thunder. Houle felt that Knowles was more like the second one described. He also said that only time would tell what impact Knowles' work would have on the field of adult education.

felt it was the best available at that time. He applied for the position of Director of Adult Education to the YMCA in Chicago. He was chosen by the responsible hiring committee because he appeared to be the "best bet"<sup>3</sup> of those applying. Chicago Central YMCA had their headquarters in the heart of the "loop" downtown. They had decided to build up their educational program and had issued requests for applicants.

Knowles had worked during his "testing years" at the Boston YMCA as an adult educator. This experience was useful in preparing him for his adult education work at Chicago Central YMCA.

As a means of getting his adult education work started at Central YMCA, Knowles used the first two months to conduct a community need survey. He made personal visits to leaders of the surrounding area. In that process he asked such questions as: What is going on in adult education?; Who is doing what adult education now?; What courses could Central YMCA provide? Knowles once said that conducting the survey was one of the smartest things he ever did to build a strong community supported program. It made him acquainted with others in the area, involved them in the planning of his program, and established cooperative, rather than competitive, relationships with them immediately. When the first group of ten courses were offered in the YMCA program each person who had been consulted looked to see if his suggestion was included in the list.

Knowles' philosophy in the YMCA program was that one could build an open door policy of adult education. As such, the program would be without any stuffiness or triviality of criteria and would simply try to

---

<sup>3</sup>Cyril O. Houle, private interview held in his office, University of Chicago, Chicago, Illinois, April, 1970.



provide a wide ranging adult educational program. The relatively conservative Chicago YMCA board of directors supported him in this and granted him an open door contract. Roosevelt University had only recently dissolved its relationship with the YMCA because it was so extremely restrictive. The YMCA policy had been to prohibit negroes from swimming in the YMCA pool. Knowles began operating within the givens where not very much was given. He had to create an institution which from the start would develop a broad based structure.<sup>4</sup>

The first year of the program, Knowles put on ten fairly staple courses. As these succeeded he put on additional courses, allowing time for a growing edge. He sowed a budget so that the basic cost of his program could be carried by eighty or ninety per cent of the courses. This allowed about a ten per cent margin for growth. In that ten per cent margin he would try to find unusual, adventuresome things he thought might be on the growing edge. That was pioneering. He took into account the realities of the situation that had to do with budgeting and moving ahead in development.

He started with a modest ten course, eighteen section, first term offering with 388 enrolled for the total year 1946-47. By 1950-51, his last year, he built that to over 100 courses, 268 sections with a total enrollment of 3,970 participants.

In a YMCA staff appraisal form completed in August, 1951, his high points were: conducting informal education activities, ability to teach, good showmanship, resourcefulness, poise, work capacity, social concern and leadership. The appraisal further stated that as a capable executive,

---

<sup>4</sup>Loc. cit.

he had made an increasingly good job of cooperation with laymen and staff at the Central Department. It also declared him an outstanding secretary with a creative mind which "blazes new trails in the YMCA."<sup>5</sup> This same August, 1951, staff appraisal, rated him low on his exercise of judgment, setting priorities for action, taking care of his physical health, and managing the business operations, building and equipment of the YMCA.

Under Points for Improvement some suggestions made by the YMCA raters were:

Has a tendency to take on outside activities which compete for his time--should balance his interest in new and creative ideas with the necessary day to day routine of administration--may tend toward the theoretical rather than the practical, realistic operating details of his job--should be closer to the actual supervision of controls of the department organization--should safe-guard his health in face of demands for professional time and his professional ability.<sup>6</sup>

By the time this evaluation had been written Knowles was considered an expert in adult education. As such he was in increasing demand as a speaker across the country. He was teaching at Northwestern University summer session, active on Chicago's Adult Education Council and was involved in the activities of forming the new Adult Education Association. This seems to support the idea that while he was hired as a program administrator, he found himself diminishing that role in favor of the field building role. He was not only in field building outside the YMCA organization, but was doing the same thing within the YMCA organization. This was made clear in an interview with Cyril Houle. He suggested that Knowles was a very systematic operator. While building

---

<sup>5</sup>Letter to Malcolm S. Knowles, August 1, 1951, from Archie B. Beck.

<sup>6</sup>loc. cit.

the YMCA program he thought systematically about such a thing as promotion. The two men developed and taught one course a number of times. The procedure in the class was to talk about the mechanics, routines and operations of adult education. They dealt with a number of questions in class while he also tested them in building the total YMCA program. Among the issues considered were: Where are the best places to put the promotion for the kinds of programs one is going to have? How does one go about finding new instructors? How does one go about morale in an institution where people come in for a course and then leave? How does one build collective decision making in a similar kind of institution?

As Cyril Houle remembers:

Knowles quite systematically took the ideas that most of us think of as being good sound educational practice and worked them out in his institution. Then in this series of seminars that he and I led we would present some ideas. Then other people who were there, who were running adult education programs in the community would build upon them, discuss and talk about them.<sup>7</sup>

Out of this kind of process of directly getting his hands dirty with the work, of talking it over, thinking about it, he built it into a theory of what Merton would call "the middle range," or a limited range of data. In this case the middle range theory was one of combining what many considered good sound educational practice with practical facets of promotion with the result of building a flourishing adult education program. To give the sense of development and historical perspective it may be said that this worked for Knowles in building the YMCA adult education program and could be expected to work when practiced and applied in other institutional adult education programs.

---

<sup>7</sup>Cyril O. Houle, private interview, April, 1970.

### Informal Adult Education - The Book

The materials developed in the course taught by Knowles and Houle ultimately were published in Knowles' first book, Informal Adult Education. This book was not only a statement of what worked in the YMCA adult education program, but was Knowles' way of saying to the adult education field that the principles tested in the YMCA would work in other institutions. In fact, if adult education wanted to grow and expand in its influence, Knowles was saying that here was one way of helping it happen.

Some of the thinking and ideas in that book had been said before by others; however, Knowles combined the materials about sound educational practice and promotion, as Benne says, "in a fresh, vivid and influential way."<sup>8</sup> As late as 1959, Benjamin Shangold was quoted as calling Informal Adult Education "a landmark in the development of adult education practice."<sup>9</sup> It made things seem practical and feasible. This is what the field of adult education needed at that time. The book became a practical guidebook for adult education practitioners in a variety of institutions.

A closer analysis of the contents of the book reveals the fact that Knowles' drew from a lot of other peoples' ideas and thinking. It also indicated his emerging emphasis in the sources from which he drew. There were thirty nine references to other writings which formed an integral part of the book. The sources most heavily drawn upon were:

---

<sup>8</sup> Kenneth D. Benne, private interview held at his office, Boston University, Boston, Massachusetts, November 18, 1969.

<sup>9</sup> Adult Leadership, February, 1959, p. 248.  
Note: This quote was used by Association Press, New York, advertising Knowles book Informal Adult Education. Adult Education was listed as the source of the quote although no volume, number, page or context was included.

(1) Research on the psychology of adulthood; (2) The research of emerging group dynamics methods in teaching adults; (3) The dynamic use of practicing a democratic philosophy in planning, organizing, executing and evaluating an adult education program.

The elements he included in the first chapter of the book gave a clue to the perspective of his contribution. Knowles indicated his feeling that each adult group must become a "laboratory of democracy."<sup>10</sup>

Knowles drew from Lindeman to state what individual adults want:

...intelligence, power, self-expression, freedom, creativity, appreciation, enjoyment, fellowship...to count for something... their talents to be utilized...to know beauty and joy...all of these realizations of their total personalities to be shared in communities of fellowship...to improve themselves...<sup>11</sup>

It is obvious, when one looks at the above statement, that it is true of adults at any age and in any generation.

Following the statement by Lindeman, Knowles added some of his own interpretation and ideas. These were mainly his thoughts that adults have a desire for educational experience in the program involvement in an organization. The function of the program director is not of "educating people but...helping them to learn."<sup>12</sup> Next, he drew from Johnson to indicate the adult function in a democratic society:

Adult education...becomes more important every year....We Americans are committed to democracy...the people cannot leave it to the rulers to decide on political issues...the responsibility...

---

<sup>10</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, Informal Adult Education (New York: Association Press, 1950), p. 70.

<sup>11</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, pp. 13-14.

<sup>12</sup>Knowles, Informal Adult Education, p. 6.

rests with us, the people. We cannot carry this responsibility properly unless we educate ourselves.<sup>13</sup>

For a challenge Knowles suggests that every adult group must become a laboratory of democracy where each may have an experience of living cooperatively. More than that, he emphasizes a group as a living organism, capable of growth as humans.

The remainder of the book Knowles combines a potpourri of new methods discovered and research in group dynamics that embodies the development (organic growth) of democracy while enabling adults to mature. The book is liberally sprinkled with forty three illustrations of dynamic adult education programs from all over the United States.

This book was an illustration of Knowles fulfilling the adult education scholar's function as seen by Johnson:

...he must put away every impulse of forming a cast apart...but improve and adapt techniques of instruction to the mature mind... and speak intelligibly to a group of laymen.<sup>14</sup>

Knowles was able to build an effective adult education institution. Even more crucially, he was able to communicate to other people how this was done.

#### Twentieth Anniversary Celebration

In Central YMCA Knowles set the foundations for an adult education program so firmly that they still survive. This is a prototype adult education institution for a number of other institutions.

On November 15, 1966, a twentieth anniversary jubilee dinner was

---

<sup>13</sup>Alvin Johnson, The Clock of History (New York: W. W. Norton and Co., Inc., 1946), p. 226.

<sup>14</sup>Ibid., pp. 194. 211.

held for the Central YMCA Learning For Living Program honoring Malcolm S. Knowles, founder. He had been gone from Central for fifteen years. The program had grown from the start of ten courses with 200 students to 500 classes and 7,000 students.<sup>15</sup> It is obvious he built an institution that survived and even grew after his departure. The name of the program "Learning For Living" had not changed.

Knowles' involvement and work in Central YMCA also laid the foundation for a continuing work relationship in National YMCA structure. He has maintained this relationship through continued staff development and the Organization Development Project in the 1960's. This will be developed in later sections of this chapter.

One comment Knowles made concerning the YMCA environment may offer a clue to his success with that institution.

I have always, with only one exception, found the 'Y' to be a completely supportive environment--one that encouraged and rewarded innovations and initiative. They were never interested in cutting you down, hurting you, showing you up, embarrassing you. You could always depend on their being people of good will.<sup>16</sup>

One of the primary emphases of Knowles' work has been the building of "an educative environment," an idea stemming from Lindeman which the YMCA experience reinforced.

To experience the "hand-in-glove" success Knowles did with Central YMCA and Informal Adult Education certainly gave him a sense of satisfaction and accomplishment. It also gave him a sense of security and independence of viewpoint that brought him to light in adult

---

<sup>15</sup>Evanston Review: A Newspaper (Evanston, Ill.), Dec. 1, 1966.

<sup>16</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, private interview held in his home, Newton Highlands, Massachusetts, November, 1969.

education circles. Without question this influenced his becoming administrative coordinator of the newly formed Adult Education Association in the U.S.A.

#### ADULT EDUCATION ASSOCIATION OF THE U.S.A.

The Department of Adult Education, National Education Association had been in operation since 1924. The American Association for Adult Education had been in operation since 1926. Both institutions were seeking in their own way to represent the concerns of the emerging adult education movement in the United States. There was concern, however, that neither was truly and totally representative.

In May, 1949 a Joint Committee from both organizations was formed "to study and make recommendations regarding the establishment of a single, new, over-all adult education organization adequately representative of the entire adult education field in the United States."<sup>17</sup>

#### Formation of a New Organization

The final recommendations of that Joint Committee resulted in the formation of the Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., May 14, 1951, in Columbus, Ohio.

Not only was it a new organization, but some unusual processes were used that are not ordinarily used in organization formation and development. According to Malcolm S. Knowles, still employed by the Chicago YMCA, this formation:

---

<sup>17</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, Year One, AEA. First Annual Report of the Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., Chicago, Illinois, June 1, 1951 to May 31, 1952 (Chicago, Illinois: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1952), p. 7.



...was the climactic act in a process that is probably unique in the history of organization development. For the first time, to my knowledge, the fruits of the recent research in group dynamics<sup>18</sup> were used consciously in the founding of a national organization.

The consuming concern of the Founding Assembly was to avoid mistakes of the past, as they perceived them, control by the few, over-emphasis on national needs and achievements, centralization in a "Mecca," pressure toward conformity to a blueprint, and rigid organization.

In creating a machinery of government for the Adult Education Association, the members of the Founding Assembly were guided by several general principles:

1. A structure should be erected that will be sensitive to the real and changing needs of the members, the movement, and society. Procedures for continuously evaluating needs and services should be built into the basic structure.
2. Participation in making decisions should be on a broad base. Control over policy and program must be kept in the membership, either directly or through their elected representatives, and must not be allowed to become centralized, through default, in any small group.
3. The interests and welfare of local organizations and workers must at all times be the governing considerations in decision making. Organization structure and policy must provide for much diversity within national unity.<sup>19</sup>

To further make sure the new organization started well, the Assembly adopted a constitution. It stated:

The purpose of the association shall be to further the concept of education as a process continuing throughout life by affording to educators of adults and other interested persons opportunities to increase their competence; by encouraging organizations and agencies to develop adult education activities and to work together in the interests of adult education; by receiving and disseminating educational information; by promoting the balanced development of

---

<sup>18</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Research in Group Dynamics Used in Founding New Adult Education Association," The Nation's Schools Magazine, July, 1951, pp. 60, 62.

<sup>19</sup>Knowles, Year One, AEA, p. 2.

educational services needed by the adult population in the United States; and by cooperating with adult education agencies internationally.<sup>20</sup>

An elaborate organizational structure was also provided for in the Constitution:

A Voting Membership, consisting of individuals and organizations ...which elects representatives to a Delegate Assembly and is the final source of power in the association.

A Delegate Assembly...responsible for formulating the policies of the association.

An Executive Committee...responsible for interpreting and carrying out the policies of the Association as determined by the Delegate Assembly and membership.

A Staff, appointed by the Executive Committee and responsible to it for the execution of its decisions.<sup>21</sup>

Knowles was interviewed for the position of administrative coordinator by the Executive Committee of the founding assembly. He indicated a willingness to accept the position for not more than five years. He felt setting the precedent of defining that role as rotating to be important. This would avoid building AEA around the personality of one man as had been the case of the American Association of Adult Education with Cartwright and the Canadian Association of Adult Education with Corbett.

On September 20, 1951, Knowles began employment in the Chicago office of the new Adult Education Association of the United States of America. His position was stated as Administrative Coordinator\* and Director of the Adult Leadership project.

The Adult Leadership project was, at best, started on a shaky

---

<sup>20</sup>Ibid., p. 4.

<sup>21</sup>Ibid., p. 8.

\*Note: A few years later the title became Executive Director at the insistence of the Fund for Adult Education.

foundation of substantial funding by an outside agency, low priority by leaders of the association as a whole, and lack of a clearly agreed upon purpose for the magazine. The project was

...included in a list of suggested proposals submitted to the Fund for Adult Education. It did not have a very high priority among the leaders of the association as a whole, many of whom felt its purpose, audience and relationship to the association needed a clearer definition than the proposal had developed....The Fund... adopted the suggestion for such a magazine as a major project. Its subsidy made the resultant publication, *Adult Leadership*, of central importance, surrounded it with an aura of unique significance, and gave it an existence as such, rather than as a part of AEA.<sup>22</sup>

With its control not being in the AEA Executive Committee, its accepted purpose became a medium of training to communicate skills in as practical, understanding and useful a way as possible. Its audience was intended to be the countless number who were doing adult education but had not had the opportunity of any specific training for the work.<sup>23</sup>

An additional problem was present. The pressure of activating a new organization resulted in assembling a full staff without benefit of a systematic statement of personnel policies and practices. By the end of the first year of AEA it was obvious "there was a growing need for such a statement,"<sup>24</sup> among other needs. It was not until September 9, 1955, three years later that the Official Personnel Policies, Practices and Procedures of the AEA were adopted. This way of operating an organization may have been partially responsible for emergent problems and confusions

---

<sup>22</sup>Edmund de S. Brunner, et. al., "The Role of a National Organization in Adult Education." A Report to the Executive Committee of the Adult Education Association, p. 52. Chicago: Adult Education Association, 1959. (Mimeographed.)

<sup>23</sup>Ibid., pp. 52-53.

<sup>24</sup>Knowles, Year One, AEA, p. 10.

of AEA. It also may have been necessary for the growth process of an embryonic organization that was started by a merger of two very different organizations.

Knowles' primary functions in the AEA centered in staff relationships, The Fund for Adult Education's relationship with the Adult Leadership project, and his role as organization head in relation to the total field of adult education. These areas shall be considered in turn. They are not mutually exclusive, but are separated for clarity in presentation.

#### Staff Relationships

Without a doubt, this was an opportunity to experiment in the development of a new kind of staff organization and new kinds of staff relationships. This kind of opportunity was in line with Knowles' desire to pioneer and as a fulfillment of, as Lindeman would say, "the need to create."

This experimentation was "not for the sake of being different, but in an effort to build a staff team that will more efficiently serve the needs of the association."<sup>25</sup>

In the first year report of the AEA, Knowles described what was the initial conception of the staff operation. His perceptions and way of reporting provides a clue to some of the problems that subsequently arose in the staff.

What he perceived, himself, was the way he stated his perceptions. However, he stated his perceptions not as his perceptions but as his statement of what the total staff perceived.

---

<sup>25</sup>Lec. cit.

Relationships are based on a one-level system, in which there are no status differences, only differences in functional roles. The function of initiating staff coordination is assigned to one role, but is implemented collaboratively.<sup>26</sup>

A report by the Operations Review Sub-Committee in January, 1956 indicated that this was only one man's perception, which was not held by all the staff.

The report stated:

The AEA has been going through a process of departmentalization for some time, which in a sense has been a process of 'wresting control' from the administrative coordinator. Inadequate delineation of roles and lack of clarity in delegation of responsibility and authority has produced insecurities on the part of the staff members about their relationship with the administrative coordinator.<sup>27</sup>

The one-level system may have worked in some instances, but it was obviously causing an undue amount of distress to the point where its value could be questioned.

Further, in Knowles' year one report he stated, "Staff members are flexible in their roles."<sup>28</sup> But the Operations Sub-committee report said, "Malcolm...tends toward...too great a valuation of 'flexibility' at the sacrifice of 'stability'."<sup>29</sup>

Again, Knowles stated, "The staff members perceive themselves as members of a collaborative team."<sup>30</sup> However, staff members reported, "The pressure of 'little tasks' on the administrative coordinator has caused

---

<sup>26</sup> Loc. cit.

<sup>27</sup> Adult Education Association of the U.S.A. Report of the meeting of the Chicago Staff, January 7-8, 1956, p. 2. (Mimeographed.)

<sup>28</sup> Knowles, Year One, AEA, p. 10.

<sup>29</sup> AEA, Report of the Chicago Staff, p. 3.

<sup>30</sup> Knowles, Year One, AEA, p. 10.

him to make snap judgments which undermine staff confidence in them."<sup>31</sup>

Finally, from Knowles, "The staff group perceives its purpose as being to serve, not to control."<sup>32</sup> Despite his notion that this was so, the staff reports,

The various staff members have different ideas about the goals of the AEA, so that it is difficult for them to feel a sense of common purpose. The staff feels that the administrator has a special responsibility to develop a commonality of purpose, but without merely imposing his conception of the AEA's goals on them.<sup>33</sup>

Despite the fact that there were differing perceptions about what the staff was doing, there was opportunity for open communication and subsequent improvement. There is no discernable evidence that Knowles had initiated a movement in the staff for this feedback. The report indicates, however, that Knowles welcomed the feedback as an invaluable training opportunity for himself.

#### The Fund for Adult Education's relationship to the Adult Leadership Project

The Fund for Adult Education was created in the months prior to the founding of the Adult Education Association. At the closing of the Association's Founding Assembly large amounts of money were granted by the Ford Foundation's Fund for Adult Education to the new Association. The basic work of the AEA was to be financed exclusively by income from membership and direct services.

The grants were to finance special projects such as Adult Leadership, Area Project, Council of National Organizations, Public School

---

<sup>31</sup>AEA, Report of the Chicago Staff, p. 2.

<sup>32</sup>Knowles, Year One, AEA, p. 10.

<sup>33</sup>AEA, Report of the Chicago Staff, p. 2.

Development, conference and consultation services and others. The largest amount of the grants went to Adult Leadership.

The Fund for Adult Education was oriented toward liberal adult education. They allowed the project leaders freedom of interpretation in the beginning. However, as the editorial direction emerged, The Fund became more strict in their interpretation of "liberal adult education." They demanded that more "inspirational" articles be included instead of so many "methods and techniques" articles. They also demanded that the name of the Administrative Coordinator of AEA be changed to Executive Director if the association expected the grants to be renewed.

Knowles was administrative head of Adult Leadership, the Operations Committee and the Executive Committee of AEA. This fact placed him in a unique and central position with The Fund and its relationship with the Adult Education Association.

The fact that much money from The Fund grants needed to be spent on developing viable Adult Education Association projects demanded much of Knowles' time. The Association had some initial goals of its own such as increasing membership, services to that membership, developing its own means of support, and helping with the development of two affiliated groups: The Council of National Organizations (CNO) and The National Association for Public School Adult Educators (NAPSAE). While it was hoped that involvement with The Fund and the Association's goals could be usefully combined to meet both, the sheer lack of time on Knowles' part presented one of the barriers to its satisfactory accomplishment.

Knowles organized week-end work conferences that produced issues of Adult Leadership. It was hoped that the concerns of field practitioners,

NAPSAE people, CNO, lingering interests of AAAE people, NEA Department of AE people, The Fund and AEA could all be satisfied through this one instrument.<sup>34</sup>

As the form and content (a training workshop in methods, techniques and current issues) of the magazine emerged, The Fund was not at all satisfied that it was in line with their interests in liberal adult education. Pressure was exerted by them upon Knowles, the administrator, for changes. His sentiments were with the initial form and content of the magazine but he felt The Fund's concern was legitimate, also. Benne, a member of that project committee, indicates remembering,

Malcolm came to the editorial group asking, 'Can't you supplement your kind of workshop training orientation of the magazine with larger treatments of inspirational issues about the needs, goals and orientation of adult education.'<sup>35</sup>

There were some changes made in the character of Adult Leadership consistent with the donor's interests indicated above.

The parts of Adult Leadership that continue to be reprinted to the present writing are: The three Leader's Digests - selections from the first three years of the magazine; and the sixteen leadership pamphlets which are reprints of the methods and techniques issues of the controversial first years.

Concurrent in time with the expiration of The Fund's initial

---

<sup>34</sup>For detailed accounts of the controversies surrounding these attempts, see Robertson Sillars, "Some Problems of Publications Policy in the Adult Education Association of the U.S.A.," Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Teachers College, Columbia University, 1954. Also, Edmund DeS. Brunner, et. al., "The Role of a National Organization in Adult Education." A Report to the Executive Committee of the Adult Education Association, pp. 52-63. Chicago: Adult Education Association, 1959. (Mimeographed.)

<sup>35</sup>Benne, private interview, November 18, 1969.



grants, came the expiration of Knowles' five years as Executive Director of AEA. He raised this issue for the Executive Committee to consider. There was a question in the minds of many whether The Fund would renew the grants. Should a grant not be forthcoming, Knowles leaving at this time might create the impression "he was running away from an impossible situation."<sup>36</sup>

Knowles stayed at the request of the Executive Committee. At such a financial crisis, the committee did not want to be leaderless in terms of experience with the organization. The Fund, however, did grant the substantial sum of \$217,800 in 1956. After a year Knowles again raised the issue with the AEA Executive Committee of his leaving and they began a search that took two years to consummate.

Even with the substantial grants from The Fund, problems continued to emerge. The desire of the AEA to allow self-determination as groups to meet the needs of their members was diverted by pressure The Fund exerted for these groups to promote liberal adult education materials.

Knowles felt that the psychic costs of self-esteem and integrity in being beholden to The Fund were greater than the rewards. Before The Fund money had become available to adult education councils, many had very dynamic active support from their member agencies. Knowles' strategy when he came to AEA was to decentralize and encourage increased activity in existing local councils, and beginning of new councils.

However, once the local councils received money from The Fund, ...the agency contributions were no longer needed. Several councils became apathetic. The Akron, Ohio Council went out of business.

---

<sup>36</sup> Knowles, private interview, November 18, 1969.

It had become one hundred per cent a sales agency for The Fund materials.<sup>37</sup>

For Knowles, this was a sad day and a prostituting of the purpose for which he had envisioned such councils had come into being. It was a relief to him when the grants finally expired. The incentive and purpose of such councils could be returned to the rightful place.

Knowles' work and behavior during the turbulent early years of AEA were seen variously. The difficulty within the staff was viewed as his "failure to change individuals' attitudes." His mediation between The Fund and Adult Leadership was seen as "compromise" and "necessary conciliation between groups of disparate interests." He was viewed as "thinking he could trap The Fund into supporting the group dynamics thrust in AEA." When The Fund grants finally expired it was viewed as "a failure on his part." Apparently it was thought that Knowles should have been able to build a permanent relationship with The Fund. This would have been contrary to his own value system because of his difference of interest with The Fund. Furthermore, there is some real question whether AEA's establishing a permanent relationship with The Fund would have kept The Fund from liquidating as it did in 1961. It was also felt by some that in its formative years the AEA suffered from "no leadership." Still others felt that there was leadership, but the kind that suffered from a "lack of values."

It appears that there was a strong desire in the AEA for an administrator who could have fit the pattern of an administrative stereotype. At least, it was felt, "he must set clear goals for himself and for the

---

<sup>37</sup>Loc. cit.

group or institution, and then communicate these goals well to all the members of the organization."<sup>38</sup> This all may have happened according to plan if the policy base had been one of using tried and proven administrative methods. However, as has been stated before, the administrative style of "one-staff level organization" was "new and experimental." This was a testing ground for new administration theory. In some parts it had worked; in others it had not.

Knowles as Administrative Coordinator of AEA in relation to the total field of Adult Education

There seemed to be another element overarching Knowles' position as administrative head of AEA. It must be remembered that Knowles viewed himself as a field builder in adult education. This was his initial commitment for becoming an adult educator. His statement "I found myself emphasizing the field building aspect of my work in AEA as contrasted to administration,"<sup>39</sup> offers a clue to what really happened in AEA and where his real contribution focuses during those years.

Knowles' goals for the organization

Some insist that a leader "must set clear goals for himself and for the group or institution, and then communicate these goals well to all the members of the organization." Knowles succeeded in the first part but not the second. It was clear to Knowles that his goal for himself was to be a field builder in adult education. His goal for the AEA was that it,

---

<sup>38</sup>Jack R. Gibb, "Dynamics of Leadership," in Organizations and Human Behavior: Focus on Schools, ed. by Fred D. Carver and Thomas J. Sergiovanni (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1969), p. 321.

<sup>39</sup>Knowles, private interview, November 18, 1969.

too, should aid in the building of adult education as a field. Whether or not AEA survived was not his prime concern. His prime concern was that both he and the AEA be an instrument for the development and coordination of the field. Whether this could be accomplished was to be determined in the process, not beforehand. Knowles' goals for AEA included its being instrumental in involving the practitioners and the field as a whole in clarifying, stating and meeting their own goals. Whether Knowles communicated his goals for himself and the organization clearly to all the members of the AEA organization is quite doubtful. Indeed it may have been impossible.

By the end of the first six years of AEA there was "inadequate... spotty...data for assessing the effectiveness of the AEA's attempts to influence the movement."<sup>40</sup> However, there were a number of direction-finding processes\* used during his time for the Association's own program. Those processes were variously: (1) assessing needs and deriving objectives from them; (2) a discussion of aims and arriving at some common denominators; (3) surveys assessing attitudes by obtaining information; (4) determining social trends and gearing AEA's program into them; and (5) empirical testing of decisions translated into operational policy and implemented by program activities. Knowles was central to those, what he calls, "democratic" processes. He especially emphasized the use of the empirical approach stemming from Lindeman and this was consistent with his group dynamics leanings. Knowles felt that despite the added time

---

<sup>40</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Direction-Finding Processes in the AEA," Adult Education, Vol. VIII, No. 1 (Autumn, 1957).

\*Note: For a full discussion of the kinds of processes used, see the article referred to in footnote No. 40 above.

involved, the direction-finding processes would include more people in the decision making and be for the good of the organization in the long run.

There was broader involvement in policy issues than ever had been before in an adult educational national organization. Despite, or because of, these processes there were tensions present in operating policy of the AEA. The issues were membership, program priorities, centralization versus decentralization, relationship with local and state organizations, relationship with foundations, relationship with other national organizations and sub-groupings within the AEA. The data was inconclusive as to just what Knowles effected and what was caused by other factors. The AEA, however, was sufficiently satiated with direction finding processes by 1959. In the Brunner study, the most comprehensive of all adult education direction-finding processes, there was solid indication that many felt this ought to be the last self-study for at least ten years.<sup>41</sup>

Knowles' idea of direction-finding process and democratic processes were about equated in his mind. Despite this belief some felt there was a lack of democracy in all those processes.

A staff study prepared for this Commission states that previous direction-finding efforts had been 'greatly influenced' by 'personalities and strong vested interests.'<sup>42</sup>

This was contrary to the notion that democracy operates by the principle of consent by all affected and does not just embody the thinking of any few people, divinely or self-appointed.

Those direction-finding processes were to be a means:

---

<sup>41</sup>Brunner, et. al., "The Role of a National Organization in Adult Education," p. 334.

<sup>42</sup>Ibid., pp. 333-334.

...through and by which it was hoped that the heterogeneous membership could be brought to think more broadly as to the purposes and functions of AEA. This objective was not understood by most members and bluntly, the scheme did not work.<sup>43</sup>

Certainly if democracy operates on the principle of consent by those affected, the ones affected by the direction-finding process would need to understand the objective, which they apparently did not. The obstacles to direction-finding appear partially responsible for the view of "a lack of democracy" in the direction-finding processes. The obstacles were listed as: (1) lack of clarity in the field; (2) agency centered thinking; (3) organizational jealousies; (4) structure of the AEA; (5) unwitting influence of The Fund for Adult Education; (6) ideological differences; (7) content versus process; and (8) a patternless mosaic or unifying system. Whether or not the direction-finding processes were or should have been designed to effectively deal with these issues is open to debate. Nevertheless, these issues remained and served to overshadow the noble efforts at direction-finding.

This feeling of a lack of democracy probably meant that while much progress had been made in democratic involvement process in adult education, there still was some distance to cover for it to become optimal. At least, the heart of the issue was not probed in enough depth to allow fruitful results. However, Knowles' role as administrative head of AEA presented him with an opportunity "to experiment boldly even in the sacrosanct sphere of pedagogical method."<sup>44</sup> He took Lindeman's remark seriously in the AEA,

---

<sup>43</sup>Ibid., p. 334.

<sup>44</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 114.

Indeed, if adult education is to produce a difference of quality in the use of intelligence, its promoters will do well to devote their major concern to method and not content.<sup>45</sup>

Progress on increased involvement was made in AEA, however, and was directly relatable to Knowles' commitment put into practice.

Knowles did not limit himself to his work with the AEA during his years as administrative head. His position afforded him unique and ever widening contacts within the expanding field of adult education.

The activities in which he was involved covered a wide range. His writings during the AEA years reveal some of his institutional involvements and the subject matter range.

#### The Church

To the church he indicated that adult education: was a twentieth century frontier;<sup>46</sup> an antidote for dullness;<sup>47</sup> could offer badly needed help in the church's educative climate;<sup>48</sup> could help keep adult discussions on track;<sup>49</sup> could increase adult participation in church affairs;<sup>50</sup> offered

---

<sup>45</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>46</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Adults Are Learning," Crossroads Magazine, October, 1950, p. 10.

<sup>47</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Antidotes for Dullness," The Bethany Guide Magazine, November, 1951, pp. 32-34.

<sup>48</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Psychology, Religion and Life," The St. Louis Unitarian--A Church Bulletin, Vol. VI, No. 20 (St. Louis: The First Unitarian Church, 1952), pp. 3, 5.

<sup>49</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Keep Your Discussion on Track," Adult Teacher Magazine, August, 1956, pp. 3-4.

<sup>50</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Participation--A Golden Key to Learning." Westminster Adult Leader Magazine, January, 1958, pp. 4-5.

new approaches to christian education;<sup>51</sup> was utilizing community influence insight to improve its methods;<sup>52</sup> objectives were mutually developed and negotiated between the individual and the institution;<sup>53</sup> and necessitated effective methods to improve the appeal of christian education.<sup>54</sup>

In 1958, with the aid of a financial grant from Lilly Endowment, Inc., the Department of Religion at The University of Pittsburgh and Department of Adult Work, Division of Christian Education of the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the United States of America gathered ninety leaders in secular and religious education to work on the future course and formulate objectives of christian adult education.<sup>55</sup> Knowles had been a part of the leadership of that conference. In June, 1961 a second workshop was convened by the University of Pittsburgh with the aid of Lilly Endowment, Inc. This one was concerning the curriculum of christian education for adults. Knowles was once again a part of the leadership. His contribution came in the form of a "Theory of Christian Adult

---

<sup>51</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "New Approaches to Adult Education," The Future Course of Christian Adult Education, ed. by Lawrence C. Little (Pittsburgh, Pa.: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1959), pp. 98-108.

<sup>52</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "The Effects of Community Influences on Adult Life," The Future Course of Christian Adult Education, ed. by Lawrence C. Little (Pittsburgh, Pa.: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1959), pp. 60-69.

<sup>53</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, Asher Isaacs, Raymond G. Kuhler, Albert B. Martin, Joy Elmer Morgan, "What Should Be the Objective of Adult Education?: A Panel Discussion," The Future Course of Christian Adult Education, ed. by Lawrence C. Little (Pittsburgh, Pa.: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1959), pp. 109-124.

<sup>54</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Use Effective Methods With Adults," Presbyterian Action Magazine, August, 1959, pp. 8-9.

<sup>55</sup>Lawrence C. Little, ed., The Future Course of Christian Adult Education (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1959), pp. 12-14.



Education Methodology."<sup>56</sup> What influence this had on adult education in the church is hard to say. Suffice it to say that the writer of this paper had close contact with adult education in the church in the 1960's, knowing the situation intimately as a pastor. A close reading of Knowles' theory clearly indicates that whatever progress adult education in the church has made in the past decade, it still has a marathon distance to cover before it is abreast with what Knowles proposed in that theory. The theory was certainly not tested and found wanting. It was simply not tested. In fact, if it had been or was currently being tested, it is the assessment of the writer of this paper that the advancement of adult education in the church would have and still could make giant strides forward.

Perhaps Knowles' closing statement offers the clue as to the crucial decision that must be made, if there is to be a difference:

It is my personal conviction that Christian Adult education faces a value choice on which its future vitality depends. If it chooses to define its mission as that of inculcating prescribed doctrines, I believe it must accept the consequence of being attractive primarily to dependent personalities. If it chooses to define its mission as being that of helping adults become increasingly able to inquire into matters of faith and morals—to grapple actively with deep theological issues—I believe the consequence will be a good deal of somewhat uncomfortable ferment, but a sense of vitality that would bring into active involvement many presently passive members and many more of the unchurched.<sup>57</sup>

It appears at present that there is a great gulf between the "dependent" persons and ones willing to "grapple actively" with issues.

---

<sup>56</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "A Theory of Christian Adult Education Methodology," Wider Horizons in Christian Adult Education, ed. by Lawrence C. Little (Pittsburgh, Pa.: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1961, pp. 73-87.

<sup>57</sup>Ibid., p. 87.

### Various organizations

To the readers of the Journal of Social Issues, Knowles indicated his belief in the ever widening applicability of group dynamic methods as being useful to adult education.<sup>58</sup>

To the readers of Nation's Schools he assured them that adult education was no longer an educational stepchild as it once was.<sup>59</sup> Added, to the Public School Administrators he stated that adult education was a fourth force in education, with primary, secondary and higher being the first three.<sup>60</sup>

To the Trade Associations he shared the idea that social science findings had the application of scientific method to improve human affairs to offer them.<sup>61</sup>

In 1955, his article on adult education, a statistical survey, appeared in Encyclopedia Americana.<sup>62</sup>

Knowles became involved with a conference sponsored by AEA on climate in adult education especially as it related to physical facilities

<sup>58</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles and Leland P. Bradford, "Group Methods in Adult Education," Journal of Social Issues, Vol. VIII, No. 2 (1952), p. 18.

<sup>59</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Adult Education--No Longer A Stepchild," The Nation's Schools Magazine, January, 1953, pp. 67-68.

<sup>60</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "What Should You Know About Adult Education?," The School Executive Magazine, August, 1958, pp. 19-21.

<sup>61</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "What Does Social Science Offer to Association Management?," American Trade Association Executives Journal, Vol. 6, No. 2 (April, 1954), p. 52.

<sup>62</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Adult Education," Encyclopedia Americana, 1965, pp. 156-160.

and their affect on adult learning.<sup>63</sup>

Extending his earlier contact with the YMCA, Knowles collaborated with his wife, Hulda, and wrote in 1955 the How To Develop Better Leaders<sup>64</sup> volume in the YMCA's fourteen volume leadership library. In 1959 again Mr. and Mrs. Knowles jointly published, this time in the form of an Introduction to Group Dynamics.<sup>65</sup> This work clearly indicated Lindeman as being basic in terms of initially applying empirical research methods to the "study of functional groups."<sup>66</sup>

#### Council of National Organizations

The Council of National Organizations (CNO) was one of the special groups related to the Adult Education Association. Knowles' worked some minimal amount with this group. One of the forces that helped maintain the minimum of contact was that the CNO office was in New York City and Knowles' office was in Chicago. However, in April, 1954, the CNO held the first national television training workshop for key leaders of national organizations in Toledo. Knowles was the workshop director. He demonstrated that the principles of learning could be applied to

---

<sup>63</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "What Adult Educators Say About the Present Environment," Creating a Climate for Adult Learning, ed. by Herbert C. Hunsaker; Richard Pierce (Washington, D. C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1959), pp. 11-15.

<sup>64</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles and Hulda Knowles, How to Develop Better Leaders (New York: Association Press, 1955), p. 40.

<sup>65</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles and Hulda F. Knowles, Introduction to Group Dynamics (New York: Association Press, 1959), p. 27.

<sup>66</sup>Ibid., p. 18.

television.<sup>67</sup>

### Theory of Maturation as a Guide to Learning

During these years as administrative head in AEA, Knowles had a unique central position and perspective in adult education, observing it from many points. He was a teacher and administrator, as well as student. (He was in a Ph.D. program in adult education at the University of Chicago.)

In 1959, the CNO held a trainer consultation in New York City. Knowles delivered a paper at the session in which he expressed what appeared to have simmered in him for some time:

I have grown increasingly dissatisfied in recent years with the current status of theory and practice in education, and especially adult education...guided by something less than a comprehensive plan for total development of potential...of a continuum of learning throughout the life span. Impelled by this sense of dissatisfaction, I began searching for more adequate guidelines for learning.<sup>68</sup>

Out of this search emerged his multidimensional theory on "Maturation as a Guide to Learning." Although Lindeman is not mentioned in the paper, a closer look clearly shows his influence upon Knowles.

First, he drew from six sources for clues to his new guidelines for learning: Franz Alexander, Carl Rogers, Harry Overstreet, John Walker Powell, Erich Fromm and Edward Stainbrook. The very fact

---

<sup>67</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Learning by TV," Adult Leadership Magazine, October, 1956, pp. 114-115.

<sup>68</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Maturation as a Guide to Learning: A Multi-Dimensional Approach to Liberal Education," Leadership in Voluntary Enterprise, ed. by Charles W. Merrifield (New York: Oceana Publications, Inc., 1961), p. 150. (Note: This paper was given before the Council of National Organizations, Trainer's Consultation, November 23, 1959, New York. Reprinted with permission of author.)

substantiates Lindeman's notion that:

We...create (not de novo, out of nothing)...by utilizing what we already have. We do not discard old patterns...in favor of new: we combine old ones with the result that new patterns emerge.<sup>69</sup>

Knowles combined the ideas he had gained from others and created a new theory.

Second, the structure of the theory and the concept of a growth direction in education showed rootage in Lindeman. Regarding life and learning, Lindeman pictured it as follows:

<u>From</u>	<u>To</u>
A fixed program of textbooks and lectures	A flexible program involving the teacher's knowledge plus students' need and adaptability
Authoritative pronouncements	Truth viewed as relative
Highly organized material (static)	Emphasis upon method (dynamic)
The teacher as subject-matter expert	The teacher as teaching expert
The use of artificial pressures	Meeting life's interests <sup>70</sup>

In Knowles' maturation theory the movement is depicted much the same way:

1. From dependence - - - - - toward autonomy
2. From passivity - - - - - toward activity
3. From small abilities - - - - - toward large abilities
4. From few functions - - - - - toward many functions
5. From narrow interests - - - - - toward broad interests
6. From egocentricity - - - - - toward altruism
7. From ignorance - - - - - toward enlightenment
8. From subjectivity - - - - - toward objectivity
9. From self-rejection - - - - - toward self-acceptance
10. From focus on particulars - - - - - toward focus on principles

<sup>69</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, pp. 45-46.

<sup>70</sup>Robert Gessner, ed., The Democratic Man, in Selected Writings of Eduard C. Lindeman (Boston: Beacon Press, 1956), pp. 149-150.

11. From amorphous self-concept - - - toward integrated self-concept
12. From static concerns - - - - - toward expanding concerns
13. From imitation - - - - - toward originality
14. From need for certainty - - - - - toward tolerance for ambiguity
15. From irrationality - - - - - toward rationality<sup>71</sup>

Third, Knowles' theory was developed to indicate that education should be designed to counteract the individual's "...underdeveloped... ability to use data from his experience for continuing change and growth ...."<sup>72</sup> Lindeman conceived "...adult education...represents a process by which the adult learns to become aware of...to evaluate...and to discover the meaning of...his experience."<sup>73</sup>

This theory was Knowles' first to be published in the nearly ten years since publishing Informal Adult Education. It has a number of interesting implications that are mentioned in passing. First, this was a somewhat seasoned expression of the human organic process blandly mentioned in Informal Adult Education.<sup>74</sup> In fact, Lindeman had earlier proclaimed "that one of the primary aims of learning is to induce an 'organic view' of life."<sup>75</sup> If direct influence upon Knowles could not be attributed at least there is strong indication of similarities of thinking in the two men's minds.

Second, marks of this theory's dimensional construct finds its way into the structure of some of his subsequent theories, i.e. dimensions

<sup>71</sup>Knowles, "Maturation as a Guide to Learning:," pp. 151-152.

<sup>72</sup>Ibid., p. 150.

<sup>73</sup>Gessner, ed., The Democratic Man, in Selected Writings of Eduard C. Lindeman, p. 160.

<sup>74</sup>Knowles, Informal Adult Education, p. 55.

<sup>75</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 84.

in the theory of the field of operations in adult education. Third, this initiates one direction of Knowles' influence of adult education field building, i.e. the construction of comprehensive theories. Fourth, this theory was field-tested by a number of organizations in the CNO before publication in a syllabus of readings on Leadership in the Voluntary Enterprise. The theory continues to be tested in the field.<sup>76</sup>

#### An Interim Period

After a two year search, the time had finally come for hiring a new AEA executive director. A substantial amount of pressure had been exerted by the Delegate Assembly of the AEA to revise or bring out a new edition of the Handbook of Adult Education. The Executive Committee of the Adult Education Association asked the outgoing Executive Director, Knowles, to edit the new edition of the handbook.<sup>77</sup> It was felt that "Knowles as first Executive Director of AEA, was in a unique position to get a panoramic view of adult education in this country."<sup>78</sup> In prospect as well as in retrospect, it could be said that Knowles' position of objectivity, if not of "neutrality" would no doubt influence the basic organization of the Handbook of Adult Education toward balance and comprehensiveness.<sup>79</sup> The task was undertaken supported by a grant from

---

<sup>76</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education (New York: Association Press, 1970), pp. 25-29.

<sup>77</sup>Knowles, private interview, November, 1969.

<sup>78</sup>"The Editor," in The Handbook of Adult Education, ed. by Malcolm S. Knowles (Washington, D. C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1960), flyleaf - inside cover.

<sup>79</sup>Loc. cit.

the Fund for Adult Education. During the same time he completed his Ph.D. dissertation at the University of Chicago.

Once again Knowles' wide and varied contacts in the field of adult education placed him in a unique and most adequate position for editing the handbook. In addition, the years of experience helped in the perspective reflected through his dissertation.

#### Knowles Ph.D. Degree

Knowles' experience in the executive position of the AEA deeply influenced the perspective of his dissertation. He writes:

Although many factors have contributed to the relative failure of co-ordinative organizations of adult education, the underlying assumption of this study is that one of the chief causes is the lack of a comprehensive and developmental conception of the adult educational field. As a result of this deficiency, the policies and programs of co-ordinative organizations have been based on largely static conceptions of the needs, interests and perceptions of adult educational workers and organizational leaders at the given points of time, and the co-ordinative organizations have themselves therefore lacked a sense of direction.<sup>80</sup>

Aside from the fact that the successful completion of this study would net Knowles a Ph.D. degree, his stated purpose of the study was to provide the field with some direction. The following statement substantiates an earlier indication of his becoming a theory developer as he sought to build the field.

Previous studies of the adult educational field have been limited to particular segments, aspects, or points of time. No one has attempted to develop a unified theory of the adult educational field as a total system of institutional components and to place this field in the context of a sequential process of development. The ultimate purpose of this study is to propose such a theory, in the hope that it will provide guidance for the

---

<sup>80</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "The Development of a Co-ordinated Adult Educational Movement in the United States," (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Chicago, December, 1960), p. 4.



further development of the adult educational field in this country. While such a theory must necessarily be highly tentative, it should be capable of being tested empirically by application in the policies and programs of local, state and national co-ordinative organizations.<sup>81</sup>

This theory he initially tested and found, among other things, that the adult educational field is taking the shape of a multi-dimensional social system: (1) Institutional; (2) Subject-Matter; (3) Geographical; and (4) Personnel.<sup>82</sup> At this point parenthetical reference is made to the fact that later he moved one characteristic<sup>83</sup> of the field into a fifth dimension<sup>84</sup> of the field, the morphological (form and method) dimension. This was his description in the context of the emerging university adult education field of study. It becomes clear that the Boston University program of adult education has emphasized this fifth dimension to date.

Knowles successfully completed the study and received his doctorate at the University of Chicago. His dissertation was published in book form in 1962, under the title, The Adult Education Movement in the United States. It has become a standard work in the adult education field. Material developed in the dissertation became the basis for: (1) a full issue of the Journal of Education devoted to the role of

---

<sup>81</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>82</sup>Ibid., pp. 426-428.

<sup>83</sup>Ibid., p. 431.

<sup>84</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "The Field of Operations in Adult Education," Adult Education: Outlines of an Emerging Field of University Study, ed. by Gale Jensen, A. A. Liveright, Wilbur Hallenbeck (Washington, D. C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1964), p. 4.

public schools in adult education;<sup>85</sup> (2) an article on what is known about the field of adult education;<sup>86</sup> and, (3) an article on the adult education field of operations<sup>87</sup> mentioned before.

It must be noted here that not all leaders of the adult education field were satisfied with the directions which were developed and followed in those early years of AEA under the Executive leadership of Knowles. Some of the dissatisfaction was clearly expressed in retrospect twelve years after Knowles had ceased being Executive director of the Association.

In 1971, "Jack" Crabtree expressed his feeling that AEA had failed to meet its responsibility to fulfill a constructive role of the leaders of sober thought in society for the first twenty years of its life. He suggested that for the first seven years AEA wandered in the Never-Never Land of Group Dynamics, allowing it to become the Alpha and Omega of the total effort. He suggests, "...we allowed ourselves to be suckered by a band of frustrated educational psychologists, the Group Dynamics Boys."<sup>88</sup>

This opinion may be a bit negative. Nevertheless, it was an opinion which lingered long enough and was strong enough to find its way

---

<sup>85</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "The Role of Adult Education in the Public Schools," Boston University Journal of Education, Vol. 144, No. 4 (April, 1962), p. 17.

<sup>86</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "What Do We Know About the Field of Adult Education?," Adult Education, Vol. XIV, No. 2 (Winter, 1964), pp. 67-79.

<sup>87</sup>Knowles, "The Field of Operations in Adult Education," pp. 41-67.

<sup>88</sup>Arthur P. (Jack) Crabtree, "Quo Vadis, AEA?" in Adult Leadership (Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association in the U.S.A.), pp. 82-84, 114-124.

into an adult education periodical years later. It was felt by Crabtree that the group dynamics emphasis had some carry over to the present. Thus, his expressed concern over the lack of responsible direction in AEA. Moreover, Knowles was in the top AEA leadership during the time designated.

#### The 1960 Handbook of Adult Education

As editor, Knowles had responsibility in planning the organization of the 1960 Handbook of Adult Education. He worked with the committee who "sought to slice the field of adult education into its most significant current dimensions."<sup>89</sup> The dimensions were general background, issues of greatest concern, institutional settings and resources, areas of study, current developments and trends, and a directory of major organizations offering adult education.<sup>90</sup> These dimensions bore no small resemblance to the dimensions developed in Knowles' dissertation theory. In addition he emphasized,

The only case that can be made for looking at the complex field of adult education in this way is that it seemed to the editor and his advisors that these dimensions reflected the essential realities of the field at this stage of its development better than any other system of categories examined. This Handbook is organized quite differently from the previous Handbooks—perhaps because the field itself has changed in structure since 1948, or perhaps because this editor simply sees it differently from the previous editors.<sup>91</sup>

Gale Jensen, Chairman, Editorial Committee of the Commission of the Professors of Adult Education, expressed in 1964 the committee's

---

<sup>89</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, ed., Handbook of Adult Education (Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1960), p. XII.

<sup>90</sup>Ibid., pp. XII-XIII.

<sup>91</sup>Ibid., p. XIII.

belief that the 1960 Handbook of Adult Education had become a historical landmark.<sup>92</sup>

The influence of both Lindeman and Johnson appears to converge upon Knowles defining thereby and building the field of adult education at a point that was needed. Knowles' commitment to exert scholarship and be a field builder came at the stimulus of Johnson. The relationship to Lindeman is self-explanatory from the following quote.

Life is confronted in the form of situations, occasions which necessitate action. Education is a method for giving situations a setting, for analyzing complex wholes into manageable parts, and a method which points out the path of action which, if followed, will bring the circumstances within the area of experiment.<sup>93</sup>

What would time do to Knowles' multidimensional theory of the adult education field? The final outcome cannot be known at this time. However, in 1964, Watson Dickerman, an adult educator himself, had this to say about Knowles' theory:

Adult education has long been noted for the complexity of its field of operation. The epithets 'chaotic' and 'jungle' have not been too strong for some of its disparing chroniclers, and there have been few attempts at critical analysis. Knowles offers a new perspective of the field of operations of adult education in terms of its institutional sponsorship, content, levels, personnel and program forms. His analysis represents the most comprehensive and systematic view that has appeared in the literature to date, and is likely to be generally used in courses in adult education for some time to come.<sup>94</sup>

---

<sup>92</sup>Gale Jensen, A. A. Liveright, Wilbur Hallenbeck, eds., Adult Education: Outlines of an Emerging Field of University Study (Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1964), p. XIV.

<sup>93</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 115.

<sup>94</sup>Watson Dickerman, "Implication of this Book for Programs of Graduate Study in Adult Education," Adult Education: Outlines of an Emerging Field of University Study, ed. by Gale Jensen, A. A. Liveright, Wilbur Hallenbeck (Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1964), pp. 313-314.

In addition, the 1970 Handbook of Adult Education has this to say:

Those who take interest in such matters will notice that the organizational plan of the 1960 Handbook basically has been retained. This provides a degree of continuity. However, the major reason for staying with the previous plan was simply that no better rationale suggested itself, and we sought to avoid the pitfall of reorganizing just for the sake of reorganizing.<sup>95</sup>

At least the structure of the 1970 Handbook remained under Knowles' influence. If the assumption is made that the structure of the Handbook defines the dimensions of the adult education field, then, Knowles' field theory still defines the field. It is, however, highly unlikely that any other structure for future handbooks will suggest itself. The decision would have to be conscious, deliberate and based more on scholarship than a happening.

AEA, Annual Meeting, 1966

Beyond the time of his having left the AEA as executive director in 1959, there was sketchy and incomplete evidence of Knowles' lasting influence. However, one of the functions he did fulfill in exerting influence on the AEA was his vision of what it could become. Or as Lindeman has described:

In...periods of the past, thinkers of vision turned occasion to account by imagining and portraying perfect societies, Utopias. The function of Utopias is to set activity toward new goals, to visualize the consequences of changed conduct, to re-direct ideals.<sup>96</sup>

If this "Utopian vision" idea is a part of "field-building," one specific incident can be referred to as a consequence of Knowles' vision

---

<sup>95</sup>George F. Aker, J. R. Kidd, and Robert M. Smith, eds., Handbook of Adult Education (Washington, D.C.: The Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1970), p. X.

<sup>96</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 83.

in AEA. The instance was the planning, execution and evaluation of the AEA annual meeting, November, 1966, in Chicago. It had been Knowles' contention that adult educators don't always practice for themselves what they preach to others. The conference theme of "Focus on Program Planning" was chosen by the committee. They also decided that the process used to plan and carry out that conference should reflect that the committee practiced what it was preaching at the conference. In other words, good program planning was the order of the day in preparation for a conference on "program planning." Furthermore, it was hoped this process would "introduce a measure of professionalism not found in previous conferences."<sup>97</sup>

Knowles was invited to give a major address at that conference. The address was geared to providing a framework for adult educational programming against which the conference could be evaluated. The process and framework principles which were suggested by Knowles could "apply in one way or another to all programs that have as their purpose the growth and development of adults."<sup>98</sup> Virtually, this became his theory on program planning in adult education. It possibly had elements included that could be found in other program planning models. However, the distinguishing difference between his and others was that it is an organic program planning model. The organic theme was an element recurring in each of his theories.

In Knowles' keynote address he described and stated his conception of the steps involved in a process of planning educational programs.

---

<sup>97</sup>Letter, Larry Delvin to Malcolm S. Knowles, March 29, 1966, Malcolm S. Knowles, Personal Library, AEA Conference File, 1966.

<sup>98</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Program Planning for Adults as Learners," Adult Leadership Magazine, February, 1967, p. 267.

They are as follows:

- (1) The creation of a structure for mutual planning.
- (2) The establishment of a climate conducive to adult learning.
- (3) The self-diagnosis of needs for learning.
- (4) The formulation of objectives.
- (5) The development of a general design.
- (6) The selection and execution of techniques and materials.
- (7) The planning of evaluation.<sup>99</sup>

Eighteen per cent of the participants believed before the conference that a program planning process was common to the whole field and forty five per cent believed it after the conference. This indicated that some progress was made and the goals were partially achieved. However, some stated, "I...am not sure...principles...have been clearly designated during this conference."<sup>100</sup> This indicated a lingering lack of clarity on the program planning process. A follow-up step in the evaluation was abandoned because of confusion on the process. This verified the lack of clarity on the program planning process.

However, the conference was considered to have met its goals.<sup>101</sup> In addition, a measure of its success was attributed to Knowles. From the chairman of the 1966, AEA-USA Conference committee come these words:

I thought Thanksgiving was an appropriate time to say thank you for all of the effort and skill you invested in the 1966 AEA-USA conference. My biased estimate as chairman rates it among, if not the best, that AEA has ever offered.<sup>102</sup>

And from the AEA Executive Director:

---

<sup>99</sup>Ibid., p. 278.

<sup>100</sup>Ibid., p. 290.

<sup>101</sup>For a full account of the speakers and evaluation of the AEA Conference on Program Planning in 1966, see full issue of Adult Leadership, February, 1967.

<sup>102</sup>Letter, Robert J. Ahrens to Malcolm S. Knowles, Personal Library, AEA Conference File, 1966.

Not only was your address at the Tuesday luncheon a first rate contribution, but the conference itself was a shining example of the faith you have had in the field of adult education and the capacity of people to plan and produce first rate conferences.<sup>103</sup>

#### Other considerations

Other incidents, to which passing reference can be made, can be labeled as fulfillment of the "vision" Knowles had of the expansion of the field. The National Association of Public School Adult Education was affiliated with AEA from the latter's beginning in 1951. By 1970 they changed the official title to National Association for Public Continuing and Adult Education, in line with their desire for a broader scope of operation.

Knowles had envisioned increased collaboration of organizations doing adult education. With AEA providing the original stimulus, in December, 1969, twenty organizations ranging from the Council of National Organizations to the International Congress of University Adult Education, sponsored the Galaxy Conference on Adult Education in Washington, D.C. This was considered by some as the most significant conference on adult and continuing education yet held.

Despite much adult education activity in the U.S.A., no national policy statement had been formulated as was the case in 1919 in England and 1951 in Canada. By 1971, a proposed bill (The Adult Education Opportunity Act of 1971, #S1037; HR5292) was being introduced by the Legislative Policies Committee of the AEA. It would be the first

---

<sup>103</sup>Letter, Eugene I. Johnson to Malcolm S. Knowles, Personal Library, AEA Conference File, 1966.



legislation "recognizing adult education as a vital part of national policy."<sup>104</sup>\*

It is clear Knowles' work in the AEA influenced the movement

---

<sup>104</sup>A Proposed Bill...The Adult Education Opportunity Act of 1971, by the Legislative Policies Committee, Anita Martin, Chairman (Washington, D.C.: The Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1971), p. 8.

\*Note: The following is taken from the pamphlet, and describes the need for such legislation. This is certainly in harmony with Knowles' conception and concern for co-ordination and planning expressed in the early days of AEA.

#### Why we need The Adult Education Opportunity Act of 1971

At least 476 different Federal programs have adult education components, yet nowhere is information available about all of them. Sharing of ideas and experiences is usually accidental. No one knows what needs are being met how well, and what needs are falling between the programs. No basis for planning exists.

Only a handful of adult education programs are operated by the Office of Education. Major programs are also in the Departments of Agriculture, Defense and Labor as well as in Health, Education and Welfare. Every department operates some programs, as do most independent agencies. Nowhere are the programs coordinated.

No agency has responsibility for evaluating legislative recommendations for possible effects of adult education provisions. In 1970 alone 2½ feet of legislation was filed with major adult education implications. The Congress has no access to information about how a specific bill might affect the over-all field of adult education, or even existing programs.

The Federal government spends an estimated three billion dollars each year on adult education activities with no way of knowing if we are getting three billion benefit. Personnel development has many different formats, with little comparative evaluation. No basis exists for allocating resources.

In addition, hundreds of thousands of local, state, private and voluntary programs are being conducted, for the most part in isolation. No information systems exist.

#### THE ACT PROVIDES

- For comprehensive long-range planning,
- For responsibility for coordination
- For advising on legislation
- For recommending allocation of resources
- For developing information systems
- That all adults may have equal opportunity to meet their education needs.

and direction within the organization. His influence moved beyond the AEA institutional boundaries to the wider field of adult education. The fermentation of this continued to take place during his executive position years with the Adult Education Association of the United States of America.

#### BOSTON UNIVERSITY

In October, 1956, AEA President Kenneth D. Benne, who was also Director, Human Relations Center, Boston University, convened at North Andover, Massachusetts, an invitational conference of some thirteen<sup>105</sup> to twenty<sup>106</sup> adult educators to explore different philosophical positions in adult education. Among the number was Malcolm S. Knowles, still Executive Director of the AEA. Max Goodson, Dean of Boston University School of Education, and Wendell J. Yeo, Boston University's Vice President for Academic Affairs were also at that philosophical conference. During a late night conversation the hope was expressed by those present from Boston University that Knowles would inform them when he was ready to leave AEA, so they could see if Boston University was at a point ready to hire a professional adult educator.<sup>107</sup>

When the search committee for AEA sent out letters accepting nominations for a new Executive Director, one was sent to Max Goodson at Boston University. Goodson inquired that if Knowles were leaving AEA,

---

<sup>105</sup>Robertson Sillars, ed., Seeking Common Ground in Adult Education (Chicago: The Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1958), p. 7.

<sup>106</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Direction-Finding Processes in the AEA," Adult Education, Vol. VIII, No. 1 (Autumn, 1957), p. 44.

<sup>107</sup>Knowles, private interview, November 18, 1969.

Boston University was still interested in him. Knowles was invited to teach at Boston University and he accepted the invitation. The invitation was to the new position with the title of Associate Professor of Education and General Consultant in Adult Education. The results of a year long study made by the faculty administrative committee became the basis for the new position.<sup>108</sup>

From the report comes the two facets of the position: "The University must help to train and develop leaders and teachers for adult education."<sup>109</sup> This was the part concerning a graduate program in adult education. Regarding the general consultant part and the person hired in that position:

His major task for a least a year should be to conduct the planning necessary to initiate wise first steps in a continuing program of development in this field. He should be so placed in the University that ready access to all relevant departments and schools of the University for purposes of conference is available to him during the planning period.<sup>110</sup>

This report was undoubtedly a strong and supportive statement to give the one filling the position a free hand in the development of the program of adult education training. However, it was weak on the side of legitimizing, mobilizing, and stimulating support of his efforts at consulting the Boston University system in order to make its resources available to the solution of community problems.

There was no provision made to assure the continued support of

---

<sup>108</sup> All-University Committee on Adult Education, Report of the Committee, "Boston University's Adult Education Program," Adult Education, Vol. X, No. 1 (Autumn, 1952), pp. 42-50. A full report of the study committee is available.

<sup>109</sup> Ibid., p. 47.

<sup>110</sup> Ibid., p. 50.

the original study committee. Just their recommendation and offer of help remained.

This Committee is willing to continue to serve on an advisory group to such an appointee, if the University Council and the President so desire.<sup>111</sup>

One of the study committee indicated they "never defined the Consultant role to give it too much of a wallop with the University Administration."<sup>112</sup>

Knowles saw in his going to Boston University an opportunity for self-fulfillment. During his years at AEA, Knowles taught at George Williams College, Northwestern University, Michigan State University, and the University of Chicago and had developed some ideas of what a graduate program of adult education could be.

I wanted to have a laboratory for pioneering, experimenting and learning to test my ideas. I also saw Boston University as my opportunity to engage in a strengthening of my weaknesses as an adult educator--especially my weaknesses in research competencies.<sup>113</sup>

This clearly indicates Knowles' prime energy would be spent on the teaching role as contrasted with his consultant role.

#### Role of General Consultant in Adult Education

In his role as consultant a few activities have been initiated but it has never become a major portion of his function at Boston University. Knowles made offers to Metropolitan College of Boston University to help develop in-service education programs with teachers but nothing

---

<sup>111</sup> Loc. cit.

<sup>112</sup> Benne, private interview, November 18, 1969.

<sup>113</sup> Knowles, private interview, November 18, 1969.

vital ever happened. In fact, feedback to him indicated his help was "impractical, theoretical stuff."<sup>114</sup>

A seminar program was planned on an adult general education model. It would have provided seminar opportunities for many people who wished to broaden their view of all kinds of issues. It would have attracted Boston people highly technically trained as well as labor workers to get into human issues and problems. The program was never launched. For whatever reasons, no one could be found that would indicate why the program never developed.

Through the efforts of Knowles the Center for the Study of the Liberal Education for Adults (CSLEA) was moved from Chicago to Boston but never really became accepted as a part of the University. It was disbanded in June, 1968, with its publications being moved to Syracuse University in New York.

Knowles' General Consultant role became one of his going into the School of Nursing for special projects, helping the School of Social Work plan for a doctorate, and infusing the School of Theology with adult learning theory. The role has also included designing with the Deans men and women in-service training programs for resident advisors.

It might be sufficient to say that to have implemented to the full the Boston University adult education study committee report, to have done the kind of conferencing and negotiating necessary to make CSLEA an integral part of Boston University, to have mobilized Metropolitan College to provide continuing education equal to the Northeastern University program, and to have implemented the Adult General

---

<sup>114</sup>Loc. cit.

Education program would have required much energy from Knowles, which he did not feel motivated to expend. Furthermore, it would have required a confronter, which Knowles was not. Knowles indicated that his lack of emphasis on the consultant role was a value choice with him. He had no sense of urgency to promote or develop that role. He felt that his "own contribution to the field of adult education would be more than trying for institutional change at Boston University."<sup>115</sup>

Even beyond all that, Knowles was not a fighter and was seen as far back as his CNO and AEA work as one who avoided hostility, and emphasized spiritual enrichment.<sup>116</sup> This certainly shows the influence of Lindeman, for his central theme was the spiritual Meaning of Adult Education.

#### The Teaching Role at Boston University

From the beginning, Knowles' greatest interest was in developing a highly innovative program of adult education at Boston University.

This adult education graduate program would be the first in New England. There was also the fact of his increasing dissatisfaction "in recent years with the current status of theory and practice in...adult education."<sup>117</sup> Knowles was convinced that most college education had been "guided by something less than a comprehensive plan for total development of potential."<sup>118</sup> More specifically, his dissatisfaction had

---

<sup>115</sup>loc. cit.

<sup>116</sup>Max Birnbaum, private interview held at Osgood Hill, North Andover, Massachusetts, June, 1970.

<sup>117</sup>Knowles, "Maturation as a Guide to Learning:," p. 149.

<sup>118</sup>Ibid., p. 150.

been at the point where he considered liberal education as strong on cognitive learning, reading critically and thinking abstractly, but weak in such areas as emotional maturity, relating with other people inter-dependently, clarity of self-concept and using data from experience for continued change and growth.

Knowles also had been promised when coming to Boston University that his role would be more in teaching rather than administration. Consequently, because it needed a departmental home, adult education was attached to the Department of Administration and Supervision in the Boston University School of Education.

The question confronting him as he started a new program was, could he incorporate in his program what he felt was generally lacking in adult education? Could he develop a unique graduate adult education program that would develop maturity and potential and be comprehensive?

Lindeman's predictions and influence was clearly in evidence as Knowles built the Boston Adult Education program.

...the approach to adult education will be via the route of situations, not subjects. Our academic system has grown in reverse order: subjects and teachers constitute the starting-point, students are secondary. In conventional education the student is required to adjust himself to an established curriculum; in adult education the curriculum is built around the student's needs and interests. Every adult person finds himself in specific situations with respect to his work, his recreation, his family-life, his community life, et cetera—situations which call for adjustments. Adult education begins at this point. Subject-matter is brought into the situation, is put to work, when needed. Texts and teachers play a new and secondary role in this type of education; they must give way to the primary importance of the learner. (Indeed...the teachers of adults become also a learner.) The situation means that the learning process is at the outset given a setting of reality. Intelligence performs its function in relation to actualities, not abstractions.<sup>119</sup>

---

<sup>119</sup>Lindeman: The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 6.

The situation at Boston University included a number of elements such as its being the first graduate adult education program in New England. Although fourteen Universities in the United States offered graduate programs, only about ten per cent of this country's leaders in continuing education had formal training in theory and practice of adult education.<sup>120</sup> There was also the need for increasing understanding of the role of adult education in the American democratic society.

From the inception Knowles built the Boston program on competency-centeredness rather than subject-centeredness. The validity of this has been questioned by some but, nevertheless, it is in line with Knowles' beliefs and earlier statement of Lindeman's conception of adult education.

Knowles initially referred to the competency idea in his description of the Boston program after he had been on duty for a year.

Models have been constructed indicating the competencies required for adequate performance of the adult educational practitioner's...and...professional's...role.<sup>121</sup>

One of Knowles' colleagues, Kenneth Benne, indicated his feeling that Knowles' definition of the Boston University Adult Education program has been a real influence on defining the field and is not a copy of any previously existing program. Benne also suggests,

The unfinished task of his (Knowles) hammering out programs for the professional development of adult educators has actually helped to define the field because it is, as you know, a very amorphous type of field and the continued hammering out of adult education professional development programs is one way of bringing

---

<sup>120</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Professional Education for Leaders of Continuing Education," Boston University Journal of Education, Vol. 147, No. 3 (February, 1965), p. 16.

<sup>121</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "The New Graduate Program in Adult Education," Boston University Graduate Journal, Vol. IX, No. 3 (February, 1961), p. 70.



the field into some kind of shape without denying the variety of settings within which people work.<sup>122</sup>

It is assumed that the "Theory of the Doctorate" model Knowles constructed would be continually used in the development of Boston's program.<sup>123</sup> He indicated that a curriculum organized wholly in accordance with a role theory of the doctoral degree would be competency-centered rather than subject-centered. Units of instruction or learning activities would be defined in terms of relevant "competencies to be developed"<sup>124</sup> based on the fulfilling of required functions of educational generalists and adult education specialists.

In fact,

...according to this theory, an adequate graduate curriculum can be evolved only by following a diagnostic procedure involving these steps:

1. Analyzing the functions required in the roles of
  - (a) educational generalists and
  - (b) each kind\* of educational specialist.
2. Determining the competencies required to perform each function.
3. Diagnosing the learnings (knowledges, understandings, skills, attitudes, interests, and values) that make up each competency.
4. Formulating objectives in terms of behavioral changes to be sought in these learnings.
5. Planning a program of learning activities that will achieve these objectives according to a design that provides for continuity, sequence and integration of learning.<sup>125</sup>

An individualized program of graduate study is mapped out for

---

<sup>122</sup>Benne, private interview, November 18, 1969.

<sup>123</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "A General Theory of the Doctorate in Education," Adult Education, Vol. XII, No. 3 (Spring, 1962), pp. 136-141.

<sup>124</sup>Ibid., p. 139.

<sup>125</sup>Ibid., p. 137.

\*Note: In this case it would be adult educational specialist.

each candidate

...on the basis of the gaps that are revealed when a template of the candidate's existing competencies derived from previous experience and training is matched against the appropriate model.<sup>126</sup>

The self-diagnostic template indicated a continuum including don't know, weak, fair and strong for each competency.

As part of his special theory of the Doctor of Education degree Knowles states,

An adequate theory of graduate training in the specialist role of adult educator must be based on...assumption that there are certain generalized competencies that differ with the various sub-specialities within the adult educational role.<sup>127</sup>

In May, 1971, a new Journal of Continuing Education and Training was launched by the Baywood Publishing Company. It has a framework which is international in scope and encompasses all major professions including: Continuing Education, Government, Instructional Media, Industrial and Commercial, Journalism and Public Relations, and Legal. Its purpose is to "research, write, solicit, and edit the information and materials important to every professional educator involved with the learning process in the area of continuing education."<sup>128</sup>

In the first issue of that new journal, Knowles presented his conception of "Professional Education for Adult Educators."<sup>129</sup> It was

<sup>126</sup> Knowles, "The New Graduate Program in Adult Education," p. 70.

<sup>127</sup> Knowles, "A General Theory of the Doctorate in Education," p. 141.

<sup>128</sup> Philip J. Sleeman, "The New Journal of Continuing Education and Training—International Scope and Focus: An Editorial," Journal of Continuing Education and Training, Vol. 1 (May, 1972), p. 222.

<sup>129</sup> Malcolm S. Knowles, "Professional Education for Adult Educators," Journal of Continuing Education and Training, Vol. 1 (May, 1971), pp. 5-13.

actually his "Theory of the Doctorate" on which the Boston University adult education program was based ten years earlier. His purpose for publishing it this time was to invite reactions as to how it holds up now after ten years.<sup>130</sup>

#### Sub-Specialty of Human Relations Trainers

One of the sub-specialities not present at the outset of the Boston program but emerging after a few years was for competency as designers and trainers in human relations laboratories. During those years on the societal scene there had been a growing demand for adult educators and other educational administrators to possess competencies as designers of and trainers in human relations laboratories. No early courses in human relations laboratories credit courses were to be found. However, by 1965 one course had been added which was called "Group and Interpersonal Processes in Adult Education."<sup>131</sup> By the following year this course name was changed to "Seminar in Group and Interpersonal Relations."<sup>132</sup> The group dynamics emphasis, in fact, was described as one of the distinguishing emerging characteristics of the Boston University adult education program in contrast to other graduate programs.

...at Boston University special emphasis is placed on group processes and institutional change, with candidates taking much of

---

<sup>130</sup>Ibid., p. 6.

<sup>131</sup>Knowles, "Professional Education for Leaders of Continuing Education," p. 18.

<sup>132</sup>Boston University, School of Education, Bulletin of Graduate Programs, 1966-1968 (Boston: Boston University Bulletin, May 31, 1966), p. 72.

their work at the Human Relations Center.<sup>133</sup>

Such courses as the Practicum, Change Strategies and Research Pro-Seminars in Human Relations were available during the school year at the Human Relations Center. Basic laboratories, community change laboratories, organization development internships and training of trainers internships were offered during the summers. The reason given for this special emphasis was because:

The adult educator of the future will view himself as an agent of social change, will view his clientele as consisting of communities and institutions as well as of individuals, will view his central tool as the concept of lifelong learning in the educative community and will view his technology as action-learning.<sup>134</sup>

Additional human relations laboratory experiences became available to students in courses of introduction to administration and supervision. Some advanced students received experience through training and co-training opportunities in these courses.

Knowles later reflects that an increasing number of candidates for advanced degrees in educational administration and adult and higher education had been requesting that learning experiences for the development of competencies in designing and training human relations laboratories be included in their graduate programs.<sup>135</sup>

However, as the Boston University adult education enrollment increased from 67 at the beginning in 1960 to over 300 in 1969, a crisis

---

<sup>133</sup> Knowles, "Professional Education for Leaders of Continuing Education," p. 18.

<sup>134</sup> Ibid., p. 20.

<sup>135</sup> Malcolm S. Knowles, "Proposed Plan for Development of Human Relations Trainers: A Memorandum," Boston, Massachusetts, April, 1969, p. 2. ( mimeographed.)

emerged. During registration for the Spring, 1969 semester, the Human Relations Center notified the Department of Administration and Supervision that

the mounting pressure from School of Education students was more than they could handle, and that therefore they would have to limit the number of students they would accept to a small quota.<sup>136</sup>

According to Benne, Knowles had been flooding the Human Relations Center with students. This action disturbed the Department of Psychology because it supports the Human Relations Center.\*<sup>137</sup> Obviously, on a priority list, the psychology students would have first admittance to Human Relations Center offerings. The second group on the Human Relations Center priority list were the students from the Foundations of Education Department in the School of Education. Adult education students were third choice on the priority list.<sup>138</sup>

The crisis resulted in thirty adult education students being "denied a phase of the training they had come to Boston University to get."<sup>139</sup>

Knowles explains further:

This crisis caused the advisors of these candidates to re-examine their assumptions about the existing curriculum for

<sup>136</sup>Ibid., p. 2.

<sup>137</sup>Benne, private interview, November 18, 1969.

<sup>138</sup>Robert Chin, statements made at Osgood Hill Conference Center, North Andover, Massachusetts. November, 1968.

<sup>139</sup>Knowles, "Proposed Plan for Development of Human Relations Trainers: A Memorandum," p. 2. (Duplicated.)

\*Note: The Human Relations Center, at that time, was supported in the Academic Department of Psychology in the Graduate School, Boston University. Adult Education had its academic home in the Department of Administration and Supervision in the School of Education, Boston University.

developing human relations trainers and to come to the conclusion that it was inadequate. Essentially, the program lacked a clear sequence of progressive experiences. Students participated in Human Relations Center courses as they could gain admission rather than according to a planned sequence of development articulated with their experiences at the School of Education.<sup>140</sup>

Benne arranged for a meeting between Knowles and the head of the psychology department to talk about the problems. Knowles could see the problem and made a quick decision that adult education could develop something on its own.

By April 7, 1969, Knowles sent a memo to Department of Administration and Supervision staff, Human Relations Center staff, trainers and co-trainers of the courses Introduction to Administration and Supervision and Seminar in Group and Interpersonal Relations requesting a feedback of their ideas to him as soon as possible.<sup>141</sup> Knowles indicated this first rough draft of a sequential plan was for better utilization of the School of Education and human relations trainers.<sup>142</sup> His attempt at collaboration was hasty. He writes,

If we are to launch something of this sort next fall it will be necessary for us to shape up at least a tentative plan so that we can get the necessary faculty approval for new courses, distribute faculty loads and schedule meeting times in the next two or three weeks.<sup>143</sup>

---

<sup>140</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>141</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>142</sup>Loc. cit. (See this article for a statement of rationale for including human relations training as part of the curriculum in Boston University School of Education, Department of Administration and Supervision. Consistent with the idea of an adult educator creating something as Lindeman explained it, Knowles did not create this plan out of nothing but sought to combine already existing elements into a comprehensive sequential plan development of human relations trainers.)

<sup>143</sup>ibid., p. 1.

This initial memorandum conceived of two new seminars being launched which would require faculty approval. However, according to the class schedule sheet explaining the courses, the Fall, 1969 courses were all subsumed under existing flexible course numbers. The School of Education would provide for sequential developmental credit experience and supplemental experiences would be available to a limited number of adult education students through the Human Relations Center.

The sequence of learning experiences for developing competency in leading human relations laboratories would be in five phases: First, a basic laboratory experience--learning from the analysis of individual and group experience; second, seminar in field experience in group observation--exploring theories about these observed phenomena; third, seminar and field experience in trainer intervention--theorizing and developing intervention strategies; fourth, seminar and field experience in laboratory method for trainers--examining theories of laboratory design and assessing trainer performance; and fifth, training internships--consulting and training with outside social systems.<sup>144</sup> To these experiences could be added some supplemental experiences on a "catch-as-catch-can" basis.

According to Knowles, the launching of the program produced much unhappiness. "We had to take people much as they came." The people marked whether they wanted to be observers, co-trainers, or trainers. Each was given his first choice. Consequently, some of the co-trainers had had more training experience than the trainers. "Many were probably

---

<sup>144</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Sequence of Learning Experiences in Human Relations Training," Boston, Massachusetts, Fall, 1969, pp. 1-2. (Mineographed.)

right in their unhappiness."<sup>145</sup>

Beyond the student unhappiness, the action of Knowles and others to expand this program so quickly had some additional negative repercussion. "While it is an excellent idea, Knowles rushed into it in such a way that some questionable things happened as to its value, student wise."<sup>146</sup>

Knowles has battled at Boston University for his values of having the students set their own goals for learning. This has been interpreted by many of his colleagues as a lowering of standards and revealing a lack of strength. This was one more instance of an uncritical quality in Knowles that helped feed his "lowering of standards image." This was perhaps an unfair image but still maintained in some measure by him.

As Benne further describes,

Knowles is an exuberant, responsive, attractive man that finds it hard to say 'no' to any appeal for help. This saying 'yes' to too many things can compromise his own efforts to build a stronger, more excellent adult education profession. A great strength of Knowles, without someone to bolster the other side, becomes a vice in some situations.<sup>147</sup>

However, this action may be seen in a different light as Knowles description of himself indicates:

In helping to develop the field of adult education, I see myself as a free wheeler, don't take myself seriously, put great value on spontaneous expression, very little fear of criticism of what I do.<sup>148</sup>

This spontaneity appeared to be operating in the development of

---

<sup>145</sup>Knowles, private interview, November 18, 1969.

<sup>146</sup>Benne, private interview, November 18, 1969.

<sup>147</sup>loc. cit.

<sup>148</sup>Knowles, private interview, November 18, 1969.



the program for human relations trainers. While Knowles' stance may not justify his actions, or, at least, hold some of them up to question, it yields more light for understanding his actions. In his own words Knowles did not see himself,

...standing on a mountaintop, looking down on the field describing and making judgments about it...but in contrast I see myself as being mixed up in the maelstrom of the field, whirling around in the whirlpools with everyone else.<sup>149</sup>

From 1969, to the end of the spring semester, 1972, over 100 students participated in this "experimental program to develop special competence in designing and conducting training in group process skills."<sup>150</sup> By January, 1972, their experience with this "experimental program" still supported the assumption that because most adult education takes place in groups, skill in using group processes and training group leaders would be important components in the professional equipment of numerous adult educators.<sup>151</sup>

Although plans were made to discontinue the program at the end of the spring semester, 1972, pending an evaluation and replanning process, resumption in a year was expected on a permanent basis because of its importance.<sup>152</sup>

### Evaluation

Another area of adult education that Knowles has expended effort

---

<sup>149</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>150</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "The Graduate Program in Adult and Higher Education at Boston University." A Written Paper, Boston, Massachusetts, January, 1972, p. 10. (Mimeographed.)

<sup>151</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>152</sup>Loc. cit.

for impact has been evaluation. Lindeman, speaking years ago said:

Adult education, happily, requires neither entrance nor exit examinations. Adult learners attend classes voluntarily and they leave whenever the teaching falls below the standard of interest. What they learn converges upon life, not upon commencement and diploma.<sup>153</sup>

This may be the ideal in adult education. However, when adult education programs for training professional adult educators were attached to private and public universities in this country, Lindeman's reference to the "class attendance," "absence of exams" and "related only to life" aspect of adult education was not quite the whole story. Boston University is a traditional university in the sense of its commitment to the subject-matter approach in teaching, tests and examinations to determine whether one has passed or failed and the giving of grades by the professors as an evaluative measure for the work the student has done.

Consequently, one of the issues Knowles would have to face in light of this given reality at Boston University was the issue of evaluation and grading of adult education students. How could he create a sub-environment within the university system that was congruent with the values he held as an adult educator and not be abrasive to the total organizational environment? The Boston University graduate adult education program was to be competency-centered in contrast to the traditional subject-centered approach. The principal weakness at that time was, and still is, the inadequacy of the measures of competency. Even so, Knowles still asserted,

Hopefully some better device for measuring competencies than the Graduate Record Exam can be devised. But until then the assessment of competencies by the judgment of faculty members would at

---

<sup>153</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 114.

least be no more damaging to sound program construction than the present process of attempting to attach meanings to grades in previous courses and scores on aptitude tests.<sup>154</sup>

In this it appears that Knowles was exercising his professional prerogative in deciding what his criteria would be for making assessments about his students' competencies. While most professors usually rely on tested, accepted objective measurements, Knowles preferred to rely on his observation of a student as a tentative measure of competency. He felt this decision would be the best for all concerned.

Educators have devoted a great deal of time and energy to the development of tests, examinations and a vast array of other methods for evaluating the consequences of their work. Lindeman argued,

Very few of these devices are applicable to adult education... adult education is wholly lacking in coercive or compulsive elements ...is an act of the free will.<sup>155</sup>

Furthermore, if Knowles' practice was to be consistent with his beliefs, he would have to devise an approach in graduate adult education evaluation and grading that, in fact, would allow him to fill the "role... of a consultant and resource person, not inculcator and judge."<sup>156</sup> Or, as Lindeman suggested: "In adult education, methods of evaluation must exemplify that same sense of freedom which characterizes the learning process itself."<sup>157</sup>

It is assumed with Knowles that the general objectives in adult

---

<sup>154</sup>Knowles, "A General Theory of the Doctorate in Education," p. 39.

<sup>155</sup>Eduard C. Lindeman, "Self-Evaluation by Adult Students," Adult Leadership Magazine, April, 1953, pp. 300-301.

<sup>156</sup>Knowles, "A General Theory of the Doctorate in Education," pp. 140-141.

<sup>157</sup>Lindeman, "Self-Evaluation by Adult Students," p. 300.

education are

...to facilitate the continuous maturing of every participant along all the dimensions...such as from dependence toward autonomy, from passivity toward activity, from subjectivity toward objectivity, from ignorance toward enlightenment, and,...to help each individual continuously to augment his ability to engage in self-directed inquiry.<sup>153</sup>

It is further assumed that learning is an internal process of need meeting and goal striving controlled by the learner and engaging his whole being—including intellectual, emotional and physiological functions. This is in contrast with a tendency to look upon learning as an external process, a transmittal of information controlled by outside forces, such as excellence of the teacher's presentation, quality of the reading materials and the effectiveness of the school discipline.<sup>159</sup>

For Lindeman the chief aim of adult education is "to discover the meaning of experience."<sup>160</sup> For Knowles,

The central dynamic of the learning process is thus perceived to be the experience of the learner, experience being defined as the interaction between the individual and his environment.<sup>161</sup>

The similarities between the thinking of Lindeman and Knowles become even more visible in the two statements that follow.

Lindeman stated,

Methods of evaluation should be internal, not imposed from without. Adult learners in short, must also learn to evaluate their own success or failure. What the adult learner needs to know is

<sup>158</sup> Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, p. 230.

<sup>159</sup> Ibid., p. 50.

<sup>160</sup> Gessner, The Democratic Man, in Selected Writings of Eduard C. Lindeman, p. 160.

<sup>161</sup> Knowles, "A Theory of Christian Adult Education Methodology," p. 77.

whether or not his learning is effecting any kind of change in him...how to detect the direction in which he is moving.<sup>162</sup>

Knowles stated,

The important implication for adult-education practice of the fact is that learning is an internal process in that those methods and techniques which involve the individual most deeply in self-directed inquiry will produce the greatest learning. This principle of ego-involvement hits at the heart of the adult educator's art. In fact, the main thrust of adult-educational technology is in the direction of inventing techniques for involving adults in ever-deeper processes of self-diagnosis of their own needs for continued learning, in sharing responsibility for designing and carrying out their learning activities, and in evaluating their progress toward their objectives.<sup>163</sup>

Even in the categorical framework of evaluating the personal directions of movement and change (behavioral objectives) in the learning experience, there was a great similarity between what Lindeman said and Knowles said. Knowles had explicitly stated in two places<sup>164, 165</sup> that behavioral objective's categories he used were taken from Ralph Tyler, director of the Center for Advanced Study of the Behavioral Sciences. The behavioral categories were as follows:

- (1) Knowledge (Generalizations about experience; internalization of information);
- (2) Understanding (Application of information and generalizations);
- (3) Skills (Incorporation of new ways of performing through practice);
- (4) Attitudes (Adaptation of new feelings through experiencing greater success with them than with old);
- (5) Values (The adoption and priority arrangement of beliefs); and,

---

<sup>162</sup>Lindeman, "Self-Evaluation by Adult Students," p. 300.

<sup>163</sup>Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, p. 51.

<sup>164</sup>Knowles, Isaacs, Kuhler, Martin, Morgan, "What Should Be the Objective of Adult Education?: A Panel Discussion," p. 123.

<sup>165</sup>Knowles, "Use Effective Methods With Adults," p. 8.

- (6) Interests (Satisfying exposure to new activities.)<sup>166</sup>

Lindeman categorized the behavioral objectives of a learning experience as follows:

- (1) Has it increased my usable fund of reliable information?
- (2) Have I changed my vocabulary? Have I, in other words, learned how to make use of some new concept's?
- (3) Have I acquired any new skills?
- (4) Have I altered any attitudes?
- (5) Have I learned how to sort out the moral ingredients in the various situations considered by this study group? Have I learned to think in terms of values?
- (6) Have I learned how to make reliable generalizations?<sup>167</sup>

Knowles included Lindeman's generalizations with the category on knowledge and added a category on interests. Lindeman had indicated these categories of evaluation were not intended to be inclusive, but were sufficiently inclusive for most purposes.<sup>168</sup>

More specifically, however, in regard to the issues of evaluation in the Boston University graduate adult education program, Knowles developed his system within the course structures. In this way he was able to satisfy the organizational requirements for grades and maintain his value system of individual integrity. He also could continue helping his students catch glimpses of better grading and evaluation methods.

Early in the program the outcomes of the learning were decided upon mutually by the students and the instructor, including the procedures

---

<sup>166</sup> Knowles, Year One, AEA, p. 294.

<sup>167</sup> Lindeman, "Self-Evaluation by Adult Students," p. 300.

<sup>168</sup> Loc. cit.

of evaluation and how grades would be determined.<sup>169</sup> An experiment in group self-directed learning: The learning-teaching team\*<sup>170</sup> became the basic format with most of the adult education courses at Boston University.<sup>171</sup> Early in each course when the learning-teaching teams are being organized the members of the class are offered an opportunity to volunteer for the evaluation team. The two-fold responsibility of the evaluation team is for "planning procedures and tools for evaluating the course outcomes and for proposing a plan for grading."<sup>172</sup> Knowles remarks, "On only one occasion in the last ten years has the class opted out of responsibility for doing its own evaluation and grading."<sup>173</sup>

One of the last class sessions is always reserved for course evaluation. The evaluation team leads the session. Most generally what has happened in that session follows:

- (1) A presentation by the evaluation team of the results of its inquiry into the theory and practice of educational evaluation....
- (2) A presentation of the evaluation team's findings regarding the students' evaluation of their course....
- (3) The collection of final suggestions from the class regarding improvements that might be made in future offerings of the course....
- (4) The determination of grades for individual students. In all but

---

<sup>169</sup>Knowles, "Professional Education for Leaders of Continuing Education." p. 19.

<sup>170</sup>Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, p. 290.

<sup>171</sup>Ibid., pp. 371-376.

<sup>172</sup>Ibid., p. 375.

<sup>173</sup>Loc. cit.

\*Note: Learning-teaching teams: groups which take responsibility for learning all they can about a content unit and sharing what they have learned with the total assembly.

a few instances the system that has been adopted for arriving at grades has been some form of self-grading.<sup>174</sup>

This researcher can remember one occasion in which an adult education class at Boston University was dealing with the issue of grading and evaluation. The class was in session and this researcher entered the class late that day. The discussion was quite heated. Students were challenging Knowles with such statements as: Why are we spending all this time talking about and doing evaluation and grading? Why should we waste this precious time talking about grades? Why don't you just give us all a 'B' or an 'A' and let it go at that? This is silly! What did I come to class for today? Knowles' rationale for spending this effort and time went something like this: The reason we're spending the time is because I figure that alone I can't effect much change in the grading and evaluation system in this country. I feel it needs some changes and improvement. I figure candidly that if I have 200 or 300 students that will be practitioners in the educational field, they can effect much more change than I could alone. In addition, if I hope for them to effect some change I had better spend some time involving them in a process of establishing their own criteria for self-evaluation and self-grading so they will have some idea of what this process is about. In this way they could at least make a value judgment based on experience as to whether they could feel like working on changes in the educational system after they leave this place.<sup>175</sup>

---

<sup>174</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>175</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, Classroom speech, Boston University, Boston, Massachusetts, 1967. Note: Much of this data exists in the memory of the writer. There are no records available for these comments.



In addition, this competency of dealing with issues of evaluation and developing new approaches to it was also one of the required functions of an educational generalist as stated in Knowles' role theory.<sup>176</sup> The issue at stake was, as Lindeman would call it,

What they learn converges upon life, not commencement or diploma. The external tokens of education are removed so that the learning process may stand or fall on its intrinsic merits.<sup>177</sup>

This researcher remembers the initial frustration in trying to evaluate and grade his own performance. The before and after\* self-diagnostic measure, feedback and consultations, interteam triads, etc., were not easy to do. He had been a product of traditional forms of grading--tests, exams, quizzes, papers and the like. However, as his course work progressed in adult education, some interesting things happened in his own learning process. His concern of "How can I memorize the right things in this course so I can regurgitate them on the final exams for the professor, in order to get a passing grade?", changed to "What do I want to learn within the allotted course time?", and "Who are some of the resources for learning from whom I can learn?" Education for him, lost its pain and drudgery. It became a thing of beauty, an aesthetic experience, a life-enhancing activity. He became turned-on to the self-directed educational process. Even when he enrolled in courses that relied on the traditional methods for evaluation and grading he found himself worrying less about

---

<sup>176</sup>Knowles, "A General Theory of the Doctorate in Education," pp. 138-139.

<sup>177</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 114.

\*Note: After diagnostic measure: This was the time of evaluation. However, Knowles was coming more to conceive of it as a time of rediagnosis for additional learning needs. Thus, the connotation of judgment might be removed from the concept of evaluation.

the grade and more about what he would learn and the purpose for which he had enrolled in the class. His reasoning went something like, "I am in this class to learn thus and thus, and this is the way I feel I need to do it. What grade the professor gives me is his problem. After all, I am in here to learn my thing, not to learn the professor's thing."

A shift of emphasis regarding self-evaluation is developing in Knowles' thinking toward redagnosis of learning needs. The same procedures at the end of the course are being used as when the learner originally diagnosed his needs for learning at the beginning of the course. The difference between the two measures could be what the learner has learned. Knowles indicates the changes occurring as he thinks less of the evaluation of learning and more in terms of redagnosis of learning needs:

...When my adult students perceive what they do at the end of a learning experience as rediagnosing rather than evaluating, they enter into the activity with more enthusiasm and see it as being more constructive. Indeed, many of them report that it launches them into a new cycle of learning, reinforcing the notion that learning is a continuous process.<sup>178</sup>

Changes made based on the analysis of the learning experience were not limited to the students. Professor Knowles also changed a course design if the experience gained from a semester's work indicated what he felt resulted in more effective learnings.

The fall semester, 1968, course in Problems in Adult Education was focused as "An Advanced Laboratory in Adult Education Technology."<sup>179</sup>

---

<sup>178</sup> Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, p. 43.

<sup>179</sup> Malcolm S. Knowles, "Problems in Adult Education: A Course Announcement and Outline," Boston, Massachusetts, Fall, 1968, p. 1. (Mimeographed.)

The purpose of the course was stated:

To provide degree candidates who are in the final phase of their program with an opportunity to deepen their understanding of concepts of program design, increase their skill in designing programs, and experiment with the invention of new techniques and materials.<sup>180</sup>

The primary method of the course was as follows:

Real case situations involving consulting with live client systems in the designing of adult educational programs will be presented by the instructor and students. Teams of the students will practice consulting with the clients and their performance will be analyzed by observing teams, the instructor and the client. Innovation teams will invent and test new<sup>181</sup> techniques and materials for peculiar learning situations.

The "innovation" and "observation" resource teams numbered five:

(1) Change strategies, (2) new techniques, (3) motivational techniques, (4) theory and practice of model building, and (5) client system involvement and consultant role.<sup>182</sup> These teams made resource suggestions as the consultation with each group progressed.

The result of that experience apparently was considered by Knowles to be of such value that the design influenced a change in another course. Knowles writes:

You will be interested to know that as a result of that experience we redesigned our...Organization and Administering Adult Education course around the principle of having teams consult with live client systems.<sup>183</sup>

### The Theory Builder

Knowles contributed to the adult education field through the

---

<sup>180</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>181</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>182</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>183</sup>Letter from Malcolm S. Knowles, January 26, 1972.

Boston University graduate program a framework theory of competency-centered education, competency development in "human relations training" and "evaluation." However, another area of his contribution was the addition of the morphological (method, technique, device, format, technology) dimension to his field theory of adult education. Referring to livening the learning process and its relation to adult life, Lindeman had stated,

If learning is to be revived, quickened so as to become once more an adventure, we shall have need of new concepts, new motives, new methods; we shall need to experiment with the qualitative aspects of education.

A fresh hope is astir. From many quarters comes the call to a new kind of education with its initial assumption that education is life--not a mere preparation for an unknown kind of future living. Consequently all static concepts of education which relegate the learning process to the period of youth are abandoned. The whole of life is learning, therefore education can have no endings. This new venture is called adult education--not because it is confined to adults but because adulthood, maturity defines its limits.<sup>184</sup>

Knowles was prepared to experiment with the qualitative aspects of education. Early in the graduate program he asserted,

Perhaps the characteristic that distinguishes the graduate program in adult education from other educational experiences even more than its content and student body, at least at Boston University, is its methodology.<sup>185</sup>

#### Knowles' Theory of Andragogy

Knowles had the drive to be a pioneer and an innovator. He also had read Lindeman's assessment of where the action is:

Adult education...builders are able to experiment boldly even in the sacrosanct sphere of pedagogical method. Indeed, if adult

---

<sup>184</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 4.

<sup>185</sup>Knowles, "Professional Education for Leaders of Continuing Education," p. 19.

education is to produce a different quality in the use of intelligence, its promoters will do well to devote their major concern to method and not content.<sup>186</sup>

In addition, Knowles realized that social science research had just begun its discoveries as to the effects of groups and their environment upon individual learning. He had been involved in new emergence of laboratory education with the National Training Laboratories. He had been greatly influenced by and involved with them in his AEA days. He saw some possibilities of that slant of education offering something to adult education. However,

...like the scientist, we may foresee what research and experiment may bring forth but until we have developed a method for taking the next step, our foreknowledge remains impotent.<sup>187</sup>

He was ready to style a graduate program to try "developing a method" for taking that next step.

There was an additional factor operating. He had learned through his early adult education work in YMCA and AEA that his dissatisfaction had increased with the theory and practice of adult education. He had already built his own theory of maturation. How he would facilitate this maturation process in the Boston University Graduate Program in Adult Education still remained to be seen. This dissatisfaction he felt with the theory and practice meant not only the substantive area, but also the conception of education and the methods of teaching by the professionals in the field. This raised the question as to whether he would be different or just like everyone else. He knew from practice,

---

<sup>186</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 114.

<sup>187</sup>Ibid., p. 103.

...a basic doctrine of the new profession of adult education is that adults differ from youth as learners in crucial ways and so must be taught differently.<sup>188</sup>

Knowles knew that he was on the spot, because "There is a special burden on the professor, therefore, to demonstrate the basic principles of adult education."<sup>189</sup>

One of the basic principles Knowles emphasized was how specifically he saw adults as different from youth as learners. Based on his theory of maturation,

- his assumptions are that as a person matures
- 1) his self-concept moves from one of being a dependent personality toward one of being a self-directing human being;
  - 2) he accumulates a growing reservoir of experience that becomes an increasing resource for learning;
  - 3) his readiness to learn becomes oriented increasingly to the developmental tasks of his social roles; and,
  - 4) his time perspective changes from one of postponed application of knowledge to immediacy of application, and accordingly his orientation toward learning shifts from one of subject-centeredness to one of problem-centeredness.<sup>190</sup>

Lindeman had warned, however,

Arguments directed against the subject-approach in education, even when sufficiently forceful to win intellectual approval of educators, will make little headway until accompanying experiments are made possible.<sup>191</sup>

Knowles was ready to make his efforts an experiment in methodology. Or, more precisely, this was to be the testing of a theory of adult education

---

<sup>188</sup> Knowles, "Professional Education for Leaders of Continuing Education," p. 17.

<sup>189</sup> Icc. cit.

<sup>190</sup> Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, p. 39.

<sup>191</sup> Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 113.

called "andragogy."\* The outcomes could only be hoped for but not known at the outset.

Later, in his own words, he clarifies what his purpose and mission was.

The graduate program in adult education was established at Boston University in 1960 with the dual purpose of extending knowledge about adult learning through research and equipping adult education practitioners with the competencies uniquely required for the effective management of learning experiences for adults.<sup>192</sup>

The last part of this statement emphasizes the competency-centeredness of the program. This implies that the tools, methods and procedures are part and parcel of the "effective management."

---

<sup>192</sup> Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, p. 371.

\*Note: The following contrast and parallel is taken from M. S. Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education: Andragogy versus Pedagogy, Chapter 3, pp. 37-38.

Most of what is known about learning has been derived from studies of learning in children and animals. Most of what is known about teaching has been derived from experiences with teaching children under conditions of compulsory attendance. And most theories about the learning-teaching transaction are based on the definition of education as a process of transmitting the culture. From these theories and assumptions there has emerged the technology of "pedagogy"--a term derived from the Greek stem paid---(meaning "child") and agogos (meaning "leading"). So "pedagogy" means, specifically, the art and science of teaching children.

...Adult-education theorists in both Europe (especially in Germany and Yugoslavia) and in North America are rapidly developing a distinctive theory of adult learning. And from this theory is evolving a new technology for the education of adults. To distinguish it from pedagogy, this new technology is being given a new name: "andragogy," which is based on the Greek word andr (with the stem andr---) meaning "man." Andragogy is, therefore, the art and science of helping adults learn.

But I believe that andragogy means more than helping adults learn; I believe it means helping human beings learn, and that it therefore has implications for the education of children and youth (which are developed later in this chapter). For I believe that the process of maturing toward adulthood begins early in a child's life and that as he matures he takes on more and more of the characteristics of the adult on which andragogy is based.

The first part of the above quote emphasizes that knowledge about "how adults learn" is less than complete. In addition, the Boston University Program would be used to increase that knowledge through research.

In the first nine years of the program the program's mission was limited, as Knowles states,

...to develop and test a theory of learning that would be more in tune with what we know about the maturation process than are the traditional theories of pedagogy.<sup>193</sup>

By this, he has moved into the "sacrosanct sphere of pedagogy." The theory he developed was based on four speculative assumptions, mentioned before, of the differences between adults and youthful learners. These speculative propositions were taken as working hypotheses to be tested empirically. Then he developed a curriculum and teaching technology that would be as congruent with the proposition as he could make them. Literally, it became an experience in self-directed learning. The first exercise in preliminary self-diagnosis was a list of twenty-nine competencies taken from Knowles' "Theory of the Doctorate." Following that first self-diagnostic experience,

Every course, field experience, and independent study project in which he engages from then on is designed to deepen his understanding of the process of self-directed inquiry and to sharpen his skills in engaging in the process himself and helping others to engage in it.<sup>194</sup>

This "process" of which Knowles speaks is not linear, but spiral; fairly superficially at first and then repeated in ever deepening cycles. Each course follows a basic process design that includes the following steps.

---

<sup>193</sup>loc. cit.

<sup>194</sup>ibid., pp. 371-372.



Phase 1: Climate setting and resource identification.

- 1)...course...purpose...orientation...
- 2)...introduction of the students and faculty...
- 3)...overview of the process design...
- 4)...review of resource materials...and people...
- 5)...prepare for second phase...

Phase 2: Diagnosis of needs for learning.

- 1)...development of a model of competencies...
- 2)...assessment...of...present level of achievement...
- 3)...pooling of individual learning needs...

Phase 3: Formulation of course objectives.

Phase 4: The planning of learning experiences.

- 1) The organization of learning-teaching teams.
- 2) Preparation of the teams for doing their work.
- 3) Team learning and planning.

Phase 5: Presentation of learning experiences.

Phase 6: Course evaluation and grading.<sup>195</sup>

The six phases of this process design and theory are in this case specifically related to the adult education courses at Boston University. Using these sequential process steps in each course has at least a two-fold result. First, it is the best way Knowles has developed to include the students' need for learning in relation to the elements of a particular course. Second, it gives the students an opportunity to experience this dynamic process of learning themselves and to assess the extent of its utility for the learning experiences they will be planning and managing as practitioners.

Thus far, in the graduate program, what has been learned may have wider application for conditions of adult learning in general. First, entrants into American graduate schools have not learned the skills of self-directed inquiry. However, they can if plunged into it, well

---

<sup>195</sup>Ibid., pp. 372-375.

coached, and supported by a respectful environment.<sup>196</sup>

Second, the basic orientation toward learning most students have developed earlier is competitiveness. Hence, the competitive attitude shows up disfunctionally,

...in the early operation of the learning-teaching teams, when struggles for control, self-assertion, and one-upsmanship get in the way of the teams' task of learning together. It frequently reveals itself, also, in the presentation designs constructed by the learning teaching teams; often the best design ideas are discarded because they don't provide an opportunity for all members of the team to show off equally. And, finally, it becomes a real problem at grading time, when the highly emotionally charged need to be 'best' or 'at the top' get in the way of using evaluation procedures of meaningful self-assessment.<sup>197</sup>

It almost sounds as if that were a re-echoing of a Lindeman description of earlier years.

We still stumble along in the sphere of human relations with no guide other than the worn out, discredited, cruel presumption that power achieved by victory over another person or group: that my advantage must mean your disability; that efficacy for me can exist only through your disqualification.<sup>198</sup>

Despite what seemed like setbacks in Knowles' program, e.g. the competitiveness getting in the way of the most effective learning, his test began to bare fruit and bring results of the kind of change he hoped for.

...it is clear that this attitude of competitiveness can be changed to one of self-acceptance and collaboration by a sequence of experiences in an environment that rewards and reinforces these latter attitudes. But this behavioral change takes longer than the development of basic skills in self-directed learning.<sup>199</sup>

---

<sup>196</sup>Ibid., p. 376.

<sup>197</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>198</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 28.

<sup>199</sup>Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, p. 376.

Beyond just acquiring the skills of self-direction and the capabilities of self-diagnosis of learning needs, there is a long range value, that of "education is life," a commitment to the life long learning process, the educative society that appears to be what takes place in the process by that method. Knowles declares,

...a large volume of evaluative statements obtained from students at the completion of their degree programs is that for most students learning to become self-directed learners is a euphoric, ego expanding experience. They report, that when they came into the program, they viewed education as a chore, a self-degrading necessity, or, at best, a mostly irrelevant means for gaining a status conferring degree. But when they really mastered the art of self-directed and collaborative learning, education became a thing of beauty, an aesthetic experience, a life-enhancing activity.<sup>200</sup>

The andragogical theory Knowles is developing and testing in his graduate courses has a much wider application. He believes,

...the principles of andragogy...translated into a process for planning and operating educational programs...involves the following phases consistently in both levels of application:

1. The establishment of a climate conducive to adult learning.
2. The creation of an organizational structure for participative planning.
3. The diagnosis of needs for learning.
4. The formulation of directions of learning (objectives).
5. The development of a design of activities.
6. The operation of the activities.
7. The rediagnosis of needs for learning (evaluation).<sup>201</sup>

As can be seen, these steps are in essence the same as used in Knowles' graduate program. The crucial step, however, that makes his theory and model different from the ordinary is number three, "The diagnosis of needs for learning." The difference comes mainly in regard to his emphasis on "self-diagnosis" of learning needs. This is based on his

---

<sup>200</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>201</sup>Ibid., p. 54.

concept that even adult education is no longer a "process of transmitting what is known"<sup>202</sup> but "a life-long process of discovering what is not known."<sup>203</sup> Hence, his concept of the role of adult educator in relation to the people and program development process suggested above is different, also, from the ordinary.

In his own words he describes what he perceives the emerging and changing role of the adult educator as contrasted with what it used to be.

Initially, an adult educator was conceived loosely as 'one who educates adults,' in the sense of transmitting knowledge to them, telling them what they ought to know, or at best enticing them to learn...In recent years, however, the adult educator is referred to increasingly in the literature as a 'change agent' and performing a 'helping role'...

As an agent of change his responsibilities extend far beyond the routine scheduling of activities in response to cursory expressions of interest. His responsibilities entail, rather, the involvement of his 'clients' in a penetrating analysis of their higher aspirations and the changes required to achieve them. diagnosis of the obstacles that must be overcome in achieving these changes, and planning of an effective strategy for accomplishing the desired results. His part in that process is that of helper, guide, encourager, consultant, and resource—not that of transmitter, disciplinarian, judge and authority. He recognizes that it is less important that his clients know the right answers to the questions he thinks are important than that they know how to ask the important questions and find the answers for themselves. His ultimate objective is to help people grow in their ability to learn, to help them become their mature selves.<sup>204</sup>

In spite of all the energy he and others had expended by 1969 on the issue of self-diagnosis of needs for learning, Knowles expresses himself after a "learning community" laboratory he worked with in California in summer, 1969.

---

<sup>202</sup>Ibid., p. 38.

<sup>203</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>204</sup>Ibid.; pp. 33-34.

Our technology for helping learners diagnose their own needs for learning in depth is still terribly primitive. I came away from this experience with a deep resolve to devote more of my energy to working creatively on the advancement of this technology.<sup>205</sup>

True to his commitment to developing adult educational technology, Knowles includes an elaborate system of designing and managing learning experiences. He sees the adult educator performing the threading function and the students participating in and influencing the decision dealing with the elements including: application of art principles, curriculum organization, learning design model components, and types, techniques, material and devices.<sup>206</sup> In fact, when the National Opinion Research decided to publish "essays in speculation on the roles that may be played by the new educational media in American society of the next few decades,"<sup>207</sup> Knowles was chosen as the one to speculate. In line with his perception of himself as a field builder, a presenter of visions of what is possible, self-diagnosed competency models, Knowles presented his visions of what he saw as possible uses of the new media in adult education.<sup>208</sup>

The most complete work of his dealing with his theory of Andragogy is The Modern Practice of Adult Education: Andragogy versus Pedagogy published by Association Press in 1970. While reference has been made

---

<sup>205</sup>Personal letter from Malcolm S. Knowles to Mrs. June Sheats, October 18, 1969.

<sup>206</sup>Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, pp. 288-295.

<sup>207</sup>Peter H. Rossi and Bruce J. Biddle, eds., The New Media and Education: Their Impact on Society (Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company, 1966), p. 2.

<sup>208</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Adult Education," in The New Media and Education, ed. by Peter H. Rossi; Bruce J. Biddle (Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company, 1966), pp. 348-352.

to a few of his special emphases in the theory, a complete reading will reveal much more about it than can be presented here.

This book was to be a revision of his classic Informal Adult Education. He states,

When I started on this task, I soon discovered that my conception of the theory of adult-education practice had moved so far from where it was in 1950 that I really had to write a new book. I was pleased to discover, however, that much of what I had written in 1950 on program operation was intuitively in tune with what had later emerged as a comprehensive theory of adult education practice, and so substantial portions of Informal Adult Education have been incorporated, with some revisions...<sup>209</sup>

The book is organized in the form of inquiry for participation by the inquirer, styling it more toward an adult education experience than most. In that book and theory, use and reference was made to 104 different items from outside sources, many items of other fields of research. In addition, there were seventy six exhibits illustrating many adult education ideas distilled by him into understandable form. Many were his own and many drawn from others. The point is that he is eclectic in his approach as he builds this coherent theory of andragogy. He is in this case what has been called, "the first effective user" rather than "the originator" of many ideas utilized in building this theory. In this he has followed the social research stimulation of Alvin Johnson in building an adult education field.

However, a short aside seems in order here that is pertinent to his development of the theory or system of andragogy. At another point in this research<sup>210</sup> it has been suggested that one kind of field builder

---

<sup>209</sup> Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, p. 5.

<sup>210</sup> See supra, pp. 50-51.

is he who digs endlessly into the roots of things to be aware of the total picture. However, Knowles is philosophically a Utilitarian; and as such holds no particular respect for the past or what claimed to be of hoary antiquity, believing instead that human reason is sufficiently cogent to criticize the time honored and ridiculous traditions, and counting as most valuable an idea's usefulness to meet current needs. In addition to following this, Knowles highly valued spontaneous expression as one means of developing the field.

Therefore, it is not surprising that in his book, The Modern Practice of Adult Education: Andragogy versus Pedagogy, Knowles does not reveal any substance of deep rootage by investigation similar to Ger van Enckevoort's investigation into the development of the new science of "andragology," which includes "andragogy."

Ger van Enckevoort traces the history of the term "andragogy" to its beginning in Germany, 1833, by Alexander Kapp, a grammar school teacher. Enckevoort suggests that Johann Fredrich Herbart, a German philosopher at the time, opposed it on the basis of a misunderstanding. Herbart thought that the exaggeration of pedagogy to andragogy was to be blamed for thinking that all adults need professional guidance in learning, because in that way a general state of tutelage would arise. He could only see that education meant tutelage because his child education was by tutor as a result of his being severely burned as a child and not able to attend school.

The term "andragogy" was buried and did not arise until 1921 in Germany by a social scientist, Rosenstock. After World War II Heinrich Hanselmann, a Swiss psychiatrist used the term "andragogik" to denote

the re-education of adults. In the 1960's the term gained currency in Yugoslavian, Hungarian and Netherlands Universities and its use by Knowles in America. Enckevoort emphasizes his disagreement on the history and etymology of the word which Knowles presents from the editors of Merriam-Webster dictionary. Enckevoort suggests that an "andragogos" is an adult educator and "andragogy" is the adult educator's activity, "andragogics" is the normative theory and "andragology" is the science. He presents his rationale for and notion of the principle parts of "andragology" which are; general and theoretical; technological or methodological; research analysis and improvement; and the special "andragologies" of social work, adult education, personnel management, social action, training and counseling. Enckevoort finishes his investigation by emphasizing its use in the Netherlands.<sup>211</sup>

It is not surprising, then, and may be fairly accurate, that Cyril Houle described

...if the apple had hit Knowles in the head, like it did Newton, Knowles would have published the theory on the law of gravity the next day. It took Newton twenty years of testing before he published the idea.<sup>212</sup>

Observing Knowles as field builder in adult education one gets a clear picture of his spontaneity, as described by Lindeman:

Adult education can at least aid in delivering us from that abject fear of expressing our quick and enthusiastic enjoyments--the fear to which we have become habituated under the discipline of professional criticism. There are people who do not know whether they think the play which they have seen is 'good' or 'bad' until their favorite critic has delivered himself of his

---

<sup>211</sup> van Enckevoort, Ger, Andragology: A New Science, Prepared for Publication in The Journal of Adult Education in Ireland, March, 1971. (Mimeographed.)

<sup>212</sup> Cyril C. Houle, private interview, April, 1970.



oracular judgment in the press the following day. To them, nothing can ever be spontaneously enjoyable--save in a post-mortem conversational sense.<sup>213</sup>

Knowles would have expressed his opinion and enthusiasm during and immediately following the play.

A few illustrations may be cited of his highlighting and adding developments to his andragogy theory since the publication of The Modern Practice of Adult Education. These serve to accent his value of spontaneity above rigorous testing and completeness before publication. Each addition emphasizes a contrast between pedagogy and andragogy.

The videotape on Nebraska Educational Television features Knowles and Dr. Roger Hiemstra from the University of Nebraska in a discussion of andragogy. The discussion emphasizes pedagogical learning experiences are planned according to content designs for transmission of bodies of knowledge. It contrasts andragogical learning experiences as planned according to process designs for mutual self-directed inquiry.<sup>214</sup>

In February, 1972, Knowles plotted the rate of growth of self-perceived as compared with culturally-perceived needs and capacities for self-direction. Obviously: the self-perceived readiness emerged much earlier than the culturally-perceived readiness. The chart suggests that andragogy is designed to close the gap by bringing the cultural perception

---

<sup>213</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. 70.

<sup>214</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles with Roger Hiemstra, Andragogy: A Discussion About a New Concept in Adult Education, A Supplementary Instruction on Videotape, (Lincoln, Nebraska: Nebraska Education Television Council for Higher Education, 1972). Program Announcement, back page.

more in line with the self-perception.<sup>215</sup>

In comparison of the assumptions and processes of andragogy and pedagogy he expands the traditional four assumptions to five. He makes orientation to learning a separate assumption whereas before it had been included as part of the other four: self-concept, experience, readiness and time perspective. Then he presents the seven process elements: climate, planning, diagnosis of needs, formulation of objectives, design, activities, and evaluation. In pedagogy each element is controlled by the teacher. In andragogy the control is mutual between teacher and learners.<sup>216</sup>

In andragogy the emphasis is on developing increased self-direction in learning. Knowles suggests that we only know how to be taught, but not to learn. He emphasizes our need to move away from reactive learning toward proactive learning. He then invites his primary audience, supervisors and employees to join him in listing some required conditions and required skills necessary for reactive and proactive resources for learning to help the learning process to succeed.<sup>217</sup>

There is one characteristic which stands out above all else in this andragogical theory. The principle holds whether in regard to the

<sup>215</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Rate of Growth of Self-Perceived as Compared with Culturally-Perceived Needs and Capacities for Self-Direction," A Chart, Boston, Massachusetts, February, 1972. (Mimeographed.)

<sup>216</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "A Comparison of Assumptions and Processes of Pedagogy and Andragogy," in A Trainer's Handbook to Andragogy: Its Concepts, Experience and Application, by John D. Ingalls and Joseph M. Arceri (Washington, D. C.: Government Printing Office, 1972), p. 176.

<sup>217</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Ways of Learning: Reactive Versus Proactive," Journal of Continuing Education and Training, Vol. I, No. 4 (May, 1972), pp. 235-237.

total field, a specific program development, one class or design model of a learning experience. Knowles states in regard to the several types of learning-design models (organic, operational, role, functional, thematic) he has developed:

I have one basic model which I call my organic model. It can serve as a discrete model for a given learning activity, but it is also a sort of second-level aspect (or counterpoint melody) in all other models.<sup>218</sup>

This basically is consistent with organic centrality stemming back to Lindeman in development of his other theories: elements of good program development and promotion, field of adult education, maturation, doctorate, christian adult education methodology, and program planning process.

#### Sequential Research Needs

Two other works, mentioned in passing, are likely to have an impact upon the field which were presented in 1969. "Sequential Research Needs in Evolving Disciplines of Social Practice" is an unpublished theory paper of Knowles. Higher Adult Education in the United States: The Current Picture, Trends and Issues was published by the American Council on Education.

In terms of history, they may be declared contributions only in the sense that they have been written and presented by Knowles. Whether time will prove them valuable contributions to the extent that others of his works have been to date, remains to be seen.

Whatever may be the weaknesses in studying the contributions of a contemporary or even asserting that a contemporary has made contributions

---

<sup>218</sup> Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, p. 290.

to an emerging field of social practice, these two works should not be passed by without mention.

The paper on "Sequential Research Needs" is as Knowles labeled it "a speculative theory." True to an earlier emergent pattern of his working on field development this is organically-determined, showing his rootage, once again, in Lindeman. During his career he had been associated with three emerging fields of social practice--recreation, social work, and adult education. The research needs idea stemmed from his work on his doctoral dissertation on the adult education movement in the United States. He says,

I began seeing the growth of a field of social practice as a genetic process which proceeds as if by natural law according to an organically determined sequence of phases of development. It struck me that a field of social practice may have developmental needs that change through the stages of maturation--and produce developmental tasks--as does any other organism.<sup>219</sup>

To meet his own need of responding to his doctoral candidates with ever more adequate criteria for selecting research problems he "intuitively speculated about the genetic phases of development of three fields of social practice."<sup>220</sup> The phases of development were described as:

- (1) definition of the field
- (2) differentiation of the field
- (3) standard-setting
- (4) technological refinement
- (5) respectability and justification
- (6) understanding the dynamics of the field.<sup>221</sup>

From the phases of development he deduced what kinds of research fit

---

<sup>219</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Sequential Research Needs in Evolving Disciplines of Social Practice--A Speculative Theory" (A Written Paper, Boston, Massachusetts, November, 1969), pp. 1-6. (Mimeographed.)

<sup>220</sup>Ibid., p. 2.

<sup>221</sup>Ibid., pp. 2-4.

logically into each phase. It may almost be said that it was like items from many places being pulled together and placed in juxtaposition, forming a technological theory on developing a field by research. Because of its unpublished form, it naturally would have a limited audience and influence.

#### Higher Adult Education

Any assessment of the contribution of Higher Adult Education in the United States would have to be more predictive than historical. Be that as it may, predictions will be limited to comments in initial book reviews.

An initial request by a number of adult educators to the American Council on Education asked them to lead in helping toward greater coordination of adult education and to provide a medium for considering current and future issues in this field.<sup>222</sup> The final result was the Council's publication of Malcolm S. Knowles' book, Higher Adult Education in the United States: The Current Picture, Trends and Issues.

While Knowles was asked to author the work, a collaborative adult educational process was initiated in its preparation. The basic design was adapted from another person. Extensive informal memoranda considering contemporary issues were provided from others. Suggestions for revisions of the first draft were made by five people. Abstracts of 170 books were provided.<sup>223</sup>

---

<sup>222</sup> Malcolm S. Knowles, Higher Adult Education in the United States--The Current Picture, Trends, and Issues (Washington, D.C.: American Council on Education, 1969), p. VII.

<sup>223</sup> Ibid., pp. 5-6.

Trent suggested this book is a "must" reading for all adult educators in the United States.<sup>224</sup> Schroeder suggests the book will be valuable for those desiring to "become more informed about what higher adult education has been, is, and probably will be."<sup>225</sup>

Fay goes farther when he says about Knowles book,

I think he has succeeded so well that his tightly-organized, 100-page study may well come to be regarded as a kind of Flexner report of the resources, problems, forces, trends and significant issues of higher adult education in the United States. And, like Flexner's earlier report on the status of medical education, Knowles' baseline appraisal circa 1970 will be consulted, quoted and referred to, I predict, for years to come by various policy decision-makers in the councils of higher education managers of operating units such as the university extension division and evening college, and by professional students of the field of adult education who monitor its growth and development.<sup>226</sup>

Knowles hoped that publishing the book would "launch a higher adult educational process."<sup>227</sup> The writer knows, for a fact, that in the extension division of one institution of higher education, the University of Missouri, the book is found on the desks of a number of the campus dean's of extension as well as many of the others involved in continuing adult education. Although this has not become a part of formal sessions where the writer of this research is involved, he has been involved in a number of informal conversations with other staff members focused on

---

<sup>224</sup>Curtis Trent, review of Higher Adult Education in the United States: The Current Picture, Trends and Issues, by Malcolm S. Knowles, in the Journal of Extension, Summer, 1970, p. 54.

<sup>225</sup>Wayne L. Schroeder, review of Higher Adult Education in the United States, by Malcolm S. Knowles, in the Adult Education Journal, 1970, p. 243.

<sup>226</sup>Francis Fay, review of Higher Adult Education in the United States, by Malcolm S. Knowles, in Adult Leadership, January, 1971, p. 237.

<sup>227</sup>Knowles, Higher Adult Education in the United States--The Current Picture, Trends, and Issues, p. 5.

topics in that book.

Knowles' contribution to adult education while at Boston University was that of a theory builder. Some of his colleagues expressed that Boston University was a place for Knowles to stand and be "Professor to the World." From this place he could engage the field of adult education in a developmental process.

Some observations and questions about his theories\* seem to be in order. First, in each theory the organic development theme forms the basis for the theory. Thus they are comprehensive in terms of subject being discussed. Second, in each one, Knowles states explicitly or implicitly that he considers the theory speculative. Therefore, each may need to be updated in the future or must be considered incomplete in its present form. Third, Knowles asks in presenting his theories that they be put to rigorous intellectual tests. He suggests such questions as:

How do these speculations stand up in light of your experience?  
Does the very notion of genetically-determined phases of development of a field social practice make sense to you? If not, what alternative guidelines...make more sense?<sup>228</sup>

Another statement was that a full work would become "a guide to discussion

---

<sup>228</sup>Knowles, "Sequential Research Needs in Evolving Disciplines of Social Practice—A Speculative Theory," p. 6.

\*Note: His theories are:

- (1) Elements of Good Program Development and Promotion
- (2) Maturation
- (3) Doctorate
- (4) Christian Adult Education Methodology
- (5) Field of Adult Education
- (6) Program Planning Process
- (7) Sequential Research Needs
- (8) Current Picture, Trends and Issues in Higher Adult Education
- (9) Andragogy

and inquiry."<sup>229</sup> In another work he asks that his readers test his ideas, assumptions, and convictions against their own experiences, adopt those that make sense to them and build on them creatively.<sup>230</sup>

To date, this writer is not aware of any one who has directed a response to Knowles on any of these questions.

In 1950, another work states,

Principles and techniques of operation, developed through trial and error have not been sufficiently tested to justify putting them down in black and white. The time has come, however, to make a beginning in formulating good principles and good practices, and submitting them to the test of experience.<sup>231</sup>

On his theory of the dimensions of maturation he said,

I present them with great tentativeness, in the hope that others will enter in the process of refining, clarifying and testing them. My greatest hope is that they will provide some hypotheses for research.<sup>232</sup>

In still another he indicates, "The intention of the author is to engage with the reader in an inquiry...exploring open-mindedly..."<sup>233</sup>

Another:

The ultimate purpose of this study is to propose...a theory in the hope that it will provide guidance for the further development of the adult educational field in this country. While such a theory must necessarily be highly tentative, it should be capable

---

<sup>229</sup>Knowles, Higher Adult Education in the United States--The Current Picture, Trends, and Issues, p. 5.

<sup>230</sup>Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, p. 16.

<sup>231</sup>Knowles, Informal Adult Education, p. VIII.

<sup>232</sup>Knowles, "Maturation as a Guide to Learning: A Multi-Dimensional Approach to Liberal Education," p. 151.

<sup>233</sup>Knowles, "Adult Education--No Longer a Stepchild," p. 73.



of being tested empirically by application in the policies and programs of local, state and national co-ordinative organizations.<sup>234</sup>

Finally:

...Boston University graduate program in adult education was inaugurated in 1960....I should like to present the theory on which the Boston University program was based ten years ago and to invite reactions as to how it holds up ten years later.<sup>235</sup>

Has Knowles received a response to his questions of how the theories stand up against other's adult education practice and thinking? If there is no response this may be because Knowles' request for "rigorous intellectual testing" and the like was never intended to elicit such a response. If it were intended for direct response, maybe one gets responses by asking specific people rather than making it an open ended invitation. It may be that the invitation to respond contained in the body of a writing seems unreal, unclear and gets lost. Again, it may be that the professionals, leaders, followers, workers, writers in adult education are so busy with their own concerns or theories that to give a direct response to a theorizer-writer is out of the question. Still further, it may be that a professional has vested interests and reasons something like this, "Why should I take my time to respond to him? Who said his ideas are any better than mine?" There may not be any direct responses to such statements or questions in a writing.

It may be that in order to receive a response it requires the person asking directly rather than through a writing. Or, the response

---

<sup>234</sup>Knowles, "The Development of a Co-ordinated Adult Educational Movement in the United States," p. 4.

<sup>235</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Professional Education for Adult Educators," Journal of Continuing Education and Training, Vol. 1, No. 1, (May, 1971), p. 6.

may be reflected through general tendencies in the total field. It would be almost too early to tell. In any event, the experimental character of the theories stands out clearly and it takes a certain stance toward life to be experimental, much as Lindeman describes a man who:

...persists in believing and acting as though the human enterprise were an everlasting experiment in which the outcome is uncertain and contingent but a continuing adventure, an exciting exploration.<sup>236</sup>

In addition there are other responses that may indicate the effects Knowles has had with his speculative theories.

### Spin-offs

There have been some spin-offs from Knowles' work and associations that have been described in writing. In addition, part of the process of this research was intended to gain the assessment of Knowles by others largely in the field of adult education. It may be that his contributions, at least as others viewed them, are more in his writing and their personal, professional and behavioral change as adult educators rather than in using his material in their writing. The spin-offs will be considered as the last part of this chapter. The assessment of others will form a subsequent chapter.

The items included here will be those elements of Knowles' writings and work included in the writings of others known by this writer. The one exception to this will be his own case description of his work with the Girl Scouts instead of a case description by someone else. The spin-offs range from inclusion of a small section of adult education method selection in a pamphlet to a description of Knowles' intervention

---

<sup>236</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, p. XXII.

into a national social system.

Dr. Leonard Nadler

Dr. Leonard Nadler in a monograph on A Process of Training indicated:

Training which is job oriented can be analyzed and developed through a deductive approach. That is, the use of an orderly process which involves the following steps:

1. Develop job standards
2. Identify needs
3. Determine objectives
4. Develop curriculum
5. Select methods and materials
6. Obtain instructional resources
7. Conduct training
8. Evaluate and feedback<sup>237</sup>

The "orderly process" of eight steps he built into a recycling model of training process. In the fifth step on selection of "methods and materials" Nadler suggests that a way to look at the function to be performed in that selection of methods would be in terms of "behavioral change desired."<sup>238</sup> He uses four of Knowles' types of behavioral changes; namely, knowledge, understanding, skill and attitude. He follows those with Knowles' suggested methods which are most appropriate for effecting those changes.<sup>239</sup>

Basically, this spin-off is one of Nadler using one small part of Knowles' adult education technology and integrating it within his own writing of a short fifteen page monograph.

---

<sup>237</sup> Leonard Nadler, A Process of Training (Washington, D. C.: Leadership Resources, Inc., 1968), p. 3.

<sup>238</sup> Ibid., p. 10.

<sup>239</sup> Ibid., pp. 10-11.

Dr. Donald Klein

Dr. Donald C. Klein served as executive director of the Wellesley, Massachusetts, Human Relations Service and the director of Boston University Human Relations Center. He was author in 1968 of Community Dynamics and Mental Health. He is one of the pioneers in demonstration centers in community mental health. In reviewing Klein's book Glen Goerke has this to say,

Dr. Klein, in the preface of the volume, indicates that at the suggestion of adult educator Malcolm Knowles, he used the deliberate device of addressing himself to six of his good friends who were chosen from differing backgrounds in the hope that he would indeed be expressing himself with understanding to a wider audience. Dr. Knowles is to be commended for his suggestion to the author and beyond any shadow of a doubt, Dr. Klein has indeed accomplished his mission.<sup>240</sup>

To what extent, Klein accomplished his mission would have to be left to an individual, subjective assessment. Even if Knowles' suggestion did influence Klein's writing, the fact is that Klein let it happen and asked Knowles for the suggestion in the first place. However, it would seem safe to assume the relationship was of such significance that Klein trusted Knowles' judgment enough to ask him. Further, Knowles' suggestion was evidently clear enough and made a sufficient impact on Klein so that he used it as the communication structure for the book to such an extent, Goerke could say Klein "indeed accomplished his mission."

Dr. Watson Dickerman

When Watson Dickerman wrote the concluding chapter, "Implications of This Book..." in Adult Education: Outlines of an Emerging Field of

<sup>240</sup> Glenn A. Goerke, Review of Community Dynamics and Mental Health, by Donald C. Klein, in the Adult Leadership, November, 1970, p. 167.

University Study, he had this to say,

This concluding chapter is not intended as a summary of the preceding chapters. Rather it is addressed to persons who have responsibility for planning or improving programs of graduate study in education, and it invites their attention to some of the things that are said in the preceding chapters and in the literature.<sup>241</sup>

In regard to objectives of graduate programs in adult education Dickerson suggested that they must be rooted in the characteristics and needs of their students. He then drew attention to Liveright's reference to the five objectives common to "programs of professional education" for a number of professions. He then invited the attention of those people responsible for programs in graduate adult education to something Knowles said in the "literature," not a "preceding chapter."

According to Knowles, planning a program of graduate study in adult education is more complex than merely establishing objectives. He suggests a five-step process<sup>242</sup> and illustrates the outcome....<sup>243</sup>

The material to which Dickerman refers is from Knowles' "A General Theory of the Doctorate in Education," upon which the Boston University program was based. Knowles' theory or conception of what a doctoral program in adult education is, is not hailed as the last word. Nor is it seen as being right or agreed to by professionals in the field.

It may be argued by some that the Doctor of Education degree, is for professional training for adult education and the Doctor of

---

<sup>241</sup>Dickerman, "Implications of this Book for Programs of Graduate Study in Adult Education," p. 307.

<sup>242</sup>See supra, p. 101, note 125.

<sup>243</sup>Dickerman, "Implications of this Book for Programs of Graduate Study in Adult Education," p. 308.

Philosophy degree is for graduate training for adult education.<sup>244</sup> One of the implications of this argument seems to be that only in a Ph. D. program does one write a thesis and thus make an original contribution to knowledge.<sup>245</sup> However, it should be noted that despite the Boston University graduate adult education program being limited to awarding Ed.D. degrees, a thesis is required for each degree awarded. A partial list of theses is included elsewhere in this research.<sup>246</sup> Moreover, Knowles indicated that he did not design the Boston University adult education graduate program any differently for the Ed.D. degree than if the program had been for awarding the Ph.D. degree.<sup>247</sup> His perception is that one of the present crying needs of the adult education field building is for developing professional practitioners who know how to apply andragogical theory and method rather than developing a host of research scholars.<sup>248</sup>

Nevertheless, to date there must not have appeared as comprehensive a model and theory for graduate adult education as Knowles' theory. At least, this would appear so from the fact that Dickerman presented this theory, incomplete as it may be, and not any others. In any event,

---

<sup>244</sup>Houle, "The Educators of Adults," p. 116.

<sup>245</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>246</sup>See supra, pp. 169-196.

<sup>247</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, private telephone conversation with this author, January 25, 1973.

<sup>248</sup>Knowles, private interview, May, 1968.

he was suggesting that Knowles' theory may be worth considering by those responsible to plan graduate programs in adult education,<sup>249</sup> in spite of the fact that the editors of the book suggested it "not be perceived as the last word about professional development in adult education."<sup>250</sup>

In two of the gaps in Knowles' theory, Dickerman took the editors seriously, using it as "the basis for further systematic organization of the field."<sup>251</sup> He suggests that Chamberlain<sup>252</sup> carries Knowles' "relevant competencies" exploration farther, and Aker<sup>253</sup> attempts to establish Knowles' behavioral changes sought.

Dr. Theodore A. Austin

Another spin-off from Knowles' Theory of the Doctorate is by Theodore A. Austin's unpublished Ed.D. dissertation at Boston University School of Education. The major question to which he sought an answer was: What are the competencies which hospital executives need in order to perform their role effectively as perceived by hospital leaders and what are the implications of these required competencies for the

---

<sup>249</sup>Dickerman, "Implications of this Book for Programs of Graduate Study in Adult Education," pp. 308-310.

<sup>250</sup>Gale Jensen, A. A. Liveright, Wilbur Hallenbeck, eds., Adult Education: Outlines of an Emerging Field of University Study. (Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1964), pp. iii.

<sup>251</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>252</sup>Martin H. Chamberlain, "The Professional Adult Educator: An Examination of His Competencies and of the Programs of Graduate Study which Prepare Him for Work in the Field." (Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Chicago, November, 1960), pp. 83-90.

<sup>253</sup>George F. Aker, "Criteria for Evaluating Graduate Programs in Adult Education," Findings of a Study Conducted for The Commission of Professors of Adult Education, The University of Chicago, Center for Continuing Education, Chicago, 3-11-63, pp. 12-13. (Mimeographed.)

professional education of hospital administrators?

Mr. Austin was at that time Executive Director of the Medical Center in Jersey City, New Jersey. He received encouragement from Mr. R. J. Stull, Executive Vice President of the American College of Hospital Administrators indicating that the research could be of help as the college upgraded its programs of continuing hospital administration education, and updated and revised the written examinations for membership.

Mr. Austin suggested that a similar approach, to Knowles' role theory being competency-centered rather than subject-centered, can be taken with the educational program for hospital administrators.

Tracing the dynamic development and changes of hospital administration, Austin advocates that the most important part of professional education should be the development of an educational theory to meet these changes. He suggests that the traditional pedagogical theory is inadequate for the professional education of hospital administrators. He further indicates elements of his proposed theory of learning for hospital administrators. It is presented here highlighting its similarity to Knowles' andragogical theory and process included elsewhere.<sup>254</sup>

1. Self-directing, responsible students as candidates.
2. Proper social climate.
3. Opportunity to diagnose educational needs.
4. Opportunity to participate in the decision-making process concerning the curriculum.
5. Opportunity to participate in conducting the learning experiences.
6. Opportunity for evaluation of progress toward goals.

The student, at this time and place in his educational development, should be free to develop his own thoughts and ideas and assume responsibility for his development. The environment and social conditions must be conducive to learning and the student must be

---

<sup>254</sup>See supra, p. 127, note 201; p. 125, note 195; p. 122, note 190.



free to discuss his thoughts, ideas and problems with faculty and students. There should be a climate of informality so that the student will feel unrestricted.

The individual is able to diagnose his own needs better than anyone else. Through complete introspection, the student can develop those competencies that are weak and can recognize those competencies that are more fully developed and require less attention. Learning should be problem-centered rather than subject-centered and the student must have the opportunity to participate in formulating a curriculum that will stimulate his particular interests.

Through participating in the learning experiences, the individual can more clearly determine the goals that he is seeking for his educational experience and can also assist in the selection of teaching methods for his own program. The informal methods of discussion through team learning, seminars, field trips, lecture series, group projects and other methods should be considered by the individual and the group. By participating in the learning process, the proper social climate will be enhanced.

The student should participate in his own evaluation. The learner himself establishes his goals and can best recognize whether or not they have been attained. In addition to evaluating his own progress, the student should evaluate the group that he is affiliated with and the course content.<sup>255</sup>

In the process of determining competencies needed for hospital administrators, skill and knowledge were the two dimensions utilized. Twelve items of each skill and knowledge were finally determined as comprehensive. An appropriate learning activity was attached to each skill and knowledge. These were at a high level of abstraction. However, in a given institution the process<sup>256</sup> will have to be continued through the following steps: (1) identifying the desired behavioral outcomes for each competency objective; (2) devising procedures for helping students diagnose their present level of performance and evaluate changes in their

---

<sup>255</sup>Theodore A. Austin, "The Perceptions of Key Hospital Leaders As To the Competencies Required For Hospital Administration and Their Implications For Professional Education;" (unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1968), pp. 137, 138.

<sup>256</sup>See supra, p. 101, note 125. The process is much the same as suggested in Knowles last three steps except the top two in those three are in reverse order in Austin.

performance; and (3) construct specific learning experiences designed to produce behavioral outcomes. One knowledge and one skill was used to illustrate the curriculum process. It will be noted by comparison that Knowles' left out the two intermediate steps on his charting while Austin referred to them in his step by step process. (Refer to Curriculum Chart on following page.)

The conclusions of Austin's study are: (1) Practicing hospital leaders tend to place less emphasis on competencies having to do with interpersonal relations and organizational change than do the contemporary management theorists as reflected in the literature; and (2) A curriculum for the preparation of hospital administrators should seek to develop both those competencies perceived to be required by current hospital leaders and those projected as required in the future by management theorists. A model of such a curriculum is proposed, based on concepts of adult education.<sup>257</sup>

Mr. Clarence H. Thompson

Another spin-off was a direct outgrowth of Knowles' differentiation between youthful and adult learners. Commission XIII of the American College Personnel Association is charged with providing leadership in "Student Personnel Work for Adults in Higher Education." Clarence H. Thompson, Dean of University College, Drake University, Des Moines, Iowa, was chairman of Commission XIII in 1967. A Pre-Convention Workshop, held by the American College Personnel Association in Dallas, Texas, March

---

<sup>257</sup> Austin, "The Perceptions of Key Hospital Leaders As To the Competencies Required for Hospital Administration and Their Implications For Professional Education." pp. 3, 136-154.

CURRICULUM PROCESS

COMPETENCY OBJECTIVE	DESIRED BEHAVIOR	DIAGNOSTIC AND EVALUATIVE PROCEDURE	SPECIFIC LEARNING EXPERIENCE
Knowledge of internal structure and organization of hospitals.	Is able to conceptualize typologies of hospitals, according to size, ownership, function and facilities.	Conceptual experiences such as writing an article on types of hospitals.	Reading and synthesizing formal articles. Field visits to various types of hospitals.
	Understands formal and informal organizational structures.	Critical incident cases on problems of staffline relationships.	Reading studies of organizational structure. Simulation exercises in which teams compete to build new organizations.
Ability to interact and communicate with groups.	Is able to conceptualize in large and small groups.	Becomes a member of a discussion group, observes and interacts.	Given a specific task within a group to perform.
	Understands skills needed to work different groups in various capacities.	Participates in both large group and mini-group discussions.	Given the opportunity to be a group leader.
	Understands individual and group leadership role.		

17-18, 1967, dealt with (1) The Special Characteristics and Needs of Adult Participants; (2) Implications for Counseling; (3) Recent Progress and Remaining Areas of Need in Adult Counseling and (4) The Selection and Training of Personnel Workers for Adults in Evening Colleges. There were twelve people in attendance from New York, Colorado, New Orleans, Flint and others. Four leaders were also at the workshop.

Clarence H. Thompson in describing the nature of adult students bases his comments on Knowles' concept of the difference between an adult and youth as in his role, ranging from dependency on the one extreme to independence on the other. Thompson states there are five differences between adults and youth that have implications for higher education and adult counseling. These are based in large part on Knowles' assumptions for his theory of andragogy.<sup>258</sup>

1. An adult has a different self-concept from youth when he comes into a learning situation—more self-directing than dependent. Thus, it means that we might have to help the adult by orienting him to the fact that learning for the adult is different; that for the adult, there are new ways of learning, different from that of youth.

2. An adult comes into a situation with a different body of experience. It is important to use educational devices that he can relate to his experience such as discussion, business games, case method, socio-drama, role playing, sensitivity training and the incident method.

3. Adults enter into a learning situation with a different set of developmental tasks. This has obvious relevance for curriculum planning for adults as well as youth.

---

<sup>258</sup>See supra, p. 122, note 190.

4. Adults differ from youth by entering into a learning situation for immediate use of learnings; for the solving of problems. Youth enters with the idea of postponed use of learnings. Youth orientation is subject-centered. Adults orientation is problem centered.

5. Adults enter into the learning situation voluntarily. Education for youth is compulsory.

Because adults are different, Thompson argues that they need the help of personnel workers and counselors who understand the differing nature of the adult student.

The overall workshop evaluation of his paper was generally positive and indicated an "ability to integrate the important factors that operate in making the adult different from the younger student." It well-documented the case for the need for counseling the adult. This paper has become one of the most quoted in American College Personnel circles in regard to the need for adult student counseling in higher education.<sup>259</sup>

#### The YMCA Organization Development Project

Another spin-off is in connection with a large social system, the YMCA. Knowles has indicated,

...I consider...one of the major trends in the role of the professional adult educator as being away from the definition of his constituency in terms of individuals, toward its definition in terms of social systems.<sup>260</sup>

In addition,

My primary focus in change is education; changing the educational

---

<sup>259</sup>Report of Commission 13 on Student Personnel Work for Adults in Higher Education, Clarence H. Thompson, chairman (Bethesda, Md.: ERIC Document Reproduction Service, 1967), pp. III, 2-5, 11, 39, 57-58.

<sup>260</sup>Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, p. 363.

capability, the quality of the environment. When I enter into a relationship with a social system I see my primary mission as being to help that social system be more effective in managing its own educational processes.<sup>261</sup>

Once again, it is obvious Knowles is aiming toward building the educative society. Or when this happens as Lindeman stated it, "Education is life and life is education."<sup>262</sup>

As was mentioned before, Knowles has had a working relationship with parts of the YMCA since 1940.<sup>263</sup> Until 1960, the staff professional society had been responsible for most of the professional staff training conducted on an area, state or national basis. In May 1960 the National Council of YMCA recognized its own responsibility for professional training. A special committee was set up in 1960 under the chairmanship of William Eastman to plan a school for general and executive secretaries in the YMCA. The result was the Organization Development Project (ODP), which was initially established for a three-year experimental period from 1961 through 1963, and was later extended through 1966.

The prime target in that program was to work more effectively toward association goals. This was to be done through development of key staff persons across the country. Appropriate objectives were set for the program. Where possible, teams came from the same YMCA, to better conserve and implement learnings in the home organization. Thirty-one outside consultants were involved in the leadership teams of ODP.

In ODP and most other YMCA programs in which consultant staff

---

<sup>261</sup>Knowles, private interview, May, 1968.

<sup>262</sup>Lindeman, The Meaning of Adult Education, pp. 5-6.

<sup>263</sup>See supra, p. 57, note 10.

have been engaged, one member of the consultant staff has been designated as the dean. It was his responsibility to serve as the chief of the consultants, giving direction to the training program and coordinating and deploying the leadership resources available.

Dr. Malcolm Knowles of Boston University served as dean during the first three-year period (1961-1963) of ODP. Although it was assumed that sensitivity training would probably be an appropriate technique to achieve certain of the learning goals of the ODP program, the participants themselves had a major say in the actual design and focus of the first three-year program, as they worked with the leadership team in an intensive two-day experience of assessing needs and identifying appropriate goals of the training experience. The result was that the ODP focus for 1961 was upon the individual and the group, for 1962 upon the organization, and for 1963 was upon the community.<sup>264</sup>

In 1962 Canada YMCA became involved. In 1964 decentralization began to take place. By 1966, 625 of 4,000 Professional YMCA Staff in the United States had participated in ODP.<sup>265</sup>

The ODP is an illustration of Knowles' contrast between putting on a program for a social system and helping a social system become more effective in managing its own educational processes. Knowles has this to say,

My primary focus in change is education: Changing the educational capability of an organization, the quality of the environment. When I enter into a relationship with a social system I see my primary mission as being to help that social system be more effective in managing its own educational processes. When I worked with the YMCA in ODP I had the choice of recruiting a lot of outsiders to come in to work with me in putting on a program that would have produced some behavioral changes in the participants. No doubt it would have done a lot of good and made a lot of difference in the organization's operation. However, after we went out, pulled back from the social system, they would have had relatively the same

---

<sup>264</sup>Richard L. Batchelder and James M. Hardy, Using Sensitivity Training and the Laboratory Method (New York: Association Press, 1968, p. 31.

<sup>265</sup>*Ibid.*, pp. 28-31, 36.

stance as they were before so far as carrying on their own educational program. So part of my contract requirement was that they would take responsibility for and would be willing to invest in the recruitment of a cadre of potential trainers to learn how to do a better job of training. Now the single most important effect of the three-year project that I engaged in was that when I left it after three years there was in existence in the YMCA a core of fifty very skillful and by that time, experienced educational designers and executors.<sup>266</sup>

### Girl Scouts of U.S.A.

A second program in which Knowles has been involved as an adult educator with a total social system is the Girl Scouts of the U.S.A. Knowles noted in 1968, "...it is the most elaborate program I know of using a design that is based on pure andragogical principles."<sup>267</sup>

In January, 1964 Knowles was approached by the Girl Scouts concerning his interest in helping the organization develop a national program for training volunteer leaders. Some ferment had preceded this inquiry. Some feeling of need for more creative involvement of the scouts, enthusiasm for new development to involve, training in how to further involve the scouts, and increased board listening to leaders. As a result The National Board approved and budgeted half million dollars for the Leader Training Project (LTP). Knowles was contacted at the suggestion of Fancon Hamilton in the organization who had "read his books, heard others talk about him and liked his philosophy of education and his way of working."

Most important, the staff and volunteers who had developed LTP were agreed that a training design should be based on "the soundest and

---

<sup>266</sup>Knowles, private interview, May, 1968.

<sup>267</sup>Loc. cit.



most modern concepts of adult education" and Knowles was the man they felt would do this best.

Knowles responded to the inquiry affirmatively, on the basis that this would be an opportunity to apply and test some of the newer concepts of adult education. Many of the newer concepts were and are in the embryonic stages of being applied and tested. Knowles had certain convictions that he felt the Girl Scouts ought to consider before making a final decision. These were:

- (1) that the principal mission of an adult educational consultant to a social system such as the Girl Scouts should be to 'educate the system'—in the sense of building up its own internal adult education competencies—rather than to produce a program for it; and (2) an educational philosophy premised on providing individuals with the skills of self-directed self development produced better long-run effects than one predicated on producing (specific behavioral) results through package programs imposed from above.<sup>263</sup>

These convictions were checked out with the organization. They agreed to them and a contract was signed with Leadership Resources, Inc., (LRI) a consulting firm with which Knowles was affiliated. Eight other adult educators from LRI also became involved in the project.

Regarding the development of a training design the following steps were used:

- (1) Convening of a 'Design Conference' in March, 1964.
  - (a) Some national staff, field staff and volunteer trainers were invited.
  - (b) Guidelines for developing a design were agreed upon.
  - (c) Behavioral objectives were developed by analysis of the competencies that seemed to be required of a successful leader as derived from
    - reports from the field.
    - experience of the experienced trainers, and
    - a content analysis of the leaders' handbooks.

---

<sup>268</sup>loc. cit.

- (d) Specific suggestions regarding techniques and materials for the design to be considered by the staff and consultants in the next phase.
- (2) The shaping up of a design for field testing and the development of teaching tools and materials ran until December, 1964.
- (3) Testing of the first design with 178 participants in six Girl Scout councils.
  - (a) Current research data on behavioral changes—shifted from instrumental to observational. Spring, 1965.
  - (b) Evaluate revised design and materials by 614 participants, February, 1966.
- (4) Tooling up for launching the new training design nationwide.<sup>269</sup>

Ultimately the design consisted of three steps: (1) diagnosis of learning needs; (2) learning activities; and (3) sharing. The cycle may recur with each leader working in any number of ways on her own sequential learning needs: independently, with a helper, in groups of two or three, and with larger groups. It once again shows the organic nature of Knowles' concept of learning which stems through the group dynamics emphasis back to Lindeman. This was a discrete design for a learning model but had as the counterpoint theme the seven steps in the andragogical process referred to elsewhere.<sup>270</sup>

As Knowles reflected on the applications of the four basic assumptions<sup>271</sup> to this Girl Scout LTP it appeared as follows: (1) Self-Concept--The student body (Girl Scouts) was deeply and directly involved in creating the new learning experience and in planning for its execution. It was their plan; it was not imposed on them. (2) Resource for learning--The

---

<sup>269</sup>Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, p. 369.

<sup>270</sup>See supra, p. 127, note 201.

<sup>271</sup>See supra, p. 122, note 190.

rich experience of the Girl Scouts in the previous training of hundreds of thousands of volunteer leaders was an important resource and was built on creativity in constructing a new design approach. (3) Readiness to learn—The design took into account the difference in readiness among local councils and among individuals within local councils to engage in a new activity, and made provision for maximum flexibility, in degree and timing of participation. (4) Time Perspective—The process was problem-centered, in that it started with an exhaustive analysis of the problems of Girl Scout Troop leaders, trainers and organizational managers as they saw them, and the emergent design was constantly tested and modified through feedback about how well it was meeting these problems.

At the point of Knowles' departure as the Girl Scout National Consultant, before it was launched nationwide several outcomes were visible:

- (1) Enthusiasm high for the new approach.
- (2) New design found effective with everyone.
- (3) A majority responded positively to this new way of learning.
- (4) Training experience resulted in more scout involvement, more growth oriented climate.
- (5) Leaders are continuing self-directed learning.

After the Design was launched nationally there was some additional evidence as to the results. Miss Fanchon Hamilton of the Training Department reports:

- (1) Increased girl and leader tenure;
- (2) The curve of normal distribution applied with some high, some low and some in middle;
- (3) Administrators are re-examining and strengthening primary and supporting services to leaders in the light of leaders expressed needs;
- (4) Convictions about the adult learning theory on which the design is based is finding expression in learning opportunities and resources made available to many adults other than leaders; and

- (5) The real test of the Girl Scouts new design for learning is yet to come. Old habits are hard to shed. But we have courage, vision and the stakes are high.<sup>272</sup>

Dr. Eugene E. DuBois

This spin-off needs to be set in a context of two observations:

- (1) Can the system andragogy and the process originated by one man be transmitted by him and be replicated by another? and (2) Is andragogy only applicable to graduate students and other adults, or is it applicable also to undergraduate students and children in general?

In regard to replication, reference to two modern psychologists may serve to present pictures of contrast. The contrast was given the writer in an interview with Cyril Houle. The psychologists are Carl Rogers and Sigmund Freud.

Carl Rogers is the father of non-directive counseling. He built it into a massive system which everyone could understand if they took time. He developed much research about it and had a very careful practicum. Yet it is true that Rogers got results that none of his students have been able to replicate. I was around here (The University of Chicago) and saw them on a day to day basis. Somehow or other, Rogers could really produce results. There was some charisma, some magnetism in his personality, some freedom from restraint, some kind of a thing that he had so that very few of his students have been able to replicate. The system as a system has somewhat receded because it isn't carried forward.<sup>273</sup>

It will be remembered that Knowles was involved in Rogers practicum at the University of Chicago. Rogers was the one who gave Knowles' congruence. However, Knowles incorporated some of Rogers concepts, with the help of Leland Bradford, into his system of andragogy and for that matter, all of his educational flavor. But, Knowles is an adult educator

---

<sup>272</sup> Knowles, "How Andragogy Works in Leadership Training in the Girl Scouts," pp. 161-162, 190-194.

<sup>273</sup> Houle, private interview, April, 1970.

utilizing the flavor of Rogers, namely, "the forward moving tendency of the organism." Knowles is not a psychotherapist seeking to replicate the Rogerian nondirective system.

As a contrast to Rogers, Sigmund Freud presents a different picture.

The psychoanalytic system of Freud is quite the reverse from Rogers. Freud's system seemed to be a system that a number of people could be trained in and could be used. It has survived and seems to be growing because it can be replicated.<sup>274</sup>

The very hard tests of whether a person is or is not a system builder is then the breadth of relevance of a number of ideals, a capacity to affect permanent change, capacity to replicate the system by putting it into the hands of other people who can use it effectively. It may be seen, shortly, that in at least one instance, it has been replicated by another person besides Knowles.

In regard to andragogy's relevance to more than graduate students, to undergraduates specifically, the same instance as referred to above has been related to undergraduates.

At times there have been allegations that Knowles makes too great a contrast between youth as learners and adults as learners.

Referring to the first ten years of experimenting with and developing this theory of andragogy as it specifically relates to the Boston University Graduate Adult Education Program, Knowles has this to say:

...I believe that the principles and techniques that have emerged from it are applicable, with some adjustments for differences in levels of maturity, to the teaching of undergraduates--and, indeed, of all children and youth.<sup>275</sup>

---

<sup>274</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>275</sup>Knowles, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, p. 371.

He sheds some additional light on his views, concerning this, elsewhere.

The differences between children and adults are not so much real differences, I believe, as differences in assumptions about them that are made in traditional pedagogy. Actually, in my observation (and retrospection), the child starts fairly early to see himself as being self-directing in broadening areas of his life. He starts accumulating experience that has increasing value for learning; he starts preparing for social roles (such as through part-time jobs) and therefore experiencing adult-like readiness to learn; and he encounters life problems for which he would like some learnings for immediate application. Therefore many of the principles of andragogy have direct relevance to the education of children and youth.<sup>276</sup>

In January, 1967, Dr. Eugene DuBois joined the Boston University School of Education faculty, as Assistant Professor. His position was in the Department of Administration and Supervision, the same department as adult education. His special teaching field was the junior and community college, one facet of higher and adult education.

Shortly after DuBois' arrival, Knowles became ill and was unable to teach for a full semester. In that semester DuBois shouldered Knowles' teaching load in addition to his own, and had responsibility for all the adult education graduate students. The group dynamics movement has done some pioneering in the development of leadership by producing a leadership vacuum. So it was that a leadership vacuum in the adult education specialization was produced by Knowles becoming ill. DuBois was catapulted into the adult education leadership position. He also found himself immersed in a system of andragogy. He has been Knowles' close associate in the experimental teaching of adult education (andragogy) ever since.

---

<sup>276</sup>Ibid., pp. 53-54. Note: A close check on this quote reveals the four assumptions of andragogy related to children and youth. See *supra*, p.

With this background of experience in using the concepts of andragogy with graduate students and adults in non-university settings, DuBois "hypothesized" that this basic learning design would be appropriate for undergraduate education with some minor modifications.

This hypothesis was discussed with a score of educators and it was decided to experiment with a class of undergraduates in a New England state college.<sup>277</sup>

The course was titled Minority Group Relations, studying broad sociological principles, dynamics, history, current scene and their acculturation.

Climate setting became the first order of business with informality being the norm. Following this DuBois stated his objectives, giving the students opportunity to use their own objectives. The objectives were behavioral in an andragogical sense, that is, to develop appreciation, acquire knowledge, achieve a healthy attitude, gain insight and to acquire understanding. Provision was not made for objective testing, but measuring would be by intuition.

The third step was in identifying student interest areas and eighteen emerged with one to four persons in each group. The areas were rather global but the benefits were felt to outweigh the liabilities. Negotiations took place to prevent overlapping of content with different groups.

A fourth step included extensive inputs by Professor DuBois in the form of lecturettes, films, debates, book based discussions. Next, the teaching-learning teams met separately, with the Professor available

---

<sup>277</sup> Eugene E. DuPois, "An Experiment With the Teaching-Learning Team: Group Self-Directed Learning in Undergraduate Education," Adult Leadership, May, 1971, p. 15.

as a resource consultant, to prepare their presentations according to area of interest.

The presentations of learning experience ranged from the time-worn lecture to mini-lab, field trip, interviews and multi-media teaching aids.

The evaluation step included such elements as take-home learning experience (exam), a question asking students to report regarding extent of change accomplished, attaching a letter grade to that report which would be the grade reported to the college registrar.

A quick check of Knowles' seven steps in andragogical process<sup>278</sup> reveals the process DuBois used with these undergraduates is basically the same with the exception of the order reversal of step three (diagnosis of needs) and step four (formulation of objectives). In DuBois' case the objectives phase were his stating his objectives with the students buying into them without formulating their own. This he intimated was because their educational experience had taught them not to think for themselves. In the diagnosis of needs phase those took the form of areas of interest for inquiry.

DuBois major conclusions after the experience were that: (1) High student interest was maintained throughout by using their own contacts, creativity of design and breadth of subject areas rather than being limited to the professor's resources in these areas; (2) Advantages of the teaching-learning teams were gained by peer development of learning material and design, competition used for mutual benefit, participatory learning increased, variety of learning design, adult methods applied and found useful

---

<sup>278</sup> See supra, p. 127, note 201.



with undergraduates, and thoroughness was present and student reaction was positive; and (3) It would appear from this experience that undergraduates are ready and capable of participating

in learning designs in which they take responsibility for the initial design as well as instruction, and that the principles of andragogy are equally applicable to undergraduates as well as older adults.<sup>279</sup>

In this one instance thus far, the principles and practice of andragogy are replicable by someone (DuBois) other than its first expressor (Knowles) in this country and are equally applicable with minor modification to undergraduate students as well as graduate students and adults.

#### Dr. John Ohliger

To this writer, the best available published spin-off illustration of Knowles' graduate class method being adapted to liberal adult education was by Dr. John Ohliger at Ohio State University College of Education. The Winter 1971 quarter in graduate adult education saw a seminar of two sections of fifteen participants each interpreting, drawing implications from and critically analyzing the ideas of Ivan Illich and his colleagues.<sup>280</sup>

Dr. Ohliger and Colleen McCarthy describe the criteria of admittance to the seminar.

---

<sup>279</sup>DuBois, "An Experiment With the Teaching-Learning Team: Group Self-Directed Learning in Undergraduate Education," pp. 14-16, 38.

<sup>280</sup>John Ohliger and Colleen McCarthy, Lifelong Learning or Lifelong Schooling? A Tentative View of the Ideas of Ivan Illich With Quotational Bibliography (Syracuse, N. Y.: Publications in Continuing Education and MEC Clearinghouse on Adult Education, 1971), pp. 1-95.

Before being admitted to the seminar, each potential participant was asked to read an article (Why We Must Abolish Schools) by Illich to determine whether he found the material of interest and worth discussion. The seminar was conducted on a basis as close to Illich's peer-matching concept as possible. That is, the ordinary trappings of academia--grades, reading assignments, attendance requirements, term papers and tests--were done away with as much as possible.<sup>281</sup>

Freedom was exercised and each section determined their own focus within the overall objective:

Each section selected its own readings and topics and handled its own discussion. At the first meeting each participant was handed a copy of an earlier version of the...bibliography and also a packet of xeroxed articles drawn from it. Though each section varied, generally the participants found it worthwhile to examine Illich's writing first...then Reimer's essay...which some found easier to work with since it is written in more conventional academic style, concluding with Freire material....<sup>282</sup>

Audio-tape, video-tape, long distance telephone conference discussion with Illich were also among the methods used for the course. The bibliography did not contain the conventional annotation, but included brief quotations from the items to give a more direct, uninterpreted flavor to the writing.<sup>283</sup>

When one considers the question of whether Knowles' learning-teaching andragogical methodology can be replicated in other settings the answer is that it can. More accurately it may be said that it was adapted by Dr. Ohliger for use in a liberal adult education seminar. The principle in this case holds that if you trust academic students with the responsibility for their own learning, they will take the responsibility even though one removes the traditional controls and trappings: grades

---

<sup>281</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>282</sup>Ibid., p. 18.

<sup>283</sup>Loc. cit.

reading assignments, attendance requirements, term papers and tests.<sup>284</sup>

North Carolina State University, Department of  
Adult and Community College Education

The Graduate Faculty of the Department of Adult and Continuing College Education lists seventeen professors of various ranks. With this listing is also the institution of their most recent degree. The eight universities mentioned from one to four times, were: Wisconsin, North Carolina, New York, Florida State, North Carolina State, Duke, Iowa State, Louisiana State and Cornell.<sup>285</sup> Boston University, where Knowles is Adult Education Professor, is not listed.

However, it is interesting to note a statement by Dr. Edgar J. Boone, the Department Head, indicating the influence of Dr. Malcolm S. Knowles on the North Carolina program.

...our departmental brochure...describes our program from the standpoint of philosophy, content and organization. Dr. Malcolm Knowles has played a major role in helping us develop our program at North Carolina State University and his philosophy is reflected in the brochure.<sup>286</sup>

One can see some similarities between the North Carolina State University and the Boston University graduate programs in adult education. They both have a strong component of Community College education. They both are strongly interdisciplinary programs including: Anthropology, Psychology, Politics, Theology, Business and Industrial Administration in

---

<sup>284</sup> ibid., p. 17.

<sup>285</sup> Edgar J. Boone, Graduate Study in Adult and Community College Education (Raleigh, N. C.: North Carolina State University, 1971), p. 31.

<sup>286</sup> A letter from Edgar J. Boone, Assistant Director and Head, Department of Adult and Community College Education, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, N. C., August 10, 1972.

addition to many others. Both programs emphasize guiding students in exploring and applying behavioral science theory. They also encourage student's exploration in the dynamic interrelations between basic processes in the education and development of an adult as an individual and as a member of a group.<sup>287, 288</sup>

Additional parallels could perhaps be drawn. However, the few cited serve to substantiate the fact that Knowles' influence on the North Carolina University graduate adult education program has been considerable.

Career Development Program, General Electric Co.,  
Management Development Institute, Ossining, N.Y.

Knowles' influence on this program was in its initial stages at the time of this research. Nevertheless, his work has been fairly specific. It was felt the best way to describe the program would be by presenting the full text of a letter this researcher received from Walter D. Storey, Manager of that program.

Dr. Knowles consulted with us a few days relative to the application of his concepts of adult learning to the design of a self-directed career development program for our exempt salaried employees. We are not authorized at this time to release the materials which we are pilot testing for outside loan or use. However, let me quote from the acknowledgements in the orientation manual which I believe captures the essence of Dr. Knowles' contribution: 'A one day seminar by Malcolm S. Knowles on adult learning initially sparked the desire to make the accidents of adult learning happen more frequently and predictably. His personal example and his book, The Modern Practice of Adult Education, were at the core of our attempt to translate theory into workable specifications for a climate in which adults learn.'

Dr. Knowles consulted with us on about three occasions when

---

<sup>287</sup>Boone, Graduate Study in Adult and Community College Education, pp. 7-8.

<sup>288</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "The Graduate Program in Adult and Higher Education at Boston University." A Written Paper, Boston, Massachusetts, January, 1972. ( mimeographed.)

we examined theoretical concepts of andragogy in terms of operationalizing these concepts for a specific career development planning program. We used Dr. Knowles as a resource and catalyst to our thinking not as a designer of specific instruments used in the program. In that the project involved the integrated work of a great many professionals of equal stature it would be very difficult to use the software as an example of Dr. Knowles' specific contribution. Thus, I believe the quote from the acknowledgements probably most appropriately captures the nature of his contribution without underestimating its importance.

In this career development planning the notion of expecting the participant to take the prime active role in determining what he has to learn, how he is to learn it, and measuring his success in learning it is in part directly traceable to the influence of Dr. Knowles' explanation of an organic process of learning. I hope this explanation provides a fair and sufficient explanation of Dr. Knowles' contribution to our Career Development Program.<sup>289</sup>

The clearest earmark of Knowles' work with this program is his "explanation of an organic process of learning." This is consistent with the theme that appears in his theories as well as his mounting consulting practice.

#### Data Education, Inc., Waltham, Massachusetts

In 1964, Knowles stated:

It seems clear that the newer media have made only a relatively paltry impact on the field of adult education to date. But at the moving edges of the field are some creative indications of the new directions.<sup>290</sup>

Data Education, Incorporated, "The Andragogy Company," appears to be one instance that supports the "creative indications of new directions." In addition, the educational philosophy orientation of this corporation is

---

<sup>289</sup>Letter from Walter D. Storey, Manager, Career Planning and Organization Development Operation, General Electric Company, Management Development Institute, Ossining, N. Y., September 19, 1972.

<sup>290</sup>Rossi and Biddle, eds., The New Media and Education: Their Impact on Society: p. 347.

attributable to Knowles.<sup>291</sup>

Data Education, Incorporated is an educational and process consulting firm founded in March, 1969, by a man who utilized his technical and computer systems background in developing education and training approaches to resolving problems in human systems. The company uses Andragogy as a systems approach in training to bring about organizational growth, personal growth, and provides innovative programs in sales training, management of training, and training effectiveness. Knowles, as a member of the Board of Directors has been primarily responsible for the company's philosophy orientation. The philosophy orientation is based largely on The Modern Practice of Adult Education: Andragogy versus Pedagogy by Knowles.

The training staff members (numbering as high as twenty-eight) of Data Education, have been deeply involved in Knowles' courses at Boston University. The company has rapidly expanded into the field of Applied Andragogy, and has been delivering training and management development programs in an effort to facilitate social change and growth.<sup>292</sup> This corporation and program began to reach into what might be called "third generation experiential education" programs. The first generation was when skill training was the methodology used. The second generation was the extensive use of "laboratory training" or "T-groups." Now, the third

---

<sup>291</sup>John D. Ingalls, "Data Education Incorporated: A Company History," Unpublished Paper, not dated. (Mimeographed.); John D. Ingalls, "Data Education, Incorporated, 'The Andragogy Company': A Company History," Unpublished Paper, not dated. (Mimeographed.)

<sup>292</sup>Ingalls, "Data Education Incorporated: A Company History,"; Letter from John D. Ingalls, Vice President, Data Education, Inc., Waltham, Massachusetts, August 9, 1972.

generation in which the first two are being fused into one program. Thus it was called Applied Andragogy.<sup>293</sup>

The range of organizations this company touched with its training programs designed for a variety of purposes continued to increase. Following are descriptions of programs conducted by the company. The descriptions were not verbatim but were, in essence, taken from the Data Education Company History.<sup>294</sup> The list included:

1. Department of Health, Education, and welfare: Social and Rehabilitation Services; Washington, D.C. The company developed "A Trainer's Guide to Andragogy."
2. Training of Trainers Workshops in Andragogy. Data Education conducted two five-day workshops (ten days per participant) for participants from various social agencies throughout the DHEW's nine regions. The states include Maine, Massachusetts, Vermont, New Jersey, Virginia, Maryland, Washington, D.C., California, Hawaii, Arizona, Nevada, Washington, Guam, Texas, and New York. The participants were from several social agencies, including state Departments of Social Services, Departments of Welfare, Social Service Bureaus, Public Service Careers, Departments of Rehabilitation, among others. Approximately 175 persons were trained in the early stages.
3. State of Maryland, Social Services Administration. Data Education conducted a five-day workshop for trainers in the Social Service administration.
4. National Alliance of Businessmen, Lowell, Massachusetts. Data Education created and implemented Career Guidance Institutes for the purpose of bringing high school students and industrial personnel together. This is in relation to the Office of Education's Career Education Program.
5. Boston School Committee. Data Education designed and implemented an 'Orientation for Integration' program in a racially troubled Boston inner community. The program brought teachers, parents, children and community members together; approximately 100 in all.

---

<sup>293</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>294</sup>Ingalls, "Data Education Incorporated: A Company History,"; Ingalls, "Data Education, Incorporated, 'The Andragogy Company': A Company History."

6. State of Rhode Island; Department of Corrections. Data Education designed and trained 157 personnel of the Department of Corrections for the purpose of creating an education and training program for the entire institutional correction system.
7. Lynn Model Cities. Data Education designed and delivered a program for 'Community and Personal Growth.' The program was basically a problem-finding/problem-solving session aimed at organization and personal development.
8. City of New York, Human Resources Administration. Data Education used a systems approach to training for the Program for the Decentralized Administration of Municipal Services in New York City communities. This multi-phased training project includes the following: Training the Office of Staff Development in the Andragogical training process; process consulting to the directors of the pilot cabinets; and organization development training with cabinet staff.
9. State of Arizona, Department of Education, Division of Vocational Rehabilitation. Data Education conducted a five-day management workshop which assisted vocational rehabilitation management throughout the state in becoming aware of organizational dynamics and intra-departmental coordination.
10. Department of Health, Education and Welfare, Social and Rehabilitation Services, Washington, D.C. Data Education acted directly as a consultant to HEW-SRS in adult education and training methods.
11. Department of Corrections--Commonwealth of Massachusetts. Data Education worked with the Administration on a project of management Staff Training through Process Consultation. Today's concern over increasing problems within institutions leads to questions about the kinds of processes that occur within these institutions and the effect of these processes on delinquent behavior. Utilizing a process approach to management, the company developed an on-going managerial approach to change.
12. Deer Island House of Corrections, City of Boston. Data Education, working with the administration, developed and implemented a two-week training program for all correctional officers on the Island. The program included such widely diverse subjects as First Aid, Custodial Procedures, Management Training, Report Writing, Human Relations, Riot Control, Officers' and Inmates' Rights, and others.
13. Department of Youth Services, Commonwealth of Massachusetts. Data Education worked with DYS as a process consultant to assist management in effecting the rapid changes which are occurring within DYS. Such changes included: Deinstitution-



alization leading to decentralization and toward community-based care facilities.

Other clients of Data Education include: the City of Boston, Emergency Employment Agency; the Civil Service Commission; the City of New Bedford, Mass.; Polaroid Corporation; the Chase-Manhattan Bank; Business Information Systems; Hoffman-LaRoche Company; the Community Youth Program, New Bedford, Massachusetts; the State of New Jersey Public Service Careers and others.

Data Education has also assumed complete administrative responsibility for several projects, including all financial and administrative reporting. These included: the State of Rhode Island's Social Rehabilitation Service grant for correction; the State of Massachusetts' Department of Youth Services; and one of the trainers' laboratories in California which included airline reservations and payments, hotels, etc., for all participants.<sup>295</sup>

Another program taking shape was the development of a Manager's Guide to Andragogy similar to A Trainer's Guide to Andragogy developed earlier by the company.<sup>296</sup>

Extensive additional information, with two exceptions, was not available from the myriad institutions listed as clients of Data Education, Incorporated, regarding Knowles' influence upon them. The two exceptions were: The testing program of The Trainer's Guide to Andragogy in the Department of Health, Education, and Welfare's Social and Rehabilitation Service, Washington, D.C.; and, the ROCOM Intensive Coronary Care

---

<sup>295</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>296</sup>Telephone conversation with Mr. John Ingalls, October 31, 1972.

Multi-media Learning System, a division of Hoffman-LaRoche, Inc.

The Trainer's Guide to Andragogy and Social Rehabilitation Services of the Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, Washington, D.C.

As one seeks to develop and build a system, the question of applicability continues to be raised. In what kinds of situations will this system be successful? What modifications will be necessary for it to work in a variety of settings? What refinements will be required for it to remain viable in today's changing world market?

A Trainer's Guide to Andragogy was prepared in response to and fulfillment of contract #SRS-71-45, Social Rehabilitation Service, of the Department of Health, Education, and Welfare of the U.S. Government. The contract "issued a statement of fundamental needs for a Syllabus and Training Guide for the Training of Trainers."<sup>297</sup> The Guide was "designed for the personal and professional development of staff trainers and manpower administrators in state and local Social Rehabilitation Service related agencies."<sup>298</sup> The stated need for such a guide can best be seen in the following paragraph, taken from the general introduction of the guide.

The role of a staff training specialist in state and local Social Service agencies that relate directly to the Social Rehabilitation Service of the United States Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, calls for a variety of skills and abilities needed for organizing, planning, designing, conducting and evaluating learning experiences for adults. These skills must be applied in a variety of settings, under vastly different conditions, with groups possessing

---

<sup>297</sup>U. S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, Social and Rehabilitation Service, A Trainer's Guide to Andragogy: Its Concepts, Experience, and Application, by John D. Ingalls and Joseph M. Arceri, (SRS) 72-05301 (Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1972), p. 42.

<sup>298</sup>Ibid., p. VII.

diverse cultural backgrounds. In addition to being called upon as training and education specialists, staff trainers today are being increasingly sought to provide assistance in organizational development activities requiring further skills and abilities in group processes and systems intervention. The role of the staff trainer, then is becoming more complex and more professionally demanding as we prepare to enter the last quarter of the 20th century.<sup>299</sup>

The Guide was designed to meet the above needs and was divided into three major parts. Part one—Andragogy: Concepts for Adult Learning, served to introduce the basic ideas central to the andragogical process. These included Knowles' traditional: four or five assumptions of differences between adults and children as learners; and, the seven step organic educational process contrasting the roles of the teachers in andragogy and pedagogy.

Part two of the Guide was designed to be a live experience, not a text to be read. Andragogy: Designs and Processes for Experience was a Five Day Residential Workshop to test out and make congruent the ideas set forth in part one. This allowed the concepts of andragogy to be communicated andragogically. This gave the participants experience and practice in what their roles as staff training specialist called for.

Part three of the Guide, Andragogy: For Continuing Application, was for participants to use in constant application and reinforcement of workshop learnings to their work in the field. A second five day workshop was to be held six months later for gaining new levels of competence.

---

<sup>299</sup>Ibid., p. VI.

By August of 1972 between 150<sup>300</sup> and 175<sup>301</sup> staff development personnel had taken a first five day workshop. The results were very good and they had plans to expand application of the training methodology to additional state programs.<sup>302</sup>

Knowles indicated that this Guide was the most comprehensive job that had been accomplished to January, 1972, "in bringing together the new concepts and techniques of adult education and showing how they can be applied to the training of real 'pros' for the Social and Rehabilitation Service."<sup>303</sup>

In addition to the three parts this Guide was divided into, there was one special striking feature emphasized which helped in andragogical refinement: andragogy's relationship to and integration into a bureaucratic organization. It was suggested that any andragogical activity first have tentative organizational approval. Then additional information would be gathered substantiating the problem, and presented for official approval for the activity to be carried out. It is naturally assumed that this activity when completed would help the organization become more effective or competent.

When official approval is obtained and the planning group is

---

<sup>300</sup>Letter from James W. Phipps, Social Science Program Specialist, Office of Manpower Development and Training, Social and Rehabilitation Service, U. S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, Washington, D. C., August 9, 1972.

<sup>301</sup>John D. Ingalls, "Data Education Incorporated: A Company History," Unpublished Paper, not dated. (Mimeographed.)

<sup>302</sup>Letter from James W. Phipps, August 9, 1972.

<sup>303</sup>U. S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, Social and Rehabilitation Service, A Trainer's Guide to Andragogy: Its Concepts, Experience, and Application: Ingalls and Arceri, p. V.

selected the andragogical activity could be planned through the design phase. Then a progress report should be made to the organization with continued approval to proceed granted. When the plan is implemented and evaluated a second progress report would be presented. These could be accompanied with suggestions for further needs to be met by another series of andragogical activities.<sup>304</sup>

Andragogical activities are based on different assumptions than ordinary ways bureaucratic organizations carry on their work. Thus the andragogical activities could be effectively linked to a bureaucratic organization. They could be seen as a tool to aid effective operations and not as a threat to the organization.

In addition, andragogical activities or this kind of adult education were not seen as something separate and distinct from day to day organizational operations. It became part of the regular process of organizational operation. Hence, this Guide also began to highlight a process of erasing the distinct lines of a conception of education, at least, adult education in the United States of America. No longer would andragogy in the U.S.A. be conceived only as an adult education activity separate from the ongoing process of life. Ingalls and Arceri in support of this changing concept suggest:

The process of education, looked at in its broadest sense can be considered to be operating all the time, during all conscious human activity.... Everything we do involves some kind of learning. Reflecting on the past, acting in the present, planning for the future, all clearly suggest the fundamental process of learning by doing. Possibly we do not look at all of life, as 'a learning experience' or a 'learning situation.' Perhaps our orientation restricts our thinking about education as that taking place within the narrow confines of a formal classroom. But whether we wish to recognize it

---

<sup>304</sup>Ibid., p. 59.

or not, the fact remains that we are learning all the time. Perhaps what we really need is an educational process that will help us generate meaning and knowledge from our life situation in a way that we can utilize all of our activities as 'potential for learning.' In that way, even our mistakes can be valued as providing information leading to change and growth. Continuous learning from the experience of life, then, is an important focus for adults in today's world.<sup>305</sup>

Essentially, the Guide sought to implement these ideas throughout its pages.

However, T. T. ten Have of the Netherlands, late in 1972 was still insisting that andragogy on the American scene was limited to adult education. This he distinguished from such things as personal management, community work, etc. He cites Knowles 1970 book title as evidence: The Modern Practice of Adult Education: Andragogy versus Pedagogy.<sup>306</sup> T. T. ten Have had stopped short in his investigation when he asserted:

...the Dutch concept 'andragogie' covers all agogical (leading, guiding, influencing) work with adults, including adult education, whereas the English andragogy and the German Andragogik confine themselves to adult education, excluding e.g. social case work, personnel management, community work.<sup>307</sup>

While he may have been correct regarding the German and Dutch concept of andragogy, he erred regarding the English concept confining itself to "adult education."

In addition to the instance previously mentioned in the Guide, the emerging "Andragogy Company" in the United States, Data Education, Inc., was helping to move the American andragogical thrust beyond the

---

<sup>305</sup>Ibid., pp. 2-3.

<sup>306</sup>T. T. ten Have, "On Agology," a paper for the 16th International Congress of Schools of Social Work (The Hague. 8-11 August, 1972), p. 5. (Mimeographed.)

<sup>307</sup>Loc. cit.

confines of adult education per se, namely into "applied andragogy."

Data Education's philosophy orientation was attributable to Knowles and was based on his book The Modern Practice of Adult Education. The philosophy clearly indicates a broader scope for andragogy.

Professional training specialists in today's complex organizations are most likely to have a variety of different training problems. While it is probably true that the various training specialists' assignments require approximately the same level of professional competence, organizations have a wide variety of programs and priorities, as well as trainees with diverse backgrounds. There is a process of adult learning that is common to all of them.

Moreover, adult education takes place in many situations that are not formally defined as adult education experiences. For instance, a managerial team may be trying to decide upon new procedures. After these procedures have been decided upon, subordinates have to be involved with the decision and helped to understand it and/or helped to apply it. In all these cases, adult learning and change is taking place. Individuals involved with the decision-making, administration, and supervision need skills supplied by adult education methodology.<sup>308</sup>

Thus, English andragogy, at least the American applied andragogy, appeared to be less confined to a narrow concept of adult education. Its development was much more in concert with T. T. ten Have's description of Dutch andragogy.

In my mind there is nothing in the word andr-agogy that justifies the restriction to educational work, since 'agogy' has the broad meaning of guiding, leading, influencing, and does not imply anything about objectives or the state of affairs at the start of the work. It lends itself perfectly to being used in a broad sense and this is what has been proposed and done in the Dutch language.<sup>309</sup>

It might be added, "this is what has been proposed and done in the English language." The concept of education has been released from its strict meaning. It has been broadened to include influencing, guiding and leading.

---

<sup>308</sup>Ingalls, "Data Education Incorporated: A Company History."

<sup>309</sup>T. T. ten Have, "On Agology," p. 5.

Intensive Coronary Care Multimedia Learning System, ROCOM Division of Hoffman-La Roche, Inc., Nutley, New Jersey

In 1970, Knowles began to make some impact into the nursing profession. "Gearing Adult Education for the Seventies," an article by him appeared in The Journal of Continuing Education in Nursing. The theme was andragogy versus pedagogy. His standard four assumptions of adult and child learner differences and his six step process (not content) design were the essence of the article. He related these to the content of the nursing profession.<sup>310</sup>

Approximately the same time, ROCOM Division of Hoffman-La Roche, Inc., Nutley, New Jersey was expanding and updating "Intensive Coronary Care—A Manual for Nurses" by Meltzer, Pinneo and Kitchell. Knowles worked very closely with ROCOM in that revision process. The System was financed in part by United States of America Public Health Service of the National Institute of Health Division of Nursing.<sup>311</sup>

The revision ultimately became the Intensive Coronary Care Multimedia Learning System. It employed a multimedia/multisensory approach to in-service education. The coordinating brochure for the program was

...directly adapted from three papers prepared by...Knowles...entitled: 'New Concepts of Adult Learning in Inservice Education;' 'The Use of Multimedia/Multisensory Approach in Inservice Education;' and 'How the ROCOM Intensive Coronary Care Multimedia Learning System Utilizes the Principles of Adult Education.'<sup>312</sup>

---

<sup>310</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Gearing Adult Education for the Seventies." The Journal of Continuing Education in Nursing, Vol. I, No. 3 (May-June, 1970).

<sup>311</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, The Use of the Multimedia/Multisensory Approach for Inservice Education, ROCOM, Division of Hoffman-La Roche, Inc., Nutley, New Jersey, no date, pp. VI, X.

<sup>312</sup>Ibid., p. VII.



Knowles' theory of andragogy with its four assumptions about adult learners and six step process design became the background and foundation of the Intensive Coronary Care Multimedia Learning System.<sup>313</sup> The theory was also woven into the fabric of the learning system to give it coherence, practicality, adaptability and maximum utility.<sup>314</sup>

The learning units of the program were competency based.<sup>315</sup> The ten competencies considered necessary for an Intensive Coronary Care nurse were as follows:

- I. The Concept of Intensive Coronary Care
- II. The Heart and Acute Myocardial Infarction
- III. Electrocardiographic Monitoring
- IV. Care of the AMI Patient
- V. Electrocardiography and the Arrhythmias
- VI. Interpretation and Treatment of Specific Arrhythmias
- VII. Confirming the Diagnosis of Acute Myocardial Infarction
- VIII. Warning Arrhythmias and Treatment
- IX. Lethal Arrhythmias and Treatment
- X. Pump Failure and Treatment.<sup>316</sup>

The learning system takes into consideration the fact that learners learn at different rates and for different reasons. It is composed of a number of components which are resources for learning. They are not just aids to supplement canned instructor's presentations. They are a highly interactive system of resources for use in a self-directed

---

<sup>313</sup>Ibid., pp. 1-6.

<sup>314</sup>Ibid., pp. 11-28.

<sup>315</sup>This is a similar approach used with other programs he helped develop such as: Boston University Graduate Program in Adult Education, Girl Scout Leadership Development Program, Social Rehabilitation Service Trainer's Guide to Andragogy to name a few.

<sup>316</sup>Knowles, The Use of the Multimedia/Multisensory Approach for Inservice Education, p. 24.

learning process.<sup>317</sup>

The system evolved from integration of the following resource media:

- a cartridge loading film projector and a filmstrip projector
- color sound films
- black-and-white filmstrips
- audiotapes
- texts and workbooks for both students and instructors (including a detailed instructor's manual)
- pre- and post-tests for diagnostic, assessment, or evaluation tools for students' and instructors' use
- instructor lectures
- instructor demonstrations
- physician lectures
- physician demonstrations
- conferences
- performance exercises
- student projects
- student case presentations
- clinical experiences<sup>318</sup>

Each medium deals with the same subject in each learning unit and probes more deeply into the content. They reinforce each other for more efficient learning in the learners.

While the ROCOM learning system could be used pedagogically or andragogically it was designed to encourage the latter. The key medium, coordinator, and indispensable factor in the success of the system is the instructor. Hence, the instructor manual contains specific yet flexible step-by-step guidelines for conducting the course.<sup>319</sup> This would aid an instructor in changing from the traditional teaching role of pedagogy to

---

<sup>317</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, How the ROCOM Intensive Coronary Care Multimedia Learning System Utilizes the Principles of Adult Education, John Sutherland Productions, ROCOM, Division of Hoffman-LaRoche Inc., Nutley, New Jersey, no date, p. 1. ( mimeographed.)

<sup>318</sup>ibid., pp. 1-2.

<sup>319</sup>Knowles, The Use of the Multimedia/Multisensory Approach for Inservice Education, p. 14.

andragogy.

On November 8 and 9, 1971, the School of Continuing Nursing Education Department of Virginia Commonwealth University, Richmond, Virginia, and ROCOM Division of Hoffman-La Roche, Inc., sponsored a seminar on multimedia instruction. Part of the program was a film featuring Knowles with the theme "Multimedia Concept of Learning and Role of the Instructor. Another part of the program was a question and answer period by telephone hook-up with Knowles.

This program gave credence to the possibility of Knowles' theory of andragogy being capable of application in a highly technical crucial business. It may point the way as prototype of multimedia-multisensory andragogical variety for some time to come. The product was considered effective by some, having been awarded first prize in its category by the National Visual Communications Association.<sup>320</sup>

Adult Education Commission of National Catholic  
Education Association and Institute for Continuing  
Education--Archdiocese of Detroit, Michigan

It is not always an easy task to pinpoint the influence one person has on an organization. It was difficult pinpointing exactly where Knowles' philosophy was used in the Adult Commission of the National Catholic Education Association. The only data regarding Knowles' influence available was a general comment from the president, Mrs. Jane Wolford Hughes who said, "two workshops were planned using many of his theories to help participants."<sup>321</sup>

---

<sup>320</sup> Ibid., p. X.

<sup>321</sup> Letter from Jane Wolford Hughes, Director, Institute for Continuing Education--Archdiocese of Detroit, Michigan, November 20, 1972.

However, the Institute for Continuing Education—Archdiocese of Detroit were influenced by Knowles in diocesan programming. The resource used most was his book, The Modern Practice of Adult Education. They also were able to put together with the help of Knowles' experiences and theories two pamphlets. The two pamphlets were "Leadership Techniques" and "Handbook for Discussion Leaders" used in their 1972 "Church, World, Kingdom" diocesan-wide program.<sup>322</sup>

The leadership techniques included motivation, leadership, approaches to inter-personal conflict, communication, goal setting and planning for achievement among others.<sup>323</sup> The most clear influence of Knowles on the discussion guide was a statement indicating,

...group discussion is...used because it will involve the adult and confront him with a personal struggle to think and judge for himself in a free atmosphere.<sup>324</sup>

No additional data was available as to the results of the program.

#### University of Missouri Extension Association

The University of Missouri Extension Division field faculty numbers approximately 450. They are adult educators serving in a variety of program sections: Food and Fiber; Family and Youth; Community-Public Sector; Continuing Education for Professionals; Business, Industry and Labor; Environmental Protection; and Consumer Health.

---

<sup>322</sup>Loc. cit.

<sup>323</sup>Institute for Continuing Education--Archdiocese of Detroit, Leadership Techniques, Detroit: Archdiocese of Detroit, Institute for Continuing Education, 1972, pp. 1-16.

<sup>324</sup>Institute for Continuing Education--Archdiocese of Detroit, Discussion Leader's Handbook, Detroit: Archdiocese of Detroit, Institute for Continuing Education, 1972.

The 117 counties in the state of Missouri are grouped into twenty geographical areas. Each area is served by a combination of faculty included in the above mentioned program sections.

The University of Missouri Extension Association (UMEA) is a professional organization with membership open to each of 450 field faculty members in the University of Missouri Extension Division.

One of the objectives of UMEA includes to "encourage and create opportunities for professional improvement."<sup>325</sup> Each year the officers, members of the board and committees, numbering about 100, gather for mid-winter workshop seeking to accomplish the "professional improvement" objective. The annual meeting is held in October of each year when about 300 attend.

In 1973, the workshop planning committee decided this workshop would be different than past workshops. It was decided that the work of the nine UMEA committees and board would be done in one-half day instead of the usual full day. Then, the other half day would be devoted to "Professional Improvement."\*

The theme of the workshop, which the planning committee adopted, was "Your Professionalism as an Adult Educator." Some objectives of the workshop to implement this theme included: (1) to improve ourselves as adult education professionals in University of Missouri Extension Association, and (2) to launch a process that will help us improve our

---

<sup>325</sup>University of Missouri Extension Association, Constitution and By-Laws, October 19, 1972.

\*Note: Much of this data in this entire section was not recorded but was remembered in the mind of this researcher, who served on the UMEA Workshop Planning Committee and as chairman of the UMEA Professional Improvement Committee in 1973.

professional operational objectives.<sup>326</sup>

Knowles was selected by the committee as the best professional adult education resource who would likely offer not just a good speech, but the most assistance in launching UMEA into a professional improvement process. Such a process would be designed to improve the UMEA members operational effectiveness as professional adult educators in their positions as University Extension faculty members.

The "Professional Improvement" part of the workshop lasted three and one quarter hours. The faculty members were placed at table groupings according to the geographical distribution of the twenty areas of the state. The sequence of that time was allotted as follows:<sup>327</sup>

- (1) 15 minutes: Orientation to the Professional Improvement Committee theme for the year and suggested design for March 23, a.m. session and for the year.
- (2) 25 minutes: Table groups (geographical area teams) generate questions based on Knowles paper "Comparison of the Assumptions and Processes of Andragogy and Pedagogy" (This paper is discussed elsewhere in this research.)<sup>328</sup>
- (3) 20 minutes: Priority selection by each table group of the number one question on their list to be prepared for asking Malcolm S. Knowles.
- (4) 50 minutes: Questions (one from each table as far as the time would allow) directed to Malcolm S. Knowles by workshop participants and his responses to them on amplified telephone. (Knowles was in Boston, Massachusetts; and the workshop was held in Columbia, Missouri.)

---

<sup>326</sup>University of Missouri Extension Association, Program Announcement for Coordinating Workshop: "Your Professionalism as an Adult Educator," Columbia, Missouri, March 22-23, 1973. (Mimeographed.)

<sup>327</sup>Letter from John A. Henschke to Malcolm S. Knowles, March 12, 1973.

<sup>328</sup>See supra, p. 134, note 216.

- (5) 10 minutes: Knowles coaches group by phone on use of the worksheets entitled "Evaluating your Professionalism as an Adult Educator."<sup>329</sup>
- (6) 45 minutes: Table groups continue to develop plans on worksheet sets.
- (7) 15 minutes: Each table group indicate their most important plans for next few months.
- (8) 15 minutes: Critique and evaluation of the morning session.

It was visualized that each group would make their own plans to involve their total area faculty group in the use of the worksheets between the March, 1973, workshop and the Annual Conference to be held in October of 1973.

It was tentatively planned to have a second phone contact with Knowles at the October, 1973 conference. At that time questions would be directed by the group to themselves concerning: What went well in the plans we formulated? What successes did we have? What roadblocks did we encounter? What problems emerged? What did we learn from our experience? Knowles would serve at that time as a problem solving resource to the group. Then the University of Missouri group would ask themselves and develop answers to the question: Where do we go from here regarding professional improvement?

At the time of writing this report only the March, 1973, workshop was history. What would happen to the program and its influence on the

---

<sup>329</sup>Knowles, Modern Practice of Adult Education, pp. 226-229, and Higher Adult Education, pp. 49-53. (The worksheets referred to were based on knowles pedagogical design which includes six process elements, fifteen objectives, and 100 evaluative questions taken from the pages numbered in this footnote. On the left side of the worksheets, space was allotted for each listed evaluative question. In the middle of the worksheets, blank space was available for each faculty member to answer each evaluative question. On the right side of the sheet there was blank space for each faculty member to write his answer to "What I plan to do about this question in the next few months [space for writing action plans]. Blank space was also allotted to add other objectives and evaluative questions.)

University of Missouri Extension faculty and programs remained to be seen.

The most formidable problem in the workshop came at the point when a sizable number of the group expressed the feeling that they had not been andragogically motivated into the program. They had come to the workshop not knowing what to expect. They had not been involved as a total group in the planning. Things were all planned. This, of course, was the risk and responsibility the planning committee was willing to shoulder when they determined to have this workshop be different than previous ones. Knowles responded with candor when the issue was raised with him on the phone, which helped greatly to diffuse and resolve the problem.

Some of those who had been on the University Extension faculty for over a quarter of a century expressed a positive note about the workshop: "Finally we (UMEA) are going to do something professionally for ourselves and not just recommend that someone else do it for us."

Knowles had helped UMEA members launch the process of evaluating their professionalism as adult educators. What would happen after the launch remained to be seen.

#### Areas in Question

There were a few areas with which Knowles had contact but the fact of or amount of his influence remains a question.

It was suggested that The Institute for Court Management, University of Denver Law Center was an organization with which he had worked. No information from that source could be obtained. The Office of Consumer Affairs, Executive Office of the President, Washington, D. C. was also suggested as an organization with which he had worked. However,



because of a personnel change, no information was available.

The Connecticut Hospital Association Inservice Education Program was also an organization in which Knowles had worked. Information was likewise not available from that source.

A man never knows how or if he will influence his children. It is a fact that Knowles' son, Eric, is a professor, a social scientist at the University of Wisconsin, Green Bay, and has been affiliated, as has Knowles, with National Training Laboratories Institute for Applied Behavioral Science, Washington, D.C. Knowles' daughter, Barbara, is an adult educator and works in Laboratory Training Groups much like her father.

Whether he exerted direct or indirect influence upon his children remains a question of debate. However, his presence in their lives or their contact with people in circles he moved was a direct or indirect influence, extensive or limited.

Doctor of Education Dissertations at Boston University which Test or Apply Concepts of Andragogy

By May, 1972, fifty-three doctoral degrees had been awarded in adult education in the Boston University program. Of this total, eighteen doctoral dissertations had been finished that tested or applied concepts of andragogy. At the same date, nineteen more doctoral dissertations were in progress which were testing or applying concepts of andragogy. This dissertation was one of the remaining nineteen. There was some question at that time whether the adult education graduate program at Boston University would be phased out as of June, 1974.

That Knowles' theory of andragogy in the United States was being subjected to the rigors of research would help in theoretical and

technological refinement of the concept. Not all the research findings of the dissertations will be listed. Only selected findings regarding andragogy are listed. Following are listed the parts which tested and applied concepts of andragogy of those finished dissertations and the author and title listing of those which were in progress.

I. The purpose of one study was to determine if particular adult education competencies are perceived by ministers as relevant for their work as organizers, administrators, and teachers in the parish. The ten out of a list of twenty adult education competencies rated as particularly significant were as follows:

- ..administration is concerned with people
- ..identify potential leaders
- ..help adults set own learning goals
- ..use teaching techniques appropriate to learners
- ..understand group process and dynamics
- ..be involved in continued study
- ..enable individuals to evaluate own learnings
- ..understand structure and organization of the community
- ..recognize developmental tasks
- ..channel expenses within budgets<sup>330</sup>

II. This study proposed the development of a typology of characteristics of students who were successful, "graduated," in the Goddard College Adult Degree Program. The typology of their most significant characteristics which are interdependent and form a general pattern were the following:

1. Age: 30-50 years
2. Social and economic status: middle class, as defined by:
  - a. financial assets well beyond the subsistence level
  - b. pre-professional positions in employment and strong belief that the degree will open up professional

---

<sup>330</sup> Donald Ehat, "Ministers' Perceptions of the Relevance for Parish Administration, Organization and Teaching of Selected Adult Educational Competencies." (Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1966), abstract.

- opportunities to them
- c. avocational and leisure-time interests congruent with the expressed motivations of students
- d. desire to fulfill themselves personally and develop better interpersonal relations
- 3. Goal-orientation toward:
  - a. professional careers
  - b. self-actualization
  - c. service to humanity<sup>331</sup>

III. The most important conclusion for andragogy in this study is its substantiation of a difference between adults and children. The conclusion was:

The behavior dimensions identified by Ryans as being related to teacher effectiveness in elementary and secondary schools apparently are not relevant in classroom situations involving teachers of disadvantaged adults.<sup>332</sup>

IV. The purpose of this study was to compare the difference in the effects of trust on learning between character-disorder delinquent boys and non-delinquent boys in three learning situations: (1) authority-administered; (2) peer-administered; and, (3) tape recorded automated presentation.

Results showed the delinquents preferred the peer-administered over authority-administered. The non-delinquents preferred authority in twelve cases, peer-administered in ten cases and tape recorded in two cases.<sup>333</sup>

---

<sup>331</sup>Beverly Cassara, "A Study of Various Kinds of Educational Growth of Students in the Goddard College Adult Degree Program." (Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1970), abstract.

<sup>332</sup>Preston E. Torrence, "A Study of the Relationship of Selected Teacher Behaviors to Teacher Effectiveness." (Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1970), abstract.

<sup>333</sup>John A. Johnston, "A Comparison of the Difference in the Effects of Trust on Learning Between Character-Disorder Delinquent and Nondelinquent Boys, as Viewed in Three Learning Situations." (Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1971), abstract.

V. One purpose of this study was to delineate some of the elements of self-image required by the Girl Scout trainer for the successful implementation of the Girl Scout Leader Training Design.

Adopters, as a group, were more person centered, more often viewed themselves as continuing learners, were more open to change and experimentation and were more respecting of learners.<sup>334</sup>

VI. The purpose of this study was to analyze Episcopal Church Missionary work in Liberia from 1836 to 1950 according to rational, power, and collaborative change strategies.

A key finding was that the Mission was initiated and pursued without collaboration with Liberians. As a result the Mission never became a viable, independent, self-renewing institution. Substantial support from the United States was always required to maintain the Mission. The Church was not able to take a consultative role; it was always forced to take an active, participatory role.<sup>335</sup>

VII. This study discovered that adult learners exhibited a moderate capacity for growth towards Inner Directed Support. This appears to be fostered when the adult learner perceives a teacher-adult learner relationship as empathic, non-possessingly warm and genuine.<sup>336</sup>

VIII. A key finding of this study was that the American Journal of Nursing 1960-1969 as a tool for continuing education implemented many adult education principles, infrequently provided for reader participation,

---

<sup>334</sup>Barbara Stone, "Analytical Study of Self-Image of 'Adopters' of the Use of Participative Learning Methods with Adult Learners." (Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1969), abstract.

<sup>335</sup>Dean A. Holt, "Change Strategies Initiated by the Protestant Episcopal Church in Liberia from 1836 to 1950 and Their Differential Effects." (Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1970), abstract.

<sup>336</sup>Pearl Rosendahl, "A Study of The Relationship Between Three Helping Conditions and Self-Actualization of Adult Learners." (Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972), abstract.

and a few editorials were presented in a spirit of mutual inquiry.<sup>337</sup>

IX. This study found that 1966-67 new enrollees into the Boston University graduate program in adult education were helped to attain three objectives of the program:

1. change toward acceptance of people,
2. appreciation of the need for group skills, and,
3. growth in sophistication in program planning.<sup>338</sup>

X. One finding of this study indicated The Institute for Advanced Pastoral Studies, Bloomfield Hills, Michigan, uses the principles and conditions of adult learning in the formulation session of its educational program.<sup>339</sup>

XI. A finding in this study was that the Skills Training and Education Program, General Electric Company, Lynn, Massachusetts, did not significantly help upward mobility of Black trainees.<sup>340</sup>

XII. A finding of this study was that the gap between perception of self and ideal self at the end of a YMCA work experience was less for those who experienced:

<sup>337</sup>Mary Ann Burn, "Content Analysis of Contemporary Nursing Journals to Determine Whether They Meet Certain Criteria of Excellence For Self-Development of the Nurse." (Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972), abstract.

<sup>338</sup>James Bromley, "Investigation of Some Changes That Take Place in Students As A Result of Their Participation in The Graduate Program of Adult Education at Boston University." (Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972), abstract.

<sup>339</sup>James P. Simmons, "A Study of Values and Behavior Orientations of Participants in Five Personal Growth and Professional Development Training Conferences." (Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972), pp. 70-71.

<sup>340</sup>Edward Thorne, "Evaluative Study of An Industrial Training Program to Prepare Hardcore Unemployed for Industrial Occupations." (Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972), abstract.

...High Career-Work Congruence and Modern Management supervision than for those who experienced Low Career-Work Congruence and Classical Management supervision.<sup>341</sup>

As one of the findings of these research efforts, this writer is conscious of the wide variety of topics relating to andragogy. A more in-depth understanding is available, of course, through reading the full account of the reports. It has not been the purpose here to research or present the findings of other research efforts except in reference.

Some of the dissertations were completed so close in time to the writing of this report that no information could be obtained except authors and titles. The following six dissertations were in that category:

1. "Case Study of Program of the Overseas Fund Institute in Leadership Development for Latin American Women in U.S.: 1963-1970" by Sister Marie Arias.
2. "Development and Validation of Criteria for Evaluating Content and Methodology of Humanities Education Program for Adults," by Armand Vorce.
3. "An Evaluation of Community Development Practice of Developing Voluntary from Five Universities in Thailand According to Criteria of a Validated Model" by Suwit Yodmani.
4. "Study of Factors for Continuance or Discontinuance of Selected Innovative Educational Programs" by Jane Skinner.
5. Jean L. Bernard--no title known.
6. Vickien Thavilab--no title known.<sup>342</sup>

Following is an incomplete title and author listing of nineteen doctoral dissertations testing or applying concepts of andragogy which

---

<sup>341</sup> Leo Johnson, "Study of Relationship Between Selected Variables and The Shift in Perception of Self, Others and YMCA by Students participating in The Greater Boston YMCA Federal College Work-Study Program." (Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972), abstract.

<sup>342</sup> Malcolm S. Knowles, "The Graduate Program in Adult and Higher Education at Boston University," a written paper, Boston, Massachusetts, January, 1972, appendix I. (Mimeographed.)

were in progress at Boston University School of Education during the final stages of writing this report.

1. "Experimental Study of Two Systems of College Dorm Administration Comparing Andragogy and Pedagogy" by William D. Abbott.
2. "Study of the Interaction Among Life Changes Psychological Defense Mechanisms and Academic Performance of Adult Students" by Paulette Baribeau.
3. "Analysis of Rationales Used to Justify Student Participation in Governance: A Philosophical Investigation of Their Relationship to Concept of Andragogy" by David Carson.
4. "Investigation of Relationship Between Selected Variables and the Utilization of Andragogical Principles and Methods in Theological Education" by Robert Fillinger.
5. "Study of Implementation of Andragogical Principles of Adult Education in Different Organizations Using Analysis of Output" by Herschel Hadley.
6. "A New Conceptual Framework for Higher Adult Education and Some Implications for Institutions of Higher Education" by Grace M. Healy.
7. "Malcolm S. Knowles: His Contributions to the Theory and Practice of Adult Education" by John A. Henschke.
8. "Comparison of the Self-Concept, Body Image and the Movement Concept of Adults of Three Different Age Groups" by Margot Howe.
9. "Analytical Study of Nature, Scope and Status of Jewish Adult Education in Greater Boston Area as Compared to Jewish Adult Education Model of Excellence" by Phillip Perlmutter.
10. "Statistical Study of School Measurements, Personal Adjustment Scores and Self-Perceived Adulthood Scores of the Inner City Eighth Grade Students" by Brenda Ross.
11. "A Learning-Design Model for Basic Police Training Programs Based Upon Perceived Competencies Required of Recruit Police Officers" by Dana Skiff.
12. "Study of Relationship Between Ideal Model of Administration and Organization Practice for CED in University or College School of Nursing and Current Practice" by Mildred Tapper.

13. "Some Applications of a Systems Analysis Measuring Instrument to Individual Ministers Participation in a college of Education Project to Assess Self-Perceived Changes According to Criteria of Professional Self-Actualization" by Edward H. Williams.
14. "An Analysis of Concept of Authority with Implications for Adult Education" by Delight Wolfe.
15. Lewis Estruine--Title not listed.
16. Arnita Harrison--Title not listed.
17. Warren Hawkins--Title not listed.
18. Eduard Keane--Title not listed.
19. Charles Yergantian--Title not listed.<sup>342</sup>

In this list of dissertations in progress which are testing and applying concepts of Knowles' theory of andragogy, the wide variety of topics, settings and means are the striking features of accomplishing the tasks. These past, present and future events and studies will ultimately help to determine the scope of his influence. At present, their factual reference serve to document his present scope of influence.

#### SUMMARY

Knowles' contribution to the field of adult education to date was based and has grown beyond his relationship with three institutions: First, his Adult Education directorship of the Chicago Central YMCA (1946-1951); second, as first Executive Secretary of the Adult Education Association (1951-1959); third, as first Professor of Adult Education and General Consultant in Adult Education at Boston University.

His contributions included published materials, programs sustained for a long period of time and continuing to expand, experimenting

---

<sup>342</sup>Loc. cit.



in new forms of organization, theory building and testing, developing a unique graduate program of adult education, speculating what would help the field grow, guiding research studies that test or apply concepts of his theory of andragogy, consulting a variety of massive organizations and spin-offs that increase the scope of his influence.

## CHAPTER IV

### ASSESSMENT OF MALCOLM S. KNOWLES BY CONTEMPORARIES

This chapter reports an assessment of Knowles' contributions to the field of adult education as perceived by current and former colleagues and students. The data gathering for this section was accomplished by developing and using an adaptation of the Applied Behavioral Science Interview schedule included in Appendix A of this work. The adapted schedule along with a cover letter was sent to 150 people and copies of each are included in Appendix B. Additional design explanation was included earlier in this work.<sup>1</sup>

The data received can be placed in three categories: (1) Negative and positive comments received regarding the study itself and the writer's procedure; (2) Non-behavioral, factual data--responses relative to individual professional background of the respondents, their perceived differences and likeness between Malcolm S. Knowles and themselves regarding educational philosophy and practice, and their perception of organizational changes occurring as a result of Knowles' intervention as a change agent; and (3) Behavioral data--the respondents perception of influence processes Knowles used with individuals and organizations, facilitating and hindering behaviors Knowles used during their degree process with him, and the most significant contributions Knowles has made to the field of adult education.

---

<sup>1</sup>See supra, pp. 17-24.

The negative and positive comments or category one (a) above were gleaned throughout the respondents' answers and expressions. They were not taken from the answers to any one particular question or questions.

The non-behavioral data came from respondents' wording of answers to questions I:1,3,4; and III:1,2,3,4 of the adapted schedule located in Appendix B.

The behavioral data came from the respondents' wording of answers to questions I:2; II: 1,2,3; III:1,2,3 of students' opinionaire; and III:5 of the professor's and other's opinionaire. There were two steps undertaken in the process of presenting the behavioral data according to Aker's categories (discussed elsewhere in this chapter).<sup>2</sup> In the first step, statements were condensed without eliminating the respondent's original meaning.

One illustration of this should suffice. One answer to the question "What do you see as Malcolm S. Knowles' most significant contribution(s) to the theory and practice of adult education?" was: "His history of the field is an expression of his expert and comprehensive knowledge of what is adult education." This statement was condensed into "The Adult Education Movement in the United States." This particular item was mentioned at least twenty-six times. Twenty of these were grouped in one behavior--number 21 of Aker. The other six were distributed in five other Aker behaviors because of their particular emphasis.

Consequently, in the second step of categorizing the data in Aker's behaviors the researcher's understanding of what was being said entered into placing an item under any of the Aker behaviors.

---

<sup>2</sup>See supra, pp. 221, 222.

## Negative and Positive Comments

### Negative Comments

The fact that sixty five people of 150 people to whom the "opinionaire" was sent never responded may indicate their perception that, to date, Knowles' contribution to the adult education field is negligible. Or, it may indicate their not understanding the project and a reluctance to commit any time to something they did not understand. Perhaps, their response would have been other than silence had the research been conducted in another manner. However, when one considers the percentage of response on research questionnaires or opinionaires in general, fifty three per cent response may be a bit above average. This may allow the interpretation that sixty five silences out of 150 requests was to be expected.

### Refusal to Answer

Twelve respondents returned the materials with comments indicating a refusal to answer. One launched a personal attack on Knowles, while two of them expressed willingness to be interviewed\* by the writer concerning the research subject. The full text of each opinionaire respondent is not included but the comments are presented in the respondents own words. There were a number of areas in which the responses could be grouped.

#### 1. Knowles not known well enough by respondent.

- I am unable to answer because I don't know Knowles well enough to make comparisons.

---

\*Note: The writer did obtain useful data in a personal interview with the two persons.

- I value Knowles very highly as an adult educator but I have had few personal contacts with him, so he has made no identifiable contributions to me.
- I don't know Knowles or his work definitively, I am not in the mainstream of adult education.
- My response would be my opinions, hence questionable.
- I don't feel I know enough about Knowles to adequately respond to your questions.
- No influence as I know him so short a time.

## 2. Questioning reliability of the project.

- I am unable to answer because data will be unusable and unreliable.
- This study is premature as Knowles' contribution is continuous and vigorous.
- I doubt your (the writer's) objectivity.
- You (the writer) are in an unbelievable position, namely doing a dissertation on a man who is the head of the adult education department of Boston University, from which you hope to obtain your degree.
- A questionnaire like this wouldn't even be approved for a term paper at either Wisconsin, Maryland or Florida. Is this a new research strategy at Boston?
- This questionnaire will surely not do justice to the richness of Knowles' contribution.
- The idea of studying the contribution of a contemporary will not yield a respectable outcome. There is no historical reference point at this time. There will be fifty years after Knowles is dead.
- I can't possibly tell you what I think of Knowles in the short space allotted.

The foregoing statements yield some insight into the dynamics of some of "the pyramid of leadership"<sup>3</sup> in the field of adult education.

Some reasons given for non-participation appear warranted, legitimate and

---

<sup>3</sup>Cyril O. Houle, "The Educators of Adults," in Handbook of Adult Education, ed. by Robert H. Smith, George F. Aker, J. R. Kidd (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1970), p. III.

accurate: (1) Inadequate knowledge on the respondent's part for accurate assessment of a contemporary's (Knowles) contribution to a field; (2) Lack of commitment to and unwillingness to participate in the project despite high regard for the subject; (3) Irritation that the opinionnaire requested large amount of information while allotting inadequate space for the information; (4) The inadequacy of the opinionnaire alone to make the study reliable; and (5) Question if there were hanky-panky going on since the writer was doing a dissertation on a man who is the head of the department of Boston University from which the writer hopes to receive his degree.

Beyond this, reasons for non-participation were expressed that raise questions about what the respondents are really saying.

To say one is "unable to answer because data will be unusable and unreliable" may be an indictment of one's own data rather than the opinionnaire. There are others who expressed similar reservations about the reliability of the thesis but nevertheless gave data to the writer, thus implying the assumption that the respondent considered his own data as reliable.

To reason that "this study is premature as Knowles' contribution is continuous and vigorous" and therefore does not merit any personal data may be a matter of personal prerogative. However, it also misses the point of the study. It is recognized by this writer that a study of this nature can be only preliminary. The ultimate result may be that Knowles will have no lasting influence on the field of adult education. It is possible that Knowles' lasting contribution will be in the direction herein suggested or in an area totally different from what is suggested in this study. Others considered the study as premature but nevertheless

gave data to the writer.

To reason that "the idea of studying the contribution of a contemporary will not yield a respectable dissertation since there can be no historical reference point until fifty years posthumous" may be asking for more certainty. However, historical certainty is left to the mercy of the historian's choice and selection<sup>4</sup> even though the longevity of time is desirable for increased certainty as discussed elsewhere in this work.<sup>5</sup> The above statement about "studying a contemporary" may be saying there is no contemporary in the field of adult education worth the effort of a doctoral dissertation at this time.

The evidence could continue to be mounted from both sides and still would be unsettled. However, one is led to speculate that such resistance to and allegation of a contemporary study being unreliable is really professional jealousy. It would be almost inconceivable that a self-professed and self-declared field builder in any field of endeavor would not encounter some negative response from peers in that field. Especially would this be so by an innovator and pioneer.

The professional jealousy may take the form of inner musings such as: Why was I not chosen for this or a similar study? I certainly am as much a field builder as this man. I am not so blatant, if visible at all, in my declaration of being a field builder in this fairly new field. After all, there are no absolute or even agreed upon standards of competency required for the doctoral programs in this field. Our field is not ready for this kind of study, now or ever.

---

<sup>4</sup>See supra, p. 12, note 17.

<sup>5</sup>See supra, p. 13, note 20.

While an absolute conclusion cannot be made about this being professional jealousy, the data strongly point in that direction. There were other respondents who raised similar questions about the reliability of the study, and about general annoyance with the opinionnaire, but nevertheless gave the requested data.

### Expressed Concerns

#### 1. Questioning the reliability of the study

- Opinionnaire difficult to complete because the full impact of his influence is yet to be felt in the future.
- This opinionnaire is obtaining information about a leader from his peers. An innovative way of handling this would be to gather this information, seal it in a vault for one hundred years, have it opened by heirs and let them obtain the doctorate. That would really be a thesis. I doubt its reliability now.
- Are you (the writer) a graduate student doing research about your own prof? A strange business. This opinionnaire is bound to elicit mostly favorable response. Great for those who are big admirers. What of those who think Knowles is a big disaster, too dumb to bother with, a phony and a stinker? Some think that, you know.
- You (the writer) will have to sift evidence in response to this opinionnaire and interview some people for this project to be reliable.
- Such a study would not have met acceptance at Boston University at the time I worked on my doctorate program.
- The opinionnaire is hard to answer because Knowles is still my model in practice.
- Isn't it a little premature to do a study like this?

#### 2. General annoyance with the opinionnaire

- I don't like questionnaires of this type.
- I am intimidated and irritated trying to answer questions in space provided.
- You (the writer) ask a hell of a lot and suggest I don't need much space to say it. I am annoyed but open to say so.



- You (the writer) don't want much, do you?

### Positive Comments

Despite the strong negative reaction to the idea of a contemporary study and its validity, there were also some positive responses to the idea and its structural components. The responses could be categorized by grouping. The full text of the responses is not presented but the respondents' words and meaning are used.

#### 1. General eulogistic comments about Knowles

- You (the writer) no doubt realize, I think very highly of Knowles.
- I consider Knowles a great adult educator. I am glad to call him my friend.

These comments could be considered and accepted for the eulogies they are.

They are more personal than an assessment of a professional adult educator.

#### 2. Enjoyment at taking part in the study

- Thanks for the opportunity to try to assist you (the writer) in your dissertation.
- What fun! There must be hundreds of us who wish we'd done something similar but didn't have the perspective until too late. Like Lord Chesterton (?) I hadn't time to be brief or (well organized) in answering the questions. However, I found myself reacting instantly--spontaneously--because I loved answering them and perhaps that is best. Good luck. I think it was also Chesterton who said something to the effect that a really great man is one who makes other feel great. It occurs to me that this is very appropriate as applied to Knowles.

These comments are closely akin to the ones eulogizing Knowles as a person.

#### 3. Those considering Knowles as a profound influence on the adult education field

- Knowles was a great influence in the promotional campaign of the United Church of Christ.
- I have the highest regard for Knowles and think he has made a greater contribution to the adult education field than anyone

else. Everything he writes seems fresh and original. He is not just repeating something that I have already read somewhere else.

- Knowles is a person who has made a great contribution to the developing field of adult education. I would automatically put him at the top four or five people to make a contribution in the last twenty years.
- Knowles is the most distinguished leader in adult education.
- Knowles has had a profound influence on the theory, philosophy and practice of adult education here and abroad—perhaps more than any single individual in the twentieth century. This happened because of his: (1) personal creative talents; (2) his extraordinary enthusiasm for adult education (and high energy level); (3) his prolific writing in important areas; and (4) his choice of career positions (Adult Education Association, Young Men's Christian Association, and Boston University).<sup>6</sup> Knowles is truly a liberal artist who employs the technology of the social sciences to expand, innovate and improve the practice of education.

These comments, it must be remembered, are assessments from a positive point of view. They are more general than specific. They have a general expression of perceiving Knowles as being one of the higher influentials in the field.

#### 4. Knowles' operational effectiveness

- Knowles' ability to think and operate effectively at all levels, from the most abstract to the very lowest level of application is particularly outstanding. I know few who can do this.
- Knowles has always stood out as a man of sincerity, integrity, good will, interested in overall welfare of Adult Education Association of the U.S.A. and adult education as a movement. He certainly has been one of the leaders from our country and it has been a leadership without self in mind.
- My doctoral program (Adult Education at Boston University) could not have been a wiser choice. It provided me with relevant forward looking education that continues to meet the needs in a demanding changing professional position. I consider Knowles a counselor, guide and friend.

---

<sup>6</sup>See pp. 19 to 197 of this study. The above comment is supported by this study.

- Knowles and my relationship is one of credentialee-credentialeeer.
- My most gratifying experience with Knowles was in a "T" group. For the first time, I learned that everyone has similar problems, behavior and personal characteristics. For the first time I felt part of a normal group. I was blind and thought I had peculiar problems. Knowles assured me I was a mature individual.
- A Knowles Cult? Maybe. But here is more than a thoughtful man and a charming personality. The effectiveness in encouraging others to grow and to find satisfaction in the growing is the extraordinary thing. Knowles is a teacher who believes that his students are more important than he--that the work they can do is essential and that he must help them find ways to do it.
- Knowles is a great guy and made contributions as a practitioner. He is able to relate in such an authentic way. He tries to be open to any issue while serving as enabler and facilitator of learning.

The very warmth, acceptance, and openness of Knowles personality has meant that the immediacy of reward that people got from their contacts with him have been substantial. The overarching assessment in this section could be stated that Knowles is a facilitator of growth and development. There were, without question, some eulogistic comments which could be considered for what they are. These may be expected on the one end of the "curve of normal distribution" just as the reactive negative comments were to be expected, to which consideration has been given.<sup>7</sup> However, there appeared to be some realistic assessment of Knowles' considered operational effectiveness in a variety of settings.

#### Data Received on Non-Behavioral Aspects of Knowles' Influence

A further development of backdrop regarding assessment of Knowles' contribution by respondents had to do with: (1) The respondent's academic and work background; (2) The likenesses in educational philosophy and practice each respondent saw between Knowles and himself; (3) The

---

<sup>7</sup>See supra, pp. 200-204.

differences in educational philosophy and practice each saw between Knowles and himself; and, (4) changes they perceived as resulting from Knowles' intervention in an organization with which they were or had been associated.

#### Respondents' academic and work background

The question out of which the data for this part came was number I:1, on the opinionnaire, namely: Will you describe your background, and development as an educator (or adult educator), the influence upon your thinking and practice, your assumptions about learners and learning process, conceptual schemata, models, strategies, your relation to your parent discipline? Since the question was very broad and openended, with little proportion of space allowed for response, two main areas formed the pattern of expression: (1) the type of organization for which respondents had or were currently working, and (2) the general philosophies and influences that shaped their development and current thinking as adult educators.

The 75 expressions stating the nineteen types of work organizations involved were distributed as follows:

Public School teaching- - - - -	15
Cooperative Extension - - - - -	11
College or University teaching- - - - -	8
Continuing Adult Education- - - - -	7
Young Men's Christian Association - - - - -	6
Clergymen - - - - -	5
Businessmen - - - - -	4
Behavioral Science Adult Education- - - - -	3
Girl Scouts of America- - - - -	3
Social Work - - - - -	3
Public Library- - - - -	2
National Training Laboratories Institute for Applied Behavioral Science - - - - -	2
Labor Unions- - - - -	1
Public Relations- - - - -	1

Nursing - - - - -	1
Special Education - - - - -	1
Law - - - - -	1
Volunteer Work- - - - -	1

The thirty two expressions of background influences and philosophy that informs the respondent's thinking, were distributed among the following fourteen categories:

Sociologist - - - - -	5
Pragmatist- - - - -	4
Psychologist- - - - -	4
Social psychologist - - - - -	3
Historicist - - - - -	3
Existentialist- - - - -	2
Social Scientist- - - - -	2
Liberal Artist- - - - -	2
Economist - - - - -	2
Political Scientist - - - - -	1
Classisist- - - - -	1
Theologist- - - - -	1
Music Educationist- - - - -	1
English Literature Humanist - - - - -	1

The prima inference and probably the only one to be drawn from the foregoing data is that there is great diversity in the persons expressing their views concerning Knowles' influence on the field of adult education. This kind of distribution on background was to be expected and true to adult education's eclectic form if what Knowles said in 1965 about the leadership in adult education is true.

Of the several thousand leaders of continuing education--the men and women who provide staff services in educational programs for adults in colleges and universities, public schools, business and industry, government agencies, religious institutions, and a dozen other institutional settings--perhaps not more than ten per cent have any formal training in the theory and practice of adult education. They are people, for the most part, who were on their way up in their organizations and were available when vacancies occurred; and they tend to be people who were intrigued by the adventure of adult education. Most of them have learned what

they know about their jobs through apprenticeship, hard knocks, and independent reading.<sup>8</sup>

Likenesses to Knowles in Educational Philosophy  
and Practice of Respondents as Seen by Respondents

This section, unlike the preceding one, utilizes the words of some, but not all, respondents. Where this is true it will be found that others, in essence, perceived some of the same likenesses of themselves with Knowles but did not use exactly the same words. This assessment of likeness in statement was this researcher's in the absence of objective criteria. The reason for not presenting the words of each in full was in the interest of brevity. Each respondent was not limited to one comment; hence, there would be more comments than respondents. The perceived likenesses are divided into specifics and general. The number before each statement indicates how many times each was mentioned.

Specific perceived likenesses of respondent to Knowles

- 17 - Faith in man as learner throughout life.
- 11 - Teacher's role is to create environment conducive to learning.
- 9 - Approach to learning is self-directed, including evaluation.
- 7 - The theory of andragogy, the differences in assumptions about adults and youth.
- 5 - Process of learning paramount--helping adults learn how to learn more important than content.
- 5 - Involvement of adults in Program Planning Process important to society and effective democracy.
- 4 - Learning is a growth experience and comprehensive including intellectual, social and emotional.
- 3 - Adult education is an organism capable of never ending growth.
- 3 - Careful diagnosis needed for learning.
- 2 - Value of group dynamics.
- 2 - Experimental approach to releasing human potential.
- 2 - Learner orientation in adult education.
- 2 - Adult educators must practice what they preach--be congruent.

---

<sup>8</sup>Malcolm S. Knowles, "Professional Education for Leaders of Continuing Education," Boston University Journal of Education, Vol. 147, No. 3 (February, 1965), p. 17.

- 1 - Learning is an active process.
- 1 - Looseness in treatment of adult education.
- 1 - Improved practice is measure which must ultimately be sought.
- 1 - Concern for development as professional.
- 1 - Requisites of education are (1) trustful sharing of relationships, and (2) direct confrontations of dilemmas.
- 1 - It is better for adults to meet and solve problems rationally.
- 1 - Societal forces to be used to examine history, current status and possible future direction of adult education.
- 1 - Shared leadership and program planning responsibilities are important in groups.
- 1 - Emphasis upon humanistic psychology.
- 1 - Adult education outside the educational establishment is important.
- 1 - Concern for interpersonal interaction.
- 1 - Commitment to the field.
- 1 - Promotion to be ethically sound and practically useful must be conceived as education--to draw out thought and action rather than to enforce decision.

These areas of perceived likenesses are in a large measure self-explanatory. However, one thing emerges clearly: the central threads of Knowles' philosophy--faith in man as life-long learner, teacher provides climate conducive to learning, self-directed learning, differences in assumptions about adults and youth, helping adults learn how to learn, and wide involvement of adults in program planning--come the highest on the list of respondents perceived likenesses to Knowles. In fact, fifty-four comments were made upholding the six areas while another thirty-four comments were distributed among twenty other areas. A closer check of the twenty areas reveals them to be items surrounding and in support of the first six central areas.

#### General perceived likenesses of respondent to Knowles

- Similar in some philosophy.
- Parallel rather closely.
- Similar in research, teaching administration, counseling and consulting.
- I strongly adhere to his philosophy of adult education.
- Some response.

- Entirely congruent.
- Entirely agreed.
- Similar in philosophy and commitment to principles of adult learning theory.
- Close
- Knowles comes closer than anyone representing my attitudes toward people and philosophy of education.
- Many ideas, interests and concerns alike.
- Complete agreement. His approach soundest I have ever known.
- Alike in philosophy.
- Share many values.
- Both pragmatic.
- Can't be specific but we are the same.

These sixteen statements are very general. No specifics were included. Hence, it is only safe to assume that the respondents perceive general likeness and affinity to Knowles' philosophy of education. What they perceive Knowles as espousing is not known by the comments. However, they do perceive themselves as being in varying degrees of agreement with Knowles.

By these general comments and the foregoing specific comments it is quite clear that these respondents share interest in many of the same adult educational things as does Knowles. The flow of influence is a shared interest with people of equal or slightly lower interest, as discussed elsewhere in this work.<sup>9</sup>

#### Differences from Knowles in Educational Philosophy and Practice of Respondents as seen by Respondents.

This section, similar to the preceding one, utilizes the words of some, but not all, respondents. Where this is true it will be found that others, in essence, perceived some of the same differences of themselves from Knowles but did not use exactly the same words. The assessment of differences in statements was this researcher's in the absence of objective

---

<sup>9</sup>See supra, p. 19, note 24.



criteria. The reason for not presenting the words of each respondent in full was in the interest of brevity. Each respondent was not limited to one comment. Hence, there would be more comments than respondents. The perceived differences are divided into references to specifics, sub-divided into respondent's expressions of "Knowles more than I" and "Knowles less than I"; and, references to perceived changes taking place in the respondent as a result of the differences from Knowles. The number before each statement indicates how many times each was mentioned.

Specific differences of respondent from Knowles  
as perceived by respondent

1. Those expressions by respondents of "Knowles more than I"

- 11 - Knowles is a more skilled congruent practitioner in application of his theories, has greater perspective and drive than I.
- 7 - Knowles has more faith in democratic processes, believes more in laymen participation in changing society, decision making and implementing than I.
- 6 - Knowles has more patience to let people develop at their own pace and leans more to unstructured situations than I.
- 6 - Knowles emphasizes group dynamics more than I.
- 2 - Knowles emphasizes techniques and methods in program planning more than I.
- 2 - Knowles' writing is more extensive; his practice is more discernable, sophisticated and accepted more readily within administrative structure than mine.
- 2 - Knowles saw adult education as whole canopy under which adult growth is located earlier than I.
- 2 - Knowles is a producer of information and I am a user of information.
- 1 - Knowles oriented more toward solution of problems than I.
- 1 - Knowles devotes more time to the adult education cause than I do.
- 1 - Knowles more protective, accepting, positive regarding and attentive to other people than I am.
- 1 - Knowles better prepared professionally than I.

Thirty of the forty-two comments just listed emphasize a clear picture of Knowles' style as an adult educator: (1) Highly skilled as a practitioner who uses and applies theory in a workable fashion; (2) A strong believer and practitioner of faith in people developing and

growing at their own pace; (3) Emphasis on lay participation in deciding and implementing societal changes; and, (4) Use of group dynamics findings and methods to accomplish these things.

The additional twelve comments are more personal and general in nature but once again emphasizes the views others have of Knowles being comprehensive in his approach.

## 2. Those expressions by respondents of "Knowles less than I."

- 6 - Knowles believes adult education graduate students need less cognitive input and guidance than I do.
- 3 - Knowles takes less of a gradual approach in the learning situation than I do.
- 2 - Knowles feels adult education less marginal than I do.
- 2 - Knowles has less emphasis on conceptual approach in program planning than I do.
- 1 - Knowles has less concern for behavioral science models than I do.
- 1 - Knowles less empirical than I.
- 1 - Knowles less conservative and concerned with guaranteed outcomes than I.
- 1 - Knowles less doctrinaire than I.
- 1 - Knowles less pragmatic than I.
- 1 - Knowles emphasizes less responsibility with trust.
- 1 - Knowles less confronting; congruent, understanding and self-descriptive than I.
- 1 - Knowles sees programmed learning as making less of a contribution than I.
- 1 - Knowles has less emphasis on Community Development, International development and Literacy Education than I.

It is difficult to see any general pattern emerging out of these comments. However it may be inferred from the statements that Knowles is seen as much more free wheeling in educational style than most of the respondents. These statements may be further substantiation of his freedom in developing the field.

It should be noted that there were only twenty-two statements of perceived differences by respondents while there were forty-two statements of perceived likenesses. This, once again, may substantiate that

the flow of influence is a shared interest with people of equal or slightly lower interest, as discussed elsewhere in this work.<sup>10</sup> The low number of difference statements in comparison to likeness statements may be indication of why those who responded could see some influence Knowles had exerted upon them. This will be discussed more later.

References to perceived changes taking place in the respondent as a result of the differences from Knowles

A few references were made by respondents pertaining to perceived changes taking place as a result of the differences. They are presented here as information because it is doubtful that any general inference can be made from them. The same style of presentation of the respondents' statement hold as for the likeness and difference statements, with the number of times mentioned preceding the statements.

- 2 - Differences are stimulating my development.
- 1 - Differences changed me to think of education as fulfilling growth potential, instead of imparting knowledge.

Only one of the three statements give a specific. The other two are general and do not indicate growth in any specific regard.

Knowles working as a change agent and changes resulting in organizations as perceived by a respondent associated with that organization

As has been noted earlier,<sup>11</sup> page 4a of the opinionaire was sent only to professional colleagues of Knowles. Page 4b of the opinionaire was sent to former or current students of Knowles. This section deals with the responses from those who received page 4a.

---

<sup>10</sup>See supra, p. 19, note 24; p. 212, note 9.

<sup>11</sup>See supra, p. 23.

Of the thirty-five responding, twenty-five indicated a "yes" answer to whether Knowles had worked as a change agent<sup>12</sup> in an organization in which the respondent had been or was currently involved. (Question III:1). Nine organizations were mentioned more than once. The list is included below with the number of responses per organization preceding the name.

- 8 - Adult Education Association of the U.S.A.
- 4 - Commission of the Professors of Adult Education.
- 2 - Leadership Resources, Inc.
- 2 - Young Men's Christian Association  
Organization Development Project, United States and Canada
- 2 - Department of Adult Education, North Carolina State  
University at Raleigh
- 1 - Providence, Rhode Island, Public Schools
- 1 - Cooperative Extension Service
- 1 - Center for the Study of the Liberal Education of Adults
- 1 - Unitarian-Universalists Women's Leadership Division
- 1 - United Church of Christ, Stewardship Council

This is not a complete listing of all the organizations in which Knowles ever worked, but only those indicated by the respondents.

There were twenty-four "yes" responses to whether there were changes in the organizations perceived by the respondents as attributable to Knowles' influence. The name and perceived changes in each organization indicated are presented in the words of the respondents.

1. Adult Education Association of the U.S.A.

- The Ford Foundation confronted with involvement of others and process emphasis as the key to adult education.
- Role of Adult Education Association conceptualized as professional organization with consistency of approach in early years of adult leadership.
- Adult Leadership pamphlets produced and still used.
- Early influence of group dynamics for good or ill attributable to Knowles.

---

<sup>12</sup>For definition of "change agent" as used in this work see appendix B, p. 4a of opinionnaire, and p. 10 of Chapter I.

- Galaxy Conference in 1969 result of Knowles' emphasis on trying to bring organizations together, i.e. Council of National Organization and National Association of Public School Adult Education which later changed its name to National Association of Public Continuing and Adult Education.
- AEA adjusted to another role after Ford Foundation Grants expired. Knowles was coordinator of catalyzing forces. From prosperity to poverty he emerged as a leader, a mature person.
- The organization and strategy adopted in AEA although I admired Knowles more for his objectives than his accomplishments.

## 2. Commission of Professors of Adult Education

- Changed from a closed group to one of wider membership and influence. It became more democratically oriented.
- Once it was a small group lacking in mission spirit. It changed to 150 members and appeals to a variety of work and study disciplines.
- Knowles' earlier contacts were in observer roles. He was accepted as peer and gave commission broader view of his AEA executive position.
- Not aware of specific ones.

## 3. Leadership Resources, Inc.

- Organization founders and managers lead to a realistic and healthy confrontation of philosophical differences affecting the organization.
- A healthy confrontation of two different philosophies in organization brought about change of ownership.

## 4. Girl Scouts of America

- Changes, yes, but the future will spell what happens to the seeds sown.
- Changed training from didactic approach to shared experimental learning. Introduced flexibility, shared leadership and group growth.

## 5. Young Men's Christian Association

- U.S.A. Organization Development Project. Trainer development workshops and concepts of adult education trained people who have come into influential positions within YMCA in the last five to ten years.
- Canada. Greater openness, risking, experimenting, collaborative effort and problem solving skills.

6. Department of Adult Education--North Carolina State University at Raleigh

- As a result of Knowles' very excellent teaching and counsel the curriculum of the department has undergone extensive study and evaluation. This self-study by the staff has resulted in modification of content and methodology of courses offered in the department.
- Knowles' history and philosophy text used in courses. Tele-lecture to students and faculty on curriculum.

7. Providence, Rhode Island, Public Schools

- Participants changed attitudes about adult education. They became committed to its support. More support was there from individuals involved.

8. Cooperative Extension Service

- Knowles' inputs to change the organization have been twofold: (1) In recent years through his contacts with a limited number of graduate students; (2) Prior to that through his consulting in workshops, seminars and state meetings of Cooperative Extension Service.

9. Center for the Study of Liberal Education for Adults

- Knowles was completely unsuccessful in CSLA in relationship to Boston University.

10. Unitarian-Universalist Women's Leadership Division

- Continental Board Procedures, training programs for local members, philosophy of leadership, development of training materials, and training programs for Continental board members.

11. United Church of Christ Stewardship Council

- Rethinking the whole philosophy and methodology of church funding within the United Church of Christ.

It must be granted that some of the observations are too general to pinpoint anything other than a vague feeling that something changed. There also was the declaration that Knowles' efforts to solidify the relationship between CSLA and Boston University were completely unsuccessful. There were also some comments indicating changes, but results would not be forthcoming for some time. So a "wait and see" was indicated.

If it is assumed that the perception of these respondents concerning changes in organizations attributed to Knowles are accurate in regard to what actually happened, then, there are some common threads and results that are observable.

First, where changes occurred there seemed to be an opening into wider horizons. In Adult Education Association there was its increasing inclusiveness of organizations collaborating. In the Commission of the Professors it was the enlarging membership and broader vision of adult education. In Leadership Resources it was willingness for the change of ownership because of differing philosophies. In the Girl Scouts there was a changed training approach from didactic to experimental. With the YMCA there was increased openness, risk taking, experimenting, collaboration and problem solving skills developed. In the North Carolina State University Department of Adult Education there was the modification of methodology and content of adult education courses. The Providence, Rhode Island, Public Schools gained greater commitment to the support of adult education. In the Unitarian-Universalist Women there were changed procedures and training for the Continental Board, and the United Church of Christ Stewardship program was revamped.

Second, the group dynamics approach with its emphasis upon organic system, wide involvement and developing internal resources were in increasing evidence. In the Adult Education Association the break with Ford Foundation and continued popularity of the leadership pamphlets substantiate this. With the Professors was the increased emphasis of wider democratic involvement and influence and developing mission spirit. The Leadership Resources group kept alive and grew by dividing rather than

seeking conformity. The Girl Scouts became experimental though uncertain about the future rather than remaining traditional. The YMCA developed new people from within to emerge into influential leadership positions for the future. In North Carolina the staff were involved in self-study resulting in changes. Changed attitudes in persons resulted in the Providence Public School's larger commitment to adult education. And the United Church of Christ Stewardship people were involved in rethinking their philosophy of church funding resulting in their change in methodology.

#### Data Received on Behavioral Aspects of Knowles' Influence

This section is to be a presentation of the respondents' perceptions of influence processes Knowles used with individuals and organizations, facilitating and hindering behaviors Knowles used during individual's degree process with him, and the most significant contributions Knowles has made to the field of adult education.

It was determined that a straight presentation of the data in the categories listed above would not do justice in viewing Knowles' competencies or deficiencies in terms of a "Professional" Adult Educator. Further, one tool for analysis of the behavioral data was selected: The Twenty-three Behavioral Descriptions of The Adult Educator as found in George Aker's 1963 study conducted for the Commission of the Professors of Adult Education entitled Criteria For Evaluating Graduate Programs in

\*Note: Quote marks are placed around the word "Professional" indicating the continuing controversy over whether adult education is a profession or an emerging profession. However, some say it is a profession and Knowles declares himself as a professional.



### Adult Education.<sup>13</sup>

#### Aker's Twenty-Three Behaviors as a Tool for Analysis

From a review of the literature of adult education, Aker derived a list of 410 objectives, competencies and behaviors. He then subjected these findings to various screening and testing procedures, including the judgment of eighteen professors of adult education and 287 persons who held graduate degrees in adult education or were working toward them. Aker arrived at the following list of twenty-three "essential behaviors" of the adult educator considered to be observable and measurable:

1. He helps people control and adjust to change rather than to maintain the status quo.
2. Intelligently observes and listens to what is being said or done and uses this information to guide his responses.
3. Selects and uses teaching methods, materials and resources that are appropriate in terms of what is to be learned and in terms of the needs and abilities of the learners.
4. Helps his clientele acquire the ability for critical thinking.
5. Provides an atmosphere where adults are free to search, through trial and error, without fear of institutional or interpersonal threat.
6. Identifies potential leaders and helps them develop their potentials and capacities.
7. Makes use of existing values, beliefs, customs and attitudes as a starting point for educational activities.
8. Is actively involved in continuing study that will increase his professional competence.
9. Understands the role of adult education in society and is aware of the factors and forces that give rise to this function.
10. Actively shares, participates and learns with the learners in the learning experience.
11. Helps adults actively to set their own goals, and provides a variety of means and opportunities for intensive self-evaluation.
12. Identifies and interprets trends that have implications for adult education.
13. Has clearly defined his unique role as an adult educator and understands his responsibility in performing it.

---

<sup>13</sup>George F. Aker, "Criteria for Evaluating Graduate Programs in Adult Education," Findings of a Study Conducted for The Commission of Professors of Adult Education, The University of Chicago, Center for Continuing Education, Chicago, 3/11/63, pp. 12-13. (Mimeographed.)

14. Arranges learning experiences so that the learner can integrate theory and practice.
15. Is effective in building a teaching team among lay leaders and group members.
16. Uses the process of appraisal to evaluate programs and help clarify and change objectives.
17. Is creative and imaginative in developing new programs, and believes that innovation and experiment are necessary for the expansion of adult education.
18. Makes use of the contributions of all group members through the utilization of individual talents and abilities.
19. Works with schools, teacher, parents and pre-adults to assist them in developing the motivation, attitudes, understanding and skills necessary for lifelong learning.
20. Objectively presents contrasting points of view.
21. Assumes the initiative in developing a strong national perception of the importance and essentiality of continuing education.
22. Recognizes when the communication process is not functioning adequately or when it breaks down.
23. Identifies, critically evaluates and discusses scholarly work by investigators in adult education and related fields.<sup>14</sup>

Quick notice will be taken that these twenty-three "essential behaviors" were nowhere mentioned in the opinionnaire. The purpose for this was to let the respondents have a free hand as they described Knowles' behavior as an adult educator. This no-suggestive bias was placed before them in the process of gaining the data. However, such a list could have served to remind them of some behavior of Knowles that had temporarily been forgotten.

As the available data is analyzed, Aker's list of twenty-three behaviors will be used to assess where Knowles was perceived to have acted the most in accordance with it and where he did not. It is also acknowledged that the process of analyzing will be subject to errors in assessment by the writer, i.e. that a statement may be listed in one category while a better listing may be in another category.

In addition, there may be data which will not fit into the Aker

---

<sup>14</sup>Loc. cit.

categories and therefore will be listed separately.

The list of Aker's "twenty-three measurable essential behaviors of adult educators" will be presented in numerical order and the data gained from the respondents will be listed immediately following each behavior. Where there are more than one reference to the same item; i.e. "use of groups as learning method," "self-directed learning," etc.; a general statement will be used as a heading and the statements referring to it will be numbered - (1), (2), etc.

1. Helps people control and adjust to change rather than to maintain the status quo.

- He\* created a level of awareness as I went through years of agonizing behavioral change.
- His viewing an adult educator as change agent.
- His conceptual elements of the adult education field have found a way into the adult education program planning course at North Carolina State University.
- He was approachable and always had time.
- His permissiveness and analysis of change processes helped. He very neatly translated into practice the evaluation and analysis processes used in group research.
- He helped us have experiences that led to insight.
- A sum of and molding through his writings--Adult Education Movement, Handbook of Adult Education and Higher Adult Education--as well as his personal guidance and comments at AEA meetings.
- His group dynamics interest helped me clarify and integrate it with liberal adult education. His graduate class method--teaching-learning teams--helped me create a similar design.

2. Intelligently observes and listens to what is being said or done and uses this information in making his response.

- I chose adult education as a career when he was willing to start where I was and help me reach my goals.
- He listened to me responsively and gave effective critique when I asked.
- He listened attentively as a classroom panel of twelve gave eight lectures to bored people. He then asked, "Did you accomplish your objective? How do you know? Would you do it the same again or differently?"

---

\*Note: The word "he" or "his" used in the data following, refers to "Knowles."

- He tunes in to diagnose what is going on, then he develops exercises or methods to explore the problem further.
  - At an AEA National Conference training session he had finished a presentation. He saw a possible contribution to AEA by some unattached agencies and adults. He responded positively to the need of broadened perspective and lighted a torch in those looking for direction and help.
3. Selects and uses teaching methods, materials and resources that are appropriate in terms of what is to be learned and in terms of the needs and abilities of the individual learners.
- Reference to the use of groups.
    - (1) He used groups as a learning medium.
    - (2) He effectively reconciled group learning experience with individual learning strategies.
    - (3) Group Process: He had skill in activating groups for complete involvement. In a two-day workshop I have observed his power to develop cohesiveness, good fellowship and workshop objectives.
    - (4) His use of group process.
    - (5) His group process techniques.
    - (6) His group leadership, teacher statesmanship and counseling.
    - (7) His films on group dynamics and leadership development.
    - (8) His participation in training programs as indicated in the films he conducted.
    - (9) His TV tapes in 1962 on group dynamics helped develop my leadership capabilities.
  - References to his book Informal Adult Education.
    - (1) Informal Adult Education.
    - (2) Informal Adult Education.
    - (3) Informal Adult Education more useful and appropriate to its time than later writings.
  - He leaves students to learn by their own method.
  - He was tops as a personal learning coach which gains motivation. His application of human relations training to adult education.
  - He accepted my personal goals, demonstrating toward others useful ways diverse goals could be harnessed.
  - He was so open when I registered at Boston University.
  - Where I was involved in a class exercise he conducted, I realized I was underprivileged because I couldn't write with my left hand. I gained a new appreciation for adults as learners.
  - As a classroom teacher he instilled basic principles and new concepts of education by lecture and demonstration involving different types of participation. In dissertation he was great resource, dynamic personality, marvelous in memory, a taskmaster and kind.
  - His toughmindedness gained my respect and increased my self-insight as we conflicted at my proposal hearing.

- His insight into the adult education field, humility and courtesy helped me grow.
- His books and publications used in our classes for those going into education work.
- His publications.
- His channels of communication are always open.
- He negotiates toward consensus.
- He uses confrontation processes.
- His live demonstration, involvement of community leaders who in turn become change agents back home.
- He has sensitivity to pacing and development.
- He facilitates through initiating structures and methods.
- He repaired the hurts and shatters he caused me in class and dissertation.

4. Helps his clientele acquire ability for critical thinking.

- He is a stimulator of ideation.
- He holds off too rapid closure in groups.
- He helped me organize my thoughts about the field of adult education.
- He is the master of Socratic method in research seminar.
- I was sold on his philosophy and methodology at first: After three semesters I feel learning-teaching teams are not appropriate all the time.
- He gives honest and helpful criticism.
- He gives frank, critical analysis.
- He gives helpful criticism.
- He suggested models and resources.
- He gave insight, inspiration and guidance through the years. He helped me see my tendency to write overkill.
- He raises appropriate questions on practice, interest and thought.
- His insistence on rigor in research, honest appraisal and quality equal to degree granted.
- In conference related to my dissertation, he confronted me with my obligation to formulate questions precisely, listen carefully to the reader, internalize a high degree of critical judgment and develop my own resources and experiences.
- I have been led in meetings he conducted to rethink my views and values. His book on the adult education movement helped me rethink my views of the future of adult education although I was disappointed in his conclusions.

5. Provides an atmosphere where adults are free to search, through trial and error, without fear of institutional and interpersonal threat.

- The concept of self-direction in learning.
  - (1) He emphasized self-direction in learning.
  - (2) He fostered freedom, personal choice, self-direction and self-diagnosis in learning.

- (3) His courses consistently encouraged freedom to make my own mistakes and successes. His summary comments helped with framework but I learned my own way.
  - (4) He repeatedly and consistently showed me I was responsible for my own learning. I took my education.
  - (5) In class groups and personally he is real, open, flexible, trusts and insists learning is the responsibility of the learner.
  - (6) His comment one day when I arrived late for an appointment "It's your life," was the essence of his focus on the individual as a self-directed learner.
  - (7) He believes in self-direction.
  - (8) He is a personal learning coach in self-direction.
  - (9) He builds a climate of self-diagnosis.
  - (10) He has concern of process before content, self-diagnosis, leadership development, interpersonal relationships.
  - (11) He has respect for students; self-assigned tasks, motivation.
  - (12) He gives support for self-direction.
  - (13) He elicited my trust and let me self-direct.
  - (14) He insisted students make their own decisions.
  - (15) His approach is toward self-directed learning.
  - (16) His is self-direction.
  - (17) He believes in self-learning.
  - (18) He is all self-direction.
- Establishing a learning climate he is willing to discuss his philosophy with others.
  - His consultative style is very supportive; and he left room for comfort and my decisions.
  - He sees caring as the essence of teaching and learning.
  - He is open, trustful, solidly supporting with no pushing or pressure.
  - He sets a climate of trust.
  - He is humane; others are cold professors.
  - His warmth, critical ability, clarity, accessibility, trust, providing tryouts and encouragement, are a model.
  - In the strangeness and discomfort of starting a doctoral program he was warm and friendly while dealing with the bureaucracy.
  - He is friendly, kind, skillful in planning of programs, encouraging and sympathetically understanding of problems.
  - He is totally honest, never critical or degrading, and has empathy for adult life problems.
  - His support in program planning, sharpness of questions, provide a setting to shape thoughts and ideas.
  - He was challenging and supportive of me—one of his first doctoral students—in the midst of much pressure on him.
  - He has not his own test—faith in people, patience, perceptiveness and kindness when learners stumble around.
  - He could help engineers become more humane as he taught technological subjects to them but I would not call on him to set up a technological institute. He is too spontaneous for that.

6. Identifies potential leaders and helps them to develop their potentials and capacities.

- Emphasis on his belief in people.

- (1) He consistently accepted my integrity as an individual whose goals and processes to move toward those goals were generated by me in my own life space.
- (2) He believed in me and my ability to do my work. He took me where I was and encouraged me to go on.
- (3) He assumed that I am my own man and he is his own man.
- (4) He gave me a feeling of self-worth by recognizing as an important contribution what I had to offer to the group.
- (5) He strongly affirms each person as the source of his own ability to learn.
- (6) He reinforced my own philosophy and practice as opposed to causing me to change.
- (7) He helps unlock the potential of others by warmth, friendliness and interest over many years.
- (8) He has humility and respect for growing capacities in others.
- (9) He persevered in his confidence in me; he advocated other work to satisfy requirement credits, data for research and oral work for comprehensive exams.
- (10) The values he placed on persons and me were professional and academic goals rather than my background in relation to University regulations.
- (11) He felt I had a contribution to make to the field of adult education. He identified me and saw to it that I had developmental opportunities.
- (12) He made me realize I had something to offer—influence and qualifications as a teacher even without degrees.
- (13) He made me feel at home, provided a good climate, did not confront, and was not flatfooted about where he disagrees. He keeps an organic relationship with one all the way with emphasis on motivation.
- (14) He helps people develop their own style and talents.
- (15) He recognizes and brings out what is best in each individual.
- (16) He has sincerity, creative ideas, optimistic personality and respect for concerns and opinions of others.
- (17) He let me emerge at my own pace. His support, caring, patience, esteem, helped first to change my self-concept, then made me feel like a high potential student, then as emerging colleague, and finally a young professional.

-- Emphasis on the environment he provided.

- (1) His warm personal interest in me as an individual and in my career; my observations of his skill and art in managing group behavior and developing theoretical views were considerable influence in shaping my views, ideas, and philosophy of education.
- (2) He cared for me as a person and learner.
- (3) He is an open friendly personality encouraging others.

- (4) He is kind and sympathetic with students while developing independence.
  - (5) He received me with enthusiasm in adult education program.
  - (6) His correspondence with me was warm, concerned and inspiring.
  - (7) His correspondence was cordial, warm and personal contact was business like.
  - (8) He supported my efforts to make Leadership Resources Incorporated a creative force.
  - (9) He was interested--early on--in my personal quest and helped me find work as a consultant.
  - (10) He treated me as a competent scholar and with human understanding.
  - (11) He accepted my blindness and was willing to guide me to right courses.
  - (12) He showed interest in my learning problems.
  - (13) He gave me cordial encouragement and counsel.
  - (14) He supported me in my plans and helped me with my inadequacies.
  - (15) His behavior served as a model: he was accessible and dependable; he let me grow up, his standards of excellence helped me to be careful and serious about my work.
  - (16) His support and honesty I trusted.
  - (17) He helped me think things through.
  - (18) He was available; knowledgeable, creative, human, friendly and collegial.
- Emphasis on things Knowles taught them.
    - (1) He taught me how to care--through personal relationship, not books.
    - (2) He develops skilled adult education practitioners.
    - (3) He is a model of contagious enthusiasm which stimulates emulation.
    - (4) He taught me by example how to care and showed me the art of loving.
    - (5) He taught me by example to love, to care and simple techniques which follow once attitudes are determined.
  - As executive of AEA he was my first adult education contact. He recommended options in adult education doctoral study which I followed.
  - He encouraged me to change from counselor education to adult education.
7. Makes use of existing values, beliefs, customs and attitudes as a starting point for educational activities.
- He provides democratic structures somewhere between the typical authoritarian role of the teacher and laissez faire complete openness.
  - He applied group dynamics and motivation research finds to adult education.
  - He functions effectively in institutions and in consulting relationships based on his philosophy.



- In our organization he worked with top administration and training personnel to create conditions so his philosophy of andragogy could flourish.
  - He reinforced my interest in socio-emotional aspects of adult teaching-learning experience.
  - I was in his office and the phone rang. He had a difficult student situation to handle. He demonstrated his values--openness, congruence, authenticity, trust, acceptance. He trusted me and showed it.
8. Is actively involved in continuing study that will increase his professional competence.
- He participates in the learning of Adult Education Professors Commission.
  - He is stimulating individuals in the Commission of the Professors of Adult Education.
9. Understands the role of adult education in society and is aware of the factors and forces that give rise to this function.
- He describes the adult education administrative function as the conducting of a symphony orchestra.
10. Actively shares, participates, and learns with the learners in the learning experiences.
- He practices planning, problem-solving mutually together.
  - He uses group processes and can pinpoint an idea after presentation.
  - He relates to each learner deeply as a person.
  - He operates as a group member.
  - He interacted interpersonally at the Commission of the Professors 1969 meeting.
  - He has substantial knowledge and ability to support others in idea development.
  - He is emphatic on involvement and collaboration. He has cognitive resource inputs or identification.
  - He participated consistently as a forthright, confronting person in the organization.
  - He is high on interpersonal interaction.
  - We have exchanged views, papers and books. I encourage students to go to B. U.--assuming Knowles will be a positive influence.
11. Holms students actively set their own goals, and provides a variety of means and opportunity for intensive self-evaluation.
- He has skill in helping people accomplish their own goals.
  - He knows and uses the process of group goal analysis by the groups.
  - He stressed student involvement always. The norm was self-selection in small groups as segment and total group evaluation.

- He had flexible accommodation of individual and organizational needs. He recognized research I did elsewhere for my dissertation at B. U.
  - He worked on evaluation and goal-setting.
12. Identifies and interprets trends that have implications for adult education.
- No statements about this behavior.
13. Has clearly defined his unique role as an adult educator and understands his responsibility in performing it.
- He has a sense of mission in adult education, based on competence in the context of responsible academic discipline.
  - He is dedicated and personally committed to adult education.
  - He has a complete dedication to his work.
  - He is rethinking the role of adult educator.
  - He pushes for professional competence, enthusiasm for learning, inquiry, exploration, thoroughness.
  - He has dedication to his student, informality as opposed to stuffiness, approachability, kindness, leadership, resourcefulness, unobtrusive on excellence.
14. Arranges learning experiences so that the learners can integrate theory and practice.
- Emphasizing the consistency of his theory and practice.
    - (1) He had a viable theoretical model which he understood. He made an entry and gave an input of that model at an appropriate time when it was needed. Even so he overstepped a bit but was not rejected.
    - (2) He has a non-ivory tower mastery of theory and expertise in practice.
    - (3) He practices what he preaches.
    - (4) He has congruence between belief and practice.
    - (5) He behaviorally demonstrates his beliefs and is able to rationally describe his beliefs and intentions--the medium is the message.
    - (6) He formulates consistent theories and practice in adult education.
    - (7) He is a model for hustlers, a good shuttler between his theory and practice.
    - (8) He is a clear theoretician, ably practicing what he preaches.
    - (9) He is congruent--able to put into action what he teaches about adult education.
    - (10) He develops and implements this theories of adult education.
    - (11) He demonstrates as feasible what he says. He treats adults as adults.
    - (12) He works at combining creatively and becoming a model of congruence.

- (13) His practice helps learners experience his philosophy of education.
  - (14) His model of practice is congruent with his philosophy.
  - (15) His congruence is emulating what he believes.
  - (16) He is a living image of adult education.
  - (17) His work with his students and clientele consistent with his philosophy.
  - (18) His practice is tied to a series of evolving theories.
  - (19) He integrated different approaches of adult education. He applied his theory of adult education to a difficult board situation as a model which influenced me.
  - (20) His personal demonstration of his beliefs, way of life, philosophy show his high faith in people.
  - (21) His classroom style theories I have tested and found dependable. His methods of handling large and small groups have been useful. His interviewing is consistent with his philosophy.
  - (22) He is a "living image" of adult education.
  - (23) He practices what he preaches. His authenticity, sensitivity and competence helped me learn for keeps as never before.
  - (24) He is consistent in methodology.
  - (25) He is a model.
  - (26) He is a model of professionalism, encouragement, and positive orientation.
  - (27) He allowed self-direction in thesis and relates to all levels of intelligence. He has an adult to adult approach--he practices congruence as well as preaching it.
  - (28) His practice is consistent with his philosophy--his approachability and genuine personal respect unique.
  - (29) His philosophy so resonated that I knew I belonged in Boston University Adult Education program.
  - (30) He modeled a consultation session with four members of a Secretary's Association planning an education event. This brought to me visible consistency to his theory and practice. From then on my training practice changed--I was able to try new behaviors in putting theory and practice together.
  - (31) He has brought a congruency to the field of adult education:
    - (a) Cognitive and affective come together beautifully in the university setting, industrial settings, educational settings and organizational change settings.
    - (b) He emulates what he believes in:
      - spirit of inquiry
      - mutuality
      - collaborative stance
      - total respect for dignity and worth of people.
- The three years with the Girl Scouts of America Leadership Development Project helped me articulate beliefs.
  - His Girl Scout design I use as a model for many places. He provides models and trusts me in new places.

- His degree program was secondary to personal integration. He was permissive and allowed me to learn my interest. His person-centeredness gave me confidence to finish.
  - Visiting his class convinced me on the spot to change to adult education from my unhappiness as social work student.
  - He made observable his skills and techniques in interpersonal relations, personal interaction and writings.
15. Is effective in building a teaching team among lay leaders and group members.
- His learning-teaching teams stand out.
  - He assisted the teaching-learning teams on projects and covered points they overlooked and forgot in presentations.
  - He related to the teaching-learning teams by not controlling but accepting and encouraging.
16. Uses the process of appraisal to evaluate programs and help clarify change objectives.
- No statements made on this behavior.
17. Is creative and imaginative in developing new programs, and believes that innovation and experiment are necessary for the expansion of adult education.
- Emphasis on his theory of Andragogy.
    - (1) His theory of andragogy relevant to adults and children.
    - (2) He will be responsible if andragogy takes hold.
    - (3) His theory of andragogy shows differences of adults and children.
    - (4) His pedagogical/andragogical distinctions are impressive and timely.
    - (5) He has struggled in his diffused way with what, in fact, is or should be different in teaching adults and plugs "andragogy."
    - (6) His theory of "andragogy" holds promise.
    - (7) He contrasts adults and youth as learners.
    - (8) He has his own psychology on how adults learn differently from youth.
    - (9) He is the real inspiration and guidance to the future of adult education, i.e. writings "Andragogy, not Pedagogy," "Program Planning for Adults as Learners," "The Future of Adult Education" in The Adult Education Movement and Higher Adult Education in the United States.
    - (10) He makes a difference between adults and children.
    - (11) He emphasizes difference between adults and children in relation to time and application.
    - (12) His andragogy--the functional application of adult differences to all teaching-learning transactions.
    - (13) He gave his theory of andragogy.

- (14) He re-examines the assumptions of differences between adults and children.
- (15) He developed the andragogical process.
- (16) His dynamic approach to education and andragogy came through in group discussion, design and training sessions.
- (17) His andragogy concept useful.
- (18) His ideas about continuing education help.
- (19) His article on conducting graduate classes in adult education has influenced my own practice.
- (20) His theory and practice of adult leadership works.
- (21) He developed theory of andragogy.
- (22) He has idea on difference between adults and youth.

- He has an exploring experimental stance with empathetic, diagnostic ability.
- Trying ideas out for size; he has worked with Commission of Professors in looking at sphere of influence and trying new views. These new views are proving to be effective in expanding the field of adult education.
- He is a pioneer.
- He has made a tie between adult education and sensitivity training.
- He maintains an overall feeling of exploration and experimentation.
- His philosophy was refined through practicum at Central 'Y', Chicago.
- He developed a Theory of the Doctorate.
- He developed a Theory of Maturation.
- He helps develop adult education technology.
- He developed the competencies concept for Boston University program.
- He emphasizes human relations in adult education.
- He developed a Theory on Research.
- His consulting skill helped United Church of Christ build a stewardship program with options and decisions individual.
- His writings and speeches are on the cutting edge.
- He shaped the editorial policies of AEA in the early years.
- In Chapter 8 of The Adult Education Movement he visions the future of adult education.

18. Makes use of the contributions of all group members through the utilization of individual talents and abilities.

- He has personal caring and respect for each person's contribution.
- One word describes his work - participation.
- In early years he designed AEA Delegate Assembly legislative sessions to increase involvement in creative thinking.
- He showed large group involvement in planning possible.
- He designed for listening, involvement, and decision making by responsible members.
- I would arrive in class with a negative view on group process. He would quickly produce a sense of involvement, purpose and direction which was part on my own.

- He developed greater student participation in planning and developing courses. His friendliness and modeling behavior said each student's idea had worth.
  - Organizes class using each member's contribution.
  - He collaborates in learning.
  - He shares leadership in professional development.
  - He built on the resources of the participants.
19. Works with schools, teachers, parents and pre-adults to assist them in developing the motivation, attitudes, understandings and skills necessary for lifelong learning.
- No statements made concerning this behavior.
20. Objectively presents contrasting points of view.
- He was calm in the AEA organizational crisis and shared leadership.
  - He used ability in the Professors' meetings to deal with controversy.
  - He served to conceptualize and clarify issues.
21. Assumes the initiative in developing a strong national perception of the importance and essentiality of continuing education.
- 20 - He formed a useful clarifying framework for the history of the Adult Education Movement in the U.S.A.--Field Development Theory. (This was variously mentioned in twenty (20) statements: referring to his published book).
- 9 - He gave a composite view in the 1960 Handbook of Adult Education. (This was mentioned nine (9) times).
- 6 - He was executive of AEA. (This was mentioned six (6) times).
- 4 - He skillfully applies his philosophy as a consultant to massive organizations. (This was mentioned four (4) times).
- 4 - He is Professor of Education at Boston University. (This was mentioned four (4) times).
- He helps systematize Adult Education emergence in American Nation.
  - He uses catalyst approach to unify the adult education field personally.
  - The concept of lifelong learning should be credited to him.
  - He has given me a much broader view of the adult education field.
  - In the early days there were no highly committed intensively trained specialists in the field. He spread himself for general development. His writings are not profound but are useful.
22. Recognizes when the communication process is not functioning adequately or when it breaks down.
- He involves a group in looking at communication and decision making processes.

23. Identifies, critically evaluates and discusses scholarly work by investigators in adult education and related fields.

- He shared his knowledge of research.
- He built on the resources of experts.
- He imparted knowledge, resources, his philosophy, historical field development and current issues.
- He kept up with developments in a variety of academic fields and has been able to translate them or use them as a practitioner--continually testing, exploring and refining.
- His appointment time was yours--discuss your problem, give answers, refer you to resources to investigate your problems.

General Analysis

The behavioral picture of Knowles as reflected in the respondents' words and categorized into Aker's twenty-three behaviors shows areas of strength and weakness. It is varied and multi-dimensional. There are some clear points of emphasis such as on "congruence." It is doubtful that a complete analysis is possible based on the fact that the questions and responses were openended but have been placed in Aker's categories by the writer. These can be seen clearly as individual expressions of experience with Knowles. If, however, a numerical analysis is valid based on the number of statements made that were considered by the writer to be in a given category, it would be charted on separate tables as follows:

- (1) Statements arranged in Aker's categories beginning with highest number mentioned first, proceeding to least number statement mentioned last;
- (2) Special statements listed beginning with most statements first, progressing to the least mentioned.

Table 1

Statements arranged in Aker's categories beginning with highest number mentioned first, proceeding to least number statement mentioned last.

TIMES MENTIONED	RANK ORDERING	AKER'S NUMBER	AKER'S STATEMENTS
48	1	21	Assumes the initiative in developing a strong national perception of the importance and essentiality of continuing education.
42	2	6	Identifies potential leaders and helps them develop their potentials and capacities.
38	3	17	Is creative and imaginative in developing new programs, and believes that innovation and experiment are necessary for the expansion of adult education.
36	4	14	Arranges learning experiences so that the learner can integrate theory and practice.
31	5	5	Provides an atmosphere where adults are free to search, through trial and error, without fear of institutional or interpersonal threat.
29	6	3	Selects and uses teaching methods, materials and resources that are appropriate in terms of what is to be learned and in terms of the needs and abilities of the learners.
14	7	4	Helps his clientele acquire the ability for critical thinking.
11	8	18	Makes use of the contributions of all group members through the utilization of individual talents and abilities.
10	9	10	Actively shares, participates and learns with the learners in the learning experience.
9	10	1	He helps people control and adjust to change rather than to maintain the status quo.
6	11	7	Makes use of existing values, beliefs, customs and attitudes as a starting point for educational activities.
6	11	13	Has clearly defined his unique role as an adult educator and understands his responsibility in performing it.
5	12	2	Intelligently observes and listens to what is being said or done and uses this information to guide his responses.



TIMES MENTIONED	RANK ORDERING	AKER'S NUMBER	AKER'S STATEMENTS
5	12	11	Helps adults actively to set their own goals, and provides a variety of means and opportunities for intensive self-evaluation.
5	12	23	Identifies, critically evaluates and discusses scholarly work by investigators in adult education and related fields.
3	13	15	Is effective in building a teaching team among lay leaders and group members.
3	13	20	Objectively presents contrasting points of view.
2	14	8	Is actively involved in continuing study that will increase his professional competence.
1	15	9	Understands the role of adult education in society and is aware of the factors and forces that give rise to this function.
1	15	22	Recognizes when the communication process is not functioning adequately or when it breaks down.
0	16	12	Identifies and interprets trends that have implications for adult education.
0	16	16	Uses the process of appraisal to evaluate programs and help clarify and change objectives.
0	16	19	Works with schools, teachers, parents and pre-adults to assist them in developing the motivation, attitudes, understanding and skills necessary for lifelong learning.
305 Total Statements			

It is clear that the first six behaviors listed above carry 224 of the total 305 statements.

Beyond and within that picture he carries an image somewhat more specific: namely, there are items categorized within those six behaviors that were mentioned more than once. These are presented on Table 2.

Table 2

Special Statements listed beginning with most statements first progressing to least mentioned.

RANK ORDER	TIMES MENTIONED	ITEM	AKER'S* NUMBER
1	31	<u>Congruence</u> --Emphasis of his modeling the consistency between his theory and practice.	14
2	22	<u>Andragogy</u> --Emphasis on his theory of <u>andragogy</u> : "The art and science of helping adults learn."	17
3	20	<u>History</u> --Referring to his book <u>The Adult Education Movement in the United States</u> .	21
4	18	<u>Self-direction</u> --Emphasis on the concept and his practice of self-direction in learning.	5
4	18	<u>Belief in people</u> --Emphasis on his belief in people and their almost unlimited capacity for growth.	6
5	17	<u>Learning environment</u> --Emphasis on the learning environment he provided.	6
5	9	<u>Handbook</u> --The 1960 <u>Handbook of Adult Education</u> gave a composite view of the field.	21
6	9	<u>Use of Groups</u> --Emphasis on this as a methodology in learning.	3
7	6	<u>A.E.A. Executive</u> --His time spent as the A.E.A. Executive officer.	21
8	5	<u>What he taught</u> --Things he taught individuals such as caring, etc.	6
9	4	<u>Professor</u> --Boston University Professor of Adult Education.	21
9	4	<u>Consultant</u> --Skillful application of his philosophy to nongovernmental organizations.	21
10	3	<u>Informal</u> --His book on <u>Informal Adult Education</u> .	3
166 Total Statements			

A quick count shows 166 out of 305 statements are distributed between thirteen items mentioned more than once. The six items stand at the top of the list (development of the field) forming the strong picture of a composite view of Knowles' contribution to date as was seen by respondents: congruence, andragogy, history, self-direction, learning environment and belief in people. These claim 126 of the 166 statements.

\*Note: Refer to Table 1, pp. 236-237, for Aker's full statement corresponding with the following numbers.

Add the seventh item of nine statements on the Handbook of Adult Education to the history-development and state of the field (in essence the same issue) and one has 135 of the possible 166 statements.

In addition to the six special areas mentioned above, paraphrasing Aker's categories, Knowles is initiating strong national perception, identifying potential leaders, innovating for expanding the field, integrating theory and practice, building a learning climate, and using appropriate methodologies for the growth of adult education.

General comments, hesitations about, and hindrances of Knowles' behavior

The final portion of this chapter includes: (1) general comments of eulogy and hesitancy, and (2) more specific statements of specific behavioral hindrances experienced by respondents.

The general comments of eulogy were as follows:

- He is Mr. Adult Education, U.S.A.
- He is father of the adult education movement in the U.S.
- Younger professors look to him.
- He is a skilled professional adding to the professionalization of the field.
- I found it hard to believe he was so genuine.
- My doctoral program at Boston University was the wisest move I ever made.
- Boston University adult education program was a relevant switch for me from Harvard Business School.
- He is the best example in the adult education field of making theory become operational through his methodology.

The general hesitancy comments were as follows:

- I feel for some students, at some points of readiness and some content, learning-teaching terms are valid but not useful all the time.
- At a summer seminar he led at University of Chicago, my reaction then was close to shock. I thought he was the most rambling, diffuse and disorganized person I have seen. I now know better.
- He was controversial in Adult Education Association.

- I feel that he steals material from everyone else, puts it together and calls it his own. That turns me off and incites anger within me.

The hindrances were a bit more specific, in fact, with some of them being repeated by more than one person:

- Lack of time as a hindrance.
  - (1) On leave, he made inadequate provision for assistance during that time.
  - (2) He was physically absent, out of town, unavailable.
  - (3) He was frequently absent, preoccupied with other things.
  - (4) He is always busy, a hurry up feeling.
  - (5) Demands of time conditions his demand for his kind of research.
  - (6) He is extremely busy and has a crowded schedule which is brought about by his excellence and devotion to students.
- Lack of structure as a hindrance.
  - (1) He hindered at beginning of my doctoral program, because I was so dependent. Then I moved to self-decision and discipline.
  - (2) Initially, I felt a lack of direction.
  - (3) Lack of structure at first confused and disoriented me. It was a first necessary step for my self-direction.
  - (4) He is weak on administrations and operations.
  - (5) He is not a confronter but too supportive, permissive and took no risks with me.
  - (6) His permissiveness and minimal intervention in my own development was much too low a level in norm setting.
- He doesn't treat all equal. He keeps me in the role of student. I am a professional colleague.
- He hindered some in personal growth.
- The number he allowed in his classes.
- He misunderstood where I was, thus delaying my dissertation progress over a year.
- There were too many prescribed, required courses contradictory to Knowles' philosophy.

It is clear that the preponderance of hindrances came with what seemed to the respondents the lack of time and lack of structure on Knowles' part in the relationship with them. Both the lack of time and structure could have been part of what was necessary for some to become more self-directing--one of Knowles' primary goals in adult education. However, the press of 300 graduates under his direction could result in

little time for each when distributed among that many people. There also was the fact that Knowles did consult with many organizations which used much of his time that some felt should be devoted to his graduate students. This writer found a lack of time and structure as being present in his relationship with Knowles. However, rather than experiencing that as a hindrance, this writer saw the lack of time and structure as an opportunity for increasing his own self-direction in learning.

#### SUMMARY

The design of obtaining data about a contemporary for historical research was fraught with difficulties: (1) the logistics of finding, locating and contacting people from whom the data was sought; (2) the running battle concerning what is solid historical research--contemporary versus the study of continuing impact of an event, person or theory fifty years after the fact; and (3) the likelihood of a positive bias in those who assess a contemporary--those who are negative toward the subject are likely not to take the time to respond.

The "opinionnaire" used had a personal influence bias, as contrasted with a pure change strategy bias, because the subject is still personally alive and is very much personally in evidence on the adult education scene. The data received was divided among three areas: (1) Positive and negative comments concerning the study itself and the writer's procedure; (2) Non-behavioral, factual data--responses relative to the diverse background of the respondents, their perceived likenesses being more than their perceived differences with Knowles in educational philosophy and practice, and their perception of the change which took

place in eleven organizations resulting from Knowles' intervention; and (3) Behavioral data—respondents' perceptions of influence processes Knowles used with individuals and organizations, facilitating and hindering behaviors Knowles used during their degree process with him, and his most significant contributions to the field of adult education. Behavioral data was categorized into Aker's twenty-three essential behaviors of adult educators and the six highest were found to be 21, 6, 17, 15, 5 and 3.<sup>15</sup> Six things (which also were in five of the six aforementioned categories) respondents' mentioned most that they perceived his contributions to be were: his congruence between theory and practice, his theory of andragogy, his book The Adult Education Movement in the U.S., his encouraging self-direction in learning, his high regard for human potential, and his building an environment conducive to learning.

The hindrances most mentioned were his lack of time to spend with persons and the lack of structure for those feeling a need for it.

---

<sup>15</sup>See supra, pp. 221-222 of this chapter for a complete listing of the referred to 23 essential behaviors of adult educators.

## CHAPTER V

### FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

Malcolm S. Knowles' work in adult education started as early as 1940, six years before he decided to make it a lifetime profession. Barring unforeseen changes, his work in adult education promises to continue beyond the time of this writing in 1973. In the Boston YMCA he served as Director of Adult Education from 1940 to 1943. In order to be useful to the World War II effort he took a job with the Detroit USO from 1943-1945. In 1945 he entered the service and in 1946 decided to become a professional adult educator--a decision he has not changed to this day.

Knowles' professional adult education career has thus far taken place in different capacities related to three organizations\*: (1) As Adult Education and Executive Director of Chicago Central YMCA from 1946 to 1951; (2) as Administrative Coordinator and Executive Director of the Adult Education Association, U.S.A., from 1951 to 1959; and (3) as Associate Professor, later Professor of Education and General Consultant in Adult Education at Boston University, from 1960 to the present (1973). However, he has carried on an adult education consultant practice with a variety of additional organizations, the Girl Scouts of America, the YMCA's of Canada and the United States to name only a couple.

In 1967, Knowles received the Delbert Clark Award from West

---

\*Note: These organizations have primary purposes other than adult education. This relationship has been quite typical thus far in the emerging life of the amorphous adult education field.

Georgia College, Carrolton; adult education's coveted award.

This research began by asking and seeking an answer or answers to the central question: What are the contributions in theory and practice Malcolm S. Knowles has made to the emerging field of adult education?

Sub-questions related to the central question of this research included at least the following issues: influences causing him to enter the field of adult education; beliefs that informed his educational philosophy and practice; adult education practices and effects remaining in organizations after his major connection terminated with those organizations; influences and practices in the wider field of adult education that appear to have changed as a result of his work.

The procedure and scope of the research developed as follows: The primary organizing principle of the study was the chronological order of Malcolm S. Knowles' emergence into the field of adult education and his work as an adult educator. This dealt with the following sequential divisions of time: boyhood background, educational training and development, basic organizations with which he did the major portion of his adult education work, the spin-offs resulting from his work in the field of adult education, and an assessment and views of his contributions by some of his contemporaries.

Sections were included that dealt with his boyhood and education in Montana and Florida; his student days at Harvard; people influencing his beliefs; professional education at University of Chicago in adult education; administrator at Chicago Central YMCA and Adult Education Association of the U.S.A.; Professor of Education at Boston University; and his influence on an ever increasing number of people, programs and



organizations. Among them were included the Girl Scouts of America; YMCA of Canada and U.S.; Dr. Leonard Nadler; Dr. Theodore Austin and Hospital Administration; Dr. Donald Klein and his book on Community Mental Health; Dr. Eugene DuBois' undergraduate class; Dr. John Ohliger's graduate class at Ohio State University; Dr. Watson Dickerman's presentation of professional adult education; Mr. Clarence Thompson's speech to school counselors; the North Carolina State University, Department of Adult and Community College Education; the Career Development Program, General Electric Company, Management Development Institute, Ossining, New York; Data Education, Incorporated, Waltham, Massachusetts with its developing consultative practice in more than thirty organizations; "The Trainer's Guide to Andragogy" and the Social Rehabilitation Service of the Department of Health, Education and Welfare, Washington, D.C.; Intensive Coronary Care Multimedia Learning System, ROCOM Division of Hoffman-LaRoche, Inc., Nutley, New Jersey; Adult Education Commission of the National Catholic Education Association and the Institute for Continuing Education, Archdiocese of Detroit; University of Missouri Extension Association; the role of his direct or indirect influence upon his son, Eric, and daughter, Barbara being involved in social science work; the eighteen dissertations completed at Boston University which tested or applied concepts of andragogy; and the additional nineteen dissertations in progress at Boston University that test or apply concepts of andragogy.

The secondary organizing principle of the study was topical issues. The selection of the issues was made as their prominence became obvious during the investigation.

The sources of information about Malcolm S. Knowles came largely

from: Malcolm S. Knowles and some of his contemporaries as prime information resources; books and other materials Knowles wrote; books and materials others wrote that reflected Knowles' influence; documents and proceedings of educational organizations--local and nationwide; newspapers, magazines and journals; unpublished materials; data received from the 150 questionnaires sent to adult education colleagues of Knowles.

### Findings

As one views the entrance into the field of adult education and prolific work of Malcolm S. Knowles relating to adult education, three elements appear to be of primary importance. First, only the activities and vocation which offered him the opportunity to pioneer and do what he perceived as socially useful could ultimately capture his efforts. The pioneer spirit was developed in his Montana boyhood, trout-fishing days, and his exploratory talks with the family lawyer regarding the meaning of life. He continued to explore these meanings through Boy Scout activities in Florida. At Harvard, Alfred North Whitehead offered a new idea that the aim of education was no longer to transmit culture but a way for man to keep from becoming obsolete in the midst of cultural change. With Jeremy Bentham and the Utilitarian's "best for the most people" Knowles was ready to be useful and pioneer in the new field of adult education. Edward Lindeman's social vision and Alvin Johnson's encouragement to use social science to advance adult education were the final things that helped Knowles make his decision to be a professional adult educator.

In the Chicago YMCA he tested and put in the book Informal Adult Education the ingredients he perceived as necessary for good program planning. He also built a structure that twenty years later makes their

adult education program second to none in the nation.

As administrative head of the new Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., his testing a new "one staff level organization" failed to function satisfactorily as initially conceived. He also failed in being able ultimately to bridge the gap between the group dynamics stream of Adult Leadership Projects staff and the liberal adult education desires of The Fund for Adult Education. However, he left after he managed the organization, not just through wealth but also poverty; while not letting it become his private ownership as had been the case with the leadership in the former American Association for Adult Education.

His work with AEA was a platform to work on wider issues within the field. He touched a variety of organizations tangentially such as the church, Council of National Organizations, and National Association of Public School Adult Education. The AEA annual meeting in 1966 on program planning was successful in carrying out their program by good adult education program planning methods. From all indications Knowles was largely responsible for this. Although it is questionable if this process has been subsequently followed.

The Galaxy Conference on Adult Education in 1969 showed some of his influence in seeking coordination by many organizations responsible for adult education.

The AEA became concerned further with adult education's trusts in the U.S. when it sought coordination on 476 adult education programs sponsored by U.S. government agencies in 1971 by the Adult Education Opportunity Act.

However, the broadest and most lasting contributions from his

AEA days appears to be his theory on the field of operations in adult education. Knowles wrote his Ph.D. dissertation on that definition of the field. The 1960 Handbook which he edited carried the same theme and outline. That theory was also the standard outline for the 1970 Handbook of Adult Education, published by the AEA.

In 1958, through his Theory of Maturation Knowles heralded his dissatisfaction with teaching in all education and specifically adult education. He felt education was only intellectually and early life oriented and needed to include continued comprehensive development of the whole person in the direction of maturity. This formed the basis of his teaching and learning approach as he moved from administration into teaching.

As first Professor of Adult Education at Boston University, he developed the doctoral program on his "General Theory of the Doctorate in Education." This was a concept uniquely his own and not a copy of any existing program in the world. Knowles' role of General Consultant of Adult Education at Boston University almost completely failed to produce any avenues of operation or results. This was because the University had virtually no nuts and bolts commitment to using the consultant role to the fullest systemwide. In addition, Knowles' values steered him away from the consultant role toward the teaching role as Professor.

In addition to regular teaching activities and program development based on his theories of maturation and the doctorate he pioneered efforts in three undeveloped areas in professional adult education: (1) Sub-specialty of competency development for laboratory trainers coupled with a sequence of learning experiences in observation, co-training, training

and consultation interns, to accomplish that: (2) evaluation of learning experiences and relationship to grades within a traditional educational setting with emphasis on self and mutual self-evaluation as contrasted with only the professor evaluating, and increasing the emphasis on recycling the process for self-diagnosing of learning needs, designing to meet those needs leading to one's rediagnosing his own learning needs in contrast with just evaluating what had happened; and (3) further development of new speculative theories of his own with emphasis on new experimental methodologies for implementing the theories. These theories included the teaching-learning teams in andragogy, contrast between adult and child learners; varying research techniques needed for sequential phases of emerging fields of social practice; and the launching of an adult educational process by means of a book on Higher Adult Education in the United States.

There were a variety of spin-offs, ranging from minimum effect to broad effect, that resulted from his work in adult education.

A small section in a pamphlet by Dr. Leonard Nadler included an excerpt from Knowles suggesting the most appropriate techniques in accomplishing certain educational objectives.

With Donald Klein, it was Knowles' suggestion to write to six specific individuals that helped Klein successfully write a book on Community Dynamics and Mental Health.

Dr. Watson Dickerman suggested that Knowles work in doctoral theory form an integral part of adult education professional development for the future.

Dr. Theodore Austin used Knowles' Theory of the Doctorate as a

basis for developing a model and suggesting that the curriculum for training hospital administrators should be one based on competency centeredness.

Mr. Clarence Thompson used the Knowles' assumptions of andragogy as a focal point in writing what has become a widely referred to article on educational counseling of adults. The paper was first read to a conference of American college personnel counselors.

A system wide effect of Knowles' work was accomplished through the YMCA, U.S.A. and Canada, when he was Organization Development Project director for the first three years in which competency development of change agents with the system was the prime focus.

Another system-wide change effort largely influenced by Knowles was with the Girl Scout organization in which three years of development yielded a learning design with Girl Scout leadership competency development based on Knowles theory of andragogy.

The adaptability of andragogy to undergraduate learners was tested and with minor modifications found successful in one case where Dr. Eugene DuBois used it with undergraduate students.

Dr. John Ohliger at Ohio State University adapted the learning-teaching team concept and Knowles' theory of andragogy to use with a class in liberal adult education and found it worked.

Knowles helped the North Carolina State University, Department of Adult and Community College Education reorganize its graduate program. His philosophy was much in evidence and the program had many similarities to the Boston University program.

The Career Development at General Electric was developed by a

highly competent staff in collaboration with Knowles personal example, his book The Modern Practice of Adult Education and his explanation of an organic process design of adult learning.

Data Education, Inc., Waltham, Massachusetts, "The Andragogy Company" adopted Knowles' theory of andragogy as their educational philosophy orientation. The philosophy was based largely upon his book The Modern Practice of Adult Education. The organization was developing a mounting educational consulting practice and clientele organizations had grown in number to thirty-three by the time this report was written. The main product of this organization became the application of andragogy to an increasing variety of social systems.

The Trainer's Guide to Andragogy was developed specifically for training adult education andragogy "pros" in the local, state and national, Social Rehabilitation Service, Department of Health, Education and Welfare, Washington, D.C. It was the most complete (to that date) and comprehensive application of andragogy to the operations of a social system. It was based largely on Knowles' theory of andragogy as it appeared in his book, The Modern Practice of Adult Education.

The Intensive Coronary Care Multimedia Learning System was a multimedia-multisensory educational program. It was developed by ROCOM Division of Hoffman-LaRoche, Inc., in a consultation with Knowles. It was an andragogical in-service education program to develop nursing competencies in intensive coronary care. The entire philosophy, development and implementation of the program was based on Knowles' theory of andragogy as it initially was in his book The Modern Practice of Adult Education.

With the Adult Education Commission of the National Catholic Education and Institute for Continuing Education, Archdiocese of Detroit, Knowles influence came largely through two workshops he led for them and his book, The Modern Practice of Adult Education. This resource book was used and aided them to develop two pamphlets "Leadership Techniques" and "Handbook for Discussion Leaders" for use in their 1972 "Church, World, Kingdom" diocesan-wide program.

The University of Missouri Extension Association used Knowles' services and influence to launch themselves into a professional improvement process. They interacted with and challenged him on his comparison of the assumptions and processes of andragogy and pedagogy. They also developed plans to improve the operational practices as professional adult educators based on his andragogical process elements, fifteen objectives and 100 evaluative questions he suggests in his books The Modern Practice of Adult Education and Higher Adult Education in the United States.

There were some organizations suggested as ones he had influenced from which no information could be obtained.

Knowles' son, Eric, and his daughter, Barbara, both are involved in social science work. To what extent he influenced those results, if at all, remains a question of debate.

By May, 1972, eighteen dissertations had been completed at Boston University that tested or applied concepts of andragogy. There were also nineteen other dissertations in process (as of this writing) which were also testing or applying concepts of andragogy.

Despite all the problems connected with and negative response to the opinionaire asking 150 person's assessment of Knowles' contribution to



the adult education field, some clear trends were detected which support the notion of his being a pioneer. The six Aker behaviors, according to the way this researcher categorized respondents' answers, that were most mentioned concerning Knowles were as follows:

- Assumes the initiative in developing a strong national perception of the importance and essentiality of adult education--mentioned forty-eight (48) times.
- Identifies potential leaders and helps them develop their potentials and capacities--mentioned forty-two (42) times.
- Is creative and imaginative in developing new programs, and believes that innovation and experiment are necessary for the expansion of adult education--mentioned thirty-eight (38) times.
- Arranges learning experiences so that the learners can integrate theory and practice--mentioned thirty-six (36) times.
- Provides an atmosphere where adults are free to search through trial-and-error without fear of institutional or interpersonal threat--mentioned thirty-one (31) times.
- Selects and uses teaching methods, materials, and resources that are appropriate in terms of what is to be learned and in terms of the needs and abilities of the individual learners--mentioned twenty-nine (29) times.

Even if one did not categorize the items mentioned according to Aker's behaviors, there were six clear indications of assessing Knowles contributions by the respondents. They are as follows:

- His own congruence as a model between theory and practice--mentioned thirty-one (31) times.
- His theory of andragogy--mentioned twenty-two (22) times.
- His book The Adult Education Movement in the United States--mentioned twenty (20) times.
- His encouraging self-direction in learning--mentioned eighteen (18) times.
- His high regard for human potential--mentioned eighteen (18) times.

- His building an environment conducive to learning—mentioned seventeen (17) times.

Thus, all this thus far shows how pioneering has captured his efforts and that others have seen him in that light.

The second finding which builds upon Knowles' pioneering of prime importance in this study is that Eduard C. Lindeman's book The Meaning of Adult Education formed the central overall perspective, inspiration, influence and foundation for Knowles' contribution to the field of adult education. More specifically, it was the notion of organic centrality of man's development as well as the organic centrality of the development of a movement such as adult education which stemmed from Lindeman and the above mentioned book.

In that book Lindeman presented his social philosophical statement of what adult education in America could become. However, he felt that method was lacking to get the job done. Lindeman also thought that some bold experimentation would have to be undertaken to get that task done. It is at the point of method that Knowles moved primarily to make his mark.

Knowles had been affiliated with the youth section of the same poverty program Lindeman was in the adult section. Knowles found Lindeman an easy model to follow when opportunity to test adult education presented itself.

Knowles accepted Hewitt and Mather's discovery of the discussion method in utilizing the learner's potential, Johnson's idea that democracy could be furthered by adult education, Roger's feeling that men had a forward moving tendency, Havinghurst's idea of developmental tasks and Bradford's relating these concepts to adult education. All these ideas

built upon Lindeman who had been a pioneer leading the scientific inquiry leading to the group dynamics findings.

Building on Lindeman's notion that a person and the system are two inseparable parts of the same reality, Knowles worked primarily with three social systems—YMCA, AEA and Boston University rather than to work by himself and seek to build adult education by himself.

The organic idea of Lindeman's found its way into each one of the theories that Knowles developed, some more explicitly than others. It became more of a clear theme in each succeeding theory. It is most clearly pronounced in his theories of the Adult Education Movement in the U.S. and andragogy.

It was out of his own organic need for increasing his competence in the position Knowles found himself that he developed and experimented with new methods. He experimented with new methodologies of good program development in the Central Chicago YMCA which resulted in Informal Adult Education. He was in touch with many aspects of the adult education field through his job as Executive Director of the Adult Education Association of the U.S.A. resulting in the need for better understanding of the dimensions of the field in The Adult Education Movement in the U.S.

His organic dissatisfaction with learning theory resulted in his developing the maturation theory as a guide to learning which, with the theory of the doctorate and his desire for a laboratory to research and test adult learning theory formed the basis of the doctorate program at Boston University.

The learning-teaching team was the initial basic unit Knowles used to develop and implement his theory of andragogy in professional

adult education. However, his book The Modern Practice of Adult Education was published in 1970. By later 1972 there were four organizations that had developed distinct and unique educational programs based on that book and its organic theory of andragogy. In addition, there was an educational consulting organization that adopted andragogy as its basic philosophy. Its consulting program had reached into more than thirty organizations by late 1972. He also had encouraged and allowed research to be done on the theory in the form of thirty-seven dissertations. This theory was indeed beginning to give coherence and technological direction to adult education in the United States.

The consulting relationship he developed with such social systems as the YMCA and the Girl Scouts of America, Data Education, Incorporated, RCCOM Division of Hoffman-LaRoche, Inc., Social Rehabilitation Service, Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, and Adult Commission of National Catholic Association and Archdiocese of Detroit, was not to put on programs for them but to increase their organic capability to manage their own educational processes. His assumptions were that the system could improve itself and he used experimental methods that would accomplish the task, not keep them dependent on him.

The third finding of prime importance in this study, which builds on the first two of pioneering and methodologically implementing the organic vision of what adult education could become, is Knowles' social science research base in his adult education activities stemming from Alvin Johnson.

During his high school days in Florida, Knowles gained the conception of himself as an intellectually capable person. When Knowles read

Johnson's The Clock of History he realized that adult education was a new field of social practice that could do much to help keep democracy and individualism alive. Knowles also realized from reading Johnson that adult education needed a lot of competent development and that it would be done by competent professional adult educators.

Knowles saw himself as capable of helping to develop the field and was stimulated by Johnson to choose to prepare himself and enter the field.

Knowles developed Informal Adult Education as a combination of research already done and his testing of what he found to be workable practice. Knowles developed his theory of the Adult Education Movement in the United States based on his competent research done for his Doctor of Philosophy degree in adult education at the University of Chicago. This theory is still accepted as of the writing of this research report.

Knowles' going to Boston gave him the opportunity to improve his research competencies, test out a new theory of adult learning (andragogy) and develop the methodologies (teaching-learning teams) (mutual self-evaluation) (sub-specialty of human relations training) to implement that research into practice.

Much of what Knowles has put into adult education practice is based on social science research already completed on the potential needs and capabilities of adults and in fact human beings.

Knowles knew the adult education movement because he researched its emergence. He believed in the great capacity of people to grow and because of this he saw them grow. He practiced self-direction in learning because it worked for him and consequently he figured it would work

for others. He developed a special technology of andragogy out of combination of others research, his hunches, and his experiments. He modeled congruence between theory and practice in adult education because he valued his and others involvement and participation. He, consequently, built out of research findings and his willingness to risk, an environment conducive to learning and turned others on to learning in a new way. He always remained optimistic about the potential of man to grow and adult education as a means to aid that growth.

### Conclusions

One could conclude, then, that Malcolm S. Knowles' contributions to the theory and practice of adult education to date were an impressive record of achievement of his educational goals as an adult educational administrator, and an effective adult educator, teacher-developer in reaching those goals.

The above may be said of many adult educators, but the writer found that Knowles meant something more to adult education than these rather obvious accomplishments.

He was a field builder for adult education. First, he was this by self-declaration--he saw himself as a field builder. By no means was he the only one but neither was he one like all the rest.

He was and is a field builder in adult education who combined three unique elements into one: (1) He was a pioneer and innovator by style of life and the new elements he chose to develop in adult education; (2) He developed a method to implement the Lindeman notion of the organic development of the field and its social practice; and (3) He utilized others' and developed his own social research findings for the advancement

of adult education as a viable field of social practice geared to the growth of human beings.

Knowles helped to differentiate adult education as distinct from child education and was able to model in his behavior a congruence indicating that theory can be practiced, theory can be consistent with practice, and theory must be practiced if adult education is to grow the way it is capable of and is needed by humans.

These, then, are the contributions of Malcolm S. Knowles to the field of adult education to date.

#### Values of this kind of research

The values of this kind of research are numerous. Some discovered by this researcher may or may not be entirely new.

1. It is possible to gain a sense of the texture of events as they are happening.
2. One acquires a view of the processes of a system and not just the output or results as is true with the study of history long after the fact.
3. The adult education practice of this researcher has been deeply influenced and positively shaped by the process and findings of this research.
4. It can provide an overview of the personal elements and attributes of those persons and events which are an important part of the educational process and events.
5. It is a movement on the frontier of qualitative research which could aid the growth of the adult educational field.
6. It places one in touch with the flavor and richness of the

context, the setting, the background and thinking of the person(s), making an effort to contribute to the growth of an emerging field of social practice.

#### Recommendations for further research

This research has opened new horizons of view regarding the emerging field of adult education. It also has raised some questions that are left unanswered. Following are some suggestions for further research.

1. This kind of study is recommended to be done regarding the contributions of other leaders of the adult education field. It should be done while they are still on the adult education scene. A few suggested names would include: Howard McClusky, Cyril Houle, Paul Bergevin, J. Roby Kidd, and Paul Sheats. Some of the richness of their contributions will be left uncaptured if a study is done only after they have personally passed from the adult education scene.

2. Since many of the findings of this research are only preliminary, a sequel to this research is recommended. It could be conducted thirty to fifty years after Knowles had personally passed from the adult education scene. The researcher could use this research and determine where its preliminary findings had been sustained or not sustained over time. It could then be seen if Knowles' theory of andragogy in the United States had been sustained as the theory giving coherence and technological direction to adult education practice. The predictive quality of this kind of preliminary research could gain some ground. If most or all of the findings of this research could be sustained over time, it may suggest that this kind of research is not as speculative as it would at first seem. If almost none of the findings of this research were



sustained over time, it may suggest that this kind of research possibly should be abandoned.

3. This study has been limited to studying Knowles' influence on the field of adult education. It is recommended that a study be made to determine if he has made any impact on the field of education in general.

## APPENDICES

## APPENDIX A

### APPLIED BEHAVIORAL SCIENCE

#### INTERVIEW SCHEDULE

Background information: This interview schedule represents a tentative step in the development of a multipurpose questionnaire assessing the role of various integral contributors to the theory and practice of planned change and the strategies of change and changing. The target population of the schedule are those persons who have made, added to, or clarified the science and practice of planned change. The data gathered from the interviews will be used to gain a better understanding of the development, present status, and the future directions of the field of change and changing.

This work is being undertaken by the members of a graduate seminar conducted by professors Robert Chin and Kenneth Benne of the Boston University Human Relations Center. It is part of a continuing interest in the foundations and development of the applied behavioral sciences. As an aid to "cognitive set" for the interviewee, may we suggest that we are interested both in how you describe the area (or a theory of change) and in how you view the role of the change agent in the process of change (or a theory of intervention or changing).

#### Overview of the Schedule:

1. YOU: your background, your development as an applied behavioral scientist (if you see yourself as one—you may wish to select the labels), the influences upon your thinking and practice, your assumptions, conceptual schemata, models, strategies, your relations to your parent discipline.
2. YOUR PERCEPTIONS REGARDING THE FIELD OF THE APPLIED BEHAVIORAL SCIENCES: ABS as a founding, changing, developing field; major contributors to the field as a discipline; trends, past and present; critical incidents.
3. FUTURE DIRECTIONS OF THE APPLIED BEHAVIORAL SCIENCES:

#### I. Background of Interviewee

1. Please tell us about your background—your academic preparation, where, and in what positions you have worked—both as related to formal and informal development.
2. Could you trace the development of your ideas regarding planned change and changing? That is, the development of your ideas regarding applied behavioral science.

--Probe: Significant people who have influenced you.

--Probe: Shifts you have made--i.e., changing from one theory to another or such.

--Probe: At what point certain issues or problems came to your awareness.

3. What are some of the "tools of the trade" that you require as a practitioner?

--Probe: How would you describe your conceptual schema--including theoretical position and assumptions.

--Probe: Do any particular models seem to you to be more appropriate for applied behavioral science?

--Probe: How would you describe your "strategy" as a practitioner?

4. Can you tell us something about your theory of intervention--what do you see as the role of the change agent in a change program?
5. In the applied behavioral science field, with whom do you see yourself as most allied, and whom do you see yourself opposed or against? How do you characterize the differences between these two groups?
6. How do you relate your activities and beliefs as an applied behavioral scientist to your parent social science discipline?
7. We are interested in the place of values in the applied behavioral sciences. What are your views on this?

--What value systems do you think influence your activities as a theoretician and practitioner?

## II. Interviewee's perceptions of the field of Applied Behavioral Science.

1. What do you see as the major significant contributions to the field of the applied behavioral sciences?

--Who, in your view, are the more significant persons?

--What particular social science disciplines or social science theoretical systems have been particularly helpful or impactful to the ABC?

--What has been the contribution of your parent discipline?

--What technologies or methodologies have been particularly significant?

2. What do you see as the major developmental trends of the field of Applied Behavioral Science?

--What are the more important historical trends—methods, theories, models?

--What are the more important current trends--methods theories, models?

3. What methodologies and technologies in the area of planned change have fallen into disuse or disfavor that you think should be given another chance or revitalized?

### III. Interviewee's perceptions of the future directions of the field.

1. What do you see as the future trends and directions for applied behavioral science?

--Technologies??

--Models??

2. What do you see as the future role and contributions of your social science discipline to the planned change field?

## APPENDIX E

244 Hadsell Dr.  
Bloomfield Hills, Mich. 48013

February 18, 1970

I am writing a dissertation for the Doctor of Education degree at Boston University, School of Education. My dissertation subject is: Malcolm S. Knowles: His contributions to the Theory and Practice of Adult Education.

Malcolm has suggested you as one who may be willing to supply data for this research. Will you help me by answering (as briefly and clearly as possible) the questions on the following sheets? Please return them to me in the enclosed envelope as soon as possible, but not later than March 20, 1970. Your accurate and prompt response will be very valuable toward making this research reliable. Thank you for your cooperation.

Sincerely,

John A. Henschke

Name \_\_\_\_\_ Return to: John A. Henschke  
244 Hadsell Dr.  
Bloomfield Hills, Mich.  
48013

Background Information: The central question of my inquiry is:

What are the contributions in theory and practice Malcolm S. Knowles has made to the emerging field of Adult Education?

The following questions are designed to gain your viewpoint concerning the above central question. Please answer the questions as briefly and clearly as possible.

- I. To provide some sense of continuity and relationship between your foundation of education and Malcolm S. Knowles foundation of education the next four questions are asked.
  1. Will you describe your background, and development as an educator (or adult educator), the influences upon your thinking and practice, your assumptions about learners and learning process, conceptual schemata, models, strategies, your relation to your parent discipline?
  2. Describe your first contact, experience(s) with Malcolm S. Knowles as an adult educator. When? Where? In what regard?

3. How do you see Malcolm S. Knowles and you as being alike in educational philosophy and practice?

4. How do you see the difference between your and Malcolm S. Knowles' educational philosophy and practice?

- II. This section focuses on your view of Malcolm S. Knowles influence on you as an individual and the field of Adult Education in general.

Definition of Terms: Influence - A persistent, shaping effect upon the thought and behavior of human beings, singly or collectively.  
Influence process - A relationship between persons or groups where one or the other party (or both) utilize some form of interpersonal (or intersystem) operation to induce the other to do, or feel or think that which the influencer believes is desirable.

2. Has Malcolm S. Knowles influenced your educational beliefs and/or practice?

Yes. \_\_\_\_\_ No. \_\_\_\_\_



2. If you answered "yes", describe and specify the most vivid experience(s) of the process by which Malcolm S. Knowles influenced you.

3. What do you see as Malcolm S. Knowles most significant contribution(s) to the theory and practice of Adult Education?

- III. This section focuses upon Malcolm S. Knowles influence upon an organization in which you have been associated.

Definition of term: Change Agent - A person or persons professionally qualified or otherwise organized to assist a person or system in the deliberate improvement for more satisfactory operation or adjustment.

1. Has Malcolm S. Knowles worked as a change agent (professor, consultant, trainer, administrator, project director) in an organization system(s) in which you have been or are involved?

Yes \_\_\_\_\_ No \_\_\_\_\_

2. If answer was "yes" please give name of organization and division.

NAME \_\_\_\_\_

DIVISION \_\_\_\_\_

3. Have there been changes in that organization that you could attribute to Malcolm S. Knowles influence?

Yes \_\_\_\_\_ No \_\_\_\_\_

4. If answer was "yes", please describe.

5. What influence process(es) has Malcolm S. Knowles used to effect change in the organization with which you are or have been associated?

If there is something which you would like to share concerning Malcolm S. Knowles, which has not been covered by this questionnaire, please write on the back.

III. This section focuses upon Malcolm S. Knowles influence on current and former students in the process of a degree program.

1. Have you finished a degree program with Malcolm S. Knowles?

Yes \_\_\_\_\_ No \_\_\_\_\_

2. What behaviors in Malcolm S. Knowles most aided in the process of your degree program?

3. What behaviors in Malcolm S. Knowles most hindered in the process of your degree program?

If there is something which you would like to share concerning Malcolm S. Knowles, which has not been covered by this questionnaire, please write on the back.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

### Books and Pamphlets

- Aker, George F., Kidd, J. R., and Smith, Robert M., eds. Handbook of Adult Education. Washington, D. C.: The Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1970.
- Batchelder, Richard L., and Hardy, James M. Using Sensitivity Training and the Laboratory Method. New York: Association Press, 1968.
- Bennis, Warren G. "Theory and Method in Applying Behavioral Science to Planned Organizational Change," The Planning of Change. Edited by Warren G. Bennis; Kenneth D. Benne; Robert Chin. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1969.
- Boone, Edgar J. Graduate Study in Adult and Community College Education. Raleigh, N. C.: North Carolina State University, 1971.
- Bradford, Leland P. "Developing Potentialities Through Class Groups," Human Forces in Teaching and Learning. Edited by Leland P. Bradford. Washington, D.C.: National Training Laboratories, 1961.
- Bradford, Leland P. "The Teaching-Learning Transaction," Human Forces in Teaching and Learning. Edited by Leland P. Bradford. Washington, D.C.: National Training Laboratories, 1961.
- Cieskie, Sophie V., ed. In Adult Education We Believe: A Handbook of Quotations from National Leaders. Lansing: Michigan Education Association, 1958.
- Copleston, Frederick, S. J. A History of Philosophy. Vol. 8: Modern Philosophy: Bentham to Russell. Part 1: British Empiricism and the Idealist Movement in Great Britain. Image Books. Garden City, New York: Doubleday and Co., Inc., 1966.
- Daniel, Walter G., and Holden, John B. Ambrose Caliver: Adult Educator and Civil Servant. Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1966.
- Dickerman, Watson. "Implications of this Book for Programs of Graduate Study in Adult Education." Adult Education: Outlines of an Emerging Field of University Study. Edited by Gale Jensen; A. A. Liveright; Wilbur Hallenbeck. Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1967.

- Dovring, Folke. History as a Social Science. The Hague, Netherlands: Martinus Nijhoff, 1960.
- "The Editor." The Handbook of Adult Education. Edited by Malcolm S. Knowles. Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1960. (Flyleaf, inside back cover.)
- Garrett, Annette. Interviewing: Its Principles and Methods. New York: Family Service Association of America, 1942.
- Gessner, Robert, ed. The Democratic Man. Selected Writings of Eduard C. Lindeman. Boston: Beacon Press, 1956.
- Gibb, Jack R. "Dynamics of Leadership," Organizations and Human Behavior: Focus on Schools. Edited by Fred D. Carver and Thomas J. Sergiovanni. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1969.
- Glaser, B. G., and Strauss, A. L. The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company, 1967.
- Glidewell, John C. "The Entry Problem in Consultation," The Planning of Change. Edited by Warren G. Bennis; Kenneth D. Benne; Robert Chin. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1961.
- Good, Carter V. and Douglas E. Scates. Methods of Research. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, Inc., 1954.
- Gottschalk, Louis. Understanding History. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1950, 1969.
- Havinghurst, Robert J. Developmental Tasks and Education. New York: David McKay Company, Inc., 1952.
- Hewitt, Dorothy, and Mather, Kirtley F. Adult Education: A Dynamic for Democracy. New York: D. Appleton-Century Co., Inc., 1937.
- Houle, Cyril O. "The Educators of Adults," Handbook of Adult Education. Edited by Robert M. Smith; George F. Aker; J. R. Kida. New York: The MacMillan Company, 1970.
- Institute for Continuing Education—Archdiocese of Detroit. Discussion Leader's Handbook. Detroit: Archdiocese of Detroit, Institute for Continuing Education, 1972.
- Institute for Continuing Education—Archdiocese of Detroit. Leadership Techniques. Detroit: Archdiocese of Detroit, Institute for Continuing Education, 1972.
- Jensen, Gale; Live-right, A. A.; Hallenbeck, Wilbur, eds. Adult Education: Outlines of an Emerging Field of University Study. Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1964.

- Johnson, Alvin. The Clock of History. New York: W. W. Norton and Co., Inc., 1946.
- Katz, Elihu, and Lazarsfeld, Paul F. Personal Influence. Free Press Paperback. New York: The MacMillan Company, 1955.
- Kent, Sherman. Writing History. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, Inc., 1941.
- Kerlinger, Fred N. Foundations of Behavioral Research. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc., 1964.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Adult Education," Encyclopedia Americana. Vol. I., 1965.
- Knowles, Malcolm S., and Johnson, Eugene I. "Adult Education," Encyclopedia Americana. Vol. I., 1969.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. The Adult Education Movement in the United States. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc., 1962.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Adult Education," The New Media and Education. Edited by Peter H. Rossi; Bruce J. Biddle. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company, 1966.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "The Effects of Community Influences on Adult Life," The Future Course of Christian Adult Education. Edited by Lawrence C. Little. Pittsburgh, Pa.: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1959.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "The Field of Operations in Adult Education," Adult Education: Outlines of an Emerging Field of University Study. Edited by Cale Jensen; A. A. Liveright; Wilbur Hallenbeck. Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1964.
- Knowles, Malcolm S., ed. Handbook of Adult Education. Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1960.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. Higher Adult Education in the United States--The Current Picture, Trends and Issues. Washington, D.C.: American Council on Education, 1969.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Historical Development of the Adult Education Movement in the United States," Handbook of Adult Education. Edited by Malcolm S. Knowles. Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1960.
- Knowles, Malcolm S., and Knowles, Hulda. How to Develop Better Leaders. New York: Association Press, 1955.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. Informal Adult Education. New York: Association Press, 1950.

- Knowles, Malcolm S., and Knowles, Hulda F. Introduction to Group Dynamics. New York: Association Press, 1959.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. The Leader Looks at the Learning Climate, Looking Into Leadership Monographs, No. 13. Edited by Warren H. Schmidt. Washington, D.C.: Leadership Resources, Inc., 1965.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. The Leader Looks at Self-Development, Looking Into Leadership Monographs, No. 4, Second Edition. Edited by Warren H. Schmidt. Washington, D.C.: Leadership Resources, Inc., 1961.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Maturation as a Guide to Learning: A Multi-Dimensional Approach to Liberal Education."\* Leadership in Voluntary Enterprise. Edited by Charles W. Merrifield. New York: Oceana Publications, Inc., 1961.  
(\*Note: A paper given before the Council of National Organizations, Trainers' Consultation, November 23, 1959, New York City. Reprinted with permission of author).
- Knowles, Malcolm S. The Modern Practice of Adult Education. New York: Association Press, 1970.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "New Approaches to Adult Education," The Future Course of Christian Adult Education. Edited by Lawrence C. Little. Pittsburgh, Pa.: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1959.
- Knowles, Malcolm S.; DuBois, Eugene B. "Prologue: The Handbooks in Perspective," Handbook of Adult Education. Edited by Robert M. Smith; George F. Aker; J. R. Kidd. Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association in the U.S.A., 1970.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Psychology, Religion and Life," The St. Louis Unitarian--A Church Bulletin. Vol. VI, No. 20. St. Louis: The First Unitarian Church, 1952.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Strategy for the Future," Growing Time. Edited by Roger DeCrow. Brookline, Mass.: Center for the Study of Liberal Education for Adults at Boston University, 1964.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "A Theory of Christian Adult Education Methodology," Wider Horizons in Christian Adult Education. Edited by Lawrence C. Little. Pittsburgh, Pa.: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1961.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. The Use of the Multimedia/Multisensory Approach for Inservice Education. RCOON, Division of Hoffman-LaRoche, Inc., Nutley, N. J., no date.
- Knowles, Malcolm S.; Isaacs, Asher; Kuhlen, Raymond G.; Martin, Albert B.; Morgan, Joy Elmer. "What Should Be the Objectives of Adult Education?: A Panel Discussion," The Future Course of Christian Adult Education. Edited by Lawrence C. Little. Pittsburgh, Pa.: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1959.



- Lafleur, L., Ed. An Introduction to the Principles of Morals and Legislation. New York, 1948. (The 1876 Oxford edition is a reprint of the 1823 edition).
- Lindeman, Eduard C. The Meaning of Adult Education. Montreal: Harvest House, 1961.
- Lindeman, Eduard C. Social Discovery: An Approach to the Study of Functional Groups. New York: Republic Publishing Co., 1925.
- Lippitt, Gordon and Tish, Leslie. Is Training a Profession? Washington, D.C.: Leadership Resources, Inc., 1960.
- Little, Lawrence C., ed. The Future Course of Christian Adult Education. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1959.
- Little, Lawrence C., ed. Wider Horizons in Christian Adult Education. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1962.
- Merrifield, Charles W., ed. Leadership in Voluntary Enterprise. New York: Oceana Publications, Inc., 1961.
- Merton, Robert K. Social Theory and Social Structure. Glencoe, New York: Free Press, 1957 (revised edition).
- Mouly, George J. The Science of Educational Research. New York: American Book Company, 1963.
- Nadler, Leonard. A Process of Training. Washington, D.C.: Leadership Resources, Inc., 1963.
- Nash, Paul. Authority and Freedom in Education. New York: John Wiley and Sons, Inc., 1960.
- Ohliger, John, and McCarthy, Colleen. Lifelong Learning or Lifelong Schooling? A Tentative View of the Ideas of Ivan Illich With Quotational Bibliography. Syracuse, N. Y.: Publications in Continuing Education and ERIC Clearinghouse on Adult Education, 1971.
- Powell, John Walker. Learning Comes of Age. New York: Association Press, 1956.
- Proposed Bill, A....The Adult Education Opportunity Act of 1971, by the Legislative Policies Committee. Anita L. Martin, Chairman. Washington, D.C.: The Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1971.
- Randall, John Herman, Jr. The Making of the Modern Mind. New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1940.

- Redfield, Robert. "The Folk Society," Cultural Anthropology. Vol. II of Readings in Anthropology. Edited by Morton H. Fried. 2 vols. New York: Thomas Y. Crowell Company, 1968.
- Rogers, Carl. "Toward Becoming a Fully Functioning Person." Behavioral Science and the Manager's Role. Edited by William B. Eddy; M. Warner Burke; Vladimir A. Dupre; and Oron South. Washington, D.C.: NTL Institute for Applied Behavioral Science, 1969.
- Rogers, Everett M. Diffusion of Innovations. New York: The Free Press of Glencoe, 1962.
- Rossi, Peter H., and Biddle, Bruce J., eds. The New Media and Education: Their Impact on Society. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company, 1966.
- Rummel, J. Francis. An Introduction to Research Procedures. New York: Harper and Brothers, Publishers, 1958.
- Schein, Edgar H. Organizational Psychology. Foundations of Modern Psychology Series, Vol. XIV. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1965.
- Selltiz, Claire; Jahoda, Marie; Deutsch, Morton; Cook, Stuart W. Research Methods in Social Science. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1959.
- Thelen, Herbert A. Dynamics of Groups at Work. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1954.
- U. S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare. Social and Rehabilitation Service. A Trainer's Guide to Andragogy: Its Concepts, Experience and Application, by John D. Ingalls and Joseph M. Arceri, (SRS) 72-05301. Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1972.
- Van Dahlen, Deobold B. Understanding Educational Research. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., Inc., 1962.
- Verner, Coolie. A Conceptual Scheme For the Identification and Classification of Processes for Adult Education. Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1962.
- Vincent, John Martin. Historical Research. New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1911.
- White, Morton. Foundations of Historical Knowledge. New York: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1965.
- Whitney, Frederick Lamson. The Elements of Research. Englewood Cliffs, N. J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1950.

## Articles and Periodicals

- All-University Committee on Adult Education. Report of the Committee. "Boston University's Adult Education Program," Adult Education, Vol. X, No. 1 (Autumn, 1959), pp. 42-50.
- Beck, Kenneth H. "A Historical Analysis of an Adult Education Institution." Adult Education, Vol. XIX, No. 2 (Winter, 1969), pp. 106-126.
- Bennis, Warren G. "The Case Study: I. Introduction." Journal of Applied Behavioral Science, Vol. IV, No. 2 (April/May/June, 1968), pp. 227-231.
- Boston University, School of Education. Bulletin of Graduate Programs, 1966-1968. Boston: Boston University Bulletin, May 31, 1966.
- Cotton, Webster, E. "The Challenge Confronting American Adult Education." Adult Education, Vol. XIV, No. 2 (Winter, 1964), pp. 80-87.
- Crabtree, Arthur P. (Jack). "Quo Vadis, ABA?" Adult Leadership, September, 1971, pp. 82-84, 114-124.
- DuBois, Eugene E. "An Experiment With the Teaching-Learning Team: Group Self-Directed Learning in Undergraduate Education." Adult Leadership, May, 1971, pp. 14-16, 38.
- Evanston Review: A Newspaper (Evanston, Ill.), Dec. 1, 1966.
- Farmer, James A., Jr. "Professionalization in Higher Adult Education Administration." Adult Education, Vol. XII, No. 1 (Fall, 1970), pp. 29-39.
- Fay, Francis. Review of Higher Adult Education in the United States, by Malcolm S. Knowles. Adult Leadership, January 1971, p. 237.
- Goerke, Glenn A. Review of Community Dynamics and Mental Health, by Donald C. Klein. Adult Leadership, November, 1970, pp. 167-168.
- Harnett, Father Robert. "Atheistic Humanism." America, September 10, 1955, p. 552.
- Henderson, L. J., "The Case Study: III. Introductory Lectures: Sociology/ 23," Journal of Applied Behavioral Science, Vol. IV, No. 2 (April/May/June, 1968), pp. 230-239.
- Herbart, Johann Friedrich, "Sämtliche Werke," edited by C. Hartenstien, vol. IX, Hamburg, 1890, pp. 437-438.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Adults Are Learning." Crossroads, October, 1950, p. 10.

- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Adult Education in the United States." Adult Education, Vol. V, No. 2 (Winter, 1955), pp. 67-76.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Adult Education—No Longer A Stepchild." The Nation's Schools, January, 1953, pp. 67-68.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Androgogy\*, Not Pedagogy!" Adult Leadership, April, 1968, pp. 350-352, 386. (\*Note: The spelling "Androgogy" has been changed to "Andragogy" on advice of the editors of Merriam Webster dictionaries).
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Antidotes for Dullness." The Bethany Guide, November, 1951, pp. 32-34.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Basic Bibliography of the Graduate Program in Adult Education at Boston University." Boston University Journal of Education, Vol. 147, No. 3 (February, 1965), pp. 62-61.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Charting the Course of Adult Education in America's Future." Adult Leadership, October, 1957, pp. 99-102, 116.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Communications Unlimited." Adult Leadership, June, 1954, p. 10.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "A Comparison of Assumptions and Processes of Pedagogy and Andragogy." A Trainer's Handbook to Andragogy: Its Concepts, Experience and Application. by John D. Ingalls and Joseph M. Arceri. Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1972, p. 246.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Deeds and Words in Adult Education—the U.S. Scene." Adult Education, Vol. VI, No. 3 (Spring, 1956), pp. 179-180.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Direction-Finding Processes in the AEA." Adult Education, Vol. VIII, No. 1 (Autumn, 1957), pp. 37-54.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "A Farewell Message." Adult Leadership, December, 1958, p. 158.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Gearing Adult Education for the Seventies." The Journal of Continuing Education in Nursing, Vol. 1, No. 3 (May-June, 1970).
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "A General Theory of the Doctorate in Education." Adult Education, Vol. XII, No. 3 (Spring, 1962), pp. 136-141.
- Knowles, Malcolm S., and Bradford, Leland P. "Group Methods in Adult Education." Journal of Social Issues, Vol. VIII, No. 2 (1952), pp. 11-22.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Having Any Fun?" Holiday, September, 1946, pp. 14-17.

- Knowles, Malcolm S. "How Andragogy Works in Leadership Training in the Girl Scouts." Adult Leadership, October, 1968, pp. 161-162, 190-194.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "How the Adult Education Association Works." Adult Leadership, April, 1954, pp. 4-5.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Informal Adult Education: What the Author Dreamed About While Preparing the Manuscript." YMCA General Program Digest, Autumn, 1950, pp. 7, 12.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Introducing AEA's New Director." Adult Leadership, December, 1958, p. 159.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Keep Your Discussion On Track." Adult Teacher, August, 1956, pp. 3-4.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Learning by TV." Adult Leadership, October, 1956, pp. 114-115.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Move Over, Mr. Robert." Adult Leadership, June, 1952, pp. 2-4.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Mr. Douglas Goes to Washington: An Interview." Adult Leadership, January, 1953, pp. 12-14.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "The New Graduate Program in Adult Education." Boston University Graduate Journal, Vol. IX, No. 3 (February, 1961), pp. 67-72.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "An Overview and History of the Field." Adult Education, Vol. VII, No. 4 (Summer, 1957), pp. 219-230.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Participation—A Golden Key to Learning." Westminster Adult Leader, January, 1958, pp. 4-5.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "A Preview of the New Handbook of Adult Education in the United States." Adult Leadership, May, 1959, p. 11.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Professional Education for Adult Educators." Journal of Continuing Education and Training, Vol. 1, No. 1 (May, 1971), pp. 5-13.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Professional Education for Leaders of Continuing Education." Boston University Journal of Education, Vol. 147, No. 3 (February, 1965), pp. 16-20.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Program Planning for Adults as Learners." Adult Leadership, February, 1967, pp. 267-268, 278-279.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Reader Comment." YMCA General Program Digest, Autumn, 1950, p. 2.

- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Recreation and Adult Education." Recreation, February, 1955, pp. 52-53.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Research in Adult Education: New Perspectives and Directions—The Relevance of Research for the Adult Education Teacher/Trainer." Adult Leadership, February, 1972, pp. 270-272, 302.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Research in Group Dynamics Used In Founding New Adult Education Association." The Nation's Schools, July, 1951, pp. 60, 62.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "The Role of Adult Education in the Public Schools." Boston University Journal of Education, Vol. 144, No. 4 (April, 1962), pp. 3-36.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Role Playing At Home." Adult Leadership, November, 1953, pp. 29-30.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Use Effective Methods With Adults." Presbyterian Action, August, 1959, pp. 8-9.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Ways of Learning: Reactive Versus Proactive," Journal of Continuing Education and Training, Vol. I, No. 4 (May, 1972), pp. 285-287.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "What, Another Magazine?" Adult Leadership, May, 1952, pp. 1-2.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "What Does Social Science Offer to Association Management?" American Trade Association Executives Journal, Vol. 6, No. 2 (April, 1954), pp. 51-53.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "What Do We Know About the Field of Adult Education?" Adult Education, Vol. XIV, No. 2 (Winter, 1964), pp. 67-79.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "What Should You Know About Adult Education?" The School Executive, August, 1958, pp. 19-21.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Your Program Planning Tool Kit." Adult Leadership, May, 1952, pp. 13-20.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "You Weren't Listening, Mr. Whitney." Adult Leadership, April, 1958, p. 266.
- Lindeman, Edward C. "Self Evaluation by Adult Students." Adult Leadership, April, 1953, pp. 300-301.
- Lombard, George F. F. "The Case Study: V. From Clinical Research and Research Reports in Human Relations," Journal of Applied Behavioral Science, Vol. IV, No. 2 (April/May/June, 1968), pp. 244-248.

- Margolis, Jan. Review of The Modern Practice of Adult Education: Andragogy versus Pedagogy, by Malcolm S. Knowles, Journal of Training and Development, November, 1970, p. 47.
- Marshall, Stuart A. "Leadership and Sensitivity Training." Boston University: Journal of Education, Vol. 153, No. 1 (October, 1970), pp. 7-37.
- Ready, R. K. "The Case Study: II. Letter to the Editor." Journal of Applied Behavioral Science, Vol. IV, No. 2 (April/May/June, 1968), pp. 232-235.
- Ready, R. K. "The Case Study: IV. A Short Primer for Case Writers in 1965," Journal of Applied Behavioral Science, Vol. IV, No. 2 (April/May/June, 1968), pp. 240-243.
- Schlesinger, Arthur, Jr. "The Historian As Participant." Daedalus, Vol. 100, No. 3 (Spring, 1971), pp. 339-358.
- Schroeder, Wayne L. Review of Higher Adult Education in the United States, by Malcolm S. Knowles. Adult Education Journal, 1970, pp. 242-243.
- Trent, Curtis. Review of Higher Adult Education in the United States: The Current Picture, Trends and Issues, by Malcolm S. Knowles. Journal of Extension, Summer, 1970, pp. 53-55.
- Walton, Richard E. "Advantages and Attributes of the Case Study." Journal of Applied Behavioral Science, VIII (January/February, 1972), pp. 75-78.

#### Reports and Proceedings

- Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., "Report of the Meeting of the Chicago Staff, January 7-8, 1956," Chicago, 1956. (Mimeographed.)
- Bradford, Leland P. "Toward a Philosophy of Adult Education." Seeking Common Ground in Adult Education. Edited by Robertson Sillars. Chicago: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1958.
- Executive Committee of the Adult Education Association of the U.S.A. "Committee Annual Report, 1955." Adult Leadership. Chicago, Illinois: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., November, 1955, pp. 16a-16h.
- Jensen, Gale, Chairman; Verner, Coolie; Liveright, A. A. The Reports Committee of The Commission of The Professors of Adult Education of the Adult Education Association of the U.S.A. Adult Education: A New Imperative for Our Times. Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1961.

- Knowles, Malcolm S. "AEA's Annual Report for 1957." The Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., Chicago, Illinois, November, 1956 to November, 1957. Adult Leadership. Chicago, Illinois: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., May, 1958, pp. 25-28.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. Adult Education On the March---Year Two, AEA, A Report and An Invitation, Chicago, Illinois, June 1, 1952 to May, 31, 1953. Chicago, Illinois: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1953.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Annual Report, 1956," The Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., Chicago, Illinois, November, 1955 to November, 1956. Adult Leadership. Chicago, Illinois: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., May, 1957, pp. 15-17.
- Knowles, Malcolm S.; and Hunsaker, Herbert C. "Architecture For Adult Education: A Preliminary Report." Adult Leadership, February, 1959, pp. 241-242.
- Knowles, Malcolm S.; and Tarcher, Martin. "Delegate Assembly Actions and Follow-Up." Adult Leadership, January, 1957, pp. 204, 227.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Latest Draft of Long-run Plan." Memorandum presented to the Executive Committee of the AEA Staff, Chicago, Illinois, December 2, 1953.
- Knowles, Malcolm S.; DuBois, Eugene E.; and Pilecki, Francis J. "Master Bibliography, The Adult and Higher Education Collection," Boston, 1969-1970. (Mimeographed.)
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Memorandum and Workbook for August 3-4, 1957 Meeting of Consultative Group on Direction-Finding." Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., Chicago, July 23, 1957. (Mimeographed.)
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "On the 1955 AEA Delegate Assembly," A Report to Members, Chicago, Illinois, November, 1955. Adult Leadership. Chicago, Illinois: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., February, 1956, pp. 6-8.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Problems of Adult Education: A Course Announcement and Outline." Boston, Fall Semester, 1968. (Mimeographed.)
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "A Proposed Plan For Development For the Five Years 1957-1962." Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., Chicago, 1956. (Mimeographed.)
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Proposed Plan for Development of Human Relations Trainers: A Memorandum," Boston, April, 1969. (Mimeographed.)
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Sequence of Learning Experiences in Human Relations Training." Boston, Fall, 1969. (Mimeographed.)



Knowles, Malcolm S. "Tensions and Gaps from Philosophical Differences." Seeking Common Ground in Adult Education. Edited by Robertson Sillars. Chicago: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1958.

Knowles, Malcolm S. "What Adult Educators Say About the Present Environment." Creating a Climate for Adult Learning. Edited by Herbert C. Hunsaker; Richard Pierce. Washington, D.C.: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1959.

Knowles, Malcolm S. "Where Has the AEA Been and Where Should It Go?" A Four-year Assessment of the Adult Education Association of the U.S.A. Appendix E: Administrator's Report, Chicago, Illinois, November 1, 1955.

Knowles, Malcolm S. Year One, AEA, First Annual Report of the Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., Chicago, Illinois, June 1, 1951 to May 31, 1952. Chicago, Illinois: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1952.

Liveright, A. A. A Study of Adult Education in the United States. Brookline, Mass.: Center for the Liberal Education of Adults at Boston University, 1968.

Report of Commission 13 on Student Personnel Work for Adults in Higher Education. Clarence H. Thompson, chairman. Bethesda, Md.: ERIC Document Reproduction Service, 1967.

Sheats, Paul H. "Annual Report 1954," The Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., Chicago, Illinois, October, 1953 to November, 1954. Adult Leadership, November, 1954, pp. 18a-18g.

Sillars, Robertson, ed. Seeking Common Ground in Adult Education. Chicago: The Adult Education Association of the U.S.A., 1958.

University of Missouri Extension Association. Committee Chairman's Notebook--Professional Improvement, 1973. (Mimeographed.)

University of Missouri Extension Association. Constitution and By Laws, October 19, 1972. (Mimeographed.)

University of Missouri Extension Association. "Program Announcement for Coordinating Workshop: Your Professionalism as an Adult Educator." Columbia, Missouri, March 22-23, 1973. (Mimeographed.)

### Unpublished Materials

- Aker, George F. "Criteria For Evaluating Graduate Programs in Adult Education." Findings of a Study Conducted for The Commission of Professors of Adult Education, The University of Chicago, Center for Continuing Education, Chicago, 3-11-63. ( mimeographed.)
- Arias, Sister Marie. "Case Study of Program of the Overseas Fund Institute in Leadership Development for Latin American Women in United States: 1963-1970." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972.
- Austin, Theodore A. "The Perceptions of Key Hospital Leaders As To the Competencies Required for Hospital Administration and Their Implications for Professional Education." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1968.
- Bromley, James. "Investigation of Some Changes That Take Place in Students as a Result of Their Participation in the Graduate Program of Adult Education at Boston University." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972.
- Brunner, Edmund de S., Nichols, William L. II, and Sieber, Sam D. "The Role of a National Organization in Adult Education." A Report to the Executive Committee of the Adult Education Association. Chicago: Adult Education Association, 1959. ( mimeographed.)
- Burn, Mary Ann. "Content Analysis of Contemporary Nursing Journals to Determine Whether They Meet Certain Criteria of Excellence For Self-Development of the Nurse." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972.
- Cassara, Beverly. "A Study of Various Kinds of Educational Growth of Students in the Goddard College Adult Degree Program." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1970.
- Chamberlain, Martin H. "The Professional Adult Educator: An Examination of His Competencies and of the Programs of Graduate Study which Prepare Him for Work in the Field." Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Chicago, November, 1960.
- Citation, Delbert Clark Award. Carrolton, Georgia: West Georgia College. July, 1967.
- Ehat, Donald. "Ministers' Perceptions of the Relevance for Parish Administration, Organization and Teaching of Selected Adult Educational Competencies." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1966.

- Holt, Dean A. "Change Strategies Initiated by the Protestant Episcopal Church in Liberia from 1836 to 1950 and Their Differential Effects." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1970.
- Houle, Cyril and Knowles, Malcolm S. "Conceptual Bases of Program Planning." Unpublished Paper, 1960.
- Ingalls, John D. "Data Education, Incorporated: A Company History." Unpublished Paper, not dated. (Mimeographed.)
- Ingalls, John D. "Data Education, Incorporated. 'The Andragogy Company:' A Company History." Unpublished Paper, not dated. (Mimeographed.)
- Johnson, Leo. "Study of Relationship Between Selected Variables and the Shift in Perception of Self, Others and YMCA by Students Participating in the Greater Boston YMCA Federal College Work-Study Program." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972.
- Johnston, John A. "A Comparison of the Difference in the Effects of Trust on Learning Between Character-Disorder Delinquent and Nondelinquent Boys, as Viewed in Three Learning Situations." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1971.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. Adult Education. Prepared for the 1955 Printing of Encyclopedia Americana. Nashville, Tennessee: Distributed by the Department of Christian Education of Adults, Division of the Local Church, Board of Education, The Methodist Church, 1955. (Mimeographed.)
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "The Development of a Co-ordinated Adult Educational Movement in the United States." Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Chicago, December, 1960.
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "The Graduate Program in Adult and Higher Education at Boston University." A Written Paper, Boston, Massachusetts, January, 1972. (Mimeographed.)
- Knowles, Malcolm S. How the ROCCM Intensive Coronary Care Multimedia Learning System Utilizes the Principles of Adult Education, John Sutherland Productions, ROCCM, Division of Hoffman-Lakocne Inc., Nutley, N. J., no date. (Mimeographed.)
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "New Concepts of Adult Learning in Inservice Education." A Written Paper, Boston University, no date. (Mimeographed.)
- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Rate of Growth of Self-Perceived as Compared With Culturally-Perceived Needs and Capacities for Self-Direction." A Chart, Boston, Massachusetts, February, 1972. (Mimeographed.)

- Knowles, Malcolm S. "Sequential Research Needs in Evolving Disciplines of Social Practice--A Speculative Theory." A Written Paper, Boston, Massachusetts, November, 1969. (Mimeographed.)
- O'Connell, Brian. "Mental Health Association Staff Development Operation: A Training Project Proposal," National Association for Mental Health, New York, March, 1970. (Mimeographed.)
- Rosendahl, Pearl. "A Study of the Relationship Between Three Helping Conditions and Self-Actualization of Adult Learners." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972.
- Sillars, Robertson. "Some Problems of Publications Policy in the Adult Education Association of the U.S.A." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Teachers College, Columbia University, 1954.
- Simmons, James P. "A Study of Values and Behavior Orientations of Participants in Five Personal Growth and Professional Development Training Conferences." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972.
- Stone, Barbara. "Analytical Study of Self-Image of 'Adopters' of the Use of Participative Learning Methods with Adult Learners." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1969.
- ten Have, T. T. "On Agology." A paper for the 16th International Congress of Schools of Social Work (The Hague, 8-11 August, 1972). First 11 pages. (Mimeographed.)
- Thorne, Edward. "Evaluative Study of An Industrial Training Program to Prepare Hardcore Unemployed for Industrial Occupations." Unpublished Ed. D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972.
- Torrence, Preston E. "A Study of the Relationship of Selected Teacher Behaviors to Teacher Effectiveness." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1970.
- van Enckervort, Ger. Andragology: A New Science. Prepared for Publication in The Journal of Adult Education in Ireland, March, 1971. (Mimeographed.)
- van Enckevort, Ger. "De Lotgevallen Van De Term 'Andragogie (k)'" (a photocopied paper), pp. 14-34.
- Vorce, Armand. "Development and Validation of Criteria for Evaluating Content and Methodology of Humanities Education Program for Adults." Unpublished Ed. D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972.
- Yodmani, Suvit. "An Evaluation of Community Development of Developing Volunteers from Five Universities in Thailand According to Criteria of a Validated Model." Unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, Boston University, 1972.

## Other Sources

- Letter from William D. Abbott. Director of University Housing, Northeastern University, Boston, Massachusetts, June 13, 1972.
- Angert, Betsy. Private interview held in her office at the Adult Education Association, U.S.A., Washington, D.C., December, 1969.
- Berne, Kenneth D. Private interview held at his office, Boston University, Boston, Massachusetts, November, 1969.
- Birnbaum, Max. Private interview held at Osgood Hill, North Andover, Massachusetts, June, 1970.
- Letter from Edgar J. Boone. Assistant Director and Head, Department of Adult and Community College Education, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, North Carolina, August 10, 1972.
- Chin, Robert. Statements made at Osgood Hill Conference Center, North Andover, Massachusetts, November 1968.
- DuBois, Eugene E. Private interview held at his office, Boston University, Boston, Massachusetts, November, 1969.
- DuBois, Eugene E. Private interview held at his office, Boston University, Boston, Massachusetts, June, 1970.
- Houle, Cyril O. Private interview held in his office, University of Chicago, Chicago, Illinois, April, 1970.
- Letter from Jane Walford Hughes. Director, Institute for Continuing Education---Archdiocese of Detroit, Michigan, November 20, 1972.
- Letter from John A. Henschke to Malcolm S. Knowles, March 12, 1973.
- Letter from John D. Ingalls. Vice-President, Data Education, Inc., Waltham, Massachusetts, August 9, 1972.
- Letter from John D. Ingalls. Vice-President, Data Education, Inc.: "The Andragogy Company," Waltham, Massachusetts, November 10, 1972.
- Ingalls, John D. Telephone conversation held with John Henschke, Arlington, Massachusetts and Maryville, Missouri, October 31, 1972.
- Johnson, Eugene I. Private interview held in his home, Athens, Georgia, June, 1970.
- Knowles, Barbara. Private interview held in her home, Newton Highlands, Massachusetts, November, 1969.

Knowles, Hulda. Private interview held in her home, Newton Highlands, Massachusetts, November, 1969.

Knowles, Malcolm S. Personal Library, AEA Conference File, 1966.

Knowles, Malcolm S. Private interview held in his office, Boston University, Boston, Massachusetts, May, 1968.

Knowles, Malcolm S. Private interview held in his home, Newton Highlands, Massachusetts, November, 1969.

Knowles, Malcolm S. Private telephone conversation held with John Henschke, Newton Highlands, Massachusetts and Maryville, Missouri, January 25, 1973.

Letter from Malcolm S. Knowles, June 13, 1972.

Letter from Malcolm S. Knowles, January 26, 1973.

Knowles, Malcolm S., with Hiemstra, Roger. Andragogy: A Discussion About a New Concept in Adult Education, A Supplementary Instruction Videotape. Lincoln, Nebraska: Nebraska Education Television Council for Higher Education, 1972.

Letter from Malcolm S. Knowles to Father Robert Harnett. September 15, 1955.

Letter from Malcolm S. Knowles to Mrs. June Sheats. October 18, 1969.

Letter from James W. Phipps. Social Science Program Specialist, Office of Manpower Development and Training, Social and Rehabilitation Service, U. S. Department of Health, Education and Welfare, Washington, D. C., August 9, 1972.

Letter from Edna Ream. Secretary to Mrs. Alice W. Price, Educational Services Coordinator, Intensive Coronary Care Multimedia Learning System, ROCOM Division of Hoffman-LaRoche, Inc., Nutley, New Jersey, August 16, 1972.

Sillars, Robertson. Private interview held in his office, Portland Cement Association, Skokie, Illinois, July, 1970.

Letter from Walter D. Storey. Manager, Career Planning and Organization Development Operation, General Electric Co., Management Development Institute, Ossining, New York, September 19, 1972.

Letter from Ger van Enckevort. Nederlands Centrum voor Volksontwikkeling, Amersfoort, Netherlands, November 10, 1972.

## VITA

John Arthur Henschke

Date of Birth: May 12, 1932

Place of Birth: Benton Harbor, Michigan

Parents: Mr. Arthur E. Henschke  
Mrs. Anna L. Henschke

### Education:

	<u>Year of Graduation</u>	<u>Degree</u>
Benton Harbor Senior High School Benton Harbor, Michigan	1949	
Northwestern College Minneapolis, Minnesota	1951- 1953	—
Norman College Norman Park, Georgia	1953	—
	1954 (Ordination)	
Bob Jones University Greenville, South Carolina	1955	B.A.
Northern Baptist Theological Seminary Chicago, Illinois	1958	B.D.
Northern Baptist Theological Seminary Chicago, Illinois	1963	Th.M.
Northern Baptist Theological Seminary Chicago, Illinois	1972	M.Div. (M.Div. awarded in exchange for B.D.)
Boston University School of Education	1973	Ed.D.

### Education Positions Held:

Associate Director	1969-1970
Institute for Advanced Pastoral Studies, Bloomfield Hills, Michigan	
Continuing Education Programmer	1970-
University of Missouri, Extension Division, Maryville, Missouri	

